SEMIANNUAL FEDERAL COURT LITIGATION STATUS REPORT

Office of the General Counsel Bureau of Competition Bureau of Consumer Protection Regional Offices

December 31, 2018

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SUMMARY OF CASES	.ii
PETITIONS FOR REVIEW	. 1
A) Orders to Cease and Desist	. 1
B) Rulemakings	. 2
INJUNCTION AND CONSUMER REDRESS CASES	. 2
A) Preliminary Injunctions (Mergers/Acquisitions)	. 2
B) Preliminary Injunctions (Other)	. 4
C) Permanent Injunctions/Consumer Redress	.4
CIVIL PENALTY AND ENFORCEMENT CASES	57
A) Consumer Protection	57
B) Competition	71
SUBPOENA AND CID ENFORCEMENT PROCEEDINGS	71
SUITS TO ENJOIN FTC ACTION AND OTHER DEFENSIVE LITIGATION	73
AMICUS CURIAE BRIEFS	77

SUMMARY OF CASES

	Dist. Ct.	Ct. App.*	S.Ct.	Total
PETITIONS FOR REVIEW	0	3	0	3
INJUNCTION AND CONSUMER REDRESS CASES	65	14	0	79
CIVIL PENALTY AND ENFORCEMENT CASES	6	1	0	7
SUBPOENA AND CID ENFORCEMENTS	5	0	0	5
SUITS TO ENJOIN FTC ACTION AND OTHER DEFENSIVE LITIGATION	7	2	0	9
AMICUS CURIAE BRIEFS	1	2	1	5 [†]
TOTALS	82	22	1	108

^{*} Includes all cases in which appellate proceedings have taken place during the reporting period or are pending; these cases are not counted in the District Court column, even if such proceedings are going on simultaneously.

[†] The total number of litigations in which the Commission filed an amicus brief includes one state court case (*In re Paplauskas, Jr., see* p. 78 herein).

PETITIONS FOR REVIEW

(A) Orders to Cease and Desist

1-800 CONTACTS v. FTC, No. 18-3848 (2d Cir.)

Parties: 1-800 Contacts, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Imad Dean Abyad (OGC)

Nature of Action: Petition for review of final Commission order.

Status: Petition for review filed 12/28/18.

LABMD, *INC. v. FTC*, No. 16-16270 (11th Cir.)

Parties: LabMD, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Jack Metzler (OGC)

Matthew Hoffman

Joel Marcus

Nature of Action: Petition for review of final Commission order.

Status: Petition for review filed 9/29/16.

Order granting stay entered 11/10/16. Petitioner's opening brief filed 12/27/16.

Commission's brief filed 2/9/17. Petitioner's reply brief filed 3/9/17.

Oral argument heard 6/21/17.

Opinion in favor of petitioner, vacating Commission's order, entered

6/6/18.

Petitioner's application for attorneys' fees filed 10/4/18; FTC's opposition

filed 11/19/18.

LOUISIANA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD v. FTC, No. 18-60291 (5th Cir.)

Parties: Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board

Assigned Attorneys: Mark Hegedus (OGC)

Michele Arington

Joel Marcus

Alleged Conduct: Petition for review of Commission's order denying LREAB's motion to

dismiss administrative complaint and granting Complaint Counsel's

motion for partial summary decision.

Status: Petition for review filed 4/19/18.

Petitioner's motion to stay administrative proceedings pending appeal filed 6/11/18; Commission's response in opposition filed 6/21/18;

Petitioner's reply filed 6/28/18; order granting motion to stay

entered 7/17/18.

Petitioner's opening brief filed 7/5/18; Commission's brief filed 8/6/18;

reply brief filed 8/20/18. Oral argument set for 2/7/19.

(B) Rulemakings

(None Pending)

INJUNCTION AND CONSUMER REDRESS CASES

(A) Preliminary Injunctions (Mergers/Acquisitions)

FTC v. SANFORD HEALTH, No. 17-3783 (8th Cir.); No. 1:17-cv-133 (D.N. Dak.)

Parties: Sanford Health

Sanford Bismarck

Mid Dakota Clinic, P.C.

State of North Dakota (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Kevin Hahm (BC/Mergers IV)

Michele Arington (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Action for preliminary injunction of Sanford Health's proposed

acquisition of Mid Dakota Clinic as a violation of Section 5 of the FTC

Act and Section 7 of the Clayton Act.

Status: Complaint filed 6/22/17.

TRO entered 6/22/17.

Evidentiary hearing held 10/30/17-11/3/17.

Order granting preliminary injunction entered 12/13/17.

Notice of appeal filed 12/15/17.

Appellants' opening brief filed 1/29/18; Commission's answering brief

filed 3/5/18; appellants' reply brief filed 3/22/18.

Oral argument held 11/13/18.

FTC v. TRONOX LTD., No. 1:18-cv-1622 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Tronox Ltd.

National Industrialization Co. National Titanium Dioxide Co. Ltd.

Cristal USA Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Dominic Vote (BC/Mergers II)

Cem Akleman Jon J. Nathan Joonsuk Lee Meredith Levert Rohan Pai Z. Lily Rudy

Charles Loughlin (BC/Dir. Office)

Alleged Conduct: Action to preliminary enjoin the consummation of Titanium's acquisition

of Cristal's titanium dioxide business as a violation of Section 5 of the

FTC Act and Section 7 of the Clayton Act.

Status: Complaint filed 7/10/18.

Order granting preliminary injunction entered 9/5/18.

FTC v. WILHELM WILHELMSEN, No. 1:18-cv-0414 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Wilhelm Wilhelmsen

Wilhelmsen Maritime Services

Resolute Fund II, L.P.

Drew Marine Intermediate II B.V.

Drew Marine Group Inc.

Wilh, Wilhelmsen Holding ASA

Assigned Attorneys: Thomas Dillickrath (BC)

Alleged Conduct: Action for an order preliminarily enjoining the proposed acquisition

between defendants as a violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act and Section

7 of the Clayton Act.

Status: Complaint filed 2/23/18; amended complaint filed 4/2/18.

TRO entered 2/23/18.

Motion for preliminary injunction filed 5/2/18; order granting motion

entered 7/21/18.

Evidentiary hearing held 5/29/18-6/13/18; closing arguments presented 6/18/18.

Commission's stipulation of dismissal without prejudice filed 11/2/18; order granting stipulation of dismissal entered 11/6/18.

(B) Preliminary Injunctions (Other)

(None pending)

(C) <u>Permanent Injunctions/Consumer Redress</u>*

FTC v. 9140-9201 QUÉBEC INC., No. 1:18-cv-4115 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: 9140-9201 Quebec Inc. d/b/a Ameteck Group d/b/a Marketing Midwest

d/b/a Midwest Marketing d/b/a Midwest Marketing Inc.

Midwest Advertising & Publishing Inc. d/b/a Midwestern Advertising and

Publishing d/b/a Global Site Design

The Local Business Pages Premium Business Pages Inc.

Ametech Group LLC, a dissolved Nev. LLC

Ameteck Group LLC, a Del. LLC Data Net Technologies, LLC

Remy Munilla Carol Beaudoin

Assigned Attorneys: William J. Hodor (MWR)

John C. Hallerud

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with defendants' unsolicited calls to small businesses to induce

them to pay for unordered Internet directory listings, search engine

optimization services or website design and hosting services.

Status: Complaint filed 6/13/18.

TRO entered 6/15/18.

Preliminary injunction with asset freeze and other equitable relief entered

6/29/18.

^{*} Unless otherwise noted, cases involve suits for permanent injunction and other equitable relief. Post-judgment proceedings in district court are not generally reported.

Order granting Commission's motion for entry of default judgment and for permanent injunction and monetary relief as to all defendants entered 11/28/18.

FTC v. A1 JANITORIAL SUPPLY CORP., No. 1:17-cv-7790 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: A1 Janitorial Supply Corp. d/b/a A One Janitorial

Century Manufacturing Corp. d/b/a A-1 Janitorial Supply Commercial Maintenance Chemical Corp. d/b/a CMC

Global Direct Resources, Inc. d/b/a A-1 Janitorial d/b/a Century

Manufacturing d/b/a Commercial Maintenance Chemical d/b/a

Target Supplies

Eric Sternberg Matthew Sternberg

Assigned Attorneys: John C. Hallerud (MWR)

Guy G. Ward

Roberto C. Menjivar Nathaniel Al-Najjar

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the

FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule, and the Unordered Merchandise Statute in connection with in connection with the telemarketing of nondurable

office and cleaning supplies.

Status: Complaint filed 10/30/17.

TRO entered 11/1/17.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 11/21/17.

Joint motion to stay discovery pending settlement negotiations granted

12/13/18.

FTC v. A1 DOCPREP INC., No. 2:17-cv-7044 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: A1 Docprep Inc

Stream Lined Marketing d/b/a Project Uplift Students

d/b/a Project Uplift America

Bloom Law Group PC d/b/a Home Shield Network d/b/a Keep Your

Home USA

Homan Ardalan

Assigned Attorneys: K. Michelle Grajales (BCP/FP)

Lisa Anne Rothfarb John D. Jacobs (WRLA)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the

Telemarketing Sales Rule, and the Mortgage Assistance Relief Services

Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of student loan debt relief and mortgage assistance relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 9/27/17.

Ex parte TRO with asset freeze, appointment of receiver, and other equitable relief entered 9/28/17.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants A1 Docprep Inc, Stream Lined Marketing, and Homan Ardalan entered 10/17/17.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendant Bloom Law Group PC entered 10/17/17.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against defendant Bloom Law Group PC entered 5/7/18.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against defendants A1 Docprep Inc, Stream Lined Marketing, and Homan Ardalan entered 11/16/18.

FTC v. ABBVIE, INC., Nos. 18-2621, 18-2748, 18-2758 (3d Cir.); No. 2:14-cv-5151 (E.D. Pa.)

Parties: AbbVie, Inc.

Abbott Laboratories

Unimed Pharmaceuticals, LLC

Besins Healthcare, Inc.

Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Markus Meier (BC)

Patricia M. McDermott

Kara Monahan Peter Taylor

Matthew Hoffman (OGC)

Joel Marcus

Alleged Conduct: Unfair methods of competition in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act

arising from baseless patent infringement lawsuits against potential

generic competitors.

Status: Complaint filed 9/8/14.

Defendants' motion to dismiss filed 11/12/14; Commission's brief in opposition filed 12/12/14; order granting motion to dismiss as to Count II of the complaint (thereby dismissing defendant Teva from

the case) entered 5/6/15.

Commission's motion for entry of judgment under Rule 54(b) filed 6/5/15; response in opposition by Abbott Laboratories, Abbvie, Inc. and Unimed Pharmaceuticals filed 6/25/15; Commission's reply filed 7/2/15; order holding pending Rule 54(b) motion in abeyance

entered 7/8/15; motion to direct entry denied 8/26/15.

Commission's motion for reconsideration of dismissal filed 7/20/15; defendant's response filed 7/31/15; reply filed 8/7/15; motion for reconsideration denied 8/25/15.

Defendants' motion for summary judgment on Count 1 of complaint filed 6/5/17; Commission's response in opposition filed 7/11/17; reply filed 7/26/17; order denying motion entered 9/15/17.

Commission's motion for partial summary judgment filed 6/5/17; defendants' response in opposition filed 7/10/17; reply filed 7/27/17; order granting motion entered 9/15/17.

Trial held 2/7/18-3/1/18.

Defendants' motion for reconsideration of 9/15/17 order filed 3/23/18; Commission's response filed 4/4/18; reply filed 4/8/18; order denying motion for reconsideration entered 6/27/18.

Monetary judgment in favor of Commission entered 7/18/18.

Commission's notice of appeal from dismissal of pay-for-delay count and declination of an injunction (Case No. 18-2621) filed 7/23/18.

Defendants AbbVie, Inc, Abbott Laboratories, and Unimed Pharmaceuticals, LLC's notice of appeal from finding of sham litigation and monetary judgment (Case No. 18-2748) filed 8/8/18.

Defendant Besins Healthcare, Inc's notice of appeal from finding of sham litigation and monetary judgment (Case No. 18-2758) filed 8/13/18.

Commission's opening brief due 3/28/19.

FTC v. ACDI GROUP LLC, No. 3:17-cv-0340 (W.D.N.C.)

Parties: ACDI Group LLC

Solutions to Portfolios LLC

Anthony Swatsworth

Assigned Attorneys: Nikhil Singhvi (BCP/FP)

Michael White

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in connection with defendants' debt

collection practices.

Status: Complaint filed 6/22/17.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 11/16/17; response in

opposition filed 12/22/17; reply to response filed 1/12/18;

Commission's and defendants' supplemental briefs as to motion

filed 5/16/18.

Order granting Commission's motion for summary judgment in part and

denying motion in part entered 8/22/18.

FTC v. ACTAVIS, INC. (formerly WATSON PHARMS., INC.), No. 12-416 (S.

Ct.); Nos. 12-16488, No. 10-12729 (11th Cir.); No. 1:09-CV-955 (N.D. Ga.), formerly No. 2:09-CV-598 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Watson Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Par Pharmaceuticals Companies, Inc.

Paddock Laboratories, Inc. Solvay Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Markus Meier (BC)

Saralisa Brau

Cynthia A. Liebes (SER) Mark S. Hegedus (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Action for a permanent injunction and other equitable relief for violations

of the Sections 1 and 2 of the Sherman Act and Section 5 of the FTC Act in connection with agreement between brand name drug manufacturer and

generic manufacturers delaying entry of generic drug.

Status: Complaint in C.D. Cal. filed 1/27/09.

Amended complaint filed 2/12/09.

Defendants' motion to transfer case to Northern District of Georgia filed 2/27/09; Commission's opposition filed 3/16/09; defendants' reply filed 3/23/09; order transferring case to N.D. Ga. entered 4/9/09.

Second amended complaint filed 5/28/09.

Commission's motion to stay proceeding filed 6/15/09; defendants' opposition filed 6/17/09; Commission's reply filed 7/6/09; order denying motion entered 7/17/09.

Defendants' motions to dismiss second amended complaint filed 7/20/09; Commission's opposition filed 8/21/09; defendants' replies filed 9/11/09.

Order granting motion to dismiss Commission's second amended complaint entered 2/22/10.

Judgment dismissing Commission's claims with prejudice entered 4/21/10

Notice of appeal filed 6/10/10.

Commission's opening brief filed 7/26/10. Defendants' answering brief filed 11/10/10. Commission's reply brief filed 12/15/10.

Oral argument heard 5/13/11.

Opinion affirming district court issued on 4/25/12.

Commission's petition for rehearing *en banc* filed 6/11/12. Order denying petition for rehearing *en banc* entered 7/18/12.

Commission's petition for writ of certiorari filed 10/4/12.

Petition granted 12/7/12.

Commission's petition to district court to unseal document filed 12/10/12; motion granted and temporary stay pending appeal entered

12/19/12.

Notice of appeal of order unsealing document by AbbVie Products filed 12/21/12; emergency motion to expedite briefing and stay unsealing order filed 12/26/12; granted 1/10/13.

Commission's Supreme Court merits brief filed 1/22/13.

AbbVie Products' opening brief in 11th Circuit filed 1/31/13; Commission's response filed 2/7/13; AbbVie Products' reply filed 2/19/13.

Respondents' Supreme Court briefs filed 2/21/13.

Commission's Supreme Court reply brief filed 3/18/13.

Oral argument in 11th Circuit held 3/20/13.

11th Circuit opinion affirming district court order lifting seal and dissolving stay filed 3/21/13.

Supreme Court grant of Solicitor General's motion to lift seal on sealed volume of joint appendix entered 3/22/13.

Supreme Court oral argument heard 3/25/13.

Supreme Court decision in favor of the FTC, reversing the Eleventh Circuit Court of Appeals and remanding the case for further proceedings consistent with its opinion entered 6/17/13.

Eleventh Circuit order vacating the district court judgment and remanding the case to the district court entered 9/9/13.

Order making Eleventh Circuit's mandate the judgment of the district court entered 11/15/13.

Motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim filed 1/15/14; Commission's opposition filed 2/14/14; defendant's reply brief filed 3/3/14.

Order denying motion to dismiss entered 4/21/14.

Motion for interlocutory appeal by Paddock Laboratories, Inc. and Par Pharmaceutical Companies, Inc. filed 4/22/14; Commission's opposition filed 5/6/14; oral argument heard 5/9/14; motion denied 5/9/14.

Motion for summary judgment by Actavis Holdco U.S. filed 10/4/16; Commission's opposition filed 12/1/16; reply filed 12/9/16; order denying motion entered 6/2/17.

Commission's unopposed motion to dismiss with prejudice as to defendants Par Pharmaceutical Companies, Inc. and Paddock Holdings LLC entered 2/2/17; order granting motion entered 2/7/17.

Defendant Solvay Pharmaceuticals, Inc's motion for summary judgment filed 9/29/17; notice of joinder by defendants Actavis Holdco U.S., Inc. and Actavis, Inc. filed 9/29/17; response in opposition filed 1/18/18; reply filed 2/20/18.

Order denying defendant's motion for summary judgment entered 6/14/18. Defendant Solvay Pharmaceuticals, Inc's motion for reconsideration filed 7/12/18; Commission's response in opposition filed 7/26/18; reply filed 8/9/18; hearing held and motion for reconsideration denied on 10/1/18.

FTC v. ADEPT MANAGEMENT, INC., No. 1:16-cv-720 (D. Ore.)

Parties: Adept Management, Inc.

