CLERK'S OFFICE

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

"LODGED" Please have this and place it the United States Attorney's

Thank you.

CARY PLESSMAN, AUSA, CIVIL DIVISION - LA California Bar Number 101233 5 Room 7516, Federal Building б 300 North Los Angeles Street Los Angeles, California 90012 Telephone: (213) 894-2474 7 Facsimile: (213) 894-2380 Attorneys for Plaintiff В 9 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 10 SOUTHERN DIVISION 11 SPATES OF AMERICA, DOGEO Plaintiff, CIVIL ACTION BODY WISE INTERNATIONAL, INC., and SACV 05-43 DOC (ANX) JESSEA. STOFF, M.D., 16 Defendants. 17 18

CONSENT DECREE AS TO JESSE A. STOFF, M.D.

WHEREAS, Plaintiff, the United States of America, has commenced this action by filing the Complaint herein; Defendant Jesse A. Stoff, M.D., has waived service of the Summons and Complaint; the parties have been represented by the attorneys whose names appear hereafter; and the parties have agreed to settlement of this action upon the following terms and conditions, without adjudication of any issue of fact or law and without Defendant admitting liability for any of the matters alleged in the Complaint;

THEREFORE, on the joint motion of Plaintiff and Defendant Jesse A. Stoff, M.D., it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED, and DECREED as follows:

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21 22

23

24

25

26

27 28 2.

1.

3.

The Complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted against Defendant

under Sections 5(a), 12, 13(b) and 16(a) of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C.

§§ 45(a), 52, 53(b) and 56(a).

This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and of the parties.

The activities of the Defendant were or are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.

4. Plaintiff and Defendant hereby waive all rights to appeal or otherwise challenge or

contest the validity of this Consent Decree. 5. Defendant has agreed that this Consent Decree does not entitle Defendant to seek

or to obtain attorney's fees as a prevailing party under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, as amended by Pub. L. 104-121, 110 Stat. 847, 863-64 (1996), and

Defendant further waives any rights to attorney's fees that may arise under said provision

of law. 6. Each party to this Consent Decree hereby agrees to bear its own costs and

attorney's fees incurred in connection with this action.

7. Entry of this Consent Decree is in the public interest.

8. Defendant does not admit any allegations set forth in the Complaint, other than jurisdictional facts. This Consent Decree does not constitute, nor shall it be interpreted to constitute, either an admission by Defendant of any wrongdoing or a finding by the Court that Defendant has engaged in any violation of law.

DEFINITIONS

The following definitions shall apply to this Consent Decree:

- 1. "Commerce" means as defined in Section 4 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 2. "Commission" means the Federal Trade Commission.
- 3. "Competent and reliable scientific evidence" means tests, analyses, research, studies, or other evidence based on the expertise of professionals in the relevant area, that has been conducted and evaluated in an objective

- manner by persons qualified to do so, using procedures generally accepted in the profession to yield accurate and reliable results.
- 4. "Defendant" means Jesse A. Stoff, M.D.
- 5. "Endorsement" and "expert" mean as defined in 16 C.F.R. § 255.0.
- 6. "Food" and "drug" mean as defined in Sections 12 and 15 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 52 and 55.

INJUNCTION

I. PROHIBITION AGAINST CERTAIN ADVERTISING CLAIMS FOR CERTAIN PRODUCTS UNLESS TRUE AND SUBSTANTIATED

IT IS ORDERED that Defendant, his agents, representatives, employees and all other persons or entities within the scope of Fed R. Civ. P. 65, and all persons in active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice of this Consent Decree by personal service or otherwise, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale or distribution of AG Immune or any food, drug, or dietary supplement, in or affecting commerce, is hereby permanently enjoined from representing or assisting others in representing, in any manner, expressly or by implication, that any such product:

