1	WILLIAM BLUMENTHAL General Counsel	
2	PETER B. MILLER KIAL S. YOUNG	
4	Federal Trade Commission	
5	600 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Room NJ-3212 Washington, DC 20580 (202) 326-2629 (Miller) (206) 220-6350 (Young) (202) 326-3259 (fax)	
6	(206) 220-6350 (Young) (202) 326-3259 (fax)	
7	JEFFREY A. KLURFELD Regional Director	
8	JOHN D. JACOBS	
9	CA Bar No. 134154 Federal Trade Commission	
10 11	10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700 Los Angeles, CA 90024 (310) 824-4360 (voice) (310) 824-4380 (fax)	
12	(310) 824-4380 (fax)	
13	ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF	
14	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA	
15		
16	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,	
17	Plaintiff,	CIVIL NUMBER
18	V.	CV-04-8190-DSF (JTLx)
19	WINDOW ROCK ENTERPRISES, INC., also d/b/a WINDOW ROCK HEALTH	STIPULATED FINAL AGREEMENT AND
20	LABORATORIES, also d/b/a	ORDER FOR PERMANENT
21	ADVERTISING, INC., STEPHEN F. CHENG, SHAWN M. TALBOTT, and	INJUNCTION AND SETTLEMENT OF
22	GREGORY S. CYNAUMON, PINNACLE MARKETING CONCEPTS,	CLAIMS FOR MONETARY RELIEF
23	INC., also d/b/a PMC HEALTH PRODUCTS, AND THOMAS F. CHENG	AS TO DEFENDANTS PINNACLE MARKETING
24	Defendants.	CONCEPTS, INC. AND THOMAS F. CHENG
25		
26		
27		
28	-1-	

1 | 2 | st | 3 | C | 4 | S | 5 | § 6 | ed | 7 | an | 8 | an | 9 | "(

The Federal Trade Commission ("Commission"), filed a complaint and subsequently amended it to name additional defendants Pinnacle Marketing Concepts, Inc. and Thomas F. Cheng (as amended, "Complaint"), pursuant to Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), to secure permanent injunctive relief, restitution, disgorgement, and other equitable relief against the Defendants for their alleged deceptive acts or practices and false advertisements in connection with the advertising, promotion, and sale of an alleged weight-loss product, "CortiSlim," and an alleged stress-relief product, "CortiStress," in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 52.

The Commission and Defendants Pinnacle Marketing Concepts, Inc., also d/b/a PMC Health Products ("Pinnacle"), and Thomas F. Cheng (Pinnacle and Thomas Cheng collectively, "Stipulating Defendants"), without the Stipulating Defendants admitting or denying liability for any of the conduct alleged in the Complaint, have stipulated to entry of the following agreement for permanent injunction and settlement of claims for monetary relief in settlement of the Commission's Complaint against the Stipulating Defendants.

The Court, having been presented with this Stipulated Final Agreement and Order for Permanent Injunction and Settlement of Claims for Monetary Relief ("Order"), finds as follows:

FINDINGS

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case, and jurisdiction over all parties. Venue in the Central District of California is proper.
- 2. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief can be granted, and the Commission has the authority to seek the relief which is stipulated to in this Order.

- 4. The Stipulating Defendants waive all rights to seek judicial review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order. The Stipulating Defendants also waive any claim that they may have held under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, concerning the prosecution of this action to the date of this Order.
- 5. The Stipulating Defendants have entered into this Order freely and without coercion.
- 6. The Commission and the Stipulating Defendants stipulate and agree to this Order, without trial or final adjudication of any issue of fact or law, to settle and resolve all matters in dispute between them arising from the Complaint up to the date of entry of this Order. By entering this stipulation, the Stipulating Defendants do not admit or deny any of the allegations set forth in the Complaint, other than jurisdictional facts.
- 7. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 65(d), the provisions of this Order are binding upon the Stipulating Defendants, and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with them, who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise.
- 8. Nothing in this Order obviates the obligation of the Stipulating Defendants to comply with Sections 5 and 12 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45 and 52.
- 9. This Order was drafted jointly by the Commission and the Stipulating Defendants and reflects the negotiated agreement of these parties.

