# QUARTERLY FEDERAL COURT LITIGATION STATUS REPORT

Office of the General Counsel Bureau of Competition Bureau of Consumer Protection Regional Offices

March 31, 2015

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

SUMMARY OF CASES	ii
PETITIONS FOR REVIEW	1
A) Orders to Cease and Desist	1
B) Rulemakings	3
INJUNCTION AND CONSUMER REDRESS CASES	3
A) Preliminary Injunctions (Mergers/Acquisitions)	3
B) Preliminary Injunctions (Other)	5
C) Permanent Injunctions/Consumer Redress	5
CIVIL PENALTY AND ENFORCEMENT CASES	73
A) Consumer Protection	73
B) Competition	79
SUBPOENA AND CID ENFORCEMENT PROCEEDINGS	80
SUITS TO ENJOIN FTC ACTION AND OTHER DEFENSIVE LITIGATION	83
AMICUS CURIAE BRIEFS	88

## **SUMMARY OF CASES**

	D. Ct.	Ct. App.*	S. Ct.	Total
PETITIONS FOR REVIEW	0	3	1	4
INJUNCTION AND CONSUMER REDRESS CASES	78	9	0	87
CIVIL PENALTY AND ENFORCEMENT CASES	11	0	0	11
SUBPOENA AND CID ENFORCEMENTS	4	1	0	5
SUITS TO ENJOIN FTC ACTION AND OTHER DEFENSIVE LITIGATION	4	5	0	9
AMICUS CURIAE BRIEFS	1	7	0	8
TOTALS	98	25	1	124

<sup>\*</sup> Includes all cases in which appellate proceedings have taken place during the reporting period or are pending; these cases are not counted in the District Court column, even if such proceedings are going on simultaneously.

#### **PETITIONS FOR REVIEW**

## (A) Orders to Cease and Desist

## NORTH CAROLINA STATE BOARD OF DENTAL EXAMINERS v. FTC, No. 13-534 (S. Ct.);

No. 12-1172 (4th Cir.)

Parties: North Carolina State Board of Dental Examiners

Assigned Attorneys: Imad D. Abyad (OGC)

Brian Fletcher (DOJ/OSG)

Nature of Action: Petition for review of final order *In re North Carolina [State] Board of* 

Dental Examiners.

Status: Petition filed 2/10/12.

Board's opening brief filed 5/10/12.

Commission's response brief filed 6/27/12.

Board's reply brief filed 7/19/12. Oral argument held 12/5/12.

Opinion holding in the Commission's favor on all issues issued 5/31/13.

Rehearing denied 7/30/13.

Petition for writ of certiorari filed 10/25/13.

Brief of amici curiae in support of petitioner by the North Carolina State Bar,

the North Carolina Board of Law Examiners, the West Virginia State

Bar filed 11/27/13.

Brief of amici curiae in support of petitioner by the American Dental

Association, the American Medical Association et al. filed 11/27/13.

Commission's brief in opposition filed 1/22/14.

Board's reply filed 2/3/14.

Petition for certiorari granted 3/3/14.

Petitioner's brief filed 5/23/14; Commission's brief due 7/30/14;

Petitioner's reply brief filed 8/29/14

Argument held 10/14/14.

Supreme Court Opinion affirming court of appeals issued 2/25/15.

#### POM WONDERFUL v. FTC, No. 13-1060 (D.C. Cir.)

Parties: POM Wonderful LLC

Roll Global LLC Stewart A. Resnick Lynda Rae Resnick Matthew Tupper Assigned Attorneys: Imad D. Abyad (OGC)

Nature of Action: Petition for review of final Commission order.

Status: Petition filed 3/8/13.

POM and Tupper's opening briefs filed 8/14/13. Commission's brief in opposition filed 2/7/14. POM and Tupper's joint reply brief filed 3/4/14.

Oral argument held 5/2/14.

Opinion affirming Commission order issued 1/30/15.

Petition for rehearing due 4/6/15.

#### PROMEDICA HEALTH SYSTEMS, INC. v. FTC, No. 12-3583 (6th Cir.)

Parties: ProMedica Health Systems, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Michele Arington (OGC)

Nature of Action: Petition for review of final divestiture order.

Status: Petition filed 5/18/12.

ProMedica's opening brief filed 9/17/12. Commission's answering brief filed 11/14/12.

ProMedica's reply brief filed 12/12/12.

Oral argument held 3/7/13.

ProMedica's petition for rehearing and rehearing en banc filed 6/3/14;

Commission's response filed 7/7/14.

Order denying petition for en banc rehearing entered 7/24/14.

ProMedica's petition for certiorari filed 12/22/14.

Commission's opposition due 4/1/15.

### *McWANE*, *Inc. v. FTC*, No. 14-11363 (11th Cir.)

Parties: McWane, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Jack Metzler (OGC)

Nature of Action: Petition for review of final Commission order.

Status: Petition filed 3/28/14.

McWane opening brief filed 6/27/14; FTC brief due 8/29/14;

McWane's reply brief filed 9/29/14.

Oral argument held 1/16/15.

McWane's supplemental brief filed 2/17/15.

## (B) Rulemakings

(None Pending)

### **INJUNCTION AND CONSUMER REDRESS CASES**

### (A) Preliminary Injunctions (Mergers/Acquisitions)

FTC v. PHOEBE PUTNEY HEALTH SYSTEM, INC., No. 11-1160 (S. Ct.); No. 11-12906 (11th Cir.); No. 1:11-CV-00058 (M.D. Ga.)

Parties: Phoebe Putney Health System, Inc.

Phoebe Putney Memorial Hospital, Inc.

Phoebe North, Inc.

HCA. Inc.

Palmyra Park Hospital, Inc.

Hospital Authority of Albany-Dougherty County

Assigned Attorneys: Imad D. Abyad (OGC)

Leslie R. Melman

Malcolm L. Stewart (DOJ/OSG)

Edward D. Hassi (BC) Priya Viswanath Thomas H. Brock Matthew Tabas Peter C. Herrick

Alleged Conduct: Action for preliminary injunction and other equitable relief for violations of

Section 5 of the FTC Act and Section 7 of the Clayton Act in connection with the monopolization of inpatient general acute care services sold to commercial health plans and their customers in Albany, Georgia and

surrounding area.

Status: Sealed complaint filed 4/20/11.

Order granting motion for TRO entered 4/21/11.

Motions to dismiss complaint or, in the alternative, for summary judgment by

defendants filed 5/16/11.

Briefs of the Commission and the State of Georgia in further support of motion for preliminary injunction and in opposition to defendants' motions to dismiss or for summary judgment filed 6/1/1.

Order granting motions to dismiss and denying motion for preliminary injunction entered 6/27/11.

Commission's notice of appeal filed 6/28/11.

Commission's emergency motion for injunction pending appeal and to expedite appeal filed 6/29/11.

Injunction pending appeal granted 7/6/11.

Commission's opening brief filed 7/27/11; appellees' answering brief filed 8/17/11; Commission's reply brief filed 8/24/11.

Order affirming district court entered 12/09/11.

Petition for writ of certiorari filed 3/23/12; granted 6/25/12.

Commission's brief filed 8/20/12.

Respondents' brief filed 10/1/12.

Commission's reply brief filed 10/31/12.

Oral argument held 11/26/12.

Supreme Court decision reversing Court of Appeals issued 2/19/13.

Court of Appeals remand order issued 5/10/13.

Stipulated preliminary injunction order entered by district court 6/5/13.

Amended complaint against all defendants filed 7/8/13.

## FTC v. SYSCO CORPORATION, No. 1:15-cv-256 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Sysco Corporation

USF Holding Corp. US Foods, Inc.

Alexis Gilman

Assigned Attorneys: Stephen Weissman (BC)

Catherine Sanchez
Christopher Abbott
David J. Laing
Jeanne Nichols
Krisha A. Cerilli
Kristian S. Rogers
Mark Seidman
Matthew McDonald
Melissa Davenport
Michael DeRita
Ryan Quillian
Sophia Vandergrift

Thomas H. Brock

Stephen Mohr

Alleged Conduct: Action for preliminary injunction and other equitable relief for violations of

Section 5 of the FTC Act and Section 17 of the Clayton Act in conjunction with Sysco Corporation's proposed merger with USF Holding Corp. and US

Foods, Inc.

Status: Complaint filed 2/20/15.

TRO entered 2/27/15.

## (B) Preliminary Injunctions (Other)

(None pending)

## (C) <u>Permanent Injunctions/Consumer Redress</u>\*

## FTC v. 4 STAR RESOLUTION, LLC, No. 1:15-cv-112 (W.D.N.Y.)

Parties: 4 Star Resolution, LLC d/b/a Consumer Recovery Group d/b/a Four Star

Capital Services d/b/a Four Star Resolution Services, LLC d/b/a FS

Mediation Group Profile Management, Inc.

International Recovery Service, LLC

Check Solutions Services, Inc.
Check Fraud Service, LLC
Merchant Recovery Service, Inc.

Fourstar Revenue Management, LLC

Travell Thomas Maurice Sessum Charles Blakely, III

Assigned Attorneys: Brian N. Lasky (NER)

Karen A. Dahlberg Robin E. Eichen Karen V. Goff

<sup>\*</sup> Unless otherwise noted, cases involve suits for permanent injunction and other equitable relief. Post-judgment proceedings in district court are not generally reported.