Anchor Publishing Group, Inc. Associated Publishers Network, Inc. Atlas Business Consulting, LLC

Clarity Group, LLC

Consolidated Publishers Exchange, Inc. d/b/a Premier Subscription

Services, Processing Express Solutions

Crown Resource Management, LLC Customer Access Services, Inc.

Express Publishers Service, Inc. d/b/a Associated Billing Service,

Associated Periodical Network, Associated Publishers
Readership, Billing Services of Circulation, Circulation
Billing Marketplace, Circulation Network Services d/b/a Global Billing
Service d/b/a Lakeshore Publishers Billing, Magazine Billing Network,
Magazine Distribution Marketplace, Magazine Payment Processing,
National Magazine Network, Publication Network Services, Publishers
Billing Marketplace, Publishers Distribution Network, Publishers
Magazine Services, Readers Magazine Services, Readers Payment
Network, Subscription Billing Agency, Subscription Billing Network,
United Billing Service, United Publishers Agency

HCG, Inc.

Henry Cricket Group, LLC

Hoyal & Associates, Inc.

Liberty Publishers Service, Inc. d/b/a Allied Publishing Services, American Consumer Publishers Association, Associated Publishers Services, Billing Services of America, Bradford Publishing Service, Circulation Billing Services, Global Publishers Center, Lakeshore Publishers Service, Magazine Billing Services, Magazine Distribution Service, Magazine Payment Services, Magazine Subscriber Services, Magazine Subscriptions Center, National Magazine Services, Periodical Billing Services, Platinum Subscription Service, Publication Service Networks, Publishers Access Services, Publishers Billing Services, Publishers Consolidated Subscription Services, Publishers Distribution Center, Publishers Education Services, Publishers Magazine Billing, Publishers Magazine Payment, Publishers Marketplace Services, Publishers Network Exchange, Publishers Payment Services, Publishers Periodical Service, Publishers Processing Service, Publishers Services Exchange, Readers Billing Services, Readers Payment Service, Seascape Publishers Network, Slo Call Center, Subscription Billing Service, Subscription Payment Exchange, Subscription Payment Services, United Publishers Services

Magazine Clearing Exchange

Magazine Link, Inc.

Maximillian, Inc. d/b/a Maxmillian, Inc.

Northwest Data Services, LLC

PPP Magazines, Inc.

Publishers Payment Processing, Inc.

Reality Kats, LLC Specialties, Inc.

Subscription House Agency, Inc.

United Publishers Exchange, Inc. d/b/a Associated Publishers Network,

Circulation Billing Network, Magazine Billing Associates,

Premier Subscription Network, Publishers Billing Network, Publishers

Magazine Exchange

Wineoceros Wine Club, Inc.

Linda Babb

Shannon Bacon a/k/a Shannon Balero, Shannon Gordon

Jeffrey Hoyal Lori Hoyal

Colleen Kaylor

Laura Lovrien a/k/a Laura Babb

Noel Parducci a/k/a Noel Littlefield, Noelle Littlefield

Lydia Pugsley a/k/a Lydia Babb

Dennis Simpson William Strickler

Assigned Attorneys: Krista Bush (NWR)

Laura Solis

Richard McKewen Connor Shively

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act

in connection with a nationwide campaign relying on misrepresentations to solicit newspaper renewals and new subscriptions from consumers.

Status: Complaint filed 4/27/16.

Motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim filed 6/27/16; Commission's opposition filed 7/11/16; order denying motion to dismiss entered

11/3/16.

Motions for stay pending resolution of criminal proceedings filed 1/27/17; Commission's response filed 1/31/17; replies filed

2/17/17; motions denied 2/23/17.

Motion for summary judgment filed 4/14/17; Commission's opposition filed 5/4/17; reply filed 5/26/17; motion deferred 6/13/17.

Default judgment as to defendants Adept Management, Inc., Anchor

Publishing Group, Inc., Associated Publishers Network, Inc., Atlas Business Consulting LLC, Clarity Group, Inc., Consolidated Publishers Exchange, Inc., Crown Resource Management LLC,

Customer Access Services, Inc., Express Publishers Service, Inc.,

HCG, Inc., Henry Cricket Group, LLC, Liberty Publishers Service, Inc., Magazine Clearing Exchange, Inc., Magazine Link, Inc., Maximillian, Inc., North West Data Services LLC, PPP Magazines, Inc., Publishers Payment Processing, Inc., Publishers Payment Processing, Inc., Specialties, Inc., Subscription House Agency, Inc., United Publishers Exchange, Inc., and Wineoceros Wine Club, Inc. ("Defaulting Defendants") entered 8/7/17.

Commission's motion for default judgment and permanent injunction order as to Defaulting Defendants filed 3/13/18; response in opposition to motion by defendants Jeffrey Hoyal, Lori Hoyal, Hoyal & Associates, Inc. filed 3/27/18; Commission's reply filed 3/30/18; response in opposition to motion by defendants Reality Kats, LLC, Dennis Simpson filed 4/6/18; Commission's reply filed 4/12/18.

Motions for summary judgement by defendants Linda Babb, Colleen Kaylor, William Strickler, Noel Parducci, Reality Kats, LLC, Dennis Simpson, Shannon Bacon, Jeffrey Hoyal, Lori Hoyal, Hoyal & Associates, Inc, Laura Lovrien, Lydia Pugsley filed 8/17/18; Commission's response in opposition filed 8/31/18; defendants' reply filed 9/7/18.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 8/17/18; response in opposition by defendants Colleen Kaylor, Jeffrey Hoyal, Hoyal & Associates, Inc, Noel Parducci, Lori Hoyal, Linda Babb, Shannon Bacon, William Strickler, Reality Kats, LLC, Dennis Simpson, Publishers Payment Processing, Inc, Lydia Pugsley, Laura Lovrien filed 8/31/18.

Order granting in part and denying in part Commission's motion for summary judgment and denying defendants' motion for summary judgment entered 9/25/18.

Trial held 11/6/18 through 12/5/18.

FTC v. ALLIANCE DOCUMENT PREPARATION, No. 2:17-cv-7048 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Alliance Document Preparation d/b/a EZ Doc Preps d/b/a Grads Aid d/b/a First Document Aid

SBS Capital Group, Inc. d/b/a Grads United Discharge

SBB Holdings, LLC d/b/a EZ Doc Preps d/b/a Allied Doc Prep d/b/a Post Grad Services

First Student Aid, LLC

United Legal Center, LLC d/b/a Post Grad Aid d/b/a Alumni Aid Assistance d/b/a United Legal Discharge

Elite Consulting Service LLC d/b/a First Grad Aid

Grads Doc Prep, LLC d/b/a Academic Aid Center d/b/a Academic Protection d/b/a Academy Doc Prep d/b/a Academic Discharge

Elite Doc Prep, LLC d/b/a Premier Student Aid

Benjamin Naderi aka Benjamin Pournaderi aka Benjamin Brooks

Shawn Gabbaie aka Shawn Goodman Avinaday Rubeni aka Avi Rubeni

Michael Ratliff

Ramiar Reuveni aka Rami Reuveni

Farzan Azinkhan

Direct Consulting Service, LLC

Capital Doc Prep, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Eleanor Durham (NWR)

Nadine S. Samter

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of

student loan debt relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 9/27/17.

TRO entered 9/28/2017.

Preliminary injunction and other equitable relief and appointment of receiver entered 11/2/17; amended preliminary injunction as to Alliance Document Preparation, LLC; SBS Capital Group, Inc.; First Student Aid, LLC; Elite Consulting Service, LLC; Elite Doc Prep, LLC; Benjamin Naderi; Direct Consulting Service, LLC; and Capital Doc Prep, Inc. entered 11/3/17; Commission's ex parte application to amend the asset freeze provisions of the preliminary injunction filed 11/20/17; order granting application to amend entered 11/22/17.

Third application for clerk's entry of default against defendant Elite Consulting Service LLC filed 12/11/17; default by clerk entered 12/11/17.

Permanent injunction and final order as to defendants Michael Ratliff; Avinadav Rubeni; United Legal Center, LLC; United Legal Center, Inc.; and Farzan Azinkhan entered 8/7/18.

Permanent injunction and final order as to defendants Ramiar Reuveni and Grads Doc Prep, LLC entered 8/8/18.

Default judgment for permanent injunction and final order as to defendants Elite Doc Prep, LLC and Elite Consulting Service LLC entered 8/30/18.

Permanent injunction and final order as to defendants Shawn Gabbaie; SBB Holdings, LLC entered 9/5/18.

Permanent injunction and final order as to defendants Benjamin Naderi; Alliance Document Preparation, LLC; SBS Capital Group, Inc.; First Student Aid, LLC; and relief defendants Direct Consulting Group, LLC; and Capital Doc Prep, Inc. entered 10/25/18.

FTC v. AMERICAN FINANCIAL BENEFITS CENTER, No. 4:18-cv-806 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: American Financial Benefits Center

Ameritech Financial

Financial Education Benefits Center

Brandon Demond Frere

Assigned Attorneys: Sarah Schroeder (WRSF)

Roberta Tonelli Evan Rose

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with the marketing of student loan debt relief.

Status: Complaint filed 2/7/18.

Commission's motion for preliminary injunction filed 3/2/18; opposition

filed 3/30/18; order granting preliminary injunction entered

11/29/18.

Defendants' motion to dismiss filed 4/23/18; Commission's opposition

filed 5/16/18; defendant's reply filed 5/30/18; order denying

defendants' motion entered 8/8/18.

Trial set for 7/27/20.

FTC v. AMERICAN HOME SERVICING CENTER, LLC, No. 8:18-cv-0597 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: American Home Servicing Center, LLC

Capital Home Advocacy Center National Advocacy Center, LLC

Jaime Aburto Marcus Fierro, Jr.

Eve Christine Rodriguez Sergio Lorenzo Rodriguez

Assigned Attorneys: Barbara Chun (WRLA)

Elsie B Kappler (BCP/ENF)

Sangjoon Han

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Mortgage Assistance Relief Services Rule in connection with the

marketing and sale of mortgage assistance relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 4/12/18.

Ex parte TRO with asset freeze and appointment of temporary receiver

entered 4/13/18.

Preliminary injunction as to defendants American Home Servicing Center,

LLC; Capital Home Advocacy Center; National Advocacy Center,

LLC; and Marcus Fierro entered 4/27/18.

Preliminary injunction as to defendants Eve Christine Rodriguez and Sergio Lorenzo Rodriguez entered 6/12/18.

Motion to dismiss by defendants National Advocacy Center, LLC, Eve Christine Rodriguez, and Sergio Lorenzo Rodriguez filed 7/13/18; response in opposition filed 7/19/18; reply to opposition filed 8/17/18; order denying motion entered 9/12/18.

FTC v. AMERICAN STUDENT LOAN CONSOLIDATORS, LLC, No. 0:17-cv-61862 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: American Student Loan Consolidators, LLC d/b/a ASLC Processing

Bbnd Marketing, LLC d/b/a United Processing Center, United SL

Processing, and United Student Loan Processing

Daniel Upbin Patrick O'Deady

Assigned Attorneys: Harold E. Kirtz (SER)

Nicholas May

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and

sale of student loan debt relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 9/25/17.

Ex parte motion for TRO, asset freeze, appointment of receiver, and other equitable relief filed 9/25/17; order granting motion and order to show cause why a preliminary injunction should not issue entered

09/26/17.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 10/26/17.

Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment

entered 11/30/18.

FTC v. AMG SERVICES, INC., Nos. 16-17197, 14-16468 (9th Cir.); No. 2:12-cv-536 (D. Nev.)

Parties: AMG Services, Inc.

Red Cedar Services, Inc., d/b/a 500FastCash

SFS. Inc., d/b/a OneClickCash

Tribal Financial Services, Inc., d/b/a Ameriloan, d/b/a UnitedCashLoan,

d/b/a USFastCash, d/b/a Miami Nation Enterprises.

AMG Capital Management, LLC

Level 5 Motorsports, LLC Lead Flash Consulting, LLC Black Creek Capital Corporation Broadmoor Capital Partners, LLC Muir Law Firm, LLC Scott A. Tucker Blaine A. Tucker Timothy J. Muir Don E. Brady Robert D. Campbell Troy L. LittleAxe Park 269 LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Nikhil Singhvi (BCP/FP)

Iona Rusu Jason Schall

Kim C. Tucker

Jack Metzler (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5, the Truth in Lending

Act, and the Electronic Fund Transfer Act, in connection with offering and

extending credit, payday loans, and the collection of those loans.

Status: Complaint filed 4/2/12.

Motion to dismiss by all defendants filed 5/25/12; Commission's response filed 6/11/12.

Partial withdrawals of motions to dismiss filed 10/15/12 and 10/16/12.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 12/27/12.

Commission's amended motion for partial summary judgment filed 3/7/13; defendants' responses filed 3/25/13.

Motion for legal determination on tribal sovereign immunity by defendants AMG Services, Inc., Red Cedar Services, Inc., SFS, Inc., and Tribal Financial Services filed 4/8/13; cross-motion for legal determination by defendant Troy Little Axe filed 4/10/13; Commission's response filed 4/19/13.

Commission's amended complaint filed 4/12/13.

Report and recommendation by magistrate that Commission's motion for partial summary judgment and defendant's motion for legal determination on tribal sovereign immunity be granted in part and denied in part entered 7/16/13.

Joint motion for permanent injunction and judgment as to defendants AMG Services, SFS, Inc., MNE Services, Inc., AMG Capital Management, LLC, Level 5 MotorSports, LLC, LeadFlash Consulting, LLC, Black Creek Capital Corp., Broadmoor Capital Partners, LLC, Scott A. Tucker, Blaine A. Tucker, Don E. Brady, Robert D. Campbell, and Troy L. Little Axe, Jr. filed 7/18/13.

Motion for summary judgment by Commission filed 9/30/13; Muir defendants' opposition filed 11/29/13; remaining defendants' opposition filed 12/4/13; Commission's reply filed 12/20/13.

- Motions for summary judgment by defendants filed 9/30/13; Commission's opposition filed 12/4/13; defendants' reply filed 12/20/13.
- Order granting joint motion for permanent injunction and judgment as to defendants AMG Services, SFS, Inc., MNE Services, Inc., AMG Capital Management, LLC, Level 5 MotorSports, LLC, LeadFlash Consulting, LLC, Black Creek Capital Corp., Broadmoor Capital Partners, LLC, Scott A. Tucker, Blaine A. Tucker, Don E. Brady, Robert D. Campbell, and Troy L. Little Axe, Jr. entered 10/8/13.
- Report and recommendation by magistrate that Commission's motion for summary judgment be granted in part and denied in part, and that defendant's motion for summary judgment be denied, entered 1/28/14; defendant's objections filed 2/14/14; Commission's response filed 3/2/14.
- Order adopting magistrate's 7/16/13 report and recommendations entered 3/7/14.
- Order adopting magistrate's 1/28/14 report and recommendations entered 5/29/14.
- Stipulation and order to dismiss defendants Timothy J. Muir and the Muir Law Firm, LLC entered 9/8/14.
- Order denying settling defendants' motion to enforce settlement entered 7/16/14; notice of appeal filed 7/30/14; Ninth Circuit order dismissing appeal for lack of jurisdiction entered 10/30/14.
- Stipulated permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants AMG Services and MNE Services, Inc. entered 1/23/15.
- Stipulated permanent injunction and monetary judgment against defendants Troy Little Axe, Jr., Don Brady and Robert Campbell entered 3/17/15.
- Motion for preliminary injunction by the Commission filed 5/8/15; responses filed 5/26/15.
- Stipulated orders for permanent injunction and equitable monetary relief as to defendants Red Cedar Services, Inc. and SFS, Inc. entered 11/25/15.
- Motion for summary judgment by Commission filed 1/20/16; defendants' opposition filed 2/26/16; Commission's reply filed 3/18/16.
- Motion for summary judgment by defendants filed 1/20/16; Commission's opposition filed 2/26/16; defendants' reply filed 3/18/16.
- Order granting Commission's motion for summary judgment, denying defendants' motion for summary judgment, and awarding permanent injunction and monetary relief of \$1.3 billion entered 9/30/16.
- Notice of appeal filed 11/29/16.
- Appellant's opening brief filed 7/21/17; Commission's answering brief filed 12/11/17; reply brief filed 1/16/18.
- Oral argument held 8/15/18.

Panel opinion, affirming district court's summary judgment and relief order, entered 12/3/18.

FTC v. APARTMENT HUNTERS, INC., No. 8:18-cv-1636 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Apartment Hunters, Inc. d/b/a

WeTakeSection8.com d/b/a ApartmentHunterz.com d/b/a

FeaturedRentals.com Real Estate Data Solutions, Inc. Rental Home Listings Inc. Uab Apartment Hunters LT

Steven Shayan

Kevin Shayan a/k/a Kaveh Shayan

Assigned Attorneys: Stacy Procter (WRLA)

Amanda Grier (BCP/MP)

Rhonda Perkins

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 of the

FTC Act in connection with the sale of access to listings of purportedly

available rental units.

Status: Complaint filed 9/11/18.

TRO entered 9/13/18.

Hearing conducted and oral order granting preliminary injunction entered

9/24/18; preliminary injunction entered 9/28/18.

Commission's application for contempt against all defendants filed

9/27/18; opposition filed 9/28/18; reply to opposition filed 10/1/18;

order holding defendants in contempt entered 10/10/18.

Trial set for 11/5/19.