- 10. The paragraphs of this Order shall be read as the necessary requirements for compliance and not as alternatives for compliance and no paragraph serves to modify another paragraph unless expressly so stated.
 - 11. Each party shall bear its own costs and attorneys' fees.
 - 12. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

For the purposes of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

- 1. Unless otherwise specified, "Stipulating Defendants" shall mean
 - a. Pinnacle Marketing Concepts, Inc., also d/b/a PMC Health Products (collectively, "Pinnacle"); and
 - b. Thomas F. Cheng, individually and as an officer of Pinnacle ("Thomas Cheng").
- 2. "Advertising" and "promotion" shall mean any written or verbal statement, illustration or depiction designed to effect a sale or create interest in the purchasing of goods, whether it appears in a brochure, newspaper, magazine, pamphlet, leaflet, circular, mailer, book insert, free standing insert, letter, catalogue, poster, chart, billboard, public transit card, point of purchase display, packaging, package insert, label, film, slide, radio, television or cable television, audio program transmitted over a telephone system, program-length commercial ("infomercial"), the Internet, email, press release, video news release, or in any other medium.
- 3. "Assisting others" shall mean knowingly providing any of the following services to any person or entity engaged in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order, including the sale or marketing of a Target Product or a Covered Product: (a) serving as an owner, partner, officer, director or manager of

- (b) formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of any Covered Product, advertising for any Covered Product, or marketing for any Covered Product, but excluding conduct in compliance with the Telemarketing Sales Rule (16 C.F.R. Part 310), telephone calls exempted from the Telemarketing Sales Rule under 16 C.F.R. 310.6(b)(4) and (5), or the purchase of media time, as long as the excluded conduct is not performed for or on behalf of any Related Party.
- 4. "Commerce" shall mean as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- "Competent and reliable scientific evidence" shall mean tests, 5. analyses, research, studies, or other evidence based on the expertise of professionals in the relevant area, that has been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by persons qualified to do so, using procedures generally accepted in the professions to yield accurate and reliable results.
- 6. "CortiSlim" shall mean the dietary supplement CortiSlim and any other product marketed by or on behalf of a Related Party that
 - contains one or more of the following ingredients present in a. current or previous formulations of CortiSlim: magnolia bark extract, beta-sitosterol, theanine, green tea leaf extract, bitter orange peel extract, Panax ginseng, banaba leaf extract, chromium, or vanadium; and
 - b. is marketed with claims that it has a weight effect or reduces or manages stress.
- "CortiSlim Study" shall mean the study conducted by Defendant 7. Talbott and others as reported, at least in part, under the title "Effect of a

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

Stress/Cortisol-Control Dietary Supplement on Weight Loss," by Shawn Talbott, Ann-Marie Christopulos, and Jill Whelan, as well as all underlying data for such study.

- 8. "CortiStress" shall mean the dietary supplement CortiStress and any other product marketed by or on behalf of a Related Party that
 - a. contains one or more of the following ingredients present in current or previous formulations of CortiStress: magnolia bark extract, beta-sitosterol, or theanine; and
 - b. is marketed with claims that it has a weight effect, or reduces or manages stress, or prevents or treats any disease.
- 9. "Covered Product" shall mean any dietary supplement, food, drug, cosmetic, or device.
 - 10. "Endorsement" shall mean as defined in 16 C.F.R. § 255.0(b).
- 11. "Food," "drug," "cosmetic," and "device" shall mean as defined in Section 15 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 55.
 - 12. "Commission" shall mean the Federal Trade Commission.
- 13. "Related Party" shall mean one or more of Window Rock Enterprises, Inc., also d/b/a Window Rock Health Laboratories, also d/b/a Cortislim, Infinity Advertising, Inc., Stephen F. Cheng, Shawn M. Talbott, and Gregory S. Cynaumon, whether acting directly or through any corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, trade name, or other entity, and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons and entities in active concert or participation
 - 14. "Target Product" shall mean CortiSlim and CortiStress.
- 15. "Weight effect" shall mean any weight-related effect attributed to a food, drug, dietary supplement, product, device, or program and includes, but is

with them.

not limited to, preventing weight gain or producing weight loss, reducing or eliminating fat, slimming, changing body composition, or causing a caloric deficit in a user of such food, drug, dietary supplement, product, device, or program.

16. A requirement that any defendant "notify," "furnish," "provide," or "submit" to the Commission shall mean that the defendant shall send the necessary information via **overnight courier**, costs prepaid, to:

Associate Director for Advertising Practices Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20580 Attn: FTC v. Window Rock Enterprises, Inc., et al., (C.D. Cal.), Civ. No. 04-8190-DSF (JTLx).

- 17. The terms "and" and "or" in this Order shall be construed conjunctively or disjunctively as necessary, to make the applicable sentence or phrase inclusive rather than exclusive.
- 18. The term "including" in this Order shall mean "including without limitation."

IT IS STIPULATED, AGREED, AND ORDERED:

I.

