1	WILLIAM E. KOVACIC
2	General Counsel JANET M. EVANS
3	JILL F. DASH LEMUEL DOWDY
4	JOCK CHUNG FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
5	JE 2404 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
6	Mail Drop NJ-3212 Washington, D.C., 20580
7	Mail Drop NJ-3212 Washington, D.C. 20580 Tel: (202) 326-2125 Fax: (202) 326-3259
8	LOCAL COUNSEL
9	RAY MCKOWN FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
10	California Bar # 150975 10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700
11	Los Angeles, CA 90024 (Tel: (310) 824-4325
12	Fax: (310) 824-4380
13	Attorneys for Plaintiff
14	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
1.5	FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
15	WESTERN DIVISION
	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,
16	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, V. Civil Action No. WELLQUEST INTERNATIONAL, INC., STIPULATED FINAL
16 17 18 19	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, V. Civil Action No. WELLQUEST INTERNATIONAL, INC., EDDIE MISHAN, TONY HOFFMAN PRODUCTIONS, INC., ANTHONY PRODUCTIONS INC., ANTHONY PRODUCTION AND
16 17 18 19	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, V. Plaintiff, Plaintiff, V. Plaintiff, V. Civil Action No. STIPULATED FINAL ORDER FOR PERMANENT PRODUCTIONS, INC., ANTHONY HOFFMAN, AND MARK J. BUCHFUHRER. PRODUCTIONS OF CLAIMS FOR MONETARY RELIEF
16 17 18 19	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, V. Phon. Civil Action No. STIPULATED FINAL ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND SETTLEMENT OF CLAIMS FOR MONETARY RELIEF AS TO WELLQUEST, MISHAN, THPI, AND THE
16 17 18 19 20 21	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, V. WELLQUEST INTERNATIONAL, INC., EDDIE MISHAN, TONY HOFFMAN PRODUCTIONS, INC., ANTHONY HOFFMAN, AND MARK J. BUCHFUHRER, Defendants, and TEFEDEY MISHAN, STEVEN MISHAN Plaintiff, District Hon. Civil Action No. STIPULATED FINAL ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND SETTLEMENT OF CLAIMS FOR MONETARY RELIEF AS TO WELLQUEST, MISHAN, THPI, AND THE RELIEF DEFENDANTS
16 17 18 19 20 21	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, V. Phon. Civil Action No. STIPULATED FINAL ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND SETTLEMENT OF CLAIMS FOR MONETARY RELIEF AS TO WELLQUEST, MISHAN, THPI, AND THE
16 17 18 19 20 21 22	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, V. STIPULATED FINAL ORDER FOR PERMANENT ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND SETTLEMENT OF CLAIMS HOFFMAN, AND MARK J. BUCHFUHRER, Defendants, and JEFFREY MISHAN, STEVEN MISHAN AL MISHAN, ISAAC MISHAN, and MORRIS MISHAN, Plaintiff, V. Hon. Civil Action No. STIPULATED FINAL ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND SETTLEMENT OF CLAIMS FOR MONETARY RELIEF AS TO WELLQUEST, MISHAN, THPI, AND THE RELIEF DEFENDANTS
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, V. PROIL Action No. STIPULATED FINAL ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND SETTLEMENT OF CLAIMS FOR MONETARY RELIEF AS TO WELLQUEST, MISHAN, THPI, AND THE RELIEF DEFENDANTS RELIEF DEFENDANTS PROIL ACTION AND NORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND SETTLEMENT OF CLAIMS FOR MONETARY RELIEF AS TO WELLQUEST, MISHAN, THPI, AND THE RELIEF DEFENDANTS RELIEF DEFENDANTS
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, V. Plaintiff, Plaintiff, V. Plaintiff, Plaintif
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, V. PROIL Action No. STIPULATED FINAL ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND SETTLEMENT OF CLAIMS FOR MONETARY RELIEF AS TO WELLQUEST, MISHAN, THPI, AND THE RELIEF DEFENDANTS RELIEF DEFENDANTS PROIL ACTION AND NORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND SETTLEMENT OF CLAIMS FOR MONETARY RELIEF AS TO WELLQUEST, MISHAN, THPI, AND THE RELIEF DEFENDANTS RELIEF DEFENDANTS
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, V. Plaintiff, Plaintiff, V. Plaintiff, Plaintif

- 1 Inc., Eddie Mishan, Tony Hoffman Productions, Inc., Anthony Hoffman, Dr. Mark
- 2 Buchfuhrer ("Defendants"), and Jeffrey Mishan, Steven Mishan, Al Mishan, Isaac
- 3 Mishan, and Morris Mishan as relief defendants ("Relief Defendants") pursuant to
- 4 Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. §
- 5 | 53(b), alleging violations of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45
- 6 and 52. Wellquest International, Inc., Eddie Mishan, Tony Hoffman Productions,
- 7 Inc., Anthony Hoffman and the Relief Defendants agree to the entry of the
- 8 | following Stipulated Final Order for Permanent Injunction and Settlement of Claims
- for Monetary Relief ("Order") to resolve the allegations set forth in the complaint.
- The Court, being advised in the premises, finds:

12

FINDINGS

- a. By entry into this Stipulation, the Defendants do not admit to the allegations
 of the Complaint, other than the jurisdictional facts.
- b. Defendants waive all rights to seek judicial review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order. Defendants also waive any claims that they may have held under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, concerning the prosecution of this action to the date of this Order.
- 19 c. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case and
 20 jurisdiction over all parties. Venue in the Central District of California is
 21 proper.
- 22 d. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief can be granted, and the Commission has the authority to seek the relief it has requested.
- 24 e. The activities of Defendants are in or affecting commerce, as defined in 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 26 f. This action and the relief awarded herein are in addition to, and not in lieu of,

- 9. "D-Snore" shall mean the "D-Snore Natural Dietary Supplement" and any other product containing one or more of the ingredients in the current product that is promoted as a remedy for snoring or the sound of snoring.
- 10. "Competent and reliable scientific evidence" shall mean tests, analyses, research, studies, or other evidence based on the expertise of professionals in the relevant area, that has been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by persons qualified to do so, using procedures generally accepted in the profession to yield accurate and reliable results.
- 9 11. "Food," "drug," and "cosmetic," shall have the meaning defined in Section 15 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 55.
- 11 | 12. "Covered product or service" shall mean any dietary supplement, food, 12 | drug, or cosmetic, or any service purporting to provide weight loss benefits.
- 13 | 13. "Commerce" shall have the meaning defined in Section 4 of the Federal
 14 | Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 15 | 14. "Billing information" shall mean any data that enables an entity to charge a consumer's account, such as a credit card, checking, savings, share or similar account, utility bill, mortgage loan account, or debit card.
 - 15. "Charge" shall mean any amount charged or debited to a consumer's credit card, checking, savings, share or similar account, utility bill, telephone bill, mortgage loan account, debit card, or any similar form of collecting money from a consumer.
 - 16. "Free-to-pay conversion" shall mean, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any goods or services, a provision under which a customer receives a product or service for free for an initial period and will incur an obligation to pay for the product or service if the customer does not take affirmative action to cancel before the end of that period.

- 17. "Negative option" shall mean, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any goods or services, a provision under which the consumer's silence or failure to reject goods or services or to cancel the agreement is interpreted by the seller or provider as acceptance or continuing acceptance of the goods or services. Agreements with negative option features include, but are not limited to: (i) free-to-pay conversion plans; (ii) continuity plans in which, subsequent to the consumer's agreement to the plan, the seller or provider automatically ships goods to a consumer unless the consumer notifies the seller or provider within a certain time not to ship the goods; and (iii) automatic renewal plans in which the seller automatically renews the agreement and charges the consumer unless the consumer cancels before the seller renews the agreement. "Preacquired account information" shall mean any information that enables 18.
 - 18. "Preacquired account information" shall mean any information that enables Defendants, or any agent acting on behalf of one or more of them, to cause a charge to be placed against a consumer's account without obtaining the account number directly from the consumer during the telemarketing transaction pursuant to which the account will be charged.
 - 19. "Telemarketing" shall mean any business activity (which includes, but is not limited to, initiating or receiving telephone calls, managing or contracting with others who initiate or receive telephone calls, operating an enterprise that initiates or receives telephone calls, owning an enterprise that initiates or receives telephone calls, or otherwise participating as an officer, director, employee or independent contractor in an enterprise that initiates or receives telephone calls) that involves attempts to induce consumers to purchase any item, good, or service, or to enter a contest for a prize, by means of telephone sales presentations, either exclusively or in conjunction with the

use of other forms of marketing; *provided* that the term "telemarketing" does not include transactions that are not completed until after a face-to-face contact between the seller or solicitor and the consumers solicited; *provided further* that for purposes of Part IX of this Order (requiring compliance with the Telemarketing Sales Rule, or "TSR"), the definition of telemarketing shall be consistent with the definition set forth in the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310, (effective as of March 30, 2003, and as it may be amended).