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Federal Debt Collection Practices Act in connection with the collection

of debt or purported debt.

Status: Complaint filed 2/9/15.

TRO entered 2/9/15.

## FTC v. A TO Z MARKETING, INC., No. 14-56582 (9th Cir.); No. 8:13-cv-00919 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: A to Z Marketing, Inc.

Apex Members, LLC Apex Solutions, Inc.

Backend, Inc.

Expert Processing Center, Inc.

Smart Funding Corp.

William D. Goodrich, Atty, Inc.

Ratan Baid Madhulika Baid William D Goodrich

Nationwide Law Center, P.C. United States Law Center, P.C.

Emax Loans, Inc.

Millennium Law Center, P.C. Legal Marketing Group, Inc.

SC Law Group, P.C.

Interstate Law Group, LLC Backend Services, Inc. Top Legal Advocates, P.C. Evergreen Law Offices, PLLC Amir (Alex) Montazeran

Business Team LLC (relief defendant)

Assigned Attorneys: Jonathan L Kessler (ECR)

Maria Del Monaco Stacy Rene Procter Steven W. Balster

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 through the operation

of a nationwide scheme regarding mortgage assistance relief services,

including loan documentation and transaction services, and loan modification

services.

Status: Complaint filed 6/18/13.

TRO entered 6/18/13.

Preliminary injunction against Backend, Inc. entered 7/12/13.

- Stipulated preliminary injunction against remaining defendants entered 7/19/13.
- Amended complaint adding 11 new defendants and one relief defendant filed 12/16/13.
- Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 8/18/14;

Opposition brief filed 8/25/14; Commission's amended motion for summary judgment filed 9/1/14; Commission's reply in support of motion for summary judgment filed 9/2/14.

Final order for permanent injunction against defendants Backend Services, Inc., Emax Loans, Inc., Legal Marketing Group, Inc., Nationwide Law Center, Inc., United States Law Center., P.C., Interstate Law Group, LLC, Millenium Law Center, P.C., William D. Goodrich and William D. Goodrich Atty, Inc. and SC Law Group, P.C. entered 9/2/14.

Order denying motion to set aside default judgment as to defendants Amir Montazeran and Business Team, LLC entered 9/2/14.

Order granting motion for default judgment as to Evergreen and Backend entered 9/2/14.

Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and settlement of claims for defendant Top Legal Advocates, P.C., Backend, Inc. entered 9/18/14.

Defendant Amir Montaxeran's notice of appeal of default judgment to the 9th Circuit filed 9/30/14.

Default judgment and final order for permanent injunction as to defendant Amir Montazeran entered 10/16/14.

Final order for monetary judgment as to Business Team, LLC entered 10/16/14.

Defandant Amir Montazeran's and Business Team, LLC's first amended notice of appeal filed 11/03/14.

Stipulated final order for permanent injunction against defendants A to Z Marketing, Inc., Apex Members, LLC, Apex Solutions, Inc., Madhulika Baid, Ratan Baid, Expert Processing Center, Inc., Smart Funding Corp. entered 11/14/14.

Appellants' opening brief filed 3/9/15.

Commission's answering brief due 5/8/15.

### *FTC v. ABBVIE, INC.*, No. 2:14-cv-5151 (E.D. Pa.)

Parties: AbbVie, Inc.

Abbott Laboratories

Unimed Pharmaceuticals, LLC

Besins Healthcare, Inc.

Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Markus Meier (BC)

Patricia M. McDermott

Kara Monahan Peter Taylor

Alleged Conduct: Unfair methods of competition in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act

arising from baseless patent infringement lawsuits against potential

generic competitors.

Status: Complaint filed 9/8/14.

Defendants' motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim filed 11/12/14;

Commission's brief in opposition filed 12/12/14.

# FTC v. ACQUINITY INTERACTIVE LLC, No. 0:14-cv-60166 (S.D. Fla.), No. 1:13-cv-5380 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: Acquinity Interactive, LLC

7657030 Canada, Inc.

**Gary Jonas** 

Revenue Path E-Consulting Private

Worldwide Commerce Associates, LLC, d/b/a WCA

Sarita Somani

Firebrand Group, S.L., LLC

Matthew Beucler Revenuepath Limited

Scott Modist Joshua Greenberg Gregory Van Horn

Burton Katz Jonathan Smyth

Assigned Attorneys: Steven M. Wernikoff (MWR)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Telemarketing Sales Rule, in connection with advertising purportedly

free merchandise through unsolicited text messages and robocalls.

Status: Complaint filed 7/29/13.

Motion by Acquinity Interactive to transfer venue to the Southern District of

Florida filed 9/30/13; Commission's response filed 11/7/13;

defendant's reply filed 11/21/13.

Defendant's motion to transfer venue granted 1/6/14.

Amended complaint filed 6/16/14.

Order closing case upon notice of settlement entered 9/3/14.

Order granting motion for voluntary dismissal as to defendants Joshua

Greenberg and Scott Modist entered 10/16/14.

Stipulated final judgment and order for permanent injunction as to remaining defendants entered 10/16/14.

FTC v. ACTAVIS, INC. (formerly WATSON PHARMACEUTICALS, INC.), No. 12-416 (S. Ct.);

Nos. 12-16488, No. 10-12729 (11th Cir.); No. 1:09-CV-00955 (N.D. Ga.), formerly No.

2:09-CV-00598 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Watson Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Par Pharmaceuticals Companies, Inc.

Paddock Laboratories, Inc. Solvay Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Markus Meier (BC)

Saralisa Brau

Cynthia A. Liebes (SER) Mark S. Hegedus (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Action for a permanent injunction and other equitable relief for violations of

> the Sections 1 and 2 of the Sherman Act and Section 5 of the FTC Act in connection with agreement between brand name drug manufacturer and

generic manufacturers delaying entry of generic drug.

Status: Complaint in C.D. Cal. filed 1/27/09.

Amended complaint filed 2/12/09.

Defendants' motion to transfer case to Northern District of Georgia filed 2/27/09; Commission's opposition filed 3/16/09; defendants' reply filed 3/23/09; order transferring case to N.D. Ga. entered 4/9/09.

Second amended complaint filed 5/28/09.

Commission's motion to stay proceeding filed 6/15/09; defendants' opposition filed 6/17/09; Commission's reply filed 7/6/09; order denying motion entered 7/17/09.

Defendants' motions to dismiss second amended complaint filed 7/20/09; Commission's opposition filed 8/21/09; defendants' replies filed 9/11/09.

Order granting motion to dismiss Commission's second amended complaint entered 2/22/10.

Judgment dismissing Commission's claims with prejudice entered 4/21/10

Notice of appeal filed 6/10/10.

Commission's opening brief filed 7/26/10. Defendants' answering brief filed 11/10/10. Commission's reply brief filed 12/15/10.

Oral argument held 5/13/11.

Opinion affirming district court issued on 4/25/12.

Commission's petition for rehearing *en banc* filed 6/11/12. Order denying petition for rehearing en banc entered 7/18/12. Commission's petition for writ of certiorari filed 10/4/12.

Petition granted 12/7/12.

Commission's petition to district court to unseal document filed 12/10/12; motion granted and temporary stay pending appeal entered 12/19/12.

Notice of appeal of order unsealing document by AbbVie Products filed 12/21/12; emergency motion to expedite briefing and stay unsealing order filed 12/26/12; granted 1/10/13.

Commission's Supreme Court merits brief filed 1/22/13.

AbbVie Products' opening brief in 11th Circuit filed 1/31/13; Commission's response filed 2/7/13; AbbVie Products' reply filed 2/19/13.

Respondents' Supreme Court briefs filed 2/21/13.

Commission's Supreme Court reply brief filed 3/18/13.

Oral argument in 11th Circuit held 3/20/13.

11th Circuit opinion affirming district court order lifting seal and dissolving stay filed 3/21/13.

Supreme Court grant of Solicitor General's motion to lift seal on sealed volume of joint appendix entered 3/22/13.

Supreme Court oral argument held 3/25/13.

Supreme Court decision in favor of the FTC, reversing the

Eleventh Circuit Court of Appeals and remanding the case for further proceedings consistent with its opinion entered 6/17/13.

Eleventh Circuit order vacating the district court judgment and remanding the case to the district court entered 9/9/13.

Order making Eleventh Circuit's mandate the judgment of the district court entered 11/15/13.

Motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim filed 1/15/14; Commission's opposition filed 2/14/14; defendant's reply brief filed 3/3/14.

Order denying motion to dismiss entered 4/21/14.

#### FTC v. ALCOHOLISM CURE CORP., No. 12-14039 (11th Cir.), No. 3:10-CV-00266 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Alcoholism Cure Corporation, d/b/a Alcoholism Cure Foundation

Robert Douglas Krotzer

Assigned Attorneys: Karen Mandel (BCP/AP)

Serena Viswanathan Jack Metzler (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 involving false

advertising claims in connection with cures for alcoholism and related

unauthorized billing.

Status: Complaint filed 3/29/10.

Final judgment and order for permanent injunctive and other equitable relief

entered 7/3/12.

Contempt proceedings filed 3/19/14. Show cause hearing held 10/15/14.