PROHIBITED REPRESENTATIONS REGARDING ANY TARGET PRODUCT

A. That the Stipulating Defendants, directly or through any corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, trade name, or other entity, and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons and entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service, facsimile, or otherwise, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any Target

Product, in or affecting commerce, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from making, or assisting others in making, directly or by implication, including through the use of endorsements or product names, any representation that any Target Product:

- 1. Reduces the risk of or prevents serious health conditions, including osteoporosis, obesity, diabetes, Alzheimer's disease, cancer, and cardiovascular disease;
- 2. Causes weight loss of 10 to 50 pounds or more for virtually all users;
- 3. Causes users to lose as much as 4 to 10 pounds per week over multiple weeks;
- 4. Causes users to lose weight specifically from the abdomen, stomach, and thighs;
- 5. Causes rapid and substantial weight loss;
- 6. Causes long-term or permanent weight loss;
- 7. Causes weight loss without the need for diet or exercise; or
- 8. Has been demonstrated effective, is supported by, or is otherwise the product of over 15 years of scientific research.
- B. That the Stipulating Defendants, directly or through any corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, trade name, or other entity, and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons and entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service, facsimile, or otherwise, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any Target Product, in or affecting commerce, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from making, or from assisting others in making, directly or by implication,

including through the use of endorsements or product names, any other representation about the performance or efficacy of any Target Product unless the representation is true and non-misleading, and, at the time it is made, the Stipulating Defendants possess and rely upon competent and reliable scientific evidence that substantiates the representation.

PROHIBITED REPRESENTATIONS REGARDING ANY COVERED PRODUCT

II.

That the Stipulating Defendants, directly or through any corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, trade name, or other entity, and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons and entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service, facsimile, or otherwise, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any Covered Product, in or affecting commerce, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from making, or assisting others in making, directly or by implication, including through the use of endorsements or product names, any representation about the weight effect, other health benefits, performance, or efficacy of any Covered Product unless the representation is true and non-misleading, and, at the time it is made, the Stipulating Defendants possess and rely upon competent and reliable scientific evidence that substantiates the representation.

23

24

25

26

27

III.

PROHIBITED REPRESENTATIONS REGARDING TESTS AND STUDIES

That the Stipulating Defendants, directly or through any corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, trade name, or other entity, and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons and entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service, facsimile, or otherwise, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any Covered Product, in or affecting commerce, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from making or assisting others in making, directly or by implication, including through the use of endorsements or product names, any misrepresentation about the existence, contents, validity, results, conclusions, or interpretations of any test or study including, but not limited to, the CortiSlim Study.

IV.

FORMATTING AND DISCLOSURES FOR BROADCAST MEDIA

That the Stipulating Defendants, directly or through any corporation, partnership, subsidiary, division, trade name, or other entity, and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons and entities in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service, facsimile, or otherwise, in connection with the labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any product, program, or service, in or affecting commerce, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from creating or producing or assisting others in creating or producing:

A. Any advertisement that misrepresents, expressly or by implication, that it is not a paid advertisement;

B. Any television commercial or other video advertisement fifteen (15) minutes in length or longer or intended to fill a broadcasting or cablecasting time slot of fifteen (15) minutes in length or longer that does not display visually in the same language as the predominant language that is used in the advertisement, in a clear and prominent manner, and for a length of time sufficient for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it, within the first thirty (30) seconds of the commercial and either immediately before each presentation of ordering instructions for the product, program, or service or periodically through the program, but no more than approximately seven (7) minutes apart, the following disclosure:

"YOU ARE WATCHING A PAID ADVERTISEMENT FOR [THE PRODUCT, PROGRAM, OR SERVICE]."

Provided that, for the purposes of this provision, the oral or visual presentation of a telephone number or address through which viewers may obtain more information or place an order for the product, program, or service shall be deemed a presentation of ordering instructions so as to require the display of the disclosure provided herein; and

C. Any radio commercial or other radio advertisement five (5) minutes in length or longer or intended to fill a time slot of five (5) minutes in length or longer that does not state in the same language as the predominant language that is used in the advertisement, in a clear and prominent manner, and in a volume and cadence sufficient for an ordinary consumer to hear and comprehend it, within the first thirty (30) seconds of the commercial and immediately before each presentation of ordering instructions for the product, program, or service, the following disclosure:

"YOU ARE LISTENING TO A PAID ADVERTISEMENT FOR
[THE PRODUCT, PROGRAM, OR SERVICE]."

Provided that, for the purposes of this provision, the presentation of a telephone number or address through which listeners may obtain more information or place an order for the product, program, or service shall be deemed a presentation of ordering instructions so as to require the stating of the disclosure provided herein.