- 20. "Upselling" shall mean soliciting the purchase of other goods or services following an initial transaction during a single telephone call and includes external upsells and internal upsells. The upsell is a separate telemarketing transaction, not a continuation of the initial transaction. An "external upsell" is a solicitation made by or on behalf of a seller different from the seller in the initial transaction, regardless of whether the initial transaction and the subsequent transaction are made by the same telemarketer. An "internal upsell" is a solicitation made by or on behalf of the same seller as in the initial transaction, regardless of whether the initial transaction and subsequent solicitation are made by the same telemarketer.
- 21. "Clear(ly) and prominent(ly)" shall mean as follows:
 - a. In an advertisement communicated through an electronic medium, (such as television, video, radio, and interactive media including the Internet and online services), the disclosure shall be presented simultaneously in both the audio and video portions of the advertisement. *Provided, however*, that in any advertisement presented solely through video or audio means, the disclosure may be made through the same means in which the ad is presented. The audio disclosure shall be delivered in a volume and cadence sufficient for an

ordinary consumer to hear and comprehend it. The video disclosure shall be of a size and shade, and shall appear on the screen for a duration, sufficient for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it. In addition to the foregoing, in interactive media the disclosure shall also be unavoidable and shall be presented prior to the consumer incurring any financial obligation.

- b. In a print advertisement, promotional material, or instructional manual, the disclosure shall be in a type size and location sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it, in print that contrasts with the background against which it appears. In multi-page documents, the disclosure shall appear on the cover page or first page.
- c. On a product label, the disclosure shall be in a type-size and location sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it and in print that contrasts with the background against which it appears. *Provided*, that if a disclosure on a bottle label or package label is made in a location other than the principal display panel, the bottle label or package label shall: (i) include the statement, "See important warning on [insert disclosure location]," in a type-size and location on the principal display panel sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it and in print that contrasts with the background against which it appears; and (ii) place the disclosure on the bottle label and, if applicable, the package label, within a border that is a color or shade that contrasts with the background against which it appears. *Provided further*, that, in a multi-page package insert, the disclosure shall appear on the cover

page or first page.

Nothing contrary to, inconsistent with, or in mitigation of the disclosure shall be used in any advertisement or on any label.

22. The term "including" in this Order shall mean "including, without limitation."

XXIIICLAIMS FOR BLOUSSANT

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Defendants, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, and their officers, agents, servants, employees and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order, by personal service or otherwise, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of Bloussant, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from making any representation, in any manner, expressly or by implication, including through the use of endorsements:

- A. That Bloussant works by stimulating breast cells to regenerate the growth process;
- B. That Bloussant enlarges the breast by two cup sizes in most women;
- C. That Bloussant firms the breast; and
- D. That after optimum breast size is achieved, some women will maintain their increased breast size without continued use of Bloussant; and the remainder of women will maintain the increase in size by taking Bloussant two or three times a week;

unless, at the time it is made, they possess and rely upon competent and reliable scientific evidence that substantiates the representation.

XXIV CLAIMS FOR D-SNORE

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Defendants Wellquest and Mishan, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, and their officers, agents, servants, employees and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order, by personal service or otherwise, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of D-Snore, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from making any representation, in any manner, expressly or by implication, including through the use of endorsements:

- A. That D-Snore significantly reduces or eliminates snoring or the sound of snoring in users of the product;
- B. That a single application of D-Snore significantly reduces or eliminates snoring or the sound of snoring for eight hours; and
- C. That D-Snore can eliminate, reduce, or mitigate the symptoms of sleep apnea including daytime tiredness and frequent interruptions of deep restorative sleep;

unless, at the time it is made, they possess and rely upon competent and reliable scientific evidence that substantiates the representation.

XXV DISCLOSURES ABOUT SLEEP APNEA

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants Wellquest and Mishan, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, and their officers, agents, servants, employees and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order, by personal service or otherwise, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any covered product or service

that has not been shown by competent and reliable scientific evidence to be effective in the treatment of sleep apnea, in or affecting commerce, shall not represent, in any manner, expressly or by implication, including through the use of 3 endorsements, that the product or service is effective in reducing or eliminating snoring or the sounds of snoring, unless they disclose, clearly and prominently, and 5 in close proximity to the representation, that such product or service is not intended to treat sleep apnea, that the symptoms of sleep apnea include loud snoring, 7 frequent episodes of totally obstructed breathing during sleep, and excessive daytime sleepiness, that sleep apnea is a potentially life-threatening condition, and that persons who have symptoms of sleep apnea should consult their physician or a 10 specialist in sleep medicine. *Provided, however,* that for any television commercial 11 or other video advertisement fifteen (15) minutes in length or longer or intended to 12 fill a broadcasting or cablecasting time slot fifteen (15) minutes in length or longer, the disclosure shall be made within the first thirty (30) seconds of the advertisement 14 and immediately before each presentation of ordering instructions for the product. 15 *Provided further*, that, for the purposes of this provision, the presentation of a 16 telephone number, e-mail address, or mailing address for listeners to contact for 17 further information or to place an order for the product shall be deemed a 18 presentation of ordering instructions so as to require the announcement of the 19 disclosure provided herein. 20