FTC v. APEX CAPITAL GROUP, LLC, No. 2:18-cv-9573 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Apex Capital Group, LLC

Capstone Capital Solutions Limited

Clik Trix Limited

Empire Partners Limited Interzoom Capital Limited

Lead Blast Limited

Mountain Venture Solutions Limited

Nutra Global Limited Omni Group Limited Rendezvous it Limited Sky Blue Media Limited Tactic Solutions Limited

Phillip Peikos

David Barnett

Assigned Attorneys: Laura Zuckerwise (NER)

Brian Lasky

Darren H. Lubetzky

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act,

> the Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act, and the Electronic Fund Transfer Act in connection with the marketing of supposedly "free trial"

offers for personal care products and dietary supplements online.

Status: Complaint filed 11/14/18.

Ex parte TRO entered 11/16/18.

Stipulated preliminary injunctions entered 12/19/18.

FTC v. AT&T MOBILITY LLC, No. 15-16585 (9th Cir.); No. 3:14-cv-4785 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: AT&T Mobility, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Evan Rose (WRSF)

Matthew D. Gold Laura Fremont **Emily Burton** Colin Hector

Maricela Segura (WRLA)

Emily Wu

Dominique Alepin Joel Marcus (OGC) Matthew Hoffman

Deceptive and unfair acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the Alleged Conduct:

FTC Act in connection with the marketing of wireless broadband internet

access service for smartphones.

Status: Complaint filed 10/28/14.

> Motion to dismiss by AT&T Mobility filed 1/5/15. Order denying motion to dismiss entered 3/31/15.

AT&T Mobility's motion for leave to take interlocutory appeal filed 4/9/15; Commission's response filed 4/23/15; AT&T Mobility's

reply filed 4/30/15.

Order granting AT&T Mobility's motion to appeal entered 5/15/15.

Petition to Ninth Circuit for permission to appeal by AT&T Mobility filed

5/26/15; Commission's response filed 6/8/15. Order granting interlocutory review entered 8/10/15.

Motion to stay pending appeal filed 8/18/15.

Stay denied 9/25/15.

Appellant's opening brief filed 11/18/15; Commission's answering brief filed 2/3/16; Appellant's reply brief filed 2/22/16.

Oral argument heard 6/17/16.

Opinion reversing the district court and ordering that the Commission's complaint be dismissed entered 8/29/16.

Commission's petition for rehearing en banc filed 10/13/16; AT&T's response filed 11/8/16; petition granted 5/9/17.

Oral argument held 9/19/17.

En banc opinion affirming district court's denial of AT&T's motion to dismiss and remanding for further proceedings entered 2/26/18.

FTC v. AWS, LLC, No. 2:18-cv-0442 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Adam S. Bowser

Christopher F. Bowser Jeffrey A. Gomez Jody L. Marshall

Adams Consulting, LLC

AWS, LLC

FBA Distributors, LLC

FBA Stores, LLC

Global Marketing Services LLC

Info Pros, LLC Info Solutions, LLC

Online Auction Learning Center, Inc. (Mass. Corp.) Online Auction Learning Center, Inc. (Nev. Corp.)

Bank of America, N.A. (Intervenor)

Assigned Attorneys: Roberto Anguizola (BCP/MP)

Miry Kim Gregory Evans

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act and

the Business Opportunity Rule by, among other things: making false or

unsubstantiated earnings claims regarding defendants' business

opportunities; and failing to furnish prospective purchasers of defendants'

business opportunities with the required disclosure documents.

Status: Complaint filed 3/12/18.

TRO entered 3/14/18.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants AWS, LLC, FBA Distributors, LLC, FBA Stores, LLC, Info Pros, LLC, Info Solutions, LLC, Online Auction Learning Center, Inc. (Mass. Corp.), and Online Auction Learning Center, Inc. (Nev. Corp.), Christopher F. Bowser, Adam S. Bowser, and

Jody L. Marshall entered 6/15/18.

Intervenor complaint by Bank of America, N.A. filed 9/28/18. Stipulated permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants Adams Consulting, LLC, Global Marketing Services, LLC, and Jeffrey A. Gomez entered 10/10/18.

FTC v. BLUE SAGUARO MARKETING, LLC, No. 2:16-cv-3406 (D. Ariz.)

Parties: Blue Saguaro, LLC d/b/a Blue Saguaro Grant Program, Gera Grant,

Government Grant Service, Grant Center, Grant Resources Marketing Ways, LLC d/b/a Amazon.com Associates Program

Max Results Marketing, LLC d/b/a Amazon.com Associates Program, Amazon Affiliate Program, Amazon Associates Central, Gera

Grant, Grant Strategy Solutions

Oro Canyon Marketing II, LLC

Paramount Business Services, LLC d/b/a Paramount Business Resources

Stephanie A. Bateluna

Stacey C. Vela Carl E. Morris, Jr.

Assigned Attorneys: Elsie Kappler (BCP/ENF)

Hong Park

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the sale and offering for

sale of grants and home-based internet business opportunities.

Status: Complaint filed 10/7/16.

Ex parte TRO entered 10/11/16.

Order extending ex parte TRO entered 10/25/16.

Preliminary injunction as to defendants Blue Saguaro, Marketing Ways,

Max Results Marketing, Oro Canyon Marketing, Paramount

Business Services, Carl Morris, Jr., and Stephanie Bateluna entered

10/28/16.

Clerk's entry of default as to Blue Saguaro, Marketing Ways, Max Results

Marketing, and Oro Canyon entered 11/28/16.

Order granting joint motion to stay case for 75 days entered 7/26/17; order

lifting stay entered 10/16/17.

Stipulated orders for permanent injunctions and monetary judgments as to defendants Stephanie A. Bateluna, Paramount Business Services,

LLC, Stacey A. Vela entered 8/11/17.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to

defendant Carl E. Morris, Jr. entered 8/30/17.

Motion for default judgment as to defendants Blue Saguaro Marketing LLC, Marketing Ways.com LLC, Max Results Marketing LLC, and Oro Canyon Marketing II LLC filed 9/12/17.

Default judgment as to defendants Blue Saguaro Marketing LLC,

Marketing Ways.com LLC, Max Results Marketing LLC, and Oro Canyon Marketing II LLC entered 7/13/18.

FTC v. BLUEHIPPO FUNDING, LLC, Nos. 11-374, 16-1599, 17-1587, 17-669 (2d Cir.); No. 1:08-cv-1819 (S.D.N.Y.); No. 9:19-cv-80001 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: BlueHippo Funding, LLC

BlueHippo Capital LLC

Joseph K. Rensin

Assigned Attorneys: Amanda C. Basta (BCP/ENF)

Michele Arington (OGC)

Jack Metzler

Alleged Conduct: Contempt proceeding for violations of a permanent injunction in

connection with the sale of personal computers, televisions, and other

consumer electronics.

Status: Complaint filed 2/22/08.

Stipulated final judgment and order for permanent injunction entered

4/9/08.

Motions for contempt and to modify permanent injunction against

BlueHippo Funding, LLC, BlueHippo Capital LLC, and Joseph K.

Rensin filed 11/17/09.

Order to show cause why defendants should not be held in contempt

entered 11/16/09; modified 11/18/09.

Defendants' memoranda of law filed 12/7/09 and 12/11/09; Commission's

reply memoranda of law filed 12/11/09 and 12/12/09.

Trial held 2/9/10-2/11/10; closing argument held 2/19/10.

Order granting motion for contempt entered 7/27/10; judgment entered

7/30/10.

Commission's motion to amend/correct judgment and order filed 8/27/10;

defendants' opposition filed 9/24/10; Commission's reply filed

10/8/10.

Order denying Commission's motion to amend/correct judgment and order

entered 12/1/10.

Commission's notice of appeal re contempt order filed 1/28/11.

Notice of appeal filed 2/1/11.

Commission's brief filed 5/16/11.

Appellee's brief filed 8/15/11.

Commission's reply brief filed 9/12/11.

Argument held 2/23/12.

Opinion vacating the district court's judgment and remanding the case to

the district court entered 8/12/14.

Appellee Joseph Rensin's petition for rehearing filed 9/25/14.

Order denying Joseph Rensin's petition for rehearing entered 11/17/14.

Oral argument before the district court concerning applicability of presumption of reliance held 6/4/15.

Opinion and order ruling that Commission is entitled to presumption of consumer reliance entered 11/6/15.

Final judgment imposing compensatory contempt sanctions entered 4/19/16.

Notice of appeal by Rensin filed 5/18/16.

Appellant's opening brief filed 8/29/16; Commission's answering brief filed 11/28/16; appellant's reply brief filed 12/9/16.

Suggestion of bankruptcy and automatic stay by Rensin filed 2/15/17; Commission's opposition filed 2/16/17; reply filed 2/27/17.

Order rejecting application of automatic bankruptcy stay entered 3/6/17. Notice of appeal filed 3/7/17.

Motion to stay contempt proceeding pending appeal filed 3/10/17; Commission's opposition filed 3/23/17; reply filed 3/29/17; temporary stay entered 3/27/17; motion for stay granted 5/2/17.

District court order finding defendant Rensin in contempt, but staying order due to appeals court's temporary stay order entered 3/28/17.

Second Circuit opinion affirming district court judgment imposing compensatory contempt sanctions entered 4/12/17.

Notice of appeal of 3/28/17 order filed by Joseph Rensin on 5/16/17; order holding appeal in abeyance entered 5/31/17.

Appellant's opening brief (No. 17-669) filed 4/10/17; Commission's answering brief filed 6/9/17; reply brief filed 7/6/17.

Oral argument heard on 2/15/18.

Supplemental briefs filed 2/19/18.

Order ordering appellant Joseph Rensin to respond to Commission's suggestion in its 2/15/18 brief that this case might be consolidated with Case No. 17-1587 entered 12/6/18; appellant's response filed 12/7/18.

Rensin's notice of appeal of bankruptcy court's ruling that his compensatory contempt sanction debt to the FTC is not dischargeable filed 12/28/18.

FTC v. CAMPBELL CAPITAL LLC, No. 1:18-cv-1163 (W.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Campbell Capital LLC d/b/a United Processing Services

Kahl, Heidenreich, and Nemmer LLC

Urban, Heidenreich, Melendez, and Associates, LLC d/b/a Capital Assets, Securities, and Holdings Group

J & V Receivables LLC Rich Financial LLC BCH & Associates Ltd. Robert Heidenreich

State of New York (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Christopher Y. Miller (NER)

Karen Dahlberg O'Connell

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in connection with the collection of

debt.

Status: Complaint filed 10/23/18.

Ex parte TRO entered 10/25/18.

Stipulated preliminary injunctions entered 12/4/18.

FTC v. CARDIFF, No. 5:18-cv-02104 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Jason Cardiff

Eunjung Cardiff Danielle Cadiz

Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc. (California Corp.) d/b/a Rengalife

Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc. (Nevada Corp.) Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc. (Delaware Corp.)

Indentify, LLC

Advanced Mens Institute Prolongz LLC d/b/a AMI

Runway Products, LLC

Carols Place Limited Partnership

Assigned Attorneys: Stacy Rene Procter (WRLA)

Edwin Rodriguez (BCP/DAP)

Elizabeth Sanger James Prunty Shira Modell

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC

Act, the Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act, the Electronic Fund Transfer Act, and the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the advertising and marketing of smoking cessation, weight-loss, and

sexual-performance aids.

Status: Complaint filed 10/10/18.

Preliminary injunction with asset freeze and other equitable relief as to defendants Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc. (California), Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc. (Nevada), Redwood Scientific Technologies, Inc. (Delaware), Indentify, LLC.

Advanced Mens Institute Prolongz LLC, Runway Products, LLC,

and Carols Place Limited Partnership entered 10/24/18.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendant Danielle Cadiz entered

11/2/18.

Preliminary injunction with asset freeze and other equitable relief as to Defendants Jason Cardiff and Eunjung Cardiff entered 11/8/18.

FTC v. CONSUMER DEFENSE, LLC, No. 18-15462 (9th Cir.); No. 2:18-cv-030 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Consumer Defense, LLC

Consumer Link, Inc. Preferred Law, PLLC

American Home Loan Counselors

Consumer Defense Group, LLC (formerly known as Modification Review

Board, LLC)

Consumer Defense, LLC

Brown Legal, Inc.

AM Property Management, LLC

Fmg Partners, LLC

Zinly, LLC

Jonathan P. Hanley Benjamin R Horton Sandra X Hanley

American Home Loans, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Adam Wesolowski (BCP/FP)

Gregory Ashe Imad Abyad (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Mortgage Assistance Relief Service Rule in connection with the

marketing and sale of mortgage assistance relief.

Status: Complaint filed 1/8/18.

TRO entered 1/10/18.

Preliminary injunction entered 2/20/18.

Defendant Benjamin R Horton's motion to dismiss filed 1/22/18;

Commission's response to motion filed 2/5/18; reply filed 2/15/18;

motion denied 6/7/18

Defendants AM Property Management, LLC, American Home Loan

Counselors, American Home Loans, LLC, Brown Legal, Inc, Consumer Defense Group, LLC, Consumer Defense, LLC, FMG Partners, LLC, Jonathan P. Hanley, Sandra X Hanley, Prefered Law, PLLC, Zinly, LLC's motions to dismiss filed 2/12/18;

Commission's responses to motions filed 2/26/18; replies filed

3/5/18; motion denied 6/7/18.

Notice of appeal of preliminary injunction filed 03/21/18.

Appellants' opening brief filed 4/18/18; Commission's answering brief

filed 5/16/18; reply brief filed 6/6/18.

Order granting stipulated consent judgment for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendant Benjamin Horton entered 6/5/18.

Ninth Circuit oral argument held 9/14/18.

FTC v. CONSUMER HEALTH BENEFITS ASS'N, No. 1:10-CV-3551 (E.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Consumer Health Benefits Association John Schwartz

Jeffery Burman

Century Senior Services

Guarantee Trust Life Insurance

Barbara Taube

Rita B. Werner

Ronald K. Werner

Richard Holson III Vantage America Solutions

Louis Leo Windi Tow

National Association for Americans National Benefits Consultants, LLC National Benefits Solutions, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Karen Dahlberg O'Connell (NER)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 and the

Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with defendants' marketing,

distribution, and sale of medical discount plans.

Status: Complaint filed 8/03/10.

Stipulation and order modifying ex parte TRO as to defendant Louis Leo

entered 8/25/10.

Stipulation and order modifying ex parte TRO as to defendants Ron

Werner and Rita Werner entered 8/25/10.

Stipulated preliminary injunction order as to defendant Louis J. Leo

entered 9/21/10.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Ron Werner and Rita

Werner entered 10/01/10.

Preliminary injunction as to corporate defendants entered 10/5/10.

Clerk's entry of default as to corporate defendants 11/15/10.

Stipulation and order modifying the preliminary injunction order as to defendants Louis Leo, Rita and Ronald Werner entered 3/31/11.

Commission's motion for leave to amend complaint naming additional defendants filed 5/06/11; magistrate judge's decision granting

motion entered 8/18/11.

Appeals of magistrate judge's decision by proposed defendants filed

9/06/11.

Commission's amended complaint filed 10/13/11.

Motions to dismiss by filed 11/22/11; Commission's response in

opposition filed 12/13/11.

Orders denying all motions to dismiss entered 5/23/12 & 5/24/12.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 7/23/2013; opposition by John Schwartz and Wendi Tow filed 8/30/13 and 11/7/13; partial oppositions by Rita Brum Werner, Ronald Kent Werner, Jeffrey Burman, Century Senior Services, Guarantee Trust Life Insurance Company, Richard Holson, III, Barbara Taube, Vantage America Solutions, Inc. filed 11/6/13; cross-motions for summary judgment by Rita Werner, GTL, Vantage, Century, Rick Holson, Jeff Burman, and Barbara Taube filed 9/4/13, 9/5/13 and 9/6/13.

Order granting motion by the Commonwealth of Massachusetts to modify the stipulated order of preliminary injunction entered 12/5/13.

FTC v. CREDIT BUREAU CENTER, LLC, Nos. 18, 3310, 18-2847 (7th Cir.); No. 1:17-cv-0194 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: Credit Bureau Center, LLC, f/k/a MyScore, LLC d/b/a efreescore.com,

credit updates.com, and freecreditnation.com

Michael Brown Danny Pierce Andrew Lloyd

Assigned Attorneys: Guy Ward (MWR)

Douglas McKenney

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act,

> the Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act, and the Fair Credit Reporting Act in connection with the marketing of credit monitoring

services.

Status: Complaint filed 1/10/17.

Ex parte TRO entered 1/11/17.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Danny Pierce and

Andrew Lloyd entered 2/8/17.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Michael Brown and Credit Bureau Center entered 2/21/17.

Order finding defendant Michael Brown in civil contempt entered 6/28/17. Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to

defendants Danny Pierce and Andrew Lloyd entered 10/26/17.

Commission's motion for summary judgment against remaining defendants Michael Brown and Credit Bureau Center, LLC filed 3/2/18; defendants' response filed 3/12/18; order granting motion for summary judgment entered 6/26/18.

Notice of appeal by defendants Michael Brown and Credit Bureau Center, LLC filed 8/22/18.

Motion by defendants Michael Brown, Credit Bureau Center, LLC to stay district court's final injunction pending appeal filed 8/31/18; response in opposition filed 9/17/18; district court order granting

motion to stay in part, barring Commission from distributing funds recovered to consumers pending conclusion of appeal, but otherwise denying, entered 9/26/18.

Amended notice of appeal of post-judgment order denying defendants' request to pay their attorneys from the receivership estate filed 10/26/18.