12

17

20

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

FDA-APPROVED CLAIMS

V.

That nothing in this Order shall prohibit the Stipulating Defendants from making any representation:

- For any product that is specifically permitted in labeling for such Α. product by regulations promulgated by the Food and Drug Administration pursuant to the Nutrition Labeling and Education Act of 1990; or
- For any drug that is permitted in labeling for such drug under any В. tentative final or final standard promulgated by the Food and Drug Administration, or under any new drug application approved by the Food and Drug Administration.
- For any medical device that is permitted in labeling of such medical device under any medical device-specific regulation promulgated by the Food and Drug Administration, under any Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act Section 510(k) premarket notification substantial equivalence determination by the Food and Drug Administration, or under any premarket approval application approved by the Food and Drug Administration.

1

3

4 5

6 7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

24

25

26 27

28

MONETARY JUDGMENT AND CONSUMER REDRESS

- That judgment for equitable monetary relief is hereby entered against the Stipulating Defendants, jointly and severally, in the amount of \$3,400,000. The judgment for equitable monetary relief shall be deemed to be satisfied if all of the following occur:
- Transfer to the Federal Trade Commission by wire transfer not 1. later than five (5) days after the date of entry of this Order and in accordance with directions provided by the Commission, the amount of \$700,000, which was placed in escrow by the Stipulating Defendants on or before the day this agreement was forwarded by the Bureau to the Commission for its review;
- 2. Transfer of title, unencumbered and free of any liens, and delivery to the Federal Trade Commission within ten (10) days after the date of entry of this Order and in accordance with directions provided by the Commission, (1) a 2004 Pursuit boat model 3350 purchased by Stipulating Defendants on August 6, 2004, for the amount of \$215,000, and (2) a 2004 Ford truck model F-150 purchased by Stipulating Defendants on August 2, 2004 for the amount of \$40,000;
- 3. Transfer to the Federal Trade Commission within one hundred and eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order, net contribution(s) made by Stipulating Defendants to an investment partnership and related charitable foundations established by or on behalf of one or more of the Stipulating Defendants. The contributions, all of which were made from assets derived from the marketing or sale of CortiSlim and CortiStress, are described more fully in the signed document entitled "Investment Partnerships, Charitable Foundations, Insurance Policies and Loans Involving Thomas Cheng" which has been provided

separately to the Commission, which is incorporated into this Part and made a part of this Order by reference, and which shall be deemed to be confidential and shall be disclosed only as necessary for enforcement purposes. Net contribution(s) shall mean all proceeds from all such contribution(s) that remain after payment of federal and state taxes, federal and state penalties, and other costs (excluding professional fees) directly associated with revoking the contributions, unwinding the business transactions, dissolving the entities, or taking other similar steps necessary to recover the contributions; and

- 4. Assignment to the Federal Trade Commission within twenty (20) days of entry of this Order of a secured lien in the amount of \$450,000 against real property which is unencumbered and free of liens and is described in the signed document set forth in paragraph A.3 of this Part. The lien, which secures assets not in the possession of the Stipulating Defendants that were derived from the marketing or sale of CortiSlim and CortiStress, shall be due and payable upon sale of the residence; transfer of the residence by gift, inheritance, or other means; refinancing; or change from an owner-occupied primary residence to a non-owner-occupied or non-primary residence.
- B. That each Stipulating Defendant hereby assigns to the Federal Trade Commission, without any encumbrances, all rights and claims to money or other assets owed to it as of the date of entry of this Order by a Related Party, and of the right to pursue any chose in action to recover any such money or assets owed to it by a Related Party, under the terms of any agreement, oral or written, including but not limited to the Joint Venture Agreement entered into on June 10, 2003 by and between Defendants Talbott and Window Rock, the Joint Venture Agreement entered into on June 21, 2003 by and between Defendants Window Rock and

Cynaumon, and the purported non-written agreement by and between Defendant Window Rock and Stipulating Defendant Pinnacle.