21

22

23

25

26

27

XXVICLAIMS FOR ENERX

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, and their officers, agents, servants, employees and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order, by personal service or otherwise, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for

sale, sale, or distribution of EnerX, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Making any misrepresentation, directly or by implication, in any manner, including through the use of endorsements, that EnerX has no harmful side effects; and
- B. Making any representation, directly or by implication, in any manner, including through the use of endorsements, that EnerX is safe, unless, at the time it is made, they possess and rely upon competent and reliable scientific evidence that substantiates the representation;

 Provided that, in any advertisement, promotional material, or product label for EnerX that contains any representation about the efficacy, benefits, performance, safety, and side effects of such product, Defendants, their officers, agents, servants, employees and attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, shall make, clearly and prominently, the following disclosure:

WARNING: This product can raise blood pressure and interfere with other drugs you may be taking. Talk to your doctor before taking this product.

unless Defendants possess competent and reliable scientific evidence that the advertised product is safe and produces no adverse side effects.

XXVII CLAIMS FOR COVERED PRODUCTS AND SERVICES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, and their officers, agents, servants, employees and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order, by personal service or otherwise,

in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any covered product or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from making any representation, in any manner, expressly or by implication, including through the use of endorsements, about the benefits, performance, efficacy, safety, or side effects, of any covered product or service unless, at the time the representation is made, they possess and rely upon competent and reliable scientific evidence that substantiates the representation.

XXVIII REPRESENTATIONS ABOUT TESTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, and their officers, agents, servants, employees and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order, by personal service or otherwise, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any covered product or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from misrepresenting, in any manner, expressly or by implication, the existence, contents, validity, results, conclusions, or interpretations of any test, study, or research.

XXIXFDA APPROVED CLAIMS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- A. Nothing in this Order shall prohibit Defendants from making any representation for any drug that is permitted in labeling for such drug under any tentative final or final standard promulgated by the Food and Drug Administration, or under any new drug application approved by the Food and Drug Administration; and
- B. Nothing in this Order shall prohibit Defendants from making any

representation for any product that is specifically permitted in labeling for such product by regulations promulgated by the Food and Drug Administration pursuant to the Nutrition Labeling and Education Act of 1990.

VIII REFUND TERM CLAIMS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, and their officers, agents, servants, employees and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order, by personal service or otherwise, in connection with the advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any covered product or service in or affecting commerce, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, that any entity will refund costs associated with purchasing, or any other material aspect or conditions of any entity's refund policy, including, but not limited to, failing to disclose any material condition, qualification, requirement, or limitation to a refund; and
- B. Failing to honor a request for a money-back refund consistent with the terms advertised by the Defendants.

IX TELEMARKETING SALES RULE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, and their officers, agents, servants, employees and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order, by personal service or otherwise, each are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from violating any provision of

- A. The provisions requiring specified disclosures in connection with the sales of goods or services, including the sale of goods or services with a negative option feature and internal and external upsells, set forth in Sections 310.3(a)(1) and 310.4(d);
- B. The provisions prohibiting misrepresentations in connection with the sale of goods or services, including the sale of goods or services with a negative option feature, set forth in Sections 310.3(a)(2) and 310.3(a)(4);
- C. The provisions regarding the submission of billing information for payment, or the collection or attempt to collect payment for goods or services, in transactions involving preacquired account information, either in conjunction with or without a free-to-pay conversion plan, set forth in Sections 310.3(a)(3) and 310.4(a)(6); and
- D. The provision regarding provision of substantial assistance or support to any seller or telemarketer when that person knows or consciously avoids knowing that the seller or telemarketer is engaged in any act or practice that violates Sections 310.3(a), (c), or (d), or Section 310.4 of the TSR, as set forth in Section 310.3(b).

X PROHIBITED TELEMARKETING PRACTICES INVOLVING NEGATIVE OPTION FEATURES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, and their officers, agents, servants, employees and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order, by personal service or otherwise,

each are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined:

- A. In connection with the telemarketing of any product or service pursuant to an offer or agreement with a free-to-pay conversion, making any representation, expressly or by implication, that a good or service is offered with "no obligation," or words of similar import, denoting or implying the absence of any obligation on the part of the recipient of the offer to affirmatively act in order to avoid charges if, in fact, a charge will be submitted for payment at the end of a trial period unless the consumer takes an affirmative action to cancel;
- B. In connection with the telemarketing of any product or service pursuant to an offer or agreement with a negative option feature, directly or indirectly causing billing information to be submitted for payment, or collecting or attempting to collect, without the consumer's express informed consent. Provided, that to obtain the consumer's express informed consent, the Defendants must clearly and conspicuously disclose, before the consumer consents to any such purchase, all material terms and conditions of the negative option feature, including but not limited to, the fact that the consumer's account will be charged unless the consumer takes an affirmative action to avoid the charge(s); the date the initial charge, and the frequency or time period that subsequent charges, will be submitted for payment; the total cost of the initial charge; the total cost, or range of costs, for of each subsequent charge; and the specific steps the consumer must take to avoid the charge(s).