Order consolidating appeals entered 11/16/18.

Appellant's brief filed 12/5/18; Commission's brief due 3/12/19; appellants' reply brief due 4/12/19.

FTC v. DIGITAL ALTITUDE LLC, No. 2:18-cv-0729 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Digital Altitude LLC

Digital Altitude Limited Aspire Processing LLC Aspire Processing Limited Aspire Ventures Ltd Disc Enterprises Inc.

RISE Systems & Enterprise LLC, a Utah LLC RISE Systems & Enterprise LLC, a Nevada LLC Soar International Limited Liability Company

The Upside, LLC

Thermography for Life, LLC d/b/a Living Exceptionally, Inc.

Michael Force Mary Dee Morgan Johnson

Alan Moore Sean Brown

Assigned Attorneys: Andrew Hudson (BCP/MP)

Jody Goodman Laura Basford

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with the marketing, advertising, promotion, and sale of an

online business-coaching scheme.

Status: Complaint filed 1/29/18.

Stipulated preliminary injunctions against defendants Sean Brown,

Morgan Johnson, and Alan Moore entered 3/1/18.

Stipulated preliminary injunction against defendant The Upside, LLC

entered 3/6/18.

Preliminary injunction against defendants Michael Force, Mary Dee, Thermography For Life, and Digital Attitude entered 3/9/18.

Stay to allow Commission approval of proposed settlements with

defendants The Upside, LLC and Morgan Johnson entered 5/3/18.

Motion for default judgements against corporate defendants filed 5/14/18 Application for court approval of stipulated final orders for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against defendants The Upside LLC and Morgan Johnson filed 6/29/18.

Joint motion to stay case pending Commissioners' review of final settlement agreement with defendant Alan Moore filed 9/18/18; motion granted 9/19/18; joint motion to continue stay filed 12/10/18; motion granted 12/11/18.

Joint motion to stay case pending Commissioners' review of final settlement agreement with defendant Mary Dee filed 10/31/18; motion granted 11/5/18.

Commission's motion for default judgment against defendants Digital Altitude LLC, Aspire Processing LLC, Disc Enterprises Inc, RISE Systems & Enterprise LLC (Utah), RISE Systems & Enterprise LLC (Nevada), Soar International Limited Liability Company, Digital Altitude Limited, Aspire Processing Limited, and Aspire Ventures Ltd filed 11/8/18; order granting motion in part, taking under submission request for entry of a final order and permanent injunction, entered 11/15/18.

FTC v. DIRECTV, INC., No. 4:15-cv-1129 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: DirecTV, Inc.

DirecTV, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Eric D. Edmondson (WRSF)

Erika R. Wodinsky

Stacy R. Procter (WRLA)

Kenneth Abbe Faye Chen Barnouw

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act

and Section 4 of the Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act in connection with the marketing of multi-channel video programming

subscription service.

Status: Complaint filed 3/11/15.

Motion for partial summary judgment by DirecTV filed 10/13/15; Commission's response filed 11/24/15; DirecTV's reply filed

1/25/16.

Oral argument on defendants' partial motion for summary judgment held

3/4/16.

Commission's motion for partial summary judgment filed 9/22/16; order granting in part and denying in part partial motion for summary

judgment entered 11/26/16.

Defendants' motion to dismiss, and alternatively, for partial summary

judgment filed 12/01/16; Commission's response filed 12/26/16; motion denied 12/27/16.

Trial conducted 8/14/17-8/29/17.

Defendants' motion for judgment pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 52(c) filed 9/11/17; Commission's opposition filed 9/25/17.

Order granting in part and denying in part defendants' motion for judgment entered 8/16/18.

Stipulated proposed order voluntarily dismissing complaint filed 10/19/18; order entered 10/22/18.

FTC v. D-LINK SYSTEMS, INC., No. 3:17-cv-0039 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: D-Link Corporation

D-Link Systems, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Kevin Moriarty (BCP/DPIP)

Cathlin Tully Jarad Brown

Katherine McCarron Brian Berggren

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act

in connection with the design, marketing, and sale of routers and internet

protocol cameras.

Status: Complaint filed 1/5/17.

Defendant D-Link System's motion to dismiss filed 1/31/17;

Commission's opposition filed 2/14/17; reply filed 2/14/17; order

granting in part and denying in part entered 9/19/17.

Defendant D-Link Corporation's motion to dismiss for lack of jurisdiction filed 4/3/17; Commission's opposition filed 4/17/17; reply filed

4/24/17.

Stipulated order dismissing defendant D-Link Corporation without

prejudice entered 5/15/17.

Cross-motions for summary judgment by Commission and defendant D-

Link Systems filed 9/21/18; order denying motions entered

11/5/18.

Trial set for 6/3/19.

FTC v. DLUCA, No. 0:18-cv-60379 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Thomas Dluca

Louis Gatto Eric Pinkston Scott Chandler Assigned Attorneys: Jason Moon (SWR)

M. Hasan Aijaz

Nature of Action: Deceptive cryptocurrency chain referral scheme and earnings

representations in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act.

Status: Complaint filed 2/20/18.

TRO entered 3/12/18.

Preliminary injunction as to defendants Dluca, Gatto, and Chandler

entered 4/16/18; order modifying the preliminary injunction as to

defendant Gatto entered 10/11/18.

Defendants Chandler and Gatto's motion to dismiss filed 4/19/18; order

denying motion entered 9/5/18.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendant Pinkston entered

4/20/18.

Motion for order to show cause as to why defendant Chandler should not

be held in contempt for violating the preliminary injunction filed

10/5/18; order denying motion entered 11/16/18.

Ordering granting joint motion for sanctions for violation of preliminary

injunction as to defendant Dluca entered 10/29/18.

Trial set for week of 9/16/19.

FTC v. ECOLOGICAL FOX, LLC, No. 1:18-cv-3309 (D. Md.)

Parties: Ecological Fox, LLC

Luke Chadwick

Andris Pukke a/k/a Marc Romeo a/k/a Andy Storm

Peter Baker

Global Property Alliance, Inc. d/b/a Sanctuary Bay, Sanctuary Belize, The

Reserve, Kanantik, Laguna Palms, Bamboo Springs, Eco Futures,

Eco Futures Development, Eco Futures Belize, Sittee River

Wildlife Reserve, Buy Belize, Buy International

Sittee River Wildlife Reserve d/b/a Sanctuary Bay d/b/a Sanctuary Belize

d/b/a The Reserve

Buy Belize, Llc d/b/a Sanctuary Bay d/b/a Sanctuary Belize d/b/a The

Reserve d/b/a Kanantik d/b/a Laguna Palms d/b/a Bamboo Springs

Buy International, Inc. d/b/a Sanctuary Bay d/b/a Sanctuary Belize d/b/a

The Reserve d/b/a Kanantik d/b/a Laguna Palms d/b/a Bamboo

Springs

Foundation Development Management Inc.

Eco-Futures Development d/b/a Sanctuary Bay d/b/a Sanctuary Belize

d/b/a The Reserve

Eco-Futures Belize Limited d/b/a Sanctuary Bay d/b/a Sanctuary Belize

d/b/a The Reserve

Power Haus Marketing

Brandi Greenfield

BG Marketing, LLC

Prodigy Management Group, LLC

John Usher Rod Kazazi

Foundation Partners f/k/a Red Crane Advisors, Inc.

Frank Costanzo a/k/a Frank Green a/k/a Frank Peerless Green a/k/a Frank Connelly a/k/a Frank Connelly-Costanzo

Belize Real Estate Affiliates, LLC d/b/a Coldwell Banker Belize d/b/a Coldwell Banker Southern Belize

Exotic Investor, LLC d/b/a Coldwell Banker Belize d/b/a Coldwell Banker Southern Belize

Southern Blaze Realty, LLC d/b/a Coldwell Banker Belize d/b/a Coldwell Banker Southern Belize

Sanctuary Belize Property Owners' Association d/b/a The Reserve Property Owners' Association

Atlantic International Bank, Ltd.

Angela Chittenden

Beach Bunny Holdings, LLC

The Estate of John Pukke a/k/a The Estate of Janis Pukke a/k/a The Estate of John Andris Pukke

John Vipulis

Deborah Connelly

Newport Land Group, LLC a/k/a Laguna Palms a/k/a Sanctuary Belize a/k/a Bamboo Springs a/k/a The Reserve

Michael Santos

Assigned Attorneys: Jonathan Cohen (BCP/ENF)

Amanda Kostner Benjamin Theisman Elizabeth Averill Khouryanna DiPrima

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of

real estate investments and related services.

Status: Complaint filed 10/31/18.

TRO entered 11/11/18.

Motion for interim preliminary injunction filed 11/15/18; response in

opposition filed 11/16/18; reply filed 11/18/18.

Order extending TRO, to remain in effect as an interim preliminary

injunction through the conclusion of a show cause hearing, entered

11/20/18.

Defendant Atlantic International Bank, LTD's motion to dismiss by filed

12/14/18.

Defendant Andris Pukke's motion to transfer case to the Central District of California filed 12/14/18.

Notice of appeal from 11/20/18 order by defendant Atlantic National Bank

filed 12/19/18.

FTC v. ELECTRONIC PAYMENT SOLUTIONS OF AMERICA, INC., No. 2:17-cv-2535 (D. Ariz)

Parties: Electronic Payment Solutions of America, Inc.

Electronic Payment Services, Inc. KMA Merchant Services, LLC Dynasty Merchants, LLC

Jay Wigdore

Michael Abelmesseh aka Michael Stewart

Nikolas Mihilli

Electronic Payment Systems, LLC Electronic Payment Transfer, LLC

John Dorsey Thomas McCann Michael Peterson

Assigned Attorneys: Bikram Bandy (BCP/MP)

Karen Hobbs Michelle Chua

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with telemarketing scheme that told consumers they could earn thousands of dollars by

lending money to small businesses.

Status: Complaint filed 7/28/17.

First amended complaint filed 3/9/18.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against

defendants KMA Merchant Services LLC and Michael

Abdelmesseh entered 6/13/18.

Joint motion to approve consent judgment against defendants Dynasty

Merchants, LLC and Nikolas Mihilli filed 12/11/18; crossclaimants Electronic Payment Systems LLC and Electronic Payment Transfer LLC's response to motion filed 12/26/18;

Commission's reply filed 12/28/18.

FTC v. EMP MEDIA, INC., No. 2:18-cv-00035 (D. Nev.)

Parties: EMP Media, Inc., also d/b/a as MyEx.com, Post My Ad, T&A Media, or

Internet Secrets

Aniello Infante

Shad Applegate, a/k/a Shad Cotelli

One Or More Unknown Parties d/b/a Yeicox Ltd.

Nevada (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Megan Cox (BCP/DPIP)

Allison Lefrak

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive and unfair practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act

and in violation of state law in connection with the posting of intimate images of people, together with their personal information, without their

consent.

Status: Complaint filed 1/9/18.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to

defendant Aniello Infante entered 1/10/18.

Motion for default judgment against defendants EMP Media, Inc. and

Shad Applegate filed 6/14/18; motion granted and final order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered 6/18/18.

Order dismissing defendant Yeicox Ltd. for failure to timely serve entered

8/16/18.

FTC v. FEDERAL CHECK PROCESSING, INC., Nos. 16-3805, 16-3811 (2nd Cir.); No. 1:14-cv-00122 (W.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Federal Check Processing, Inc.

Federal Recoveries, LLC

Federal Processing Services, Inc.

Federal Processing, Inc.

United Check Processing, Inc. Central Check Processing, Inc. Central Processing Services, Inc. Nationwide Check Processing, Inc. American Check Processing, Inc. State Check Processing, Inc. Check Processing, Inc.

US Check Processing, Inc. Flowing Streams, F.S., Inc.

Mark Briandi William Moses

Empowered Racing, LLC, Relief Defendant

Assigned Attorneys: Katherine M. Worthman (BCP/FP)

Colin A. Hector

Michele Arington (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 and the Fair Debt

Collection Practices Act in connection with debt collection operation.

Status: Complaint filed 2/24/14.

Ex parte TRO entered 3/24/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 3/25/14.

Motion for summary judgment by Commission filed 8/27/15; opposition by William Moses filed 11/4/15; opposition by Mark Briandi filed

12/3/15; Commission's reply filed 1/12/16.

Order granting Commission's motion for summary judgment entered

8/12/16.

Judgment and permanent injunction entered 10/13/16.

Notices of appeal filed 11/8/16.

Briandi's opening brief filed 5/24/17; Commission's brief filed 8/23/17.

Oral argument heard 10/3/18.

FTC v. FORMS DIRECT, INC., No. 4:18-cv-06294 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: Forms Direct, Inc.

Cesare Alessandrini

Assigned Attorneys: Patricia Hsue (BCP/MP)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion or sale of

immigration and naturalization form preparation services.

Status: Complaint filed 10/15/18.

Order granting stipulation for permanent injunction and monetary

judgment entered 12/7/18.

FTC v. GERBER PRODUCTS, CO., No. 2:14-cv-6771 (D. N.J.)

Parties: Gerber Products Co., d/b/a Nestle Nutrition, d/b/a Nestle Infant Nutrition,

d/b/a Nestle Nutrition North America

Assigned Attorneys: Victor V. DeFrancis (BCP/AP)

Michelle K. Rusk Ella Krainsky

Andrew David Wone

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the

FTC Act in connection with the marketing of an infant formula purporting

to prevent allergies.

Status: Complaint filed 10/29/14.

Case stayed until 2/25/16.

Order extending stay of case entered 3/1/16.

Defendant's motion to dismiss for lack of subject matter jurisdiction or to stay pending decision in *FTC v. Shire ViroPharma* (3d Cir.) filed 11/9/18; response in opposition filed 12/3/18; reply filed 12/10/18.

FTC v. GLOBAL ACCESS TECHNICAL SUPPORT, No. 4:16-cv-01556 (E.D. Mo.)

Parties: Global Access Technical Support, LLC d/b/a Global S Connect, Yubdata

Tech, Technolive

Global SMind, LLC d/b/a Global S Connect

Source Pundit LLC d/b/a OneSource Tech Support

Helios Digital Media LLC VGlobal Ites Private Limited

Digicare Desk LLC Rajiv Chhatwal Rupinder Kaur Neeraj Dubey Harinder Singh

Assigned Attorneys: Elizabeth Scott (MWR)

Samantha Gordon Douglas McKenney

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with a telemarketing scheme that deceives consumers into purchasing unnecessary technical support or computer security services.

Status: Complaint filed 10/3/16.

Ex parte TRO entered 10/4/16.

Order extending ex parte TRO with asset freeze, appointment of a receiver

and other equitable relief as to defendants Global SMind, Neeraj Dubey, and VGlobal Ites Private Limited entered 10/14/16.

Preliminary injunction as to defendants Neeraj Dubey, Global SMind, and VGlobal Ites Private Limited entered 10/28/16.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Rupinder Kaur, Rajiv Chhatwal, Global Access Technical Support, Source Pundit, and

Helios Digital Media entered 11/15/16.

Amended complaint filed 12/20/16.

Stipulated permanent injunction as to defendants Rupinder Kaur and Harinder Singh entered 6/2/17.

Stipulated permanent injunction as to defendants Rajiv Chhatwal, Global Access Technical Support, Source Pundit, Helios Digital

Media, and Digicare Desk entered 6/6/17.

Clerk's entry of default as to defendant Global SMind entered 6/7/17.

Motion for clerk's entry of default as to defendants Neeraj Dubey and VGlobal Ites Private Limited filed 6/30/17.

Default judgment and permanent injunction as to defendants Global SMind, LLC, Neeraj Dubey, and VGlobal ITES Private Limited entered 7/27/17.

Order approving distribution of remaining receivership funds to Commission and authorizing wind up of receivership entered 5/18/18.

FTC v. GLOBAL PROCESSING SOLUTIONS, LLC, No. 1:17-cv-4192 (N.D. Ga.)

Parties: Global Processing Solutions, LLC

Intrinsic Solutions, LLC
North Center Collections, Inc.
Diverse Financial Enterprises, Inc.
American Credit Adjuster, LLC
Advanced Mediation Group, LLC
Apex National Services, LLC
Capital Security Investments, LLC

Mitchell & Maxwell, LLC Mirage Distribution, LLC

Lamar Snow

Glentis Wallace aka Glen Wallace

Jahaan McDuffie

Assigned Attorneys: Colin Hector (BCP/FP)

Patrick Roy

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in connection with the collection of

consumer debt.

Status: Complaint filed 10/23/17.

Ex Parte TRO entered 10/23/17.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Global Processing

Solutions, LLC, Intrinsic Solutions, LLC, North Center

Collections, Inc., Capital Security Investments, LLC, Diverse Financial Enterprises, Inc., LLC, Lamar Snow, Jahaan McDuffie,

and Glentis Wallace entered 11/15/17.

Unopposed preliminary injunction as to defendants American Credit

Adjusters, LLC, Advanced Mediation Group, LLC, Apex National

Services, LLC, Mitchell & MaxweU, LLC, and Mirage

Distribution, LLC entered 11/17/17.

Order granting Commission's motion to stay for 120 days pending final

settlement entered 5/21/18.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to

defendants Lamar Snow, Diverse Financial Enterprises, Inc.; North

Center Collections, Inc.; Global Processing Solutions, LLC; Intrinsic Solutions, LLC; Jahaan McDuffie; Capital Security Investments, LLC; American Credit Adjusters, LLC; and Glentis

Wallace entered 7/17/18.