- A. prevents, mitigates, treats, cures or improves the symptoms of any disease including but not limited to: Allergies; AIDS; Asthma; Cancer; Candida; Canker Sores; Chronic Fatigue Syndrome; Cold; Colon Disease; Crohn's Disease; Epstein Barr; Fibromylagia; Flu; Heart Disease; Hepatitis B; Hepatitis C; HIV; Hyperactive Thyroid; Infection; Irritable Bowel Syndrome; Lupus; Mononucleosis; Poison Ivy; Rheumatoid Arthritis; Shingles; Sinusitis; Toenail Fungus; and Ulcerative Colitis;
- B. triggers or activates the immune system to prevent or treat diseases;
- C. increases the activity and/or the production of natural killer (NK) or other immune blood cells to prevent or treat diseases;

- D. gives the immune system specific, coded information on how to respond to prevent or treat diseases;
- E. improves immune system function to prevent or treat diseases; or
- F. provides any other health benefit;

unless the representation is true and, at the time of making such representation, Defendant possesses and relies upon competent and reliable scientific evidence that substantiates the representation. *Provided, however*, that for any representation made by Defendant as an expert endorser, he must possess and rely upon competent and reliable scientific evidence and an actual exercise of his represented expertise, in the form of an examination or testing of the product at least as extensive as an expert in the field would normally conduct in order to support the conclusions presented in the representation.

II. PROHIBITION AGAINST MISREPRESENTING THE EXISTENCE OR RESULTS OF TESTS, STUDIES OR RESEARCH

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant, his agents, representatives, employees and all other persons or entities within the scope of Fed. R. Civ. P. 65, and all persons in active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice of this Consent Decree by personal service or otherwise, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale or distribution of AG Immune or any food, drug, or dietary supplement, in or affecting commerce, is hereby permanently enjoined from misrepresenting or assisting others in misrepresenting, in any manner, expressly or by implication, the existence, contents, validity, results, conclusions, or interpretations of any test, study or research.

III. FOOD AND DRUG ADMINISTRATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that nothing in this Consent Decree prohibits Defendant from:

A. Making any representation for any drug that is permitted in labeling for such drug under any tentative final or final standard promulgated by the

- Food and Drug Administration, or under any new drug application approved by the Food and Drug Administration; or
- B. Making any representation for any product that is specifically permitted in labeling for such product by regulations promulgated by the Food and Drug Administration pursuant to the Nutrition Labeling and Education Act of 1990.

IV. SUSPENDED MONETARY RELIEF AND RIGHT TO REOPEN

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that judgment is hereby entered against Defendant Jesse A. Stoff in the amount of THREE HUNDRED FIFTY-EIGHT THOUSAND DOLLARS (\$358,000); *provided, however*, that this judgment shall be suspended until further order of the Court, and *provided further* that this judgment shall be subject to the following conditions:

- A. Plaintiff's agreement to this Consent Decree is expressly premised on the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of Defendant's sworn financial statements and supporting documents submitted to the Commission, including: Defendant's Financial Statement dated September 20, 2004; Defendant's 2001 amended federal tax return and his 2002 and 2003 federal tax returns; and the letters from Barry J. Cutler, Esq., dated November 5, 2004 and November 18, 2004. Such financial statement and supporting documents contain material information upon which Plaintiff relied in negotiating and agreeing to this Consent Decree.
- B. If Plaintiff should have evidence that Defendant has failed to disclose any material asset, or materially misrepresented the value of any asset, or made any other material misrepresentation or omission in the financial statement or supporting documents described above, the Plaintiff may move that the Court reopen this Order for the sole purpose of allowing it to modify the monetary liability of Defendant. If the Court finds that Defendant failed to disclose any material asset, materially misrepresented the value of any

asset, or made any other material misrepresentation or omission in the above-referenced financial statement or supporting documents, the Court shall reinstate the suspended judgment against Defendant in favor of Plaintiff, in the amount of THREE HUNDRED FIFTY-EIGHT THOUSAND DOLLARS (\$358,000) in U.S. currency, which amount would be rendered immediately due and payable. Interest computed at the rate prescribed in 28 U.S.C. § 1961 shall immediately begin to accrue on the balance. For the purposes of this Part and any subsequent proceedings to enforce payment, Defendant waives any right to contest any of the allegations in the Complaint filed in this action. *Provided, however*, that in all other respects this Consent Decree remains in full force and effect unless otherwise ordered by the Court; and *provided further*, that proceedings instituted under this Paragraph are in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies that may be provided by law, including any other proceedings the Plaintiff may initiate to enforce this Order.