25

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

26

27

3

4 5

> 6 7

9

8

11

10

12 13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20 21

22

23 24

25

26

27

IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND ORDERED that judgment in the amount of Three Million, Two Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$3,200,000) is hereby entered against Defendants Wellquest and Mishan and the Relief Defendants, jointly and severally, which shall be paid as follows:

- Within ten (10) days of the date of entry of this Order, Defendants A. Wellquest and Mishan and the Relief Defendants, jointly and severally, shall pay the sum of One Million, Six Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$1,600,000) to the Commission by wire transfer in accord with directions provided by the Commission.
- В. Thereafter, Defendants Wellquest and Mishan and the Relief Defendants, jointly and severally, shall pay the remaining One Million, Six Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$1,600,000) owed to the Commission by paying the sum of One Hundred Thirty Three Thousand, Three Hundred Thirty-Four Dollars (\$133,334.00) on August 1, 2003 and on the first day of each of the following ten months; and on the first day of the twelfth month, they shall pay One Hundred Thirty Three Thousand, Three Hundred and Twenty-Six Dollars (\$133,326).
- C. The unpaid balance of One Million, Six Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$1,600,000) identified in Paragraph B shall be secured by a noninterest bearing promissory note executed by Defendant Wellquest International, Inc., in such amount in favor of the Federal Trade Commission. Such note, in the form attached hereto as Appendix B, shall be secured by the inventory of Wellquest International, Inc. Defendants Wellquest and Mishan and Relief Defendants represent and acknowledge that the Federal Trade Commission is relying on the material representations that the asset pledged as security has a value

that exceeds the debt secured and that it is not encumbered. The Federal Trade Commission is permitted to perfect a security interest in such collateral as permitted by law. In the event such security interest is found to be defective, after reasonable notice, Defendants Wellquest and Mishan and Relief Defendants agree to cooperate with the Federal Trade Commission to cure any deficiencies in perfecting said security interest. Defendants Wellquest and Mishan and Relief Defendants agree that they shall not encumber the security without the express prior written permission of the staff of the Federal Trade Commission. The Federal Trade Commission agrees to release said security interest upon full payment of the judgment.

- D. In the event of any default on any obligation to make payment under this Order, interest, computed pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1961(a), shall accrue from the date of default to the date of payment. In the event such default continues for ten (10) calendar days beyond the date a payment is due, the entire unpaid amount shall immediately become due and payable. Defendants Wellquest and Mishan and Relief Defendants shall be jointly and severally liable for all payments required by this Order and any interest on such payments.
- E. All funds paid pursuant to this Order shall be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including but not limited to consumer redress or one or more of the products or services set forth in the Complaint, and any attendant expenses for the administration of such equitable relief. In the event that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable, or funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including

consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to the Defendants' practices alleged in the complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited to the United States Treasury as disgorgement. Defendants shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies under this Paragraph. Defendants shall have no right to contest the manner of distribution chosen by the Commission. No portion of any payments under the judgement herein shall be deemed a payment of any fine, penalty, or punitive assessment.

- F. Defendants and Relief Defendants relinquish all dominion, control and title to the funds paid to the Commission, and all legal and equitable title to the funds. Defendants and Relief Defendants shall make no claim to or demand for the return of the funds, directly or indirectly, through counsel or otherwise; and in the event of bankruptcy of any Defendant or Relief Defendant, Defendants and Relief Defendants acknowledge that the funds are not part of the debtor's estate, nor does the estate have any claim or interest therein.
- G. In accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701, Defendants and Relief Defendants are hereby required, unless they have done so already, to furnish to the FTC their taxpayer identifying number and/or social security number, which shall be used for purposes of collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of Defendants' and Relief Defendants' relationship with the government.
- H. Defendants shall provide their complete customer lists for Bloussant, DSnore, and EnerX to the Commission within thirty (30) days of the date of entry of this Order. The customer lists shall be in a searchable electronic format and shall include the names and addresses of all

purchasers of the three products, the number of each product purchased, the date of purchase, the number of times each consumer made a repeat purchase, and the date and dollar amount of any refund to the consumer, to the extent such information is contained in the files.

I. Defendants also shall, within ten (10) days following a written request by a representative of the Commission, provide copies of all recorded consumer complaints with regard to Bloussant, D-Snore, or EnerX, received by them on or after January 1, 1999, and all responses thereto.

XII RIGHT TO REOPEN

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- A. The Commission's agreement to this Order, requiring that the Defendants and the Relief Defendants be liable for less than the full amount of consumer injury, is expressly premised on the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of their sworn financial statements and supporting documents submitted to the Commission, namely:
 - 1. With regard to Defendants Wellquest, Mishan, and the Relief Defendants, the February 6, 2003 letter from Counsel for Defendants, Linda A. Goldstein, including the financial disclosures, Statements of Financial Condition, U.S. Income Tax Returns and the New York S Corporation Franchise Tax Returns attached thereto; and the letter from Counsel for Defendants, Linda A. Goldstein submitted on March 5, 2003, and attachments thereto; and
 - 2. With regard to Defendants THPI and Hoffman, the May 12,

2003 letter from Counsel for Defendants, Charulata B. Pagar, including the Financial Statement of Corporate Defendant Tony Hoffman Productions, Inc. and attachments thereto.