Order for default judgment and permanent injunction and monetary relief as to defendants Advanced Mediation Group, LLC; Apex National

Services, LLC; Mitchell & Maxwell, LLC; and Mirage

Distribution entered 9/4/18.

FTC v. HELP THE VETS, INC., No. 6:18-cv-01153 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Help The Vets, Inc. d/b/a American Disabled Veterans Foundation,

Inc. d/b/a Military Families of America d/b/a Veterans Emergency Blood Bank d/b/a Veterans Fighting Breast Cancer d/b/a Vets

Fighting Breast Cancer

Neil G. Paulson, Sr.

State of Florida (Plaintiff)

State of California State of Maryland State of Minnesota State of Ohio State of Oregon

Assigned Attorneys: Laura Fremont (WRSF)

Tracy S. Thorleifson (NWR)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with soliciting charitable contributions purportedly to assist wounded or disabled veterans.

Status: Complaint for permanent injunction and other relief filed 7/18/18.

Stipulated order for final judgment and permanent injunction entered

11/21/18.

FTC v. HIGHER GOALS MARKETING LLC, No. 6:17-cv-02048 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Higher Goals Marketing LLC

Sunshine Freedom Services LLC

Brandun L Anderson Lea A. Brownell Melissa M. Deese Gerald D. Starr, Jr. Travis L. Teel Wayne T. Norris Assigned Attorneys: Tejasvi Srimushnam (BCP/MP)

Joshua A. Doan Rhonda Perkins

Nature of Action: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the sale of interest-rate-reduction services to consumers struggling with credit card

debt.

Status: Complaint filed 11/29/17.

Stipulated preliminary injunctions against all defendants and order

appointing receiver entered 12/28/17.

Order granting motion to stay proceedings pending Commission approval

of proposed settlements entered 6/8/18.

Unopposed motion for entry of stipulated orders for permanent injunction

and monetary relief as to defendants Brandun Anderson, Lea Brownell, Wayne Norris, Gerald Starr, Jr, Sunshine Freedom Services LLC, Travis Teel, and Melissa Deese filed 8/9/18.

FTC v. HITE MEDIA GROUP LLC, No. 2:18-cv-02221 (D. Ariz.)

Parties: Hite Media Group LLC d/b/a Premium Grants d/b/a PremiumGrants.com

Premium Business Solutions LLC d/b/a Premium Grants d/b/a

PremiumGrants.com d/b/a Premium Services

Premium Domain Services LLC d/b/a Premium Grants d/b/a

PremiumGrants.com d/b/a Premium Services

2 Unique LLC d/b/a Unique Services d/b/a Unique Grants d/b/a

UniqueGrants.com d/b/a Grant Support

Amazing App LLC Michael Ford Hilliard Michael De Rosa Shawn Stumbo Tiffany Hoffman Jeremy Silvers

Assigned Attorneys: Ronnie Brooke (BCP/MP)

Russell Deitch

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the sale and

offering for sale of grants services.

Status: Complaint filed 7/16/18.

Ex parte TRO with asset freeze entered 7/17/18.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Hilliard, Hoffman, De Rosa, Hite Media Group, LLC, 2 Unique, LLC, and Amazing App, LLC entered 7/31/18.

Preliminary injunction as to unstipulated defendants Shawn Stumbo, Jeremy Silvers, Premium Business Solutions, and Premium Domain Services entered 7/31/18.

Application for entry of default against defendants Shawn Stumbo, Premium Domain Services, Jeremy Silvers, and Premium Business Solutions filed 8/28/18; clerk's entry of default entered 8/29/18.

Joint motion to stay for 60 days pending filing of stipulated orders for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants Michael Ford Hilliard, Amazing APP, LLC, Hite Media Group, LLC, Michael De Rosa, Tiffany Hoffman, and 2 Unique LLC filed 11/9/18; order granting motion entered 11/19/18.

FTC v. HORNBEAM SPECIAL SITUATIONS, LLC, No. 1:17-cv-03094 (N.D. Ga.)

Parties: Hornbeam Special Situations, LLC

Cardinal Points Holdings, LLC

Cardinal Points Management, LLC d/b/a Clear Compass Digital Group

Gyroscope Management Holdings, LLC

EDebitPay, LLC

Platinum Online Group, LLC d/b/a Premier Membership Clubs

Clickxchange Media, LLC iStream Financial Services, Inc.

Jerry L. Robinson Earl G. Robinson James McCarter Keith Merrill Mark Ward

Dale Paul Cleveland William R. Wilson

Kris Axberg Richard Joachim Chet Andrews

Patricia Brandmeier Robinson [executor of estate of Jerry L. Robinson]

Assigned Attorneys: R. Michael Waller (BCP/ENF)

Korin Felix

Elizabeth J. Averill Omolara Joseney Reenah L. Kim Hong Park

Nature of Action: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act,

Section 4 of Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act, and the FTC's

Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing of various products or services, including memberships in online discount clubs, to consumers seeking payday, cash advance, or other subprime loans.

Status:

Complaint filed 8/15/17.

- Consent motion to stay case for 90 days as to defendant Keith Merrill filed 10/6/17; order granting stay entered 10/11/17.
- Consent motion to stay case and suspend filing obligations upon the death of defendant Jerry L. Robinson filed 11/15/17; order granting consent motion entered 11/21/17.
- Motions to dismiss by defendants Mark Ward, Dale Paul Cleveland, EDebitPay, LLC, William Wilson, Kris Axberg, Richard Joachim, iStream Financial Services, Inc, and Earl Robinson filed 2/9/18; response in opposition 2/23/18; opinion and order denying motion entered 4/16/18.
- Motion to dismiss by defendant by Patricia Brandmeier Robinson filed 3/22/18; response in opposition 4/5/18; order denying motion entered 4/16/18.
- Motion to dismiss complaint for lack of subject matter jurisdiction by defendants Chet Andrews, Kris Axberg, Dale Paul Cleveland, EDebitPay,LLC, Richard Joachim, James McCarter, Earl G. Robinson, Patricia Brandmeier Robinson, Mark Ward, William R. Wilson, iStream Financial Services, Inc. filed 4/20/18; response in opposition filed 5/4/18; reply filed 5/11/18; order denying motion, but ordering supplemental briefing on part of the court's 4/16/18 opinion, entered 7/11/18.
- Defendants' response to court's 7/11/18 request for supplemental briefing filed 7/23/18; Commission's response to court's request filed 7/30/18.
- Order vacating part of court's 4/16/18 opinion and granting Commission leave to file an amended complaint entered 10/15/18.

Amended complaint filed 11/5/18.

Motions to dismiss for failure to state a claim by defendants iStream Financial Services, Inc, Chet Andrews, Patricia Brandmeier Robinson, Dale Paul Cleveland, EDebitPay, LLC, William Wilson, James McCarter, Mark Ward, and Earl Robinson filed 11/15/18; response in opposition filed 12/13/18.

FTC v. HYLAN ASSET MANAGEMENT LLC, No. 1:18-cv-00710 (W.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Hylan Asset Management LLC

Worldwide Processing Group LLC Worldwide Processing d/b/a Forward Movement Recovery d/b/a FMR

Andrew Shaevel Frank A Ungaro, Jr.

State of New York (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Michael White (BCP/FP)

Matthew Wilshire

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in connection with the collection,

marketing, and sale of phony and unauthorized debt portfolios.

Status: Complaint filed 6/26/18.

Stipulated TRO entered 6/29/18.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 7/9/18.

FTC v. IMPETUS ENTERPRISE, INC., No. 8:18-cv-01987 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Impetus Enterprise, Inc. d/b/a Aiding Student Relief d/b/a Aiding Student

and Teachers d/b/a Aidnest d/b/a Avec Staffing d/b/a National

Education Student and Teacher

Fig Tree and Co., LLC d/b/a Aiding Student Relief d/b/a Aiding Students

and Teacher d/b/a Aiding Students and Teachers Tuan Dinh Duong a/k/a Thomas Duong a/k/a Thomas Dinh

Brenda Avitia-Pena

Brian Colombana d/b/a Futero

Noel Solutions, LLC Jimmy Calderon

Premier Capital Investments Capital Sun Investments

Assigned Attorneys: Barbara Chun (WRLA)

Brian Welke (BCP/ENF)

Joshua Millard

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and

sale of student loan debt relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 11/6/18.

Ex parte TRO with asset freeze and other relief entered 11/13/18.

Preliminary injunction with asset freeze and other relief entered 11/29/18.

FTC v. INNOVATIVE DESIGNS, INC., No. 2:16-cv-1669 (W.D. Pa.)

Parties: Innovative Designs, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Alejandro Rosenberg (BCP/ENF)

Omolara Bewaji Joseney

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with the advertising of Insultex House Wrap.

Status: Complaint filed 11/3/16.

Trial set for 7/29/19.

FTC v. INTEGRATED FLIGHT SOLUTIONS LLC, No. 3:18-cv-01658 (D. Ore.)

Parties: Integrated Flight Solutions LLC d/b/a NoveltyExcuses.com

Steven Simmons

Assigned Attorneys: Katherine White (BC/DPIP)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with the marketing and sale of fake financial, identity, and

medical documents.

Status: Complaint filed 9/13/18.

Stipulated permanent injunction entered 9/17/18.

FTC v. LENDING CLUB CORP., No. 3:18-cv-02454 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: Lending Club Corporation d/b/a Lending Club

Assigned Attorneys: Katharine Roller (BCP/FP)

Matthew Wilshire

David Lincicum (BCP/DPIP)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive and unfair acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the

FTC Act and the Privacy of Consumer Financial Information Rule in connection with the advertising, promotion, and sale of unsecured loans.

Status: Complaint filed 4/25/18.

Motion to dismiss complaint filed 6/18/18; response in opposition filed 7/18/18; reply in support of motion filed 8/1/18; order granting

motion in part and denying in part entered 10/3/18.

First amended complaint filed 10/22/18.

FTC v. LIFE MANAGEMENT SERVICES OF ORANGE COUNTY, INC., No. 6:16-cv-00982 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Life Management Services of Orange County, Inc.

Loyal Financial and Credit Services LLC d/b/a FOC Credit and Reward

Services
IVD Recovery LLC
KWP Services LLC

KWP Services of Florida LLC

LPSOFFLA LLC

LPSOFFLORIDA LLC

PW&F Consultants of Florida LLC

UAD Secure Services LLC

UAD Secure Service of Florida LLC

URB Management LLC YCC Solutions LLC YFP Solutions LLC

Kevin Guice Chase Jackowski Linda McNealy

Clarence Wahl a/k/a Harry Wahl

Karen Wahl Robert Guice Timothy Woods

State of Florida (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Tejasvi Srimushnam (BCP/MP)

Joshua Doan

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act,

the Telemarketing Sales Rule, and the Florida Deceptive and Unfair Trade

Practices Act in connection with the sale of debt relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 6/7/16.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 6/30/16.

Motion for summary judgment as to defendant Kevin Guice filed 5/1/17; opposition filed 5/30/17; Commission's reply filed 6/14/17; order granting summary judgment and permanent injunction entered

12/7/18.

Notice of stipulated proposed orders for permanent injunction and

monetary judgment against all defendants except Kevin Guice filed

9/1/17.

Order for permanent injunction and monetary relief against Kevin Guice

entered 12/7/18.

Summary judgment against Kevin Guice entered 12/10/18.

FTC v. LIFEWATCH, No. 16-2310 (7th Cir.); No. 1:15-cv-5781 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: Lifewatch Inc. d/b/a Lifewatch USA and Medical Alarm Systems

Evan Sirlin

Safe Home Security, Inc. Medguard Alert, Inc.

Michael May David Roman Assigned Attorneys: David O'Toole (MWR)

Samantha Gordon Roberto Menjivar

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive and unfair acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the

FTC Act, the Telemarketing Act, and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with robocalls that pitched seniors "free" medical alert

systems.

Status: Complaint filed 6/30/15.

Motion for preliminary injunction filed 7/6/15. Preliminary injunction hearing held 12/14/15. Preliminary injunction entered 3/31/16.

Notice of appeal filed 5/31/16. Amended complaint filed 7/14/16.

Order suspending appeal pending court-ordered mediation entered

7/26/16.

Defendants David Roman, Safe Home Security, Inc. and Medguard Alert,

Inc.'s and defendant Mitchel May's motions for summary

judgment filed 12/27/17; Commission's response in opposition to

motions filed 2/26/18.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 12/27/17; defendants' opposition filed 2/26/18; Commission's reply filed 3/19/18.

Order denying parties' cross-motions for summary judgment entered

9/24/18.

Trial set for 7/15/19.

FTC v. MAIL TREE, No. 0:15-cv-61034 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Awards Research Consultant, LLC

John Leon

MCP Marketing Activities, LLC d/b/a Magellan Mail and Magellan

Marketing

Mail Tree Inc.

Mailpro Americas Corp.

Masterpiece Marketing, LLC d/b/a Affiliated Opportunities Group

d/b/a Corporate Accounting Authority d/b/a Dispatch Notifications

Services d/b/a Information Reporting Group d/b/a Priority

Information Exchange

Michael McKay Co. Matthew Pisoni Serena Pisoni Marcus Pradel Victor Ramirez

Romeria Global, LLC d/b/a Lowenstein Varick and Nagel

Spin Mail, Inc.

Supreme Media, LLC

Trans National Concepts, Inc.

Vernier Holdings, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Guy Ward (MWR)

Douglas McKenney

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with sweepstakes scam.

Status: Complaint filed 5/18/15.

Ex parte TRO entered 5/19/15.

Preliminary injunction against all defendants except Marcus Pradel and

Trans National Concepts entered 6/12/15.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Marcus Pradel and

Trans National Concepts entered 6/12/15.

Order staying case entered 6/12/15.

FTC v. MDK MEDIA, INC., No. 2:14-cv-05099 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: MDK Media Inc. d/b/a SE Ventures d/b/a GMK Communications d/b/a

EMG

Makonnen Demessow Kebede

Tendenci Media LLC

Sarah Brekke

Mindkontrol Industries LLC Christopher Thomas Denovellis

Anacapa Media LLC Wayne Calvin Byrd

Bear Communications LLC James Matthew Dawson Network One Commerce Inc.

Casey Lee Adkisson Erdi Development LLC Erdolo Levy Eromo Ocean Tactics LLC Fraser R. Thompson

Phwoar LLC

Darcy Michael Wedd Concise Consulting, Inc. MMJX Consulting, Inc. Michael Peter Pajaczkowski

Assigned Attorneys: Faye C. Barnouw (WRLA)

Maricela Segura

Barbara Y K Chun Kenneth H. Abbe

Alleged Conduct: Unfair and deceptive practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act in

connection with placing unauthorized third-party charges on consumers'

mobile phone bills, or "cramming."

Status: Complaint filed 7/3/14.

TRO entered 7/3/14.

First amended complaint filed 10/6/14.

Motion to dismiss and motion to strike portions of complaint filed

11/7/14; opposition filed 11/17/14; reply filed 11/24/14; motion

denied 12/4/14.

Final orders for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against

defendants MDK Media Inc., Makonnen Demessow Kebede,

Tendenci Media LLC, Sarah Brekke, Mindkontrol Industries LLC,

Christopher Thomas Denovellis, Anacapa Media LLC, Wayne Calvin Byrd II, Bear Communications LLC, James Matthew

Dawson, Network One Commerce Inc., and Casey Lee Adkisson

entered 5/6/15.

Order granting U.S. Attorney's application to intervene and staying case

for 90 days entered 7/23/15.

Order staying case entered 10/20/15.

FTC v. MOBE LTD., Nos. 18-13715, 18-13716 (11th Cir.); No. 6:18-cv-00862 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: MOBE Ltd.

MOBEProcessing.com, Inc.

Transaction Management USA, Inc.

MOBETraining.com, Inc.

MOBE Pro Limited

MOBE Online Ltd.

9336-0311 Quebec, Inc. d/b/a Business Education Training

MattLloydPublishing.com Pty Ltd.

MOBE Inc.

Matthew Lloyd McPhee a/k/a Matt Lloyd

Russell W. Whitney, Jr.

Susan Zanghi

Assigned Attorneys: Bikram Bandy (BCP/MP)

Sung Kim

Benjamin Davidson

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with the marketing and sale of an online business education

program.

Status: Complaint filed 6/4/18.

Ex parte TRO entered 6/5/18; order extending TRO entered 6/19/18. Emergency motion for relief from TRO and, to extent necessary, to intervene by Qualpay, Inc. filed 6/22/18

Motion to approve stipulated preliminary injunction as to Defendant Susan Zanghi filed 6/25/18; order granting motion entered 8/20/18.

Motion to approve stipulated preliminary injunction as to Defendant Russell Whitney filed 7/3/18; order granting motion entered 8/20/18.

Motion by interested party Synovus Bank for emergency relief from TRO and to intervene filed 7/10/18.

Ordering denying motion for emergency relief by intervenor Qualpay, Inc. and Synovus Bank entered 8/8/18.

Motion by Synovus Bank for clarification regarding order filed 8/13/18; order denying motion for clarification entered 8/16/18.

Notice of appeal (No. 18-13715), as to 8/8/18 court order, by Synovus Bank filed 8/31/18; order granting motion to voluntarily dismiss appeal entered 11/13/18.

Notice of appeal (No. 18-13716), as to 8/16/18 court order, by intervenor Qualpay, Inc. filed 8/31/18.

Order granting consent motion to stay all proceedings as to defendant Susan Zanghi filed 10/24/18.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against defendant Susan Zanghi entered 12/6/18.