## FTC v. ALLSTAR MARKETING GROUP, LLC, No. 1:15-cv-1945 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: Allstar Marketing Group, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Rozina C. Bhimani (MWR)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with "buy-one-get-one-free"

promotions.

Status: Complaint filed 3/4/15.

Joint stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment filed

3/17/15.

### FTC v. AMAZON.COM, No. 2:14-cv-1038 (W.D. Wash.)

Parties: Amazon.com

Assigned Attorneys: Laura Marie Solis (NWR)

Jason Adler (BCP/FP)

Alleged Conduct: Unfair practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act in connection with

Amazon's billing for charges related to activity within software applications.

Status: Complaint filed 7/10/14.

Amazon's motion to dismiss filed 9/08/14; Commission's response filed

9/29/14; Amazon's reply filed 10/3/14.

Order denying Amazon's motion to dismiss entered 12/1/14. Order adopting stipulated protective order entered 1/12/15.

## FTC v. AMERICAN YELLOW BROWSER, INC., No. 1:15-cv-02047 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: American Yellow Browser, Inc.

American Yellow Group, Inc.

Distribution H.E.P. Inc. d/b/a American Yellow Distribution and Medical

Yellow Directories, Inc. Official Yellow Guide, Inc. Publication A.A.P., Inc. Publications A.Y.D., Inc.

Ivan Chernev

German Lebedev

Publication A.Y.B., Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: John C. Hallerud (MWR)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with deceptive acts

and advertising regarding listings in business directories.

Status: Complaint filed 3/9/15.

TRO entered 3/10/15.

Preliminary injunction entered 3/25/15.

#### FTC v. AMG SERVICES, INC., No. 14-16468 (9th Cir.); No. 2:12-CV-00536 (D. Nev.)

Parties: AMG Services, Inc.

Red Cedar Services, Inc., d/b/a 500FastCash

SFS, Inc., d/b/a OneClickCash

Tribal Financial Services, Inc., d/b/a Ameriloan, d/b/a UnitedCashLoan,

d/b/a USFastCash, d/b/a Miami Nation Enterprises.

AMG Capital Management, LLC

Level 5 Motorsports, LLC Lead Flash Consulting, LLC Black Creek Capital Corporation Broadmoor Capital Partners, LLC

Muir Law Firm, LLC Scott A. Tucker Blaine A. Tucker Timothy J. Muir

Don E. Brady

Robert D. Campbell Troy L. LittleAxe Park 269 LLC Kim C. Tucker

Assigned Attorneys: Helen Wong (BCP/FP)

Jason Schall

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5, the Truth in Lending

Act, and the Electronic Fund Transfer Act, in connection with offering and

extending credit, payday loans, and the collection of those loans.

Status: Complaint filed 4/2/12.

Motion to dismiss by all defendants filed 5/25/12; Commission's response

filed 6/11/12.

Partial withdrawals of motions to dismiss filed 10/15/12 and 10/16/12.

- Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 12/27/12.
- Commission's amended motion for partial summary judgment filed 3/7/13; defendants' responses filed 3/25/13.
- Motion for legal determination on tribal sovereign immunity by defendants AMG Services, Inc., Red Cedar Services, Inc., SFS, Inc., and Tribal Financial Services filed 4/8/13; cross-motion for legal determination by defendant Troy Little Axe filed 4/10/13; Commission's response filed 4/19/13.
- Commission's amended complaint filed 4/12/13.
- Report and recommendation by magistrate that Commission's motion for partial summary judgment and defendant's motion for legal determination on tribal sovereign immunity be granted in part and denied in part entered 7/16/13.
- Joint motion for permanent injunction and judgment as to defendants AMG Services, SFS, Inc., MNE Services, Inc., AMG Capital Management, LLC, Level 5 MotorSports, LLC, LeadFlash Consulting, LLC, Black Creek Capital Corp., Broadmoor Capital Partners, LLC, Scott A. Tucker, Blaine A. Tucker, Don E. Brady, Robert D. Campbell, and Troy L. Little Axe, Jr. filed 7/18/13.
- Motion for summary judgment by Commission filed 9/30/13; Muir defendants' opposition filed 11/29/13; remaining defendants' opposition filed 12/4/13; Commission's reply filed 12/20/13.
- Motions for summary judgment by defendants filed 9/30/13; Commission's opposition filed 12/4/13; defendants' reply filed 12/20/13.
- Order granting joint motion for permanent injunction and judgment as to defendants AMG Services, SFS, Inc., MNE Services, Inc., AMG Capital Management, LLC, Level 5 MotorSports, LLC, LeadFlash Consulting, LLC, Black Creek Capital Corp., Broadmoor Capital Partners, LLC, Scott A. Tucker, Blaine A. Tucker, Don E. Brady, Robert D. Campbell, and Troy L. Little Axe, Jr. entered 10/8/13.
- Report and recommendation by magistrate that Commission's motion for summary judgment be granted in part and denied in part, and that defendant's motion for summary judgment be denied, entered 1/28/14; defendant's objections filed 2/14/14; Commission's response filed 3/2/14.
- Order adopting magistrate's 7/16/13 report and recommendations entered 3/7/14.
- Order adopting magistrate's 1/28/14 report and recommendations entered 5/29/14.
- Stipulation and order to dismiss defendants Timothy J. Muir and the Muir Law Firm, LLC entered 9/8/14.
- Order denying settling defendants' motion to enforce settlement entered 7/16/14; notice of appeal filed 7/30/14; Ninth Circuit order dismissing appeal for lack of jurisdiction entered 10/30/14.
- Stipulated permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants AMG Services and MNE Services, Inc. entered 1/23/15.

Stipulated permanent injunction and monetary judgment against defendants Troy Little Axe, Jr., Don Brady and Robert Campbell entered 3/18/15.

### FTC v. APPLY KNOWLEDGE, LLC, No. 2:14-cv-0088 (D. Utah)

Parties: Apply Knowledge, LLC, d/b/a Apply Knowledge Institute and Coaching

Dept.

Dahm International, LLC

Dominion of Virgo Investments, Inc.

Ecommerce Support, LLC

Essent Media, LLC Evertex Solutions, LLC

EVI LLC, d/b/a Members Learning Center

Nemrow Consulting, LLC

Novus North, LLC, d/b/a Mymentoring, Yes International, LLC and

Your Ecommerce Support International, LLC

Purple Buffalo, LLC, d/b/a NetMarketing

Supplier Source, LLC

365 Dailyfit, LLC, d/b/a Net Training

Vensure International VI Education, LLC David Gregory Bevan

Jessia Bjarnson

Phillip Edward Gannuscia

Chad Huntsman Richard Nemrow Jeffrey Nicol Thomas Riskas Babata Sonnenberg Ken Sonnenberg

Assigned Attorneys: Collot Guerard (BCP/MP)

Svetlana Gans

Michael D. Bergman (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 and the Telemarketing

and Consumer Fraud Abuse and Prevention Act in connection with work-

from-home business opportunity scheme.

Status: Complaint filed 2/10/14.

TRO entered 2/11/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction and asset freeze as to defendant David

Bevan entered 3/20/14.

Commission's motion to dismiss Sonnenberg Defendants' counterclaim

## FTC v. AT&T MOBILITY, LLC, No. 3:14-cv-04785 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: AT&T Mobility, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: David M. Newman (WRSF)

Eric David Edmonson

Kerry O'Brien Laura Fremont Linda K. Badger Matthew D. Gold

Evan Rose

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive and unfair acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC

Act in connection with the marketing of wireless broadband internet access

service for smartphones.

Status: Complaint filed 10/28/14.

Motion to dismiss by AT&T Mobility filed 1/5/15. Order denying motion to dismiss entered 3/31/15.

## FTC v. BAYVIEW SOLUTIONS, LLC, No. 1:14-cv-01830 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Bayview Solutions, LLC

Aron Tomko Jonathan Ortiz

Assigned Attorneys: Thomas J. Widor (BCP/FP)

Michael D. White

Katherine Ripley White (DPIP)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with defendants'

unfair public disclosure of consumers' sensitive personal and financial

information.

Status: Complaint filed 10/31/14.

Notice of voluntary dismissal of Jonathan Ortiz filed 12/18/14.

Order granting stay entered 2/2/15.

## FTC v. BF LABS, INC. No. 4:14-cv-815 (W.D. Mo.)

Parties: BF Labs, Inc.

Darla Drake Nasser Ghoseiri Sonny Vleisides Kyle Alexander Dylan Symington

Assigned Attorneys: Helen Wong (BCP/FP)

Leah Frazier

Teresa N. Kosmidis

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with the marketing and sale of Bitcoin mining machines.

Status: Complaint filed 9/15/14.

TRO entered 9/18/14.

Motions to dismiss entered 10/10/14.

Order denying motions to dismiss entered 12/23/14.

Commission's motion to dismiss counterclaims for lack of jurisdiction

filed 3/10/15.

#### FTC v. BLUEHIPPO FUNDING, LLC, No. 11-374 (2d Cir.); No. 1:08-CV-01819 (S.D.N.Y.)

Parties: BlueHippo Funding, LLC

BlueHippo Capital LLC

Joseph K. Rensin

Assigned Attorneys: Amanda C. Basta (BCP/ENF)

Michael D. Bergman (OGC)

David C. Shonka

Alleged Conduct: Contempt proceeding for violations of a permanent injunction in connection

with the sale of personal computers, televisions, and other consumer

electronics.