Such financial statements and supporting documents contain material information upon which the Commission relied in negotiating and agreeing to this Order.

- B. If, upon motion by the Commission, this Court finds that:
 - 1. Defendants Wellquest, Mishan, or the Relief Defendants have failed to disclose any material asset, or made any other material misrepresentation or omission in the above-referenced financial statements and related documents described in Paragraph A1, above, the Court shall enter judgment against Defendants Wellquest, Mishan, and the Relief Defendants, jointly and severally, in the amount of Twenty Million Dollars (\$20,000,000) in U.S. currency, minus any payments previously made under Part XI, which amount would be rendered immediately due and payable; or
 - 2. Defendants THPI and Hoffman have failed to disclose any material asset, or made any other material misrepresentation or omission in the above-referenced financial statements and related documents described in Paragraph A2, above, the Court shall enter judgment against Defendants THPI and Hoffman, jointly and severally, in the amount of Nine Hundred and Two Thousand Dollars (\$902,000) in U.S. currency, minus any payments previously made under Part XI, which amount would be rendered immediately due and payable.

Interest computed at the rate prescribed in 28 U.S.C. § 1961 shall

immediately begin to accrue on the balance. For the purposes of this Part XII and any subsequent proceedings to enforce payment, the Defendants waive any right to contest any of the allegations in the Complaint filed in this action. *Provided however*, that in all other respects this Stipulated Final Order shall remain in full force and effect unless otherwise ordered by the Court; and *provided further*, that proceedings instituted under this Paragraph XII are in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies that may be provided by law, including any other proceedings the Commission may initiate to enforce this Order.

XIII NOTIFICATION TO COMMISSION

IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND ORDERED a requirement in this Order that any Defendant "notify the Commission" shall mean that the Defendant shall send the necessary information via first-class mail, costs prepaid, to the Associate Director for Advertising Practices, Federal Trade Commission, 600 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Washington, D.C. 20580. Attn: FTC v. Wellquest International, Inc. et al., (C.D. Cal.).

XIV ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER

IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND ORDERED that, within five (5) business days after receipt by Defendants and Relief Defendants of this Order as entered by the Court, Defendant Mishan, individually and on behalf of Defendant Wellquest; Defendant Hoffman, individually and on behalf of Defendant THPI; and each of the Relief Defendants, individually, shall execute and submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement, in the form shown on Appendix A, that shall acknowledge receipt of this Order.

9

10

8

11

12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

2021

22

23

24

25

26

2728

XV DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- For a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendants Wellquest and THPI, and any business where (1) Defendants Mishan or Hoffman is the majority owner of the business, or directly or indirectly manages or controls the business, and (2) the business is engaged in the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, distribution, or sale of any covered product or service, shall deliver a copy of this Order to all officers, directors, and all individuals employed by them serving in a management capacity, and must deliver a Summary of Parts I through X of this Order, agreed upon by Plaintiff's Counsel, to all sales and sales verification personnel and all personnel involved in responding to consumer complaints or inquiries (whether such persons are designated as employees, consultants, independent contractors, or otherwise) for goods or services subject to this Order and must secure from each such person a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the Order or Summary, as applicable. This Order must be delivered to current personnel within thirty (30) days after the date of service of this Order and to future personnel within thirty (30) days after the person assumes such position or responsibilities.
- B. For a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order,
 Defendants Mishan and Hoffman shall deliver a Summary of Parts IX
 and X of this Order, agreed upon by Plaintiff's Counsel, to (1) any
 business engaged in telemarketing, as defined in Definition 15, above,
 if it includes negative option features, or telemarketing, as defined in

the TSR, where (2) Defendant Mishan or Hoffman (a) is the majority owner, (b) directly or indirectly manages or controls the business, or (c) is employed by the business. Defendants Mishan and Hoffman shall obtain a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of the Summary from such business.

C. Defendants shall maintain for a period of three (3) years after creation, and upon reasonable notice make available to representatives of the Commission, the original signed and dated acknowledgments of the receipt of copies of this Order, as required in Paragraphs A and B above.

XVI COMMISSION'S AUTHORITY TO MONITOR COMPLIANCE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Commission is authorized to monitor Defendants' compliance with this Order by all lawful means, including but not limited to the following:

- A. The Commission is authorized, without further leave of court, to obtain discovery from any person in the manner provided by Chapter V of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Fed. R. Civ. P. 26 37, including the use of compulsory process pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 45, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating Defendants' compliance with any provision of this Order;
- B. The Commission is authorized to use representatives posing as consumers and suppliers to Defendants, Defendants' employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by Defendants, without the necessity of identification or prior notice; and
- C. Nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of

compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to investigate whether Defendants have violated any provision of this Order or Section 5 or 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45, 52.