FTC v. MONEYGRAM INTERNATIONAL, INC., No. 1:09-cv-06576 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: MoneyGram International, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Karen D. Dodge (MWR)

Joannie T. Wei

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the

Telemarketing Act, and FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in the course of

providing money transfer services to consumers.

Status: Complaint filed 10/19/09.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and final judgment entered

10/21/09.

Commission's motion for entry of stipulated order for compensatory relief

and modified order for permanent injunction, as a result of MoneyGram's violations of the 2009 order, filed 11/8/18.

Stipulated order for compensatory relief and modified order for permanent

injunction entered 11/13/18.

FTC v. MOORE, No. 5:18-cv-01960 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Katrina Moore, individually and also d/b/a as Innovative Paycheck

Solutions d/b/a FakePayStubOnline.com

Assigned Attorneys: Kenneth Abbe (WRLA)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with the marketing and sale of fake pay stubs, fake bank statements, fake tax forms, and a service for falsifying real bank

statements.

Status: Complaint filed 9/13/18.

Order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered 9/17/18.

FTC v. MYTEL INTERNATIONAL, INC., No. 2:87-cv-07259 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Mytel International, Inc.

Gilbert N. Michaels Gerald Feldman

Assigned Attorneys: Reenah L. Kim (BCP/ENF)

Elsie B. Kappler

John D. Jacobs (WRLA) Mark S. Hegedus (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Violation of 1988 permanent injunction order regarding deceptive acts and

Practices in connection with the sale of photocopier toner.

Status: Complaint filed 10/29/87.

Final judgment entered 11/16/88.

Commission's motion for contempt filed 4/17/14.

Defendants motion to stay filed 6/16/14. Order granting stay entered 11/6/14. Order lifting stay entered 4/15/15.

FTC v. NATIONAL UROLOGICAL GROUP, INC., No. 10-125 (S. Ct); Nos. 17-15695,

14-13131, 14-13972, 09-10617 (11th Cir.); No. 1:04-cv-03294 (N.D. Ga.)

Parties: National Urological Group, Inc., d/b/a Warner Laboratories

National Institute for Clinical Weight Loss, Inc.

Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Jared Wheat Thomasz Holda Michael Howell Stephen Smith Terrill Mark Wright, M.D.

Assigned Attorneys: Sydney M. Knight (BCP/AP)

Tawana E. Davis Edward Glennon Mary Johnson

Leslie Melman (OGC) Amanda Basta (BCP/ENF)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive practices in violation of Sections 5 and 12 in connection with

the sale of a purported weight loss product.

Status: Complaint filed 11/10/04.

Final judgment entered 12/16/08. Notice of appeal filed 2/4/09.

Opinion affirming district court order entered 12/15/09.

Petition for rehearing en banc filed 1/29/10; order denying petition entered 4/26/10.

Appellant's petition for a writ of certiorari filed 7/23/10; Commission's opposition filed 9/24/10; appellant's petition denied 11/1/10.

Commission's motion to hold defendants Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Stephen Smith and Jared Wright in contempt filed 11/1/11; defendant's opposition filed 12/2/11.

Commission's motion to hold defendant Terrill Mark Wright in contempt filed 3/21/12.

Order to show cause why defendants Wright, Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Stephen Smith, and Jared Wright should not be held in contempt entered 5/11/12; response filed 11/13/12.

Motion for contempt judgment filed 10/22/12; defendants' response filed 2/14/12; Commission's reply brief filed 1/10/13.

Order finding defendants liable for contempt and ordering further proceedings on remedy entered 8/8/13.

Trial on contempt remedies held on 1/21/14 - 1/24/14.

Order holding defendants liable for contempt and directing compensatory sanctions to redress consumers entered 5/14/14.

Defendants' notices of appeal filed 7/11/14 and 7/14/14.

Order by district court imposing coercive contempt sanction and directing that defendants Jared Wheat and Stephen Smith be incarcerated until they comply with product recall entered 9/2/14.

Petition for mandamus by defendants Wheat and Smith seeking to overturn coercive contempt order filed 9/4/14; denied 9/4/14.

Notice of appeal from coercive contempt order and emergency motion for a stay by defendants Wheat and Smith filed 9/4/14; Commission's opposition filed 9/5/14; motion for stay denied 9/5/14; motion to voluntarily dismiss appeal filed 9/8/14; appeal no. 14-13972 dismissed 10/15/14.

- Motion to purge contempt defendants of contempt filed 9/26/14; Commission's opposition filed 9/26/14.
- Second motion to purge contempt defendants or release contempt defendants pending determination of less restrictive mean to purge contempt filed 10/16/14; Commission's response filed 1/13/15; granted 1/20/15.
- Motion to stay execution of judgment pending appeal entered 10/30/14; denied 1/23/15.
- Appellants' briefs (No. 14-13131) filed 10/30/14.
- Order that the US Marshal's Service release Jared Wheat and Stephen Smith from incarceration entered 11/10/14.
- Commission's answering brief (No. 14-13131) filed 1/9/15; appellants' reply briefs filed 2/17/15.
- Oral argument in Eleventh Circuit held 4/17/15.
- Opinion vacating district court's judgment of contempt and remanding case to district court for further proceedings entered 5/5/15.
- Commission's motion for clarification filed 6/4/15; Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals response filed 6/18/15.
- Commission's motion for entry of contempt judgement relating to Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Jared Wheat, and Stephen Smith's violation of section VI and motion for compensatory sanctions filed 8/20/15; opposition filed 10/9/15; Commission's reply filed 10/26/15; order denying motion with leave to refile entered 11/4/15.
- Contempt hearing held 3/27/17 4/7/17.
- Final judgment against defendants Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Jared Wheat, and Stephen Smith, and Terrill Mark Wright entered 10/31/17.
- Defendants Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Stephen Smith and Jared Wheat's notice of appeal filed 12/21/17; appellants' briefs filed 3/30/18; Commission's answering brief filed 6/14/18; reply briefs filed 7/30/18.

FTC v. NEXT-GEN, INC., No. 4:18-cv-00128 (W.D. Mo.)

Parties:

- Next-Gen, Inc. d/b/a Award Notification Services d/b/a Cash Claim Advisors d/b/a Central Award Distribution d/b/a International Award Services d/b/a National Award Commission d/b/a Prize Notification Services Foundation d/b/a Security Dispatch, Ltd.
- Westport Enterprises, Inc. d/b/a Cash Claim Advisors d/b/a Security Dispatch, Ltd. d/b/a Award Prize Advisory d/b/a Award Review Board d/b/a National Awards Commission
- Opportunities Unlimited Publications, Inc. d/b/a Entertainment Awards Center d/b/a International Award Payment Center d/b/a North American Awards Center d/b/a Puzzle Mania
- Opportunities Management Co.

Summit Management Team, LLC

Contest America Publishers, Inc. d/b/a Entertainment Award Company d/b/a International Awards Payment Center

Reveal Publications, LLC d/b/a National Research Company d/b/a Fortune Research Bureau d/b/a Financial Report Services

Aosr Corporation d/b/a Subscription Reporter Corporation (formerly known as Sweepstakes Reporter Co., Inc.) d/b/a American

Sweepstakes Publisher d/b/a National Bureau

Lighthouse Fla Enterprises, LLC

Gamer Designs, LLC Kevin R. Brandes William J. Graham

State of Missouri (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Sarah Shifley (NWR)

Richard McKewen

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with the worldwide distribution of deceptive sweepstakes and

other prize mailers.

Status: Complaint filed 2/20/18.

Motion for TRO filed 2/20/18; Commission's brief in support of motion filed 2/23/18; brief in opposition filed 3/8/18; reply filed 3/22/18;

order granting TRO entered 7/17/18.

Motion to dismiss case filed 3/29/18; brief in support filed 3/29/18;

Commission's brief in opposition filed 4/1/18; reply filed 4/26/18;

order denying motion entered 9/10/18.

Trial set for 4/1/19.

FTC v. NOBETES CORP., No. 2:18-cv-10068 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Nobetes Corporation a/k/a Side Effects Solutions Corporation

Marvin Silver Jeffrey Fleitman

Assigned Attorneys: Janet Evans (BCP/DAP)

Robert Quigley (WRLA)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC

Act in connection with the advertising and labeling, offering for sale, sale,

or distribution of Nobetes, a purported diabetes treatment.

Status: Complaint filed 12/3/18.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered

12/13/18.

FTC v. OMICS GROUP, INC., No. 2:16-cv-02022 (D. Nev.)

Parties: OMICS Group, Inc. d/b/a OMICS Publishing Group

iMedPub, LLC

Conference Series, LLC

Srinubabu Gedela

Assigned Attorneys: Iona Rusu (BCP/FP)

Gregory Ashe

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act in

connection with the publishing of online publications styled as academic

journals.

Status: Complaint filed 8/25/16.

Commission's motion for preliminary injunction filed 9/8/16.

Defendants' motion to dismiss or, in alternative, summary judgment, filed 1/6/17; Commission's opposition filed 1/19/17; reply filed 2/2/17.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 5/1/18; response to

motion filed 6/22/18; reply filed 7/6/18.

Defendants' motion for summary judgment filed 5/1/18; Commission's

response to motion filed 5/22/18; reply filed 6/22/18.

FTC v. PASSPORT IMPORTS, INC., No. 8:18-cv-03118 (D. Md.)

Parties: Passport Imports, Inc. d/b/a Passport Toyota

Passport Motorcars, Inc. d/b/a Passport Infiniti of Alexandria d/b/a Passport Nissan of Alexandria d/b/a Passport Nissan of Marlow

Heights

Autos International, Inc. d/b/a Passport Infiniti of Suitland Jay A. Klein

Everett A Hellmuth, III

Temecula Equity Group, LLC d/b/a Overflowworks.com

Jeffrey R Bush

Assigned Attorneys: Thomas Kane (BCP/FP)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with the mailing tens of thousands of fake "urgent recall"

notices to consumers to lure them to visit car dealerships.

Status: Complaint filed 10/10/18.

Stipulated orders for permanent injunction as to defendants Passport

Imports Inc.; Passport Motorcars, Inc; Autos International, Inc.; Temecula Equity Group, LLC; and Jeffrey Bush entered 11/27/18.

FTC v. PETERSON, No. 4:18-cv-00049 (D. Utah)

Parties: Travis Deloy Peterson a/k/a Travis Peterson a/k/a T. D. Peterson d/b/a

Veterans of America d/b/a Telefunding d/b/a Vehicles for Veterans d/b/a Saving Our Soldiers d/b/a Donate Your Car d/b/a Donate

That Car d/b/a Act of Valor d/b/a Medal of Honor

Assigned Attorneys: Fil M. de Banate (ECR)

Adrienne Jenkins

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act and

FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with soliciting

contributions to a purported charity for veterans.

Status: Complaint filed 7/10/18.

TRO entered 7/10/18.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 7/20/18.

FTC v. POINTBREAK MEDIA, LLC, No. 0:18-cv-61017 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: PointBreak Media, LLC d/b/a Point Break Media d/b/a Point Break

Solutions d/b/a Kivanni Marketing DCP Marketing, LLC d/b/a Point Break

Modern Spotlight Group LLC Modern Spotlight

Modern Spotlight LLC

Modern Internet Marketing LLC

Modern Source Media, LLC Modern Source

Perfect Image Online LLC

Dustin Pillonato Justin Ramsey

Aaron Michael Jones aka Michael Aaron Jones aka Mike Jones

Ricardo Diaz Michael Pocker Steffan Molina Allstar Data, LLC

National Business Listings, LLC

Pinnacle Presence LLC

Vincent Yates Daniel Carver

Stephanie Watt (Relief Defendant) Jennefer Ramsey (Relief Defendant)

Assigned Attorneys: Brian M. Welke (BCP/ENF)

Christopher J. Erickson Evan M. Mendelson

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

the course of marketing, offering for sale, and selling Google listing or

search engine optimization services.

Status: Complaint filed 5/7/18.

TRO entered 5/8/18.

Preliminary injunction as to defendant Ricardo Diaz entered 5/25/18. Preliminary injunction as to defendants Steffan Molina and Perfect Image Online LLC entered 6/6/18.

Clerk's entry of default as to defendants PointBreak Media; DCP Marketing, LLC; Modern Source Media, LLC; and Aaron Michael Jones entered 6/28/18.

Order granting Commission's motion for preliminary injunction as to defendants Allstar Data, LLC, National Business Listings, LLC, Pinnacle Presence LLC, Vincent Yates, and Daniel Carver, and relief defendants Stephanie Watt and Jennefer Ramsey entered 8/13/18.

Motion to vacate and/or set aside preliminary injunction by relief defendants Jennefer Ramsey and Stephanie Watts filed 8/13/18; order granting motion, giving defendants time to respond to Commission's motion for preliminary injunction, entered 8/14/18.

Defendants' response to Commission's motion for a preliminary injunction filed 8/16/18; Commission's reply file 8/23/18.

Order granting preliminary injunction entered 8/30/18.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to relief defendants Stephanie Watt and Jennefer Ramsey entered 8/31/18.

Commission's motion for summary judgment as to defendants Dustin Pillonato and Justin Ramsey filed 12/18/18.

Trial set for 4/15/19.

FTC v. PUBLISHERS BUSINESS SERVICES, INC., Nos. 17-15600; 11-17270 (9th Cir.); No. 2:08-cv-620 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Publishers Business Services, Inc.

Ed Dantuma Enterprises, Inc. d/b/a Publishers Direct Services d/b/a

Publishers Business Services

Persis Dantuma

Brenda Dantuma Schang

Dries Dantuma Dirk Dantuma Jeffrey Dantuma Edward Fred Dantuma

Assigned Attorneys: Faye Chen Barnouw (WRLA)

Maricela Segura Karen Goff (WRSF) Leslie Melman (OGC)

Joel Marcus

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of section 5(a) and the

Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of

magazine subscriptions.

Status: Complaint filed 5/14/08.

Amended complaint filed 2/5/09.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 7/31/09; opposition

filed 11/23/09; reply filed 12/7/09.

Order granting the Commission's motion for summary judgment entered

4/7/10.

Order for permanent injunction as to all defendants entered 4/7/10.

Commission's opening brief on the issue of damages filed 4/20/10.

Final judgment as to all defendants entered 7/25/11.

Commission's opening brief filed 2/13/12; defendants' answering brief

filed 4/13/12; reply brief filed 5/11/12.

Memorandum disposition remanding case to district court

entered 9/19/13.

Petition for writ of certiorari filed 2/27/14.

Petition for writ of certiorari denied 6/9/14.

Commission's motion for monetary judgment filed 5/31/16; defendants' brief on damages filed 7/19/16; Commission's reply filed 8/9/16.

Order granting Commission's motion for judgment entered 3/2/17.

Notice of appeal filed 3/31/17.

Appellants' opening brief filed 8/30/17; Commission's answering brief

filed 10/30/17; reply brief filed 12/20/17.

Oral argument held 8/15/18.

Opinion affirming judgment of the district court entered 8/31/18.

Appellants' petition for rehearing filed 10/15/18; Commission's

opposition filed 12/20/18.

FTC v. QUALCOMM, INC., No. 5:17-cv-00220 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: Qualcomm, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: J. Alexander Ansaldo (BC/ACP)

Dana Abrahamsen Joseph Baker Wesley Carson Kente Cox Rajesh James

Philip Kehl

Lin Kahn (WRSF)

Alleged Conduct: Unfair methods of competition in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC

Act in connection with defendant's maintenance of a monopoly in

baseband processors and semiconductor devices.

Status: Complaint filed 1/17/17.

Motion to dismiss filed 4/3/17; Commission's opposition filed 5/12/17;

reply filed 5/16/17; order denying motion entered 6/26/17. Commission's motion for partial summary judgment filed 8/30/18; Qualcomm's opposition filed 9/24/18; reply filed 10/4/18.

Order granting Commission's motion for partial summary judgment

entered 11/6/18. Trial set for 1/4/19.

FTC v. QUINCY BIOSCIENCE HOLDING CO., INC., No. 17-3745 (2nd Cir.); No. 1:17-cv-124 (S.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Quincy Bioscience Holding Company, Inc.

Quincy Bioscience, LLC

Prevagen, Inc. d/b/a Sugar River Supplements Quincy Bioscience Manufacturing, LLC

Mark Underwood Michael Beaman

State of New York (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Michelle Rusk (BCP/AP)

Annette Soberatas

Bradley D. Grossman (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) and 12 of the

FTC Act, the New York Executive Law, and the New York General Business Law, in connection with the marketing of defendants' purported

memory improvement supplement, Prevagen.

Status: Complaint filed 1/9/17.

Motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim filed 4/6/17; Commission's opposition filed 4/25/17; reply filed 5/5/17; order granting motion

entered 9/29/17.

Commission's notice of appeal filed 11/21/17.

Commission's opening brief filed 2/28/18; appellees' brief filed 5/30/18; Commission's reply filed 6/13/18; appellees' corrected brief filed

6/15/18; Commission's corrected brief filed 7/17/18.

Oral argument scheduled for 2/8/19.

FTC v. REGENERATIVE MEDICAL GROUP, INC., No. 8:18-cv-01838 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Regenerative Medical Group, Inc.

Telehealth Medical Group, Inc.

Bryn Jarald Henderson

Assigned Attorneys: Annette Soberats (BCP/DAP)

Tawana Davis

Delilah Vinzon (WRLA)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC

Act in connection with the labeling, advertising, marketing, distribution, and sale of stem cell therapy to treat, cure, and mitigate various diseases

and health conditions

Status: Complaint filed 10/12/18.