- C. That, if a Related Party later assigns to the Federal Trade Commission rights of recovery and claims to money or other assets purportedly owed as of the date of entry of this Order by Stipulating Defendants Pinnacle and Thomas Cheng, the Commission shall not exercise any such rights and claims in a manner that would allow it to recover additional funds from Stipulating Defendants Pinnacle and Thomas Cheng; *provided, however*, that this paragraph shall cease to apply upon occurrence of any of the events described under Part VII.
- That all funds paid pursuant to this Order shall be deposited into an D. account administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including but not limited to consumer redress for nationwide sales of CortiSlim and CortiStress from the time those products were first advertised up to and including September 30, 2004, and any attendant expenses for the administration of such equitable relief. In the event that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to the Stipulating Defendants' practices alleged in the Complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited to the United States Treasury as disgorgement. Stipulating Defendants shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies under this Part. Stipulating Defendants shall have no right to contest the manner of distribution chosen by the Commission. No portion of any payments under the judgment herein shall be deemed a payment of any fine, penalty, or punitive assessment;

26

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

27

- E. That Stipulating Defendants relinquish all dominion, control and title to the funds paid into the account established pursuant to this Order, and all legal and equitable title to the funds shall vest in the Treasurer of the United States unless and until such funds are disbursed to consumers. Stipulating Defendants shall make no claim to or demand for the return of the funds, directly or indirectly, through counsel or otherwise; and in the event of bankruptcy of any Stipulating Defendant, Stipulating Defendants acknowledge that the funds are not part of the debtor's estate, nor does the estate have any claim or interest therein;
- F. That each Stipulating Defendant shall provide to the Commission a sworn statement setting forth i) the amount of 2003 and 2004 state and federal taxes, if any, paid by each Stipulating Defendant on or before the day this agreement was signed; ii) the amount of 2005 estimated state and federal tax payments, if any, paid by each Stipulating Defendant on or before the day this agreement was signed; and iii) a statement of the date(s) on which each tax payment to a state or federal tax authority was made. All 2003 or 2004 tax payments reported to the Commission as being owed to a state or federal tax authority must be paid in full no later than sixty (60) days from the date of entry of this Order. The financial information and documents referenced in this paragraph F shall be designated as confidential.

VII.

RIGHT TO REOPEN

- A. That, by agreeing to this Order, the Stipulating Defendants reaffirm and attest to the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of the financial information that Stipulating Defendants have previously submitted to the Commission. The Commission's agreement to this Order is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of the Stipulating Defendants' financial statements and supporting documents submitted to the Commission, namely:
 - 1. For Stipulating Defendant Pinnacle Marketing Concepts, Inc.:
 - a. Federal Trade Commission Financial Statement of Corporate Defendants
 - b. Financial Statements, September 30, 2004 and December 31, 2003
 - c. Statement of Operations, unaudited, January 1, 2005 to April 30, 2005;
 - d. Statement of Operations, unaudited, September 2004 through December 2004;
 - e. Summary of Bank Balances as of October 8, 2004;
 - f. Current Balances as of March 31, 2005;
 - g. Current Balances as of May 25, 2005;
 - h. Cash Flow Analysis; and
 - 2. For Stipulating Defendant Thomas F. Cheng:
 - a. Federal Trade Commission Financial Statement of Individual Defendant dated April 25, 2005, with

	1
	2
	3
	4
	5
	6
	7
	8
	9
1	0
1	1
1	2
1	3
1	4
1	5
1	6
1	7
1	8
1	9
2	0
2	1
2	2
2	3
2	4
2	5
2	6
2	7
2	8

accompanying United States and California income tax returns and applications for extension of time to file;

- b. Summary of Bank Balances, Investment Accounts, and Personal Accounts as of October 8, 2004;
- c. Summary of Bank Activity, September 2004 through January 2005;
- d. Addendum to Item 12 of Federal Trade Commission
 Financial Statement of Individual Defendant dated April
 25, 2005, updated through May 25, 2005;
- e. Letter dated June 17, 2005 from Kleinfeld, Kaplan and Becker LLC to Federal Trade Commission

If, upon motion by the Commission, this Court finds that any Stipulating Defendant failed to disclose any material asset, or materially misrepresented the value of any asset, or made any other material misrepresentation in or omission from the Financial Statements or other supporting documents listed in this Part, the Court shall enter judgment against the Stipulating Defendants and for the Commission in the amount of \$23,837,000, less any amount already paid by or on behalf of the Stipulating Defendants to the Commission; *provided, however*, that in all other respects this Order shall remain in full force and effect unless otherwise ordered by the Court; and *provided further*, that proceedings instituted under this Part would be in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies as may be provided by law, including any other proceedings that the Commission may initiate to enforce this Order. Solely for purposes of this Part, the Stipulating Defendants waive any right to contest any of the allegations in the Commission's Complaint. Except for the amount of the judgment, the

financial information and documents referenced in this Part shall be designated as confidential.