Status: Complaint filed 2/22/08.

Stipulated final judgment and order for permanent injunction entered 4/9/08.

Motions for contempt and to modify permanent injunction against

BlueHippo Funding, LLC, BlueHippo Capital LLC, and Joseph K.

Rensin filed 11/17/09.

Order to show cause why defendants should not be held in contempt

entered 11/16/09; modified 11/18/09.

Defendants' memoranda of law filed 12/7/09 and 12/11/09; Commission's

reply memoranda of law filed 12/11/09 and 12/12/09.

Trial held 2/9/10-2/11/10; closing argument held 2/19/10.

Order granting motion for contempt entered 7/27/10; judgment entered 7/30/10.

Commission's motion to amend/correct judgment and order filed 8/27/10; defendants' opposition filed 9/24/10; Commission's reply filed 10/8/10.

Order denying Commission's motion to amend/correct judgment and order entered 12/1/10.

Commission's notice of appeal re contempt order filed 1/28/11.

Notice of appeal filed 2/1/11. Commission's brief filed 5/16/11. Appellee's brief filed 8/15/11.

Commission's reply brief filed 9/12/11.

Argument held 2/23/12.

Opinion vacating the district court's judgment and remanding the case to the district court entered 8/12/14.

Appellee Joseph Rensin's petition for rehearing filed 9/25/14.

Order denying Joseph Rensin's petition for rehearing entered 11/17/14.

## FTC v. BOOST SOFTWARE, INC., No. 9:14-cv-81397 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Boost Software, Inc.

Vast Tech Support, LLC d/b/a OMG Tech Help, d/b/a OMG Total

Protection, d/b/a OMG Back Up, d/b/a Softwaretechsupport.com

OMG Tech Help, LLC Success Capital, LLC Jon Paul Holdings, LLC

Ami Mehta

Elliot Loewenstern Jon-Paul Vasta Mark Donohue

Assigned Attorneys: J. Ronald Brooke, Jr. (BCP/MP)

Russell S. Deitch

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive and unfair acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the

FTC Act and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing,

advertising, and sale of tech support services.

Status: Complaint filed 11/10/14.

TRO entered 11/12/14.

TRO extended to all defendants entered 11/26/14.

Order denying preliminary injunction against Boost Software and Ami Mehta

entered 11/26/14.

Order of entry of default as to Vast Tech Support LLC, OMG Tech Help

LLC, Success Capital LLC and Jon Paul Holding LLC

#### entered 3/18/15.

## FTC v. BROADWAY GLOBAL MASTER, INC., No. 2:12-CV-00855 (E.D. Cal.)

Parties: Broadway Global Master, Inc.

In-Arabia Solutions Inc.

Kirit Patel

Assigned Attorneys: Austin A.B. Ownbey (WRSF)

Kerry O'Brien Sarah Schroeder

Alleged Conduct: Unfair and deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 and the

FDCPA related to debt collection practices.

Status: Complaint filed 4/3/12.

TRO entered 4/5/12.

Preliminary injunction and asset freeze entered 4/26/12.

Kirit Patel indicted on 21 counts of mail and wire fraud on 8/23/12

Order granting six-month stay entered 9/17/12.

Orders extending stay entered 3/7/13, 7/8/13, and 11/18/13.

Orders extending stay entered 2/7/14, 4/30/14, 8/4/14, and 12/8/14.

#### *FTC v. CARDFLEX, INC.*, No. 3:14-cv-397 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Cardflex, Inc.

Blaze Processing, LLC March 1 Merchanting, LLC

Andrew M. Phillips John S. Blaugrund Shane Fisher Jeremy Livingston

Assigned Attorneys: Karen S. Hobbs (BCP/MP)

Benjamin Robert Davidson Blaine T. Welsh (AUSA)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 of the FTCF Act in connection with unauthorized

charges to consumer's debit and credit accounts.

Status: Complaint filed 7/30/14.

Permanent injunction and final order against defendants Blaze Processing,

LLC, Mach 1 Merchanting, LLC and Shane Fisher entered 10/27/14.

Permanent injunction and final order against defendant Jeremy Livingston

#### entered 1/2/15.

Order granting 60 day stay of proceedings entered 1/26/15.

## FTC v. CARIBBEAN CRUISE LINE, No. 0:15-cv-60423 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Caribbean Cruise Line, Inc.

Linked Services Solutions, LLC

Economic Strategy, LLC

Pacific Telecom Communications Group International Telephone Corporation International Telephone, LLC

T M Caller ID, LLC

**Telephone Management Corporation** 

Scott Broomfield Jason Birkett Jacob Dejongh Fred A. Accuardi Steve Hamilton

Assigned Attorneys: Bikram Bandy (BCP/MP)

Emily C. Burton

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Telemarketing Sales Rule

in connection with robocalls.

Status: Complaint filed 3/3/15.

Motion by Commission to approve consent judgment as to defendants Caribbean Cruise Line, Inc., Linked Services Solutions, LLC,

Scott Broomfield, Jason Birkett, Economic Strategy, Jacob Dejongh

and Steve Hamilton filed 3/3/15.

## FTC v. CD CAPITAL INVESTMENTS, LLC, 8:14-CV-1033 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: CD Capital Investments, LLC

CD Capital, LLC

GDS Information Systems, Inc.

Christian D. Quezada

Mireya Duenas

Gabriel Drews Stewart

Assigned Attorneys: Barbara Y K Chun (WRLA)

LaShawn M. Johnson (BCP/FP)

Mark L. Glassman

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC and Mortgage

Assistance Relief Services Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of

mortgage assistance relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 7/7/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 8/21/14.

#### FTC v. CENTRO NATURAL CORP., No. 1:14-cv-23879 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Centro Natural Corp.

Sumore, LLC Carolina Orellana Damian Biondi Javier Sumbre Jessica Anzola Bionore, Inc. Susana Sumbre

Jorge Sumbre (Relief Defendant)

Allianza Inmobiliaria Corp. (Relief Defendant) Jager International, Inc. (Relief Defendant)

Assigned Attorneys: Dotan Weinman (BCP/MP)

Janice L. Kopec

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive and unfair acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the

FTC Act, the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, and the Telemarketing Act

in connection with soliciting payments for unverified debts.

Status: Complaint filed 10/20/14.

TRO entered 10/21/14.

Amended complaint filed 10/27/14.

Order denying without prejudice preliminary injunction as to defendant

Susana Sumbre and relief defendants Allianza Immobiliaria Corp.,

Jager International, Inc. and Jorge Sumbre entered 10/31/14.

Amended temporary restraining order entered 11/3/14

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to Javier Sumbre, Jessica Anzola, and

Sumore LLC entered 1/5/15 and 1/8/15.

Order by clerk for entry of default as to Centro Natural Corp.

entered 1/20/15.

Order granting second motion for preliminary injunction against relief

defendants entered 1/26/15.

# FTC v. CEPHALON, INC., No. 2:08-CV-02141 (E.D. Pa.), formerly No. 1:08-CV-00244 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Cephalon, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Markus H. Meier (BC)

Bradley S. Albert Garth W. Huston Suzanne Munck

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 in connection with inducing generic companies to

abandon patent challenge and agreeing to refrain from producing a generic

form of the drug Provigil.

Status: Complaint for injunctive relief in D.D.C. filed 2/13/08.

Order granting defendant's motion to transfer case to E.D. Pa. entered

4/28/08.

Defendant's motion to dismiss filed 5/2/08; Commission's opposition to

motion filed 6/2/08; defendant's reply filed 6/20/08.

First amended complaint filed 8/12/09.

Defendant's motion to dismiss filed 8/31/09; Commission's response in

opposition filed 9/14/09; oral argument held 10/21/09.

Order and memorandum denying motion to dismiss entered 3/29/10.

Order staying case pending Supreme Court resolution of pay-for-delay

pharmaceutical litigation settlements entered 8/29/12.

Notice by Commission of Supreme Court decision in FTC v. Actavis filed

6/19/13.

 $Motion\ for\ partial\ summary\ judgment\ by\ the\ Commission\ filed\ 9/20/13;$ 

defendant's opposition filed 11/19/13; Commission's reply filed

12/20/13.

Motion to dismiss for lack of jurisdiction by Cephalon, Inc. filed 9/20/13;

Commission's response filed 11/18/13; defendant's response filed

12/20/13.

Motion to join Teva Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd. by Commission filed

12/9/13; denied without prejudice 5/5/14.

Order that FTC v. Cephalon, Inc. proceed to trial separate from private

plaintiffs' cases entered 2/4/15.

FTC v. COMMERCE PLANET, INC., No. 12-57064 (9th Cir.); Nos. 8:14-cv-01529, 8:09-CV-01324 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Commerce Planet, Inc., d/b/a Online Supplier

Michael Hill

Charles Gugliuzza

**Aaron Gravitz** 

Assigned Attorneys: David M. Newman (WRSF)

Eric D. Edmondson Michele Arington (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Unfair and deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 in

connection with the marketing and sale of Online Auction Starter Kits and

automatic debiting of monthly charges to consumer credit cards.