Stipulated permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered 10/25/18.

FTC v. ROCA LABS, INC., No. 8:15-cv-2231 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Roca Labs, Inc.

Roca Labs Nutraceutical USA, Inc.

Don Juravin

George C. Whiting

Assigned Attorneys: Carl H. Settlemyer (BCP/AP)

Paul Bryan Spelman

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act in connection with the

deceptive marketing of weight loss products.

Status: Complaint filed 9/24/15.

Stipulated TRO entered 9/29/15.

Preliminary injunction entered 10/29/15.

Order granting joint motion to stay case for 120 days entered 4/20/16.

Stipulated TRO entered 8/22/16.

Stipulated preliminary injunction with asset freeze and other equitable

relief entered 9/13/16.

Commission's motion for summary judgment as to all defendants filed

3/24/17; defendants opposition filed 5/9/17; reply filed 5/22/17; Commission's notice to court of pending motion filed 12/8/17.

Defendants' motion for partial summary judgment filed 3/24/17;

Commission's opposition filed 4/24/17; reply filed 5/22/17.

Order staying all remaining case deadlines entered 7/26/17.

Suggestion of bankruptcy by Roca Labs, Inc filed 11/18/17; response by

Commission filed 11/21/17.

Commission's amended motion for summary judgment as to all

defendants filed 4/26/18; defendants' opposition to motion filed

5/29/18; Commission's reply filed 6/12/18.

Permanent injunction and monetary judgment against all defendants

entered 11/6/18.

FTC v. SELLERS PLAYBOOK, INC., No. 0:18-cv-02207 (D. Minn.)

Parties: Sellers Playbook, Inc.

Exposure Marketing Company d/b/a Sellers Online d/b/a Sellers Systems

Jessie Conners Tieva Matthew R. Tieva

State of Minnesota (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Claire Wack (BCP/MP)

Roberto Anguizola

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act,

FTC's Business Opportunity Rule, and the Consumer Review Fairness Act

in connection with the marketing of business opportunities.

Status: Complaint filed 7/30/18.

TRO entered 7/30/18; order extending TRO entered 8/7/18.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered

11/28/18.

FTC v. SHIRE VIROPHARMA, INC., No. 18-1807 (3rd Cir.); No. 1:17-cv-131 (D. Del.)

Parties: Shire ViroPharma, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Bradley Albert (BC/HC)

June Im

Meredyth Andrus Josepth Matthias Steve Vieux

James Weingarten

Matthew Hoffman (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Unfair methods of competition in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act

in connection with Defendant's serial, sham petitioning to the FDA to delay generic competition to its branded prescription drug, Vancocin HCI

Capsules.

Status: Complaint filed 2/7/17.

Motion to dismiss filed 4/10/17; Commission's opposition filed 5/25/17;

reply filed 6/26/17.

Order granting motion to dismiss entered 3/20/18. Commission's notice of appeal filed 4/11/18.

Commission opening brief filed 6/19/18; appellee's brief filed 8/2/18;

Commission's reply brief filed 8/30/18.

Oral argument held 12/11/18.

FTC v. SIMPLE HEALTH PLANS, LLC, No. 18-cv-62593 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Simple Health Plans, LLC

Health Benefits One LLC d/b/a Health Benefits Center d/b/a Simple Health d/b/a Simple Health Plans d/b/a Simple Insurance d/b/a Simple Insurance Plans d/b/a Simple Auto d/b/a Simple Home

d/b/a Simple Home Plans d/b/a Simple Care d/b/a Simple Life d/b/a National Dental Savings

Health Center Management LLC Innovative Customer Care LLC

Simple Insurance Leads LLC d/b/a Health Insurance Services

Senior Benefits One LLC

Steven J. Dorfman

Assigned Attorneys: Elizabeth Scott (MWR)

James Davis Joannie Wei Kenneth Hawkins Roberto Menjivar Nathaniel Al-Najjar

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the sale and marketing of limited benefit insurance plans and medical discount

memberships.

Status: Complaint filed 10/29/18

TRO entered 10/31/18; order extending TRO entered 12/21/18.

Preliminary injunction hearing set for 4/16/19.

FTC v. STARWOOD CONSULTING, LLC, No. 4:18-cv-02368 (S.D. Tex.)

Parties: Star Wood Consulting, LLC d/b/a Corporate Compliance Services

Thomas Henry Fred, Jr. State of Florida (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Luis Gallegos (SWR)

Reid Tepfer

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act,

and the Florida Deceptive and Unfair Trade Practices Act in connection posing as a government entity or authority in the sale of labor law posters.

Status: Complaint filed 7/10/18.

Order granting joint motion for preliminary injunction entered 9/6/18.

FTC v. STRNAD, No. 4:18-cv-03239 (S.D. Tex.)

Parties: George Jiri Strnad II, individually and also d/b/a Abstract United,

PayStubDirect.com, PaycheckStubOnline.com, and iVerifyme.com

Assigned Attorneys: Elisa Jillson (DPIP)

Katherine White James Elliott (SWR)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with the marketing and sale of fake pay stubs, fake bank statements, fake tax forms, and a fake employment verification service.

Status: Complaint filed 9/12/18.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered

9/24/18.

FTC v. STUDENT DEBT DOCTOR, LLC, No. 0:17-cv-61937 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Student Debt Doctor, LLC

Gary Brent White, Jr.

Assigned Attorneys: Hans Clausen (SER)

R. Michael Waller (BCP/ENF)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act,

and the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing

and sale of student loan debt relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 10/2/17.

TRO entered 10/3/17.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 10/16/17.

Clerk's entry of default as to defendant Student Debt Doctor, LLC entered

12/8/17.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered

11/30/18.

FTC v. TATE'S AUTO CENTER, No. 3:18-cv-008176 (D. Ariz.)

Parties: Tate's Auto Center of Winslow Inc.

Tates Automotive Inc.

Tate Ford Lincoln Mercury Inc. d/b/a Tate's Auto Center

Tate's Auto Center of Gallup Inc.

Richard Berry Linda Tate

Assigned Attorneys: Colin Hector (WRSF)

Katherine Worthman (BCP/FP)

Naomi Takagi Nikhil Singhvi

Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act and Alleged Conduct:

the Truth in Lending Act and its implementing regulations in connection

with the marketing, sale, and financing of motor vehicles.

Status: Complaint filed 7/31/18.

FTC v. TRIANGLE MEDIA CORP., No. 18-56161 (9th Cir.); No. 3:18-cv-1388 (S.D. Cal.)

Parties: Triangle Media Corporation aka Triangle CRM aka Phenom Health aka

Beauty and Truth aka E-Cigs

Jasper Rain Marketing, LLC aka Phenom Health aka Cranium Power Hardwire Interactive, Inc. aka Phenom Health aka Beauty and Truth aka

E-Cigs **Brian Phillips**

Assigned Attorneys: Samantha Gordon (MWR)

Matthew Wernz Douglas McKenney Michele Arington (OGC)

Olga Vaytsman

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the

Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act, and the Electronic Fund

Transfer Act in connection with the online advertising and sale of skincare

products, e-cigarettes, and dietary supplements.

Status: Complaint filed 6/25/18.

Ex parte TRO with asset freeze and receivership entered 6/29/18; order

extending TRO entered 7/9/18.

Preliminary injunction entered 8/24/18.

Notice of appeal of preliminary injunction by Hardwire Interactive filed

8/27/18.

Opening brief by appellant filed 9/25/18; answering brief by FTC filed 10/23/18; reply brief filed 11/13/18.

Oral argument set for 3/7/19.

FTC v. VANTAGE POINT SERVICES, No. 1:15-cv-00006 (W.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Vantage Point Services, LLC

Payment Management Solutions, Inc. Bonified Payment Solutions, Inc.

Gregory Mackinnon Megan Vandeviver Angela Burdorf Joseph Ciffa

Assigned Attorneys: Colin Hector (BCP/FP)

Nikhil Singhvi

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in connection with debt collection

activities.

Status: Complaint filed 1/5/15.

TRO entered 1/5/15.

Preliminary injunction with asset freeze entered 5/15/15.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 8/19/16; opposition by defendants filed 11/3/16; Commission's reply filed 11/30/16;

motion denied 7/17/17.

Motion for contempt against defendant Joseph Ciffa filed 12/13/16.

Second TRO entered 12/14/16.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendant Joseph Ciffa filed

1/17/17.

Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and settlement of claims as to defendant Megan Vandeviver entered 2/7/18.

Defendants Angela Burdorf, Gregory Mackinnon, Vantage Point Services, LLC, and Payment Management Solutions, Inc.'s motion to vacate the preliminary injunction, dissolve the asset freeze order, and allocate money for attorney's fees filed 3/28/18; Commission's response in opposition filed 4/10/18; defendants' reply filed 4/18/18; order denying motion entered 5/8/18.

Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and settlement of claims as to defendants Joseph Ciffa and Bonified Payment Solutions, Inc. entered 7/16/18.

Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants Payment Management Solutions, Inc., Vantage Point Services, LLC, Angela Burdorf, and Gregory Mackinnon entered 9/18/18.

FTC v. VISION SOLUTION MARKETING, No. 2:18-cv-356 (D. Utah)

Parties: Vision Solution Marketing d/b/a VSM Business Services d/b/a VSM

Group d/b/a VSMHUB.COM

Vsm Group LLC

Ryze Services d/b/a Business Finance Pro

Specialized Consulting Solutions

Jared Rodabaugh Justin Larsen

Assigned Attorneys: Darren H. Lubetzky (NER)

Christopher Y. Miller Savvas S. Diacosavvas

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and

sale of work-at-home programs and business coaching services.

Status: Complaint filed 5/1/18.

Stipulated TRO against defendants Justin Larsen, Specialized Consulting

Solutions, and VSM Group LLC entered 5/4/18.

Stipulated TRO against defendants Jared Rodabaugh, Vision Solution

Marketing, and Ryze Services entered 5/14/18.

Stipulated permanent injunctions and monetary judgments as to all

defendants entered 10/25/18.

FTC v. VYLAH TEC LLC, No. 17-13481 (11th Cir.); No. 2:17-cv-00228 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Vylah Tec LLC d/b/a VTec Support

Express Tech Help LLC Tech Crew Support LLC

Angelo J. Cupo Robert Cupo Dennis Cupo

State of Florida (Plaintiff)

Assigned Attorneys: Robin Rock (SER)

Sana Chriss

Mark Hegedus (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act

in connection with the adverting, marketing, distribution, and sale of

computer technical support services and security software.

Status: Complaint filed 5/1/17.

TRO entered 5/12/17.

Preliminary injunction order entered 6/4/17. Notice of appeal to 11th Cir. filed 8/1/17.

Appellants' opening brief filed 9/25/17; Appellee's brief filed 11/7/17; reply filed 11/21/17; opinion affirming entry of preliminary injunction, but partially vacating and remanded for additional findings on application of asset freeze to individual defendants, entered 3/8/18.

Defendant Dennis Cupo's motion for summary judgment filed 6/5/18; Commission's response filed 6/20/18; Dennis Cupo's objection to

Commission's response filed 6/27/18.

Motion for partial summary judgment by defendants Angelo J. Cupo, Robert Cupo, Express Tech Help LLC, Tech Crew Support LLC, and Vylah Tec LLC filed 10/17/18; response in opposition filed 11/2/18; reply filed 11/7/18.

Commission's motion for summary judgment against defendants Vylah Tec LLC, Express Tech Help LLC, Tech Crew Support LLC, Angelo Cupo, and Robert Cupo filed 10/17/18; response in opposition filed 11/8/18; reply filed 11/15/18.

FTC v. WV UNIVERSAL MANAGEMENT, LLC, Nos. 16-17727, 15-11500, 15-13380 (11th Cir.); No. 6:12-cv-1618 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: WV Universal Management, LLC, d/b/a Treasure Your Success

Leading Production, LLC Global Financial Assist, LLC

HES Merchant Services Company, Inc.

Business First Solutions, Inc.

Voiceonyx Corp.

Universal Processing Services of Wisconsin, LLC

Derek Depuydt Hal E. Smith

Jonathon E. Warren Ramon Sanchez-Ortega

Willy Plancher Valbona Toska

Assigned Attorneys: Fil M. de Banate (ECR)

Jonathan Kessler Mark Hegedus (OGC) Theodore Metzger

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 and the Telemarketing

Sales Rule in connection with sale of services that will purportedly reduce

consumers' credit card interest rates.

Status: Complaint filed 10/29/12.

Order granting preliminary injunction entered 11/14/12.

Amended complaint filed 6/18/13.

Motion to dismiss by HES Merchant Services Company filed 8/7/13; Commission's response filed 8/23/13.

- Motion for summary judgment by Universal Processing Services filed 8/16/13; Commission's opposition filed 9/16/13; reply filed 9/30/13.
- Stipulated order for permanent injunction and final judgment as to defendants Willy Plancher, Valbona Toska, WV Universal Management LLC, Global Financial Assist LLC, and Leading Production LLC entered 9/23/13.
- Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 6/30/14; defendant Derek Depuydt's opposition brief filed 7/29/14; Business First Solutions, VoiceOnyx Corp., and Jonathon Warren's brief in opposition filed 7/30/14; affidavit in opposition by Hal Smith filed 8/1/14.
- Permanent injunction and final judgment as to defendant Ramon Sanchez-Ortega entered 10/6/14.
- Order granting Commission's motion for summary judgment entered 11/18/14.
- Stipulated permanent injunction and final order as to Derek Depuydt entered 11/19/14.
- Stipulated order for permanent injunction and final judgment as to defendants, Jonathon Warren, Business First Solutions Inc. and Voiceonyx Corp. entered 11/19/14.
- Permanent injunction and final judgment as to defendants Hal E. Smith and HES Merchant Services Company, Inc. entered 2/11/15.
- Order granting motion for equitable monetary relief judgment against defendants Hal E. Smith, HES Merchant Services Company, Inc., and Universal Processing Services of Wisconsin, LLC entered 2/11/15.
- Permanent injunction and final monetary judgment as to defendant Universal Processing Services of Wisconsin, LLC entered 5/19/15.
- Notice of appeal of summary judgment by Universal Processing Services of Wisconsin, LLC filed 7/17/15.
- Appellant UPS's opening brief filed 10/20/15; Appellant HES's opening brief filed 10/21/15; Commission's responsive brief filed 12/23/15; UPS's reply brief filed 1/19/16.
- Oral argument heard 5/18/16.
- Per curiam decision affirming district court's summary judgment order and monetary relief against HES, but vacating the order of monetary relief against UPS and remanding case to district court for further findings on appropriateness of joint and several liability against UPS, entered 6/14/16.

Notice of appeal filed 12/21/16.

Appellant's opening brief filed 2/27/17; Commission's answering brief filed 4/17/17; Appellant's reply brief filed 5/18/17.

Oral argument held 10/24/17.

Opinion affirming the district court's decision issued 12/13/17. UPS's petition for writ of certiorari filed 3/13/18; Commission's opposition filed 5/16/18; UPS's reply filed 6/1/18; cert denied 6/25/18.

Order granting Commission's motion to disburse funds from registry of the court entered 8/15/18.

CIVIL PENALTY AND ENFORCEMENT CASES*

(A) Consumer Protection

FTC v. CHRISTIANO, No. 8:18-cv-00936 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: James Christiano

NetDotSolutions, Inc. TeraMESH Networks, Inc.

Andrew Salisbury World Connection, LLC

World Connection USA, LLC

World Connection, SA

Assigned Attorneys: James Evans (BCP/MP)

Ian Barlow

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the FTC's Telemarketing

Sales Rule in connection with defendants' facilitating of robocalls, calls to phone numbers on the National Do-Not-Call Registry, calls with spoofed

caller IDs, and abandoned calls.

Status: Complaint filed 5/31/2018.

Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and civil penalty judgment

as to defendants Andrew Salisbury, World Connection LLC,

World Connection, S.A. entered 9/18/18.

Stipulation to stay case pending Commission's approval of proposed

settlements as to defendants James Christiano, NetDotSolutions, Inc., and TeraMESH Networks, Inc filed 11/1/18; order granting

^{*} Includes all suits in which civil penalties are sought; consumer redress, injunctions, and ancillary equitable relief may also be sought.

stay entered 11/5/18.

UNITED STATES v. DISH NETWORK LLC, No. 17-3111 (7th Cir.); 13-2282 (7th Cir.); 3:09-CV-3073 (C.D. Ill.)

Parties: Dish Network L.L.C.

Assigned Attorneys: Russell Deitch (BCP/MP)

Patrick Runkle (DOJ/CPB)

Lisa Hsiao

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection

with abandoned calls and telephone calls to consumers on the National Do

Not Call registry.

Status: Complaint filed 3/25/09.

Defendant's motion to dismiss filed 5/21/09; plaintiff's response in opposition filed 7/17/09; defendant's reply filed 7/27/09; plaintiff's

sur-reply filed 9/11/09.

Order denying motion to dismiss entered 11/2/09.

Defendant's motion for reconsideration or interlocutory appeal filed 11/19/09; plaintiff's response filed 12/22/09; order denying motion entered 2/4/10.

Memorandum in opposition to motion/petition filed 5/21/10.

Motion to compel 7/30/10; memorandum in opposition to motion

8/16/10; memorandum in support of motion filed 9/24/10; order on motion to compel entered 12/9/10.

Appeal of magistrate judge decision to district court filed 12/29/10.

Defendants' motion to stay action under doctrine of primary jurisdiction filed 12/21/10; opposition filed 1/12/11.