B. That, in agreeing to this Order, the Commission has specifically relied on the representations that each Stipulating Defendant has made regarding the amount of federal and state taxes it has paid or will pay for tax years 2003 and 2004 and the amount of estimated federal and state taxes, if any, that it has paid toward estimated taxes for tax year 2005, including but not limited to representations in the sworn statements referenced in Part VI, paragraph F, above, and in the documents listed in paragraph A of this Part. It shall be a violation of this Part for a Stipulating Defendant to file any federal or state tax return seeking a cash refund of some or all of the amounts previously reported to the Commission as taxes owed and paid for tax years 2003 and 2004, or a cash refund of some or all of the amounts paid toward estimated taxes for tax year 2005. *Provided however*, that seeking such a cash refund shall not be deemed to be a violation of this Part if the Stipulating Defendant promptly remits to the Commission the full amount of any such cash refund within ten (10) days of receipt of the refund.

VIII.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER BY THE STIPULATING DEFENDANTS

That, within five (5) business days after receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, Stipulating Defendant Thomas Cheng, individually and on behalf of Pinnacle, shall submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Order, using the form shown at Attachment A.

DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY THE STIPULATING DEFENDANTS

That, for a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order, the Stipulating Defendants shall deliver copies of the Order as directed below:

- A. Stipulating Defendant Pinnacle must deliver a copy of this Order to all of its principals, officers, directors, and managers and also to all of its supervisory employees, agents, and representatives who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order. For current personnel, delivery shall be within ten (10) business days of entry of this Order. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to their assuming their position or responsibilities;
- B. Stipulating Defendant Thomas Cheng as Control Person: For each business that is not already subject to paragraph A of this Part and that is controlled, directly or indirectly, by Stipulating Defendant Thomas Cheng, and for each business that is not already subject to paragraph A of this Part in which Stipulating Defendant Thomas Cheng has a majority ownership interest, he must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals, officers, directors, and managers of each such business and also to all supervisory employees, agents, and representatives of each such business who engage in conduct related to the marketing of Target or Covered Products. For current personnel, delivery shall be within ten (10) business days of entry of this Order upon Defendant. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to their assuming their position or responsibilities;
- C. Stipulating Defendant Thomas Cheng not as Control Person: For each business that is not already subject to paragraphs A or B of this Part and that is not controlled, directly or indirectly, by Thomas Cheng, he must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals and managers of each such business before engaging in conduct related to the marketing of Target or Covered Products.

7

10 11

12 13

14 15

16 17

18 19

20

21

22 23

24

25

26

27

28

- Provided however, that Stipulating Defendant Thomas Cheng 1. must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals and managers of each such business subject to this paragraph C before engaging in any conduct relating directly or indirectly to any Related Party.
- 2. *Provided further*, that this paragraph C shall not apply if the conduct engaged in by Stipulating Defendant Thomas Cheng consists solely of conduct in compliance with the Telemarketing Sales Rule (16 C.F.R. Part 310), telephone calls exempted from the Telemarketing Sales Rule under 16 C.F.R. 310.6(b)(4) and (5), or the purchase of media time for a Covered Product (other than a Target Product), as long as that conduct is not performed for or on behalf of any Related Party and as long as that conduct does not include assisting others in marketing or advertising a Covered Product.
- Each Stipulating Defendant shall create, maintain, and update as D. necessary a declaration identifying the dates, names, titles, addresses, and telephone numbers of the persons and entities that the Stipulating Defendant has provided with a copy of this Order as required by this Part; and
- E. Each Stipulating Defendant shall maintain, for a period of three (3) years, and upon reasonable notice make available to the Commission, a signed declaration regarding distribution of copies of this Order as required by this Part.

X.

NOTICE REGARDING MEDIA PLACEMENT

That Stipulating Defendants shall:

Send, as soon as practicable but in no event later than thirty (30) days Α. after entry of this Order, by first-class mail, postage prepaid and return receipt requested, an exact copy of the notice attached hereto as Attachment B, showing the date of mailing, to each media placement company, broadcasting company,

and other entity or individual that the Stipulating Defendants used to place television, radio, print, or on-line advertisements, for any Target Product between September 30, 2004, and the date of entry of this Order. This mailing shall not include any other document or enclosures;

- B. Notify, immediately, each media placement company, broadcasting company, or other entity or individual that the Stipulating Defendants used to place television, radio, print, or on-line advertisements for any Target Product that the Stipulating Defendants will stop doing business with that media placement company, broadcasting company, or other entity or individual in connection with any Target Product in the event that the Stipulating Defendants become aware that the media placement company, broadcasting company, or other entity or individual is using or disseminating any advertisement or promotional material that contains any representation prohibited by this Order subsequent to receipt of the notice required by paragraph A of this Part, if that media placement company, broadcasting company, or other entity or individual fails to take prompt corrective action, if it continues to use any advertisement or promotional material that contains any representation prohibited by this Order, or if it engages in conduct prohibited by this Part on more than two separate occasions; and
- C. Terminate all placements for any Target Product with any media placement company, broadcasting company, or other entity or individual that the Stipulating Defendants used to place television, radio print, or on-line advertisements for any Target Product within ten (10) days after the Stipulating Defendants become aware that the media placement company, broadcasting company, or other entity or individual has failed to take prompt corrective action, has continued to use any advertisement or promotional material that contains any representation prohibited by this Order, or has engaged in conduct prohibited by this Part on two separate occasions.