C. All funds paid pursuant to this Part shall be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including but not limited to, consumer redress and any attendant expenses for the administration of any redress fund. The Commission shall have full and sole discretion to administer any redress program implemented pursuant to this Consent Decree. In the event that the Commission determines, in its sole discretion, that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to Defendant's practices alleged in the Complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited into the Treasury as disgorgement. Defendant acknowledges and agrees that all money paid pursuant to this

Part is irrevocably paid to the Commission. Defendant shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice or administration of remedies under this Part. No portion of this judgment shall be deemed a fine, penalty or punitive assessment, or forfeiture.

V. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF CONSENT DECREE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant, within five (5) business days of receipt of this Consent Decree as entered by the Court, shall submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Consent Decree.

VI. DISTRIBUTION OF CONSENT DECREE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Consent Decree, Defendant shall deliver copies of the Consent Decree as directed below:

- A. For any business that Defendant controls, directly or indirectly, or in which Defendant has a majority ownership interest, Defendant must deliver a copy of this Consent Decree to all principals, officers, directors, and managers of that business. Defendant must also deliver copies of this Consent Decree to all employees, agents, and representatives of that business who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of this Consent Decree. For current personnel, delivery shall be within thirty (30) days of service of this Consent Decree upon Defendant. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming their responsibilities.
- B. For any business where Defendant is not a controlling person and he engages in the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale or distribution of any food, drug or dietary supplement, Defendant must deliver a copy of this Consent Decree to all principals and managers of such business before engaging in such conduct.

C. Defendant must secure a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the Consent Decree, within thirty (30) days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of the Consent Decree pursuant to this Part.

VII. RECORD KEEPING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that for a period of six (6) years from the date of entry of this Consent Decree, Defendant, if he is engaged in the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale or distribution of any food, drug, or dietary supplement, and any business where (1) Defendant is the majority owner of the business or directly or indirectly manages or controls the business, and (2) the business is engaged in the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale or distribution of any food, drug, or dietary supplement, their agents, employees, and representatives, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Consent Decree by personal service or otherwise, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, in connection with the dissemination of any representation covered by this Consent Decree, are hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the following records:

- A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
- B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
- C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, phone numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and description of items or services purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;

- D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly, indirectly or through any third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests;
- E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements, or other marketing materials;
- F. All materials that were relied upon to substantiate any representation made in the sales scripts, training materials, advertisements or other marketing materials;
- G. All tests, reports, studies, surveys, demonstrations, or other evidence in their possession or control that contradict, qualify, or call into question any representation made in the sales scripts, training materials, advertisements or other marketing materials; and
- H. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Consent Decree, including but not limited to, copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this Consent Decree, required by Part VI, and all reports submitted to the FTC pursuant to Parts VIII and IX.

VIII. COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY DEFENDANT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Consent Decree may be monitored:

- A. For a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Consent Decree, Defendant shall notify the Commission of the following:
 - (1) Any changes in residence, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers of Defendant, within thirty (30) days of the date of such change;
 - (2) Any changes in employment status (including self-employment) of Defendant, and any change in the ownership of the Defendant in any business entity, within thirty (30) days of the date of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of each business that the Defendant is affiliated with, employed by, creates or forms, or performs services for; a statement of the nature of the business, and a