Order directing the parties to file an administrative complaint with the FCC, to obtain its interpretation of statutory language entered 2/4/11.

Order vacating magistrate's decision denying Commission's motion for leave to file second amended complaint entered 3/12/13.

Amended complaint filed 3/12/13.

Petition for writ of mandamus by Dish Network filed 6/12/13.

Order denying petition for mandamus entered 7/3/13.

United States' motion for summary judgment filed 12/23/13; opposition filed 3/6/14.

Motion for summary judgment by Dish Network filed 1/6/14; opposition filed 5/30/14.

United States' motion for summary judgment filed 5/30/14.

Order directing parties to file memoranda addressing issue of deference to agency's interpretation of its regulations entered 7/8/14; parties' memoranda of law filed 8/8/14; parties' responses to each other's

memoranda filed 8/22/14.

Order granting partial summary judgment for United States and partial summary judgment for Dish Network entered 12/12/14.

Motion for sanctions by United States and state plaintiffs filed 7/20/15; memorandum in opposition filed 8/21/15; reply filed 9/10/15; order granting motion in part and denying in part entered 10/13/15.

Trial on civil penalties held 1/19/16-2/17/16.

Trial on permanent injunctive relief held 10/25/16-11/2/16.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and civil penalty judgment entered 6/5/17.

Defendant's notice of appeal filed 10/6/17.

Appellant-defendant's brief filed 2/22/18; United States' brief filed 6/22/18; reply brief filed 8/10/18.

Oral argument held 9/17/18.

UNITED STATES v. DUSKIN, No. 1:18-cv-07359 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: Lawrence L. Duskin, individually, and d/b/a

HollywoodColorContacts.com, WorldColorContacts.com, and

TopModelContacts.com

Assigned Attorneys: Kendrack Lewis (DOJ)

Alysa S. Bernstein (BC/AP)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act and

the Contact Lens Rule in connection with the advertising and sale of plano

contact lenses.

Status: Complaint filed 12/6/19.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction, civil penalties, and other relief

entered 12/12/18.

FTC v. GOTRA, No. 1:18-cv-10548 (D. Mass.)

Parties: Jasjit Gotra

Alliance Security Inc. f/k/a Versatile Marketing Solutions, Inc. f/k/a VMS

Alarms f/k/a VMS f/k/a Alliance Home Protection f/k/a AH

Protection

Jessica Merrick a/k/a Jessica Bright a/k/a Jessica Dudlicek

Defend America LLC

Kevin Klink

Power Marketing Promotions LLC d/b/a J Tele Alarms

Assigned Attorneys: Danielle M. Estrada (BCP/MP)

Ian L. Barlow

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC, the

FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule, and the Fair Credit Reporting Act in connection with the marketing and sale of home security systems and

monthly alarm monitoring services.

Status: Complaint filed 3/22/18.

Consent motions to approve stipulated final orders for permanent

injunctions and civil penalty judgments as to defendants Kevin Klink and Power Marketing Promotions LLC, and as to Jessica

Merrick and Defend America LLC filed 3/22/2018.

Motion for preliminary injunction as to defendants Jasit Gotra and

Alliance Security filed 3/23/18.

Defendant Jasit Gotra's motion to dismiss filed 5/14/18; Commission's

opposition filed 5/24/18.

FTC v. REALPAGE INC, No. 3:18-cv-02737 (N.D. Tex.)

Parties: RealPage, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Ann D LeJeune (SWR)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act and of the Fair Credit Reporting

Act in connection with credit screening reports.

Status: Complaint filed 10/16/18.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and civil penalty judgment

entered 10/19/18.

UNITED STATES v. SUNKEY PUBLISHING INC, No. 3:18-cv-01444 (N.D. Ala.)

Parties: Sunkey Publishing, Inc.

Sun Key Publishing, LLC

Fainmail.Com, LLC Wheredata, LLC Christopher Upp Mark Van Dyke Lon Brolliar Andrew Dorman

Assigned Attorneys: Joshua Rothman (DOJ)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

FTC's Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with generating marketing

leads to sell to educational and other institutions.

Status: Complaint filed 9/6/18.

Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and civil penalty judgment entered 9/12/18.

(B) Competition

UNITED STATES v. DOLAN, No. 1:18-cv-02858 (D.D.C.)

Parties: James L. Dolan

Assigned Attorneys: Kenneth A. Libby (BC/Compliance)

Alleged Conduct: Violation of the notice and waiting requirements of the Hart-Scott-Rodino

Antitrust Improvements Act of 1976, with respect to the acquisition of

voting securities of the Madison Square Garden Company.

Status: Complaint filed 12/6/18.

SUBPOENA AND CID ENFORCEMENT PROCEEDINGS

FTC v. BARTOLI, No. 6:18-mc-027 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Derek J. Bartoli

Assigned Attorneys: Burke Kappler (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Petition for order to enforce a CID.

Status: Petition filed 4/16/18.

Order granting petition entered 5/23/18.

Commission's notice of voluntary dismissal filed 8/15/18; order dismissing action without prejudice entered 8/16/18.

FTC v. DONOR RELATIONS, LLC, No. 2:18-cv-00183 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Donor Relations, LLC

Courtesy Call, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Burke W. Kappler (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Petition to enforce a CID.

Status: Petition filed 2/1/18.

Order granting Commission's motion for order to show cause entered

2/1/18;

Motion to dismiss filed 2/6/18; Commission's response filed 2/13/18; reply filed 2/15/18; order denying motion entered 2/16/18.

Show cause hearing held and oral order to produce entered 2/20/18.

Order administratively closing case entered 9/12/18.

FTC v. FULLY ACCOUNTABLE, LLC, No. 5:18-mc-00054 (N.D. Ohio)

Parties: Fully Accountable, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Burke W. Kappler (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Petition to enforce a CID.

Status: Petition filed 6/8/18.

> Order to show cause entered 6/13/18. Show cause hearing held 8/9/18.

Order compelling compliance with CID entered 8/13/18.

FTC v. REDWOOD SCIENTIFIC TECHNOLOGIES, No. 2:17-cv-7921 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Redwood Scientific Technologies

Assigned Attorneys: Burke Kappler (OGC)

Stacy Procter (WRLA)

Nature of Action: Petition for an order to enforce a CID.

Status: Petition filed 10/30/17.

Order compelling compliance with CID entered 1/25/18.

Joint stipulation to dismiss case filed 10/18/18; order granting stipulation

entered 10/19/18.

FTC v. SWAIN, No. 2:18-mc-00020 (E.D. Va.)

Parties: Monshay Swain

> Damilare Adebayo Gio-Crystal, LLC Ebdm, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Burke Kappler (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Petition for an order to enforce a CID.

Petition filed 7/19/18. Status:

SUITS TO ENJOIN FTC ACTION AND OTHER DEFENSIVE LITIGATION

AMERICAN FINANCIAL BENEFITS CENTER v. FTC, No. 18-16034 (9th Cir.); No. 4:17-cv-4817 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: American Financial Benefits Center

Ameritech Financial

Financial Education Benefits Center

Brandon Frere

Assigned Attorneys: Imad Abyad (OGC)

Roberta Tonelli (WRSF)

Sarah Schroeder

Nature of Action: Action seeking a judicial declaration that the debt relief provision of the

Telemarketing Sales Rule (TSR) will not apply to plaintiffs' businesses,

or, alternatively, that plaintiffs are fully complying with the legal

requirements outlined by the TSR.

Status: Complaint filed 8/18/17; amended complaint filed 11/2/17.

Commission's motion to dismiss for lack of jurisdiction filed 10/20/17;

motion to dismiss amended complaint filed 11/16/17; response in opposition to motion filed 11/30/17; reply to opposition filed 12/7/17; order granting motion to dismiss entered 5/29/18.

Defendants' notice of appeal filed 6/5/18.

Appellants' opening brief filed 11/1/18; Commission's answering brief

due 2/8/19.

CAUSE OF ACTION INSTITUTE v. FTC, No. 1:18-cv-00580 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Cause of Action Institute

Assigned Attorneys: Melanie Hendry (DOJ)

Alleged Conduct: Action under the Freedom of Information Act seeking access to agency

records withheld by the Commission.

Status: Complaint filed 3/15/18.

Joint proposed summary judgment briefing schedule due by 3/8/19.

CONSUMERS FOR AUTO RELIABILITY & SAFETY v. FTC, No. 1:17-cv-00540 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Consumers for Auto Reliability and Safety

Center for Auto Safety

U.S. Public Interest Research Group, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Leslie Melman (OGC)

Nature of Action: Action for declaratory and injunctive relief under the Administrative

Procedure Act in connection with the Commission's consent orders with General Motors and two dealerships regarding the advertising of used

motor vehicles.

Status: Complaint filed 3/24/17.

Amended complaint filed 5/2/17.

Commission's motion to hold case in abeyance or, in the alternative, for

an extension of time filed 5/16/17; opposition filed 5/30/17;

motion to stay granted 6/13/17.

Commission's motion dismiss filed 9/8/17; response in opposition filed

10/5/17; Commission's reply filed 10/27/17.

Motion hearing held 9/18/18.

DOE v. FTC, No. 4:16-cv-00071 (W.D. Mo.)

Parties: John Doe

Jane Doe

Assigned Attorneys: Jeffrey Ray (AUSA)

Leslie Melman (OGC)

Nature of Action: Action seeking damages under the Privacy Act in connection with the

disclosure of private and sensitive identifying information.

Status: Complaint filed 1/28/16.

Amended complaint filed 10/21/16.

Commission's motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim filed

11/22/16; plaintiff's opposition filed 12/21/16; reply filed 1/17/17;

order denying motion entered 9/11/17.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 12/7/18.

ELECTRONIC PRIVACY INFORMATION CENTER v. FTC, No. 1:18-cv-00942 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Electronic Privacy Information Center

Assigned Attorneys: William Nebeker (DOJ)

Alleged Conduct: Action under the Freedom of Information Act for injunctive and other

relief to secure the release of agency records.

Status: Complaint filed 4/20/18.

Joint status report filed 11/19/18.

ENDO PHARMACEUTICALS INC. v. FTC, Nos. 2:16-cv-5599, 2:16-cv-5600 (E.D. Pa.)

Parties: Endo Pharmaceuticals Inc.

Endo International, PLC Impax Laboratories, Inc. Watson Laboratories, Inc. Allergan Finance, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Bradley Albert (BC/HC)

Jamie Towey

Matthew Hoffman (OGC)

Nature of Action: Action seeking declaratory judgment that Section 13(b) of the FTC Act

does not authorize the Commission to pursue its claims against them in

federal court.

Status: Complaint filed 10/26/16.

Commission's motion to dismiss for lack of subject matter jurisdiction filed 12/30/16; opposition filed 1/13/17; Commission's reply filed

1/20/17.

Order consolidating case with Allergan Finance v. FTC, No. 2:17-cv-

00406, entered 2/1/17.

Notice of voluntary dismissal by Endo Pharmaceuticals, Inc and Endo

International PLC entered 2/2/17.

Consolidated amended complaint by Allergan and Watson filed 2/15/17.

Commission's motion to dismiss for lack of subject matter jurisdiction, or in the alternative, failure to state a claim, filed 3/2/17; plaintiffs' opposition filed 3/16/17; Commission's reply filed 3/23/17;

plaintiffs' sur-reply filed 3/30/17; order denying without prejudice

entered 12/28/17.

Motion for summary judgment filed 5/9/17; Commission's opposition filed 5/23/17; reply filed 5/31/17; Commission's sur-reply filed

6/7/17.

Commission's motions to dismiss for lack of jurisdiction and for failure to state a claim filed 1/30/18; Watson's response filed 6/5/18.

Order granting Commission's motions to dismiss, and denying plaintiffs' motion for summary judgment as moot, entered 10/29/18.

FOWLER v. SPRINT SPECTRUM L.P., No. 8:18-cv-00615 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Jamarlin Fowler (Plaintiff)

Sprint Spectrum L.P. (Defendant) Federal Communications Commission

Federal Trade Commission

Assigned Attorneys: Joel Marcus (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Action by former Sprint customer seeking damages for copyright

infringement, breach of contract, and conversion, and alleging government

inaction in response to his complaints.

Status: Complaint filed 4/13/18.

Motion to dismiss case by defendant Sprint Spectrum L.P. filed 8/3/18;

plaintiff's response filed 9/7/18; reply filed 9/14/18.

Order granting motion to dismiss entered 9/26/18.

SOUNDBOARD ASSOCIATION v. FTC, No.17-5093 (D.C. Cir.); No. 1:17-cv-00150 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Soundboard Association

Assigned Attorneys: Bradley Grossman (OGC)

Matthew Hoffman

Nature of Action: Action seeking declaratory judgment, challenging an FTC staff opinion

letter advising that the TSR's restrictions on "prerecorded messages"

apply to soundboard technology.

Status: Complaint filed 1/23/17.

Motion for preliminary injunction by Soundboard Association filed

1/24/17; Commission's opposition filed 2/17/17; reply filed

2/24/17.

Hearing held 3/3/17.

Order granting summary judgment in favor of the Commission entered

4/24/17.

Notice of appeal filed 4/27/17.

Appellant's opening brief filed 6/28/17; Commission's answering brief

filed 7/28/17; appellant's reply brief filed 8/11/17.

Oral argument held 11/6/17.

Opinion and order vacating district court's decision and dismissing

complaint, entered 4/27/18.

Appellant's corrected petition for rehearing en banc filed 6/8/18;

Commission's response filed 7/16/18; per curiam order denying

petition entered 8/3/18.

Petition for certiorari filed 11/30/18.

WORLD CONNECTION, LLC v. FTC, No. 1:18-cv-00202 (D. Idaho)

Parties: World Connection, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: James Evans (BCP/MP)

Alleged Conduct: Action for declaratory judgment and injunctive relief to prevent the

Commission from asserting that plaintiff is a "common enterprise" with other entities that the agency has charged with violating its Telemarketing

Sales Rule.

Status: Complaint filed 5/8/18.

Stipulation of dismissal with prejudice by plaintiff World Connection, LLC filed 9/25/18; order granting stipulation entered 9/26/18.

AMICUS CURIAE BRIEFS or PARTIAL INTERVENTIONS

APPLE INC. v. ROBERT PEPPER, No. 17-204 (S. Ct.)

Assigned Attorney: Michael Bergman (OGC)

Mark Hegedus

Nature of Action: Private action raising question whether indirect purchasers of app

distribution services that Apple provided directly to app developers have

standing to sue for damages under Section 4 of the Clayton Act.

Status: Brief for the United States as amicus curiae supporting petition for

certiorari filed 5/8/18.

Petition for writ of cert granted 6/18/18. Brief of petitioner Apple Inc. filed 8/10/18.

Brief of United States as amicus curiae filed 8/17/18. Brief of respondents Robert Pepper, et al. filed 9/24/18.

Reply of petitioner Apple Inc. filed 10/29/18.

Oral argument held 11/26/18.

U.S. CHAMBER OF COMMERCE v. CITY OF SEATTLE, No. 17-35640 (9th Cir.)

Assigned Attorneys: Michele Arington (OGC)

Nature of Action: Private action raising the question whether a Seattle ordinance that allows

Uber, Lyft, and other for-hire drivers working as independent contractors to collectively bargain with ride-referral service companies is exempt from

the Sherman Act under the state action doctrine.

Status: Brief of the U.S. Department of Justice and the Federal Trade Commission

as amici curiae filed in support of appellants filed 11/3/17.

Oral argument held 2/5/18.

Opinion reversing district court's state action ruling issued 5/11/18. Seattle's petition for panel rehearing or rehearing en banc filed 6/25/18.

Order denying petition for rehearing entered 9/14/18.

INTELLECTUAL VENTURES I LLC v. CAPITAL ONE FINANCIAL CORP., No. 18-1367 (Fed. Cir.)

Assigned Attorney: Mark Hegedus (OGC)

John Dubiansky (OPP)

Nature of Action: Private action alleging patent infringement claims and antitrust

counterclaims, raising question of *Noerr-Pennington* doctrine's application to allegedly anticompetitive conduct that includes patent-

litigation activity.

Status: Corrected brief of the Justice Department and the Commission as amici

curiae filed in support of in support of neither party filed 5/11/18.

Corrected brief for appellants filed 7/19/18.

Brief for appellees filed 8/28/18. Reply for appellants filed 9/25/18.

Motion of the United States for leave to participate in oral argument filed

10/22/18.

IN RE PAPLAUSKAS, JR., No. SU-2018-161-M.P (S. Ct. R.I.)

Parties: William E. Paplauskas, Jr. (Respondent)

Assigned Attorneys: Joel Marcus (OGC)

Nature of Action: Action raising the question of whether a non-attorney notary public

engaged in the unauthorized practice of law while participating in a real

estate closing.

Status: Brief for the United States and the Commission as amicus curiae

supporting respondent filed 9/17/18.

TAKEDA PHARMACEUTICAL COMPANY LTD. v. ZYDUS PHARMACEUTICALS (USA)

INC., No. 3:18-cv-1994 (D.N.J.)

Assigned Attorney: Kara Monahan (BC/HC)

Nature of Action: Action alleging patent infringement and counterclaims alleging patent-

infringement lawsuit is a sham, and raising issue about the application of

the Noerr-Pennington doctrine in the pharmaceutical industry.

Status: Commission's motion for leave to file an amicus brief filed 6/6/18.

Stipulation and proposed order of partial dismissal filed 7/25/18; order

granting stipulation entered 7/26/18.