XVII COMPLIANCE REPORTING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

- A. For a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order, each individual Defendant shall notify the Commission of the following:
 - Any changes in his residence, mailing addresses, and telephone 1. numbers, within ten (10) days of the date of such change; and
 - 2. Any changes in his employment status (including selfemployment) within ten (10) days of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of each business that Defendant is employed or hired as a consultant or independent contractor for personal services in his individual capacity, a statement of the nature of the business, and a statement of Defendant's duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment.
- For a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order, B. Defendants Wellquest and THPI each shall notify the Commission of any proposed change in its structure, such as creation, incorporation, dissolution, assignment, sale, creation or dissolution of subsidiaries, or any other change that may affect compliance obligations arising out of this Order, thirty (30) days prior to the effective date of any proposed

26

change; *provided*, *however*, that, with respect to any proposed change in the corporation about which a Defendant learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, it shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.

- C. Ninety (90) days after the date of entry of this Order, Defendants shall provide a written report to the FTC, sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which they have complied and are complying with this Order. This report shall include but not be limited to:
 - 1. The individual Defendants' then current residence addresses and telephone numbers;
 - 2. The individual Defendants' then current employment, business addresses, and telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of each such employer, and the Defendants' title and responsibilities for each employer;
 - 3. For Defendants Wellquest and THPI, their then current business addresses, telephone numbers, a description of their business activities, and identification of all products that they advertise or sell;
 - 4. A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this Order obtained by Defendants pursuant to Part XV; and
 - 5. A statement describing the manner in which Defendants have complied and are complying with Parts I through XII.
- D. Upon written request by a representative of the Commission,

 Defendants shall submit additional written reports (under oath, if
 requested) and produce documents on thirty (30) days' notice with

22 23

19

20

21

25 26

24

27

28

respect to any conduct subject to this Order.

E. For purposes of the compliance reporting required by this Part, if any Defendant is no longer represented by Hall Dickler Kent Goldstein & Wood, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with that Defendant.

XVIIIRECORD KEEPING PROVISIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of six (6) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendants Wellquest and THPI and any business where (1) individual Defendants Mishan or Hoffman is the majority owner or an officer or director of the business, or directly or indirectly manages or controls the business and where (2) the business engages in telemarketing, as defined in Definition 15, above, if it includes negative option features; or telemarketing, as defined in the TSR; or the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, distribution or sale of any covered product or service; and their agents, employees, officers, corporations, successors, and assigns, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, are hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain, unless otherwise specified:

- A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and disbursement of such revenues;
- B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
- C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, telephone numbers,

- dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and description of items or services purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;
- Records accurately reflecting all consumer complaints and refund D. requests (whether received directly, indirectly, or though any third party), including the date of the complaint, the name, address, and other contact information provided by the consumer, and the substance of the complaint, and any responses to those complaints or requests;
- E. Copies of all advertisements, promotional materials, sales scripts, training materials, or other marketing materials utilized in the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, distribution or sale of any covered product or service, to the extent such information is prepared in the ordinary course of business;
- F. All materials that were relied upon in making any representations contained in the materials identified in Paragraph E above, including all documents evidencing or referring to the accuracy of any claim therein or to the efficacy of any covered product or service, including, but not limited to, all tests, reports, studies, demonstrations, or other evidence that confirm, contradict, qualify, or call into question the accuracy or efficacy of such covered product or service; and
- Records accurately reflecting the name, address, and telephone G. number of each manufacturer or laboratory engaged in the development or creation of any testing obtained for the purpose of advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, distributing, or selling any covered product or service.

XIX RETENTION OF JURISDICTION 1 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this ² matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order. 3 **\$**O STIPULATED: WELLQUEST INTERNATIONAL, INC. ⁴ JANET M. EVANS By: Eddie Mishan, President EMUEL DOWDY OCK CHUNG ILL F. DASH EDDIE MISHAN, individually and as an officer Federal Trade Commission or director of Wellquest International, Inc. 600 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., VJ-3126 Washington, D.C. 20580 TONY HOFFMAN PRODUCTIONS, Inc. 202) 326-2125 By: Anthony Hoffman, President 202) 326-3259 (facsimile) Attorneys for Plaintiff ANTHONY HOFFMAN, individually 11 and as an officer or director of Tony Hoffman Productions, Inc. 12 13 JEFFREY MISHAN, Relief Defendant 14 STEVEN MISHAN, Relief Defendant 15 16 AL MISHAN, Relief Defendant 17 18 ISAAC MISHAN, Relief Defendant 19 MORRIS MISHAN, Relief Defendant 20 21 LINDA GOLDSTEIN 22 Hall Dickler Kent Goldstein & Wood 909 Third Avenue 23 New York, New York 10022-4731 (212) 339-5400 24 Attorney for Defendants **\$O ORDERED**: 26 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE Date 27 28