Status: Complaint filed 11/10/09.

Stipulated final orders for permanent injunction and monetary relief against Commerce Planet, Inc., Michael Hill, and Aaron Gravitz entered 11/18/09.

Motion to dismiss as to

defendant Charles Gugliuzza filed 1/19/10; Commission's opposition to motion filed 2/1/10; defendants' reply filed 2/8/10; order denying defendants' motion to dismiss entered 2/12/10.

Defendant Charles Gugliuzza's answer impleading Superfly Advertising, Inc. (a Delaware corporation) and Superfly Advertising, Inc. (an Indiana corporation) as third-party defendants filed 4/16/10; amended answer adding counterclaim against Commission filed 5/4/10.

Motion to dismiss Charles Gugliuzza's counterclaim filed 5/25/10; Gugliuzza's opposition filed 6/21/10; Commission's reply filed 6/28/10.

Motion to dismiss third-party defendant Superfly Advertising, Inc. filed 6/22/10; Gugliuzza's opposition filed 7/19/10; reply by third-party defendant Superfly Advertising, Inc. filed 7/26/10.

Order granting third-party defendant Superfly Advertising's motion to dismiss entered 8/5/10.

Amended third-party complaint against counter defendants Superfly Advertising, Inc. (an Indiana corporation) and Superfly Advertising, Inc. (a Delaware corporation) by defendant Charles Gugliuzza filed 8/25/10.

Motion to dismiss first amended third-party complaint by third-party defendant Superfly Advertising, Inc. filed 9/15/10; order granting motion entered 10/27/10.

Second amended third-party complaint against counter defendants Superfly Advertising, Inc. (an Indiana corporation) and Superfly Advertising, Inc. (a Delaware corporation) by defendant Charles Gugliuzza filed 11/16/10.

Motion to dismiss second amended third-party complaint by third-party defendant Superfly Advertising, Inc. filed 11/29/10; order granting motion entered 12/28/10.

Motion for summary judgment by defendant Charles Gugliuzza filed 4/22/11

First amended complaint for permanent injunction and other equitable

relief filed 6/29/11.

Defendant Charles Gugliuzza's motion for summary judgment filed 7/27/11; Commission's opposition filed 8/22/11; reply filed 8/29/11; order denying motion for summary judgment entered 9/08/11.

Trial held 1/31/12-2/28/12.

Post-trial briefs submitted 3/23/12.

Appellant filed his reply 1/31/14.

Memorandum of decision in favor of the Commission and directing Commission to file proposed permanent injunction and judgment entered 6/22/12.

Final order and permanent injunction as to all defendants entered 7/17/12.

Defendant Charles Gugliuzza's notice of appeal filed 11/13/12.

Appellant's opening brief filed 7/5/13; Commission's answering brief filed 11/18/13; appellant's reply brief filed 1/31/14.

Notice of defendant Charles Gugliuzza's appeal to the 9th Circuit filed 9/6/14.

Order dismissing appeal as duplicative of pending appeal 12-57064 entered 9/19/14; Gugliuzza's motion for reconsideration filed 9/25/14.

Notice regarding appeal (No. 8:14-cv-01529) from bankruptcy court's ruling that Gugliuzza's debt to the Commission is nondischargeable entered 9/22/14.

Gugliuzza's opening brief in bankruptcy appeal filed 12/5/14; Commission's answering brief due 1/16/15; Gugliuzza's reply brief due 1/30/15.

Oral argument in merits appeal held 2/9/15.

Oral argument in district court regarding bankruptcy appeal held 2/26/15. Order by district court affirming in substantial part and reversing in part the bankruptcy court's order on nondischargeability entered 3/12/15.

#### FTC v. CONSUMER COLLECTION ADVOCATES, CORP., No. 0:14-cv-62491 (S.D Fla.)

Parties: Consumer Collection Advocates, Corp.

Michael R. Ettus

Assigned Attorneys: Barbara E. Bolton

Marcela C. Mateo

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the

Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with recovery services claiming to

collecting funds consumers previously lost to telemarketing fraud.

Status: Complaint filed 11/3/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 11/17/14.

Trial scheduled for 10/19/15.

## FTC v. CONSUMER HEALTH BENEFITS ASS'N, No. 1:10-CV-03551 (E.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Consumer Health Benefits Association John Schwartz

Jeffery Burman

Century Senior Services

Guarantee Trust Life Insurance

Barbara Taube

Rita B. Werner

Ronald K. Werner

Richard Holson III Vantage America Solutions

Louis Leo Windi Tow

National Association for Americans National Benefits Consultants, LLC National Benefits Solutions, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Karen A. Dahlberg (NER)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 and the Telemarketing

Sales Rule in connection with defendants' marketing, distribution, and sale of

medical discount plans.

Status: Complaint filed 8/03/10.

Stipulation and order modifying ex parte TRO as to defendant Louis Leo

entered 8/25/10.

Stipulation and order modifying ex parte TRO as to defendants Ron Werner

and Rita Werner entered 8/25/10.

Stipulated preliminary injunction order as to defendant Louis J. Leo entered

9/21/10.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Ron Werner and Rita

Werner entered 10/01/10.

Preliminary injunction as to corporate defendants entered 10/5/10.

Clerk's entry of default as to corporate defendants 11/15/10.

Stipulation and order modifying the preliminary injunction order as to defendants Louis Leo, Rita and Ronald Werner entered 3/31/11.

Commission's motion for leave to amend complaint naming additional

defendants filed 5/06/11; magistrate judge's decision granting motion

entered 8/18/11.

Appeals of magistrate judge's decision by proposed defendants filed

9/06/11.

Commission's amended complaint filed 10/13/11.

Motions to dismiss by filed 11/22/11; Commission's response in

opposition filed 12/13/11.

Orders denying all motions to dismiss entered 5/23/12 & 5/24/12.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 7/23/2013; opposition by

John Schwartz and Wendi Tow filed 8/30/13 and 11/7/13; partial oppositions by Rita Brum Werner, Ronald Kent Werner, Jeffrey Burman, Century Senior Services, Guarantee Trust Life Insurance

Company, Richard Holson, III, Barbara Taube, Vantage America Solutions, Inc. filed 11/6/13; cross-motions for summary judgment by Rita Werner, GTL, Vantage, Century, Rick Holson, Jeff Burman, and Barbara Taube filed 9/4/13, 9/5/13 and 9/6/13.

Order granting motion by the Commonwealth of Massachusetts to modify the stipulated order of preliminary injunction entered 12/5/13.

## FTC v. CREAM GROUP, INC., No. 2:13-cv-8843 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Cream Group, Inc., d/b/a Terra Nova, TNT, Inc., d/b/a CRM, Inc.

Sami Charchian, d/b/a Oro Marketing, d/b/a Modo, d/b/a Modo Industry, d/b/a Oro Max, d/b/a Casa de Oro, d/b/a Casa de Moda, d/b/a Oro

Mundo, d/b/a Mation/Modo

John Charchian, a/k/a Djahangir Charchian, a/k/a Jahangir John Charchian

Norma Rae Ramos

Assigned Attorneys: Julie K. Mayer (NWR)

Laura M. Solis

Raymond E. McKown (WRLA)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 and the Telemarketing Sales Rule, in connection with

the sale of purported brand-name merchandise for resale.

Status: Complaint filed 12/3/13.

TRO entered 12/3/13.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 1/9/14.

Default by clerk against Cream Group entered 3/18/14.

Amended complaint filed 4/2/14.

Default judgment as to relief defendants Bahareh Ramin and Spring Acres,

LLC entered 7/8/14.

Final order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against

defendants Cream Group, Inc., John Cahrchian, and Sami Charchian and for monetary relief defendants Spring Acres, LLC and Bahareh

Ramin entered 12/22/14.

### FTC v. CWB SERVICES, LLC, No. 4:14-cv-783 (W.D. Mo.)

Parties: CWB Services, LLC

Orion Services, LLC Sandpoint Capital, LLC Basseterre Capital, LLC Namakan Capital, LLC Vandelier Group, LLC St. Armands Group, LLC Anasazi Group, LLC Anasazi Services, LLC Longboat Group, LLC

Orlead Group

Timothy A. Coppinger Frampton Rowland, III

Assigned Attorneys: Rebecca M. Unruh (BCP/FP)

Charles M. Thomas Lisa Rothfarb Matthew Wilshire

Alleged Conduct: Unfair and deceptive practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act, the

Truth in Lending Act, and the Electronic Fund Transfer Act in connection

with the offering or extension of payday loans.

Status: Complaint filed 9/5/14.

TRO entered 9/9/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 9/23/14.

Bench trial scheduled for 2/22/16.

# FTC v. DAYTON FAMILY PRODUCTIONS, INC., No. 13-17448 (9th Cir.); No. 2:97-CV-00750 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Glen E. Burke, d/b/a American Health Associates, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Reenah L. Kim (BCP/ENF)

Sarah Waldrop

Joel Marcus-Kurn (OGC) Blaine T. Welsh (AUSA)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of a 1998 order for permanent

injunction in connection with telemarketing, by misrepresenting to consumers that they have won a valuable prize and requiring payment in

order to retrieve the alleged prize.

Status: Complaint filed 6/20/97.

Permanent injunction entered 10/1/98.