- statement of Defendant's duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment; and
- (3) Any change in Defendant's name or use of any aliases or fictitious names.
- B. Defendant shall notify the Commission of any changes in corporate structure or any business entity that Defendant directly or indirectly controls, or has an ownership interest in, that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Consent Decree, including but not limited to a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action that would result in the emergence of a successor entity; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Consent Decree; the filing of a bankruptcy petition; or a change in the corporate name or address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, *provided* that, with respect to any proposed change in the corporation about which Defendant learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, Defendant shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.
- C. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Consent Decree, Defendant shall provide a written report to the FTC, sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which he has complied and is complying with this Consent Decree. This report shall include, but not be limited to:
 - (1) The then-current residence address, mailing address and telephone numbers of Defendant;
 - (2) The then-current employment and business address and telephone numbers of Defendant, a description of the business activities of each such employer or business, and the title and responsibilities of Defendant for each such employer or business;

- (3) A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this Consent Decree obtained pursuant to Part V.; and
- (4) Any other changes required to be reported under subparagraph A of this Part.
- D. For purposes of this Consent Decree, Defendant shall, unless otherwise directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, mail all written notifications to the Commission to:

Associate Director for Enforcement Bureau of Consumer Protection Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC, 20580

Re: United States v. Jesse A. Stoff, M.D., Civil Action No.

IX. COMPLIANCE MONITORING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating compliance with any provision of this Order,

- A. Within thirty (30) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, Defendant shall submit additional written reports, sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and/or provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in such defendant's possession or direct or indirect control to inspect the business operation;
- B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to monitor compliance with this Order by all other lawful means, including but not limited to the following:
 - (1) obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, and 45;
 - (2) posing as consumers and suppliers to Defendant's employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by Defendant, without the necessity of identification or prior notice; and

	1
	2
	3
	4
	5
	6
	7
	8
	9
1	0
1	1
1	2
1	3
1	4
1	5
1	6
1	7
1	8
1	9
2	0
2	1
2	2
2	3
2	4
2	5
2	6
2	7

Defendant shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any C. employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

Provided, however, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

X. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for the purposes of enabling any of the parties to this Consent Decree to apply to the Court at any time for such further orders or directives as may be necessary or appropriate for the interpretation or modification of this Consent Decree, for enforcement of compliance therewith, or for the punishment of violations thereof.

JUDGMENT IS THEREFORE ENTERED in favor of Plaintiff and against Defendant pursuant to all the terms and conditions recited above. This _____, 2005.

United States District Judge

The parties, by their respective counsel, hereby consent to the terms and conditions of the Consent Decree as set forth above and consent to the entry thereof.

28

T	FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA:
2	PETER D. KEISLER Assistant Attorney General
3	Civil Division
	U.S. Department of Justice
4	DEBRA W. YANG United States Attorney
5	,
6	GARY PLESSMAN
7	Assistant United States Attorney United States Attorney's Office
8	Room 7516, Federal Building 300 North Los Angeles Street
9	Los Angeles, California 90012
10	(213) 894-2474 (voice) (213) 894-2380 (facsimile)
11	EUGENE M. THIROLF Director
12	Office of Consumer Litigation
13	By: ELIZABETH STEIN
14	Trial Attorney Office of Consumer Litigation
15	U.S. Department of Justice P.O. Box 386
16	Washington, DC 20044
17	(202) 307-0486 (202) 514-8742
18	FOR THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION:
19	ELAINE D. KOLISH
20	Associate Director Division of Enforcement
21	
22	ROBERT M. FRISBY Assistant Director
23	Division of Enforcement
24	JOEL N. BREWER
25	Attorneys Division of Enforcement
26	Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
27	Washington, DC 20580
28	

1	
2	FOR THE DEFENDANT:
3	TOK THE DELENDARY.
4	
5	JESSE A. STOFF, M.D.
6	
7	BAKER AND HOSTETLER, LLP 1050 Connecticut Ave., N.W., Suite 1100 Washington, D.C. 20036-5304
8	Washington, D.C. 20036-5304
9	
10	By:
11	Barry J. Cutler Julia A. Oas
12	00210121 0005
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	