XI.

COMPLIANCE MONITORING

That, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating compliance with any provision of this Order:

- A. Within thirty (30) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, each Stipulating Defendant so notified shall submit additional written reports, sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and/or provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in any Stipulating Defendants' possession or direct or indirect control to inspect the business operation. Copies of any such notice shall also be provided by the Commission to the undersigned counsel representing the Stipulating Defendants or to any other counsel whose identity has been furnished to the Commission;
- B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to monitor the Stipulating Defendants' compliance with this Order by all other lawful means, including but not limited to the following:
 - 1. obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, and 45; and
 - 2. posing as consumers, marketers, suppliers, or other product-related entities to the Stipulating Defendants, the Stipulating Defendants' employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by any defendant, without the necessity of identification or prior notice; and
- C. The Stipulating Defendants, upon fourteen (14) days notice, shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any officer, director, employee, employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, or agent

of any entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by a Stipulating Defendant who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

Provided, however, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

11

13

17

18

22

23

26

27

28

XII.

COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY THE STIPULATING DEFENDANTS

That, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

- Stipulating Defendant Thomas Cheng, within ten (10) business days Α. of service of this Order, shall notify the Commission, in writing, with the following information:
 - his residence address and mailing address; 1.
 - his home telephone number; 2.
 - the name, address, and telephone number of his employer(s); 3.
 - 4. if applicable, the names of his supervisor(s);
 - a description of each employer's activities; and 5.
 - a description of his duties and responsibilities for each 6. employer;
- B. For a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order,
 - Stipulating Defendant Thomas Cheng shall notify the 1. Commission of the following:

- (a) Any changes in his residence, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers, within ten (10) days of the date of such change;
- (b) Any changes in his employment status (including self-employment), any change in his ownership in any business entity, and any change in the corporate structure of any business entity in which he has an ownership interest in that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, within ten (10) days of the date of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of each business that he is affiliated with, employed by, creates or forms, or performs services for; a statement of the nature of the business; and a statement of his duties and responsibilities in connection with the business; and
- (c) Any changes in his name or use of any aliases or fictitious names; and
- 2. Stipulating Defendant Pinnacle shall notify the Commission of any changes in its corporate structure or in any business entity that it directly or indirectly control(s), or has an ownership interest in, that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including but not limited to a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action that would result in the emergence of a successor entity; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; the filing of a bankruptcy petition; or a change in the corporate name or address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, *provided that*, with

respect to any proposed change in the corporation about which a Defendant learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, that Defendant shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge;.

- C. Ninety (90) days after the date of entry of this Order, the Stipulating Defendants each shall provide a written report to the Commission, sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which they have complied and are complying with this Order. This report shall include, but not be limited to any changes required to be reported pursuant to paragraph (B) of this Part; a copy of the signed declaration regarding distribution of copies of this Order as required by Part IX.E; and, for any Covered Product, a copy of all advertising and promotional materials in use at any point from the date of entry of the Order until submission of the written report required by this paragraph;
- D. Each Stipulating Defendant shall provide to the Commission, no more than 10 days after submitting it to a state or federal tax authority, a complete copy of any submission seeking a cash refund of some or all of the taxes it reported under Part VI as owed in tax years 2003 and 2004 or as paid toward estimated 2005 tax;
- E. For purposes of the compliance reporting and monitoring required by this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with the Stipulating Defendants, with contemporaneous notice to undersigned counsel or to any other counsel whose identity has been furnished to the Commission; and
- F. The information and documents referenced in paragraphs A, B, and D of this Part shall be designated as confidential information.

XIII.