Motion for contempt and stipulated preliminary injunction filed

1/28/13.

Order granting preliminary injunction entered 3/5/13.

Hearing held 9/5/13.

Order finding civil contempt liability entered 9/27/13.

Notice of appeal filed 11/26/13.

Commission's motion in district court for an indicative ruling and to

clarify judgment filed 2/10/14.

Commission's motion in court of appeals to suspend briefing schedule and stay proceeding filed 2/11/14; order by court of appeals staying case entered 2/14/14.

Commission's motion in court of appeals for remand filed 3/4/14; order remanding case entered 3/14/14.

Order by district court reaffirming its 9/27/13 order of contempt entered 7/28/14.

Appellant's opening brief filed 10/23/14; Commission's answering brief filed 12/24/14; appellant's reply brief filed 12/31/14.

#### FTC v. DEBTPRO 123, LLC, No. 8:14-cv-0693 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Debtpro 123, LLC

Allstar Processing Corp. Allstar Debt Relief, LLC Redwave Management Group

BET Companies, Inc.

Bryan E. Taylor, a/k/a B. Edward Taylor Ryan Foland, a/k/a R Eugene Foland

Stacey Frion Kara Taylor

Assigned Attorneys: Stacy Rene Procter (WRLA)

Benjamin J. Theisman (BCP/ENF)

Miriam R. Lederer

Alleged Conduct: Unfair and deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 of the

FTC Act, the Telemarketing Sales Rule, and the Credit Repair Organization

Act in relation to advertising and business practices by credit repair

organizations.

Status: Complaint filed 5/2/14.

### FTC v. DERMADOCTOR, INC., No. 4:14-cv-01129 (W.D. Mo.)

Parties: DERMAdoctor, Inc.

Audrey Kunin, MD

Assigned Attorneys: Christine DeLorme

Elizabeth Nach (BCP/AP) Thomas M. Larson (AUSA)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act in connection with the

advertising, marketing, distribution, and sale of DERMAdoctor line of

cosmetic products.

Status: Complaint filed 12/23/14.

Stipulated final judgment and order for permanent injunction and other

equitable relief entered 12/29/14.

FTC v. DIRECTV, INC., No.3:15-cv-01129 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: DirecTV, Inc.

DirecTV, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Eric D. Edmondson (WRSF)

Boris Yankilovich Erika R. Wodinsky Jacob A. Snow

Raymond E. McKown (WRLA)

Stacy R. Procter

Alleged Conduct: Decemptive actis and practices in violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act

and Section 4 of the Restore Online Shoppers' Confidence Act in connection

with the advertising, marketing, and sale of multi-channel video

programming subscription service.

Status: Complaint filed 3/11/15.

FTC v. DIVERSIFIED EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, LLC, No. 0:14-cv-62116 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Diversified Educational Resources, LLC

Motivational Management & Development Services, Ltd.

IDM Services, LLC

Alexander Wolfram a/k/a Alex Wolfram

Maria T. Garcia

Steinbock Holdings, LLC

Zwillinge, LLC Tiffany Chambers Sylvia Gads

Assigned Attorneys: Ioana Rusu (BCP/FP)

Miya Rahamim

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act

regarding the sale, marketing, and distribution of high school diplomas.

Status: Complaint filed 9/16/14.

TRO entered 9/16/14.

Preliminary injunction entered 9/30/14.

Stipulation Order for Permanent Injunction and Monetary Judgment as to defendants Maria Garcia, IDM Services LLC, Alexander Wolfram, and relief defendants Steinbock Holdings LLC, Zwillinge LLC,

Sylvia Gads and Tiffany Chambers entered 1/15/15.

Order and Final Default Judgment in favor of FTC against defendants Diversified Educational Resources LLC and Motivational Management & Development Services Ltd. entered 2/26/15.

## FTC v. EMERICA MEDIA CORPORATION, No. 9:13-CV-00003 (D. Mont.)

Parties: Emerica Media Corporation

Global Voice Mail, Ltd. Network Assurance, Inc. Techmax Solutions, Inc. Voice Mail Professionals, Inc.

Steven V. Sann

Terry D. Lane, a/k/a Terry D. Sann

Nathan M. Sann Robert M. Braach Bibliologic, Ltd.

American eVoice, Ltd.

FoneRight, Inc. HearYou2, Inc. SecuraDat, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Kathryn Decker (NWR)

Richard McKewen

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 in connection with

recurring charges on consumers' monthly telephone bills for

telecommunications services that consumers neither requested nor

authorized.

Status: Complaint filed 1/8/13.

Stipulated preliminary injunctions as to all defendants entered 5/8/13. Order staying the case until at least 7/8/13, pending developments in a

parallel criminal investigation entered 5/9/13.

Order staying the case pending the resolution of a parallel criminal

prosecution entered 9/24/13.

Stipulated permanent injunction order and monetary relief as to defendant

Nathan M. Sann entered 11/25/14.

#### *FTC v. EWING*, No. 2:07-cv-00479-PMP-GWF (D. Nev.)

Parties: Crystal A. Ewing

Consumer Direct Enterprises, LLC

Top Choice, Inc.

Classic Productions, LLC Response Processing, LLC

David F. Ewing

Top Choice, Inc., d/b/a Sweepstakes Information Reporting Services, Cash Claim Information Center, Consumer Award Advisory Service, Mega Marketing Group, and Prize Distribution Center

Assigned Attorneys: Kathryn Decker (NWR)

Mary Benfield

Alleged Conduct: Violation of Section 5 in connection with deceptive sweepstake claims.

Status: Complaint for injunctive and other equitable relief filed 4/11/07.

Consent judgment and order for permanent injunction in favor of

Commission entered 6/14/07.

Commission's contempt motion against Crystal Ewing filed 5/1/14.

Consent judgment, final judgment, order for compensatory contempt relief,

and modified order for permanent injunction and other equitable

relief as to Crystal Ewing entered 2/3/15.

## FTC v. EWING, No. 2:14-cv-0683 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Crystal Ewing

Classic Productions, LLC

Health Nutrition Products, LLC d/b/a W8-B-Gone, Quick & Easy

Howard Raff, a/k/a Howard Bruce

David Raff

Omni Processing Center MBE Management, LLC

Shirley Murphy Ronald Boyde

Global Access Management Systems, Inc.

Ricki Black

Assigned Attorneys: Alejandro Rosenberg (BCP/ENF)

Elsie B. Kappler Korin Ewing Felix

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC act in connection with the

advertising, marketing and sale of purported weight loss pills.

Status: Complaint filed 5/1/14.

Default judgment as to defendants Ricki Black and Global Access

Management Systems, Inc. entered 6/23/14; Defendants' motion to set aside entry of default filed 6/26/14; Commission's stipulation of

no opposition to Ricki Blacki only filed 7/8/14.

Default judgment as to Omni Processing Center and MBE Management,

LLC entered 7/18/14.

## FTC v. FEDERAL CHECK PROCESSING, INC., No. 1:14-cv-0122 (W.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Federal Check Processing, Inc.

Federal Recoveries, LLC

Federal Processing Services, Inc.

Federal Processing, Inc.

United Check Processing, Inc.
Central Check Processing, Inc.
Central Processing Services, Inc.
Nationwide Check Processing, Inc.
American Check Processing, Inc.
State Check Processing, Inc.
Check Processing, Inc.
US Check Processing, Inc.
Flowing Streams, F.S., Inc.

Mark Briandi William Moses

Empowered Racing, LLC, Relief Defendant

Assigned Attorneys: Colin A. Hector (BCP/FP)

Katherine M. Worthman

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 and the Fair Debt

Collection Practices Act in Connection with debt collection operation.

Status: Complaint filed 2/24/14.

Ex parte TRO entered 3/24/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 3/25/14.

#### FTC v. FIRST CONSUMERS, LLC, No. 2:14-cv-1608 (E.D. Pa.)

Parties: First Consumers, LLC

Standard American Marketing, Inc.

Powerplay Industries, LLC

1166519075 Quebec Inc., d/b/a Landmark Holdings, Inc.

1164047236 Quebec Inc., d/b/a Madicon Inc.

Ari Tietolman Marc Ferry Charles W. Borie Robert Barczai

Assigned Attorneys: David R. Spiegel (BCP/MP)

Alleged Conduct: Unfair and deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 and the

Telemarketing Sales Rules in connection with marketing of supposed fraud

protection, legal protection and pharmaceutical benefit services.

Status: Complaint filed 3/18/14.

Ex parte TRO entered 3/18/14.

Preliminary injunction order entered 3/28/14.

Motion for contempt against defendant Ari Tietolman filed 5/15/14. Order imposing coercive sanction against Air Tietolman entered 7/17/14.

Bench warrant for Air Tietolman issued 8/7/14.

Default judgment as to defendants 1164047236 Quebec Inc., 1166519075 Quebec Inc., First Consumers, LLC, Powerplay Industries, LLC, and

Standard American Marketing, Inc. entered 12/4/14.

Motion for summary judgment against Ari Tietolman filed 1/13/15. Motion for default judgment as to corporate defendants filed 1/13/15.

Stipulation and final order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants Marc Ferry and Robert Barczai entered 2/5/15.

Order granting summary judgment against defendant Ari Tietolman, and default judgment as to corporate defendants entered 2/20/15.

Notice of voluntary dismissal as to defendant Charles Borie filed 3/30/15.

#### FTC v. FIRST TIME CREDIT SOLUTION, No. 2:15-cv-1921 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: First Time Credit Solution, Corp. d/b/a 1st Consumer Credit USA d/b/a

Doctor de Credito

Guillermo Leyes Jimena Perez Maria Bernal Fermin Campos

Assigned Attorneys: Stacy R. Procter (WRLA)

Christine M. Todaro (BCP/MP)

Dotan Weinman Rhonda Perkins Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and Section 404 of the Credit

Repair Organization Act in connection with the deceptive advertising, marketing, promotion offering for sale, or sale of credit repair services.

Status: Complaint filed 3/16/15.

TRO entered 3/16/15.

## FTC v. FMC COUNSELING SERVICES, INC., No. 0:14-cv-61545 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: FMC Counseling Services, Inc.

FDC Assoc Group, Inc. FDC Business, Inc.

FMC Review Corporation, Inc.

NDR Group, Inc.

FMC Consultants Group, Inc.

Jonathan L. Herbert

Assigned Attorneys: Elizabeth C. Stout (MWR)

James Davis

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act and the Mortgage Assistance Relief

Services Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of mortgage

assistance relief services.

Status: Complaint for permanent injunction and other equitable relief filed 7/7/14.

Preliminary injunction with asset freeze and other equitable relief as to

Jonathan L. Herbert entered 7/17/14.

Final judgment adopting parties' proposed stipulated final order for permanent injunction and monetary relief entered 12/12/14.

### FTC v. GENESIS TODAY, INC., No. 1:15-cv-62 (W. D. Tex.)

Parties: Genesis Today, Inc.

Pure Health, LLC Lindsey Duncan

Assigned Attorneys: Carl H. Settlemeyer, III (BCP/AP)

**Edward Glennon** 

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Sections 5 and 12 of the FTC Act in connection with the

deceptive advertising, marketing, and sale of green coffee bean extract.

Status: Complaint filed 1/26/15.

Stipulated final judgment and order for permanent injunction entered

#### 1/27/15.

### FTC v. GERBER PRODUCTS, CO., No. 2:14-cv-06771 (D.N.J.)

Parties: Gerber Products Co. d/b/a Nestle Nutrition, d/b/a Nestle Infant Nutrition,

d/b/a Nestle Nutrition North America

Assigned Attorneys: Michelle K. Rusk (BCP/AP)

Victor V. DeFrancis

Ella Krainsky

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC

Act in connection with the labeling, advertising, marketing, distribution, and

sale of an infant formula purporting to prevent allergies.

Status: Complaint filed 10/29/14.

### FTC v. HEALTH FORMULAS, LLC, No. 2:14-cv-01649 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Health Formulas, LLC d/b/a Simple Pure Nutrition

Pure Vitamins, LLC

Longhorn Marketing, LLC

Method Direct, LLC

Weight Loss Dojo, LLC d/b/a Fitness Dvds VIP Savings d/b/a VIP Savings Center

DJD Distribution, LLC

MDCC, LLC d/b/a Method Direct Call Center

Chapnick, Smuckler & Chapnick, Inc.

Brandon Chapnick Keith Smuckler Danelle Miller Jason Miller

Assigned Attorneys: Danielle Estrada (BCP/MP)

Roberto Anguizola Shameka L. Walker

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act,

Electronic Fund transfer Act, Restore Online Shoppers Confidence Act, and

the Telemarketing Act in connection with "free" trials of health and

cosmetic products.

Status: Complaint filed 10/7/14.

TRO and other equitable relief granted 10/9/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to defendants Chapnick, Smukler & Chapnick, Inc., Brandon Chapnick, and Keith Smukler entered 11/18/14.

## FTC v. HISPANIC GLOBAL WAY, CORP, No. 1:14-cv-22018 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Hispanic Global Way, Corp.

Hispanic Global Way, LLC

Hispanic Global Way Venez Corp., d/b/a TVO

Hispanic Global Way Venez I Corp.

Gold Lead USA Corp. Sky Advance Choices Corp.

Sky Advance, LLC

First Airborne Service Trading Corp., d/b/a Fast Solutions, L'Nature

Lab, Movil English F.A.S.T, Molding Motion 5 First

Airborne

Hispanic Network Connections, LLC, d/b/a Lo Vi En TV

Fast Solutions Plus Corp. Grand Team Service Corp. Maria Elizabeth Vera Rafael Martin Hernandez Roberto Carrasco Macedo Maria Gisella Macedo

Assigned Attorneys: Michelle L. Schaefer (BCP/ENF)

Alleged Conduct: Unfair and deceptive practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the

FTC act in connection with the sale of purported weight loss products.

Status: Complaint filed 6/2/14.

TRO entered 6/2/14.

Preliminary injunction order entered 7/1/14.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment against

Fast Solutions Plus Corp., First Airborne Service Trading Corp., Gold

Lead USA Corporation, Hispanic Global Way Venez I Corp., Hispanic Global Way, Corp., Hispanic Global Way LLC, Hispanic Network Connections LLC, Sky Advance Choices Corp., Sky

Advance LLC, Maria Elizabeth Vera, Maria Gisella Carrasco, and

Rafael Martin Hernandez entered 3/4/15.

Motion for default judgment against Grand Team Service Corp. and Roberto

Carrasco Macedo filed 3/11/15.

Judgment by default and permanent injunction against Grand Team Service Corp. and Roberto Carrasaco Macedo entered 3/13/15.

# FTC v. HOLD BILLING SERVICES, LTD., No. 5:98-CV-00629-FB (W.D. Tex.)

Parties: Hold Billing Services, Ltd.

HBS, Inc.

Avery Communications, Inc.

Veterans of America Association, Ltd.

Thomas M. Lyons Keith C. Calil Milford H. Balaban

Billings Services Group Limited (Contempt Defendant)

Billing Services Group North America, Inc. (Contempt Defendant)

HBS Billing Services Company (Contempt Defendant) Enhanced Billing Services, Inc.(Contempt Defendant)

Billing Concepts, Inc. (Contempt Defendant) ACI Billing Services, Inc. (Contempt Defendant)

Assigned Attorneys: Douglas Wolfe (BCP/ENF)

Alleged Conduct: Unfair and deceptive billing practices in cramming bills for services upon

telephone line subscribers in sweepstakes promotion.

Status: Complaint filed 7/15/98.

Stipulated final judgments entered 9/22/99.

Contempt motion against Billings Services Group Limited, Billing

Services Group North America, Inc., HBS Billing Services Company, Enhanced Billing Services, Inc., Billing Concepts, Inc., and ACI Billing Services, Inc. filed 3/28/12; contempt defendants' oppositions

filed 4/30/12; Commission's reply filed 5/15/12.

Order conditionally granting Commission's motion for order to show cause regarding contempt entered 3/26/13; further proceedings, including resolution of the contempt motion, referred to Magistrate Judge.

Order referring case to mediation entered 7/8/13; mediation completed by

9/18/13.

Evidentiary hearing held 11/4/13 to 11/14/13.

Report and recommendation of magistrate judge to grant in part Commission's motion for contempt entered 3/27/14.

#### FTC v. HOME RELIEF FOUNDATION, INC., No. 1:14-cv-652 (W.D. Tex.)

Parties: Home Relief Foundation, Inc. d/b/a National Home Retention

John Dicristofalo

Josephine Amanda Dicristofalo

Assigned Attorneys: Emily B. Robinson (SWR)

Luis H. Gallegos

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act and the Mortgage Assistance Relief

Services Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of mortgage

assistance relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 7/14/14.

Preliminary injunction entered 7/18/14.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment

entered 3/6/15.

FTC v. IAB MARKETING ASSOCIATES, LP, No. 12-16265 (11th Cir.); No. 3:14-cv-00458-L (N.D. Tex.); No. 0:12-CV-61830 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: IAB Marketing Associates

Independent Association of Businesses

Healthcorp International, Inc. JW Marketing Designs, LLC

International Marketing Agencies LP

International Marketing Management, LLC

Wood, LLC

Health Services Providers, Inc. Magnolia Technologies Corporation

Fav Marketing Inc. James C. Wood James J. Wood Michael J. Wood Gary D. Wood Roy D. Hamilton Judy M. Hamilton

Magnolia Health Management Corporation

Tressa K. Wood (Relief Defendant) Avis S. Wood (Relief Defendant)

Assigned Attorneys: Dotan Weinman (MWR)

Patricia Hsue

Jack Metzler (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Sections 5 of FTC Act and the

Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the advertising, marketing and

sale of healthcare insurance.

Status: Complaint filed 9/18/12.

TRO as to all defendants entered 9/18/12. Preliminary injunctions entered 10/9/12.

Notice of appeal of preliminary injunction by IAB Marketing Associates and

- other defendants filed 12/3/12.
- Stipulated final order as to Health Service Providers, Inc., Magnolia Technologies Corporation, Fav Marketing Inc., Magnolia Health Management Corporation, Roy D. Hamilton, and Judy M. Hamilton entered 2/19/13.
- Commission's amended complaint adding two relief defendants filed 3/4/13.
- Motion to dismiss the amended complaint filed by IAB defendants and relief defendant Tressa Wood filed 4/8/13; FTC's response filed 4/22/13.
- Appellant's brief filed 3/8/13; Commission's responsive brief filed 5/10/13; appellants' reply brief filed 5/28/13.
- Motion by IAB defendants and relief defendant Tressa Wood to transfer venue to the Northern District of Texas filed 6/3/13; Commission's opposition filed 6/20/13.
- Motion by defendant Gary Wood to transfer venue to the Northern District of Texas filed 7/2/13; Commission's opposition filed 7/15/13; defendant's reply filed 7/22/13.
- Order denying motion to dismiss entered 8/21/13.
- Order stating that the asset freeze and preliminary injunction also apply to the relief defendants entered 9/16/13.
- Order denying IAB defendants' motion to dismiss entered 11/8/13.
- Motion for summary judgment by Avis Wood filed 11/11/13; Commission's opposition filed 11/27/13; reply filed 12/5/13.
- Motion for summary judgment by Commission filed 11/11/13; opposition filed 12/10/13; reply brief filed 12/20/13.
- Motion to transfer venue to the Northern District of Texas granted 2/6/14. Oral arguments in the 11th Circuit held 2/27/14.
- Opinion by 11th Circuit upholding preliminary injunction entered 3/27/14.
- Stipulated final order for monetary judgment as to relief defendant Avis S. Wood entered 8/7/14.
- Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants IAB Marketing Associates, LP, Independent Association of Business, HealthCorp International, Inc., JW Marketing designs, LLC, International Marketing Agencies, LP, International Marketing Management, LLC, Wood, LLC, James C. Wood, James J. Wood, Michael W. Wood, Gary D. Wood, and relief defendant Tressa K. Wood entered 10/10/14.

#### FTC v. IDEAL FINANCIAL SOLUTIONS, No. 2:13-CV-00143 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Ideal Financial Solutions, Inc.

Ascot Crossing, LLC Bracknell Shore, Ltd. Chandon Group, Inc.

Avanix, LLC

Fiscal Fitness, LLC Steven Sunyich Michael Sunyich Christopher Sunyich Shawn Sunyich

Melissa Sunyich Gardner

Kent Brown Shane Mosher Jared Mosher

Thomas W. McNamara

Assigned Attorneys: Megan Bartley (BCP/ENF)

Richard Michael Waller

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 in connection with a

scheme to debit and charge consumers without authorization.

Status: Complaint filed 1/28/13.

TRO entered 1/30/13.

Preliminary injunction entered 2/15/13.

FTC's amended complaint and motion for preliminary injunction and asset

freeze against Jared Mosher filed 4/10/13.

Preliminary injunction and asset freeze against Jared Mosher entered 5/10/13.

Settlement agreement between the Commission and Shawn Sunyich filed

3/12/14.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 3/19/14.

Consent judgment and permanent injunction against defendants Kent Brown

and Shawn Sunyich entered 6/5/14.

Clerk's entry of default against Ascot Crossing, LLC, Avanix, LLC,

Bracknell Shore, Ltd., Chandon Group, Inc., Fiscal Fitness, LLC,

and Ideal Financial Solutions entered 6/6/14.

# FTC v. INBOUND CALL EXPERTS, LLC, No. 9:14-cv-81395 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Inbound Call Experts, LLC

Advanced Tech Supportco, LLC

PC Vitalware, LLC Super PC Support, LLC Robert D. Deignan Justin M. Wright PC Cleaner, Inc. Netcom3 Global, Inc.

Netcom3, Inc.

Cashier Myricks, Jr.

Paul M. Herdsman

Assigned Attorneys: Colleen B. Robbins (BCP/MP)

Emily C. Burton

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the

Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the marketing, advertising, and

sale of computer security or technical support services.

Status: Complaint filed 11/10/14.

TRO entered 11/12/14.

Order granting preliminary injunction entered 12/23/14.

Trial scheduled for 5/2/16.

### FTC v. INSTANT RESPONSE SYSTEMS, LLC, No. 1:13-CV-00976 (E.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Instant Response Systems, LLC

B.B. Mercantile, Ltd. Medical Alert Industrial Medical Alert Services

Jason Abraham

Assigned Attorneys: Arturo DeCastro (BCP/MP)

Paul Spelman

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act,

Telemarketing Sales Rule, and the Unauthorized Merchandise Statute in connection with unsolicited calls to elderly consumers to sell medical alert

services.

Status: Complaint filed 2/25/13.

TRO entered 2/25/13.

Preliminary injunction entered 3/18/13.

Default judgment against defendant Instant Response Systems entered

1/31/14.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 6/6/14; Jason Abraham's

motion to strike filed 7/24/14; Commission's reply in support of motion for summary judgment filed 8/15/14; Jason Abraham's informational supplement to motion to strike filed 12/10/14; Commission's reply in opposition to informational supplement of

Abraham filed 12/15/14.

# FTC v. IVY CAPITAL, INC., No. 13-16052 (9th Cir.); No. 2:11-CV-00283 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Ivy Capital Inc. Virtual Profit, LLC

Fortune Learning Systems, LLC.

Fortune Learning, LLC.

Vianet, Inc.

Dream Financial
ICI Development Inc.
Ivy Capital, LLC

Enrich Wealth Group, LLC Logic Solutions, LLC

Business Development Div., LLC Oxford Debts Holdings, LLC

Nevada Credit Division, LLC
Corporate Credit Division, LLC
Tax Planning Division, LLC
Zyzac Commerce Solutions, Inc.
The Shipper, LLC
3 Day MBA, LLC
Global Finance Group, LLC
Corporate Credit Division, LLC
Sell IT Vizions, LLC
Kyle Kirchbaum
John Harrison
Steven Lyman
Benjamin Hoskins
Christopher Zelig

Global Finance Group, LLC
Steven Sonnenberg

Global Finance Group, LLC
Steven Sonnenberg

Genjamin Hoskins

Christopher Zelig

James Hanchett

Joshua Wickman Cherrytree Holdings, LLC

Oxford Financial, LLC S&T Time, LLC Virtucon LLC Curva, LLC

Mowab, Inc Keirsten Kirschbaum

Melyna Harrison Tracy Lyman

Leanne Hoskins

Assigned Attorneys: Emily Burton (BCP/MP)

Shameka Gainey Leslie Melman (OGC) Burke W. Kappler

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 and the Telemarketing

Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of get rich quick

programs and the billing of consumers' accounts.

Status: Complaint filed 2/22/11

TRO entered 2/22/11.

Preliminary injunction entered 3/25/11.

Default as to defendants Business Development Division, LLC, Corporate

Credit Division, LLC, Credit Repair Division, LLC, Nevada Corporate Division, Inc., and Tax Planning Division, LLC entered

4/4/11.

Motion for summary judgment by Defendant Benjamin Hoskins filed

8/8/12; Commission's response filed 9/18/12.

Motion for summary judgment by Defendant Leanne Hoskins filed

9/12/12.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 9/12/12.

Stipulated final judgment and order for permanent injunction as to 30

defendants and relief defendants entered 12/20/12.

Order granting summary judgment entered 3/26/13.

Notice of appeal by Ben Hoskins, Dream Financial, Leanne Hoskins, and Oxford Financial filed 5/23/13.

Order holding appeal in abeyance until post-judgment motion in district court is resolved entered 5/29/13.

Anthon Holdings Corp.

Order granting FTC's motion for default judgment against Business Development Division, Corporate Credit Division, Credit Repair Division, and Tax Planning Division entered 6/26/13.

Final judgment and order for permanent injunction and monetary relief entered 7/5/13.

Amended notice of appeal filed 7/10/13.

Appellant's brief filed 12/16/13; Commission's answering brief filed 2/21/14; appellant's reply brief filed 3/28/14.

FTC v. JEREMY JOHNSON, Nos. 11-17265, 11-17267, 12-15778, 12-16213, 13-15768, 13-15778, 13-15822 (9th Cir.); No. 2:10-CV-02203 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Jeremy D. Johnson

Big Bucks Pro, Inc.

Blue Net Progress, Inc.

Blue Streak Progressing, Inc.

Bottom Dollar, Inc.

Business First, Inc.

Business Loan Success, Inc.

CPA Upsell, Inc.

Cloud Nine Marketing, Inc.

Cloud Nine Marketing, Inc.

Cloud Nine Marketing, Inc.

Costnet Discounts, Inc. Cutting Edge Processing, Inc.

Diamond J Media, Inc. EBusiness First, Inc. Ebusiness Success, Inc. Elite Debit, Inc.

Employee Plus, Inc. Excess Net Success, Inc. Duane Fielding Fiscal Fidelity, Inc.

Fitness Processing, Inc. Funding Search Success, Inc.

Funding Success, Inc.

GG Processing, Inc.

GGL Rewards, Inc.

Highlight Marketing, Inc.

Hooper Processing, Inc. I Works, Inc.

Internet Business Source, Inc. Internet Economy, Inc.

Internet Fitness, Inc.JRB Media, Inc.Jet Processing, Inc.Andy JohnsonLoyd JohnstonScott Leavitt

Lifestyles for Fitness, Inc. Market Funding Solutions, Inc.

Mist Marketing, Inc. Money Harvest, Inc.

Monroe Processing, Inc. Scott Muir

Net Business Success, Inc.Net Commerce, Inc.