Page 28 of 33

1 APPENDIX A UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 2 FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 3 WESTERN DIVISION 4 EDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, 5 6 Plaintiff, Hon. Civil Action No. v. 7 AFFIDAVIT OF DEFENDANT WELLQUEST INTERNATIONAL, INC., IDDIE MISHAN. TONY HOFFMAN PRODUCTIONS, INC., ANTHONY HOFFMAN, AND MARK J. BUCHFUHRER, Defendants, and 11 12 EFFREY MISHAN, STEVEN MISHAN AL MISHAN, ISAAC MISHAN, and 13 MORRIS MISHAN, 14 Relief Defendants 15 Defendant, being duly sworn, hereby states and affirms: My name is . I am a citizen of the United 17 1. \$tates and am over the age of eighteen. I have personal knowledge of the matters discussed in this declaration, and if called as a witness, I could and would ompetently testify as to the matters stated herein. I am a defendant in the above 20 aptioned action. 21 My current business address is ______. My 22 current business telephone number is . My current residential ddress is ______. My current residential telephone number is 24

26 and Settlement of Claims for Monetary Relief, which was signed by the Honorable

_____, United States District Court Judge for the Central District of

25

27

28

3.

On (date) _____, I received a copy of the Stipulated Final Order

1	California. A true and correct copy of the Order that I received is appended to this
2	Affidavit.
3	4. I reaffirm and attest to the truthfulness, accuracy and completeness of
4	he financial statements that I submitted to the Federal Trade Commission on or about
_	·
5	hereby declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of
	America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on (date), at
7	city, state),
8	
9	
10	
11	(Name of Defendant)
12	TATE OF
13	OUNTY OF
14	BEFORE ME this day personally appeared,
15	who being first duly sworn, deposes and says that s/he has read and understands the
	oregoing statement and that s/he has executed the same for the purposes contained
17 1	herein.
18	SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN TO before me thisday of,
	2001 by S/he is personally
	nown to me or has presented (state identification)
21 -	as identification.
22	
23 -	
	Print Name
24	NOTARY PUBLIC,
25	STATE OF
26	Commission Number
27	
28	Page 30 of 33

Affix Seal

Page 31 of 33

APPENDIX B 1 **Promissory Note** 2 Date: 4 One Million, Six Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$1,600,000) 5 FOR VALUE RECEIVED, the undersigned, Wellquest International, Inc., Eddie Mishan, Jeffrey Mishan, Steven Mishan, Al Mishan, Isaac Mishan, and Morris Mishan, jointly and severally, ("Makers") promise to pay to the Federal Trade Commission together with its assigns ("Holder") at such place s the Holder may designate in writing, in lawful money of the United States of America, the principal sum of One Million, Six Hundred Thousand Dollars 10 \$1,600,000). This Note shall be paid in twelve installments as follows: the sum of One Hundred Thirty Three Thousand, Three Hundred Thirty-Four Dollars 13 \$133,334.00) shall be paid on August 1, 2003, and on the first day of each of he following ten months; and the sum of One Hundred Thirty Three Thousand, Three Hundred and Twenty-Six Dollars (\$133,326) shall be paid on July 1, 2004. 16 n the event of any default on any obligation to make payment under this Note, 17 nterest, computed pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1961(a), shall accrue from the ate of default to the date of payment. In the event such default continues for 19 en (10) calendar days beyond the date the payment is due, the entire unpaid 20 amount shall immediately become due and payable. The Makers and any endorser or guarantor hereof shall have the right to prepay this Note at any 22 time in whole or in part without premium or penalty. The Makers and any endorsers waive presentment, notice of dishonor and protest; and agree that any extension of the time of payment of all or any part f this Note may be made before, at, or after maturity by agreement with the Holder without notice to and without releasing the liability of any other party 26 o this Note. 27 28

,	This Note is secured by the inventory of Wellquest International, Inc. identified
1	elow.
2	WITNESS the following signatures and seals:
3	
4 ⁵ 5	WELLQUEST INTERNATIONAL, INC. By: Eddie Mishan, President
6	EDDIE MISHAN, individually
7	
8	IEFFREY MISHAN, individually
	TEVEN MISHAN, individually
10	AL MISHAN, individually
11 	
	SAAC MISHAN, individually
13	MORRIS MISHAN, individually
14	
15	secured Inventory consists of the following items:
	Design a Nail; Super Styler; Clean Between Machine; Interdental Toothbrushes; Revo Hair
17 []]	Brush
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
4 8	Page 33 of 33