RECORD-KEEPING PROVISIONS

That, for a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, the Stipulating Defendants, and their agents, employees, officers, corporations, successors, and assigns, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, if engaging or assisting others engaged in the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, distribution or sale of any Covered Product, in or affecting commerce, and any business where (1) Stipulating Defendant Thomas Cheng is a majority owner or an officer or director of the business, or directly or indirectly manages or controls the business and where (2) the business is engaged, participating, or assisting in any manner whatsoever, directly or indirectly, in the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, distribution or sale of any Covered Product, in or affecting commerce, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the following records:

- A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
- B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any supervisory capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
- C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, telephone numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items purchased, and description of items purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;

- D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly, indirectly or through any third party), and any response to those complaints or requests;
- E. Copies of all advertisements, promotional materials, sales scripts, training materials, or other marketing materials utilized in the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, distribution or sale of any Covered Product, to the extent such information is prepared in the ordinary course of business;
- F. All documents evidencing or referring to the accuracy of any claim or representation contained in the materials identified in Paragraph E of this Part, or to the efficacy of any Covered Product, including, but not limited to, all tests, reports, studies, and demonstrations, as well as all evidence that confirms, contradicts, qualifies, was relied upon in making, or calls into question the accuracy of such claims;
- G. Records accurately reflecting the name, address, and telephone number of each manufacturer or laboratory engaged in the development or creation of any testing obtained for the purpose of advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, distributing, or selling any Covered Product; and
- H. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including but not limited to copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this Order, required by Part VIII, and all reports submitted to the Commission pursuant to Part X.

XIV.

COOPERATION WITH COMMISSION COUNSEL

That the Stipulating Defendants must, in connection with the unwinding of the charitable foundation and its related limited partnership described in Section VI.A.3, and in cooperation with the Commission: request the voluntary

unwinding of these entities and request the trustees, agents, or representatives of these entities to cooperate in this voluntary unwinding; initiate communications for the purposes of unwinding these entities with State or Federal authorities; cooperate in good faith with the Commission's reasonable requests for documents and writings and testimony in connection with the unwinding of these entities; and, if necessary, appear in person or through their representatives at such places and times or execute such documents as the Commission shall reasonably request after written notice to the Stipulating Defendants and their counsel of record.

XV.

NOTICE OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS TO THIRD PARTIES HOLDING ASSETS

That within five (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, defendants shall serve a copy of this Order on all entities, including financial institutions, charitable foundations, investment partnerships, and individuals, that hold or have assets derived from the marketing or sale of Cortislim and Cortistress and gifted by any of the Stipulating Defendants.

XVI.

TURNOVER OF ASSETS

That, in order to partially satisfy the monetary judgment set forth in paragraphs A.3 and A.4 of Part VI, above, any law firm, financial or brokerage institution, escrow agent, title company, commodity trading company, general or limited partner of any investment partnership, director of any charitable foundation, business entity, or person, whether located within the United States or outside the United States, that holds, controls, or maintains accounts or assets derived from the marketing or sale of Cortislim and Cortistress and gifted by any of the Stipulating Defendants to a charitable foundation or investment partnership,

shall turn over such account or asset to the Commission within one hundred and eighty days (180) days of receiving notice of this Order by any means, including but not limited to via facsimile;

XVII.

RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

That this Court shall retain jurisdiction over the Stipulating Defendants for

1	purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order and for		
2	issues relating to the Complaint and to non-settling Defendants.		
3			
4	IT IS SO ORDERED, this	day of, 2005.	
5			
6		UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE	
7	SO STIPULATED:	UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE	
8	SO STIPULATED:		
9	WILLIAM BLUMENTHAL		
10	General Counsel		
11		PINNACLE MARKETING CONCEPTS, INC.	
12	PETER B. MILLER KIAL YOUNG	By: Thomas F. Cheng, President	
13	Federal Trade Commission		
14	600 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Room NJ-3212 Washington, DC, 20580	THOMAS F. CHENG	
15	Washington, DC 20580 (202) 326 -2629 (Miller) (206) 220-6350 (Young) (202) 326-3259 (fax)	Individually, and as an officer of Pinnacle Marketing Concepts, Inc.	
16	(200) 326-3259 (fax)	r illiacie Warkeung Concepts, inc.	
17	JEFFREY A. KLURFELD Regional Director		
18	JOHN D. JACOBS	ANTHONY L. YOUNG ANNE V. MAHER	
19	CA Bar No. 134154 Federal Trade Commission	Kleinfeld, Kaplan and Becker, LLP 1140 Nineteenth St. N.W., Suite 900	
20	10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700 Los Angeles, CA 90024	Washington, DC 20036	
21	(310) 824-4360 (voice) (310) 824-4380 (fax)	GLENN E. DAVIS CA Bar NO. 59274	
22	(310) 824-4380 (lax)	Kleinfeld, Kaplan and Becker, LLP 550 North Catalina Avenue, No. 17	
23	ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF	Pasadena, CA 91106	
24		ATTORNEYS FOR	
25		STIPULATING DEFENDANTS	
26			
27	September, 2005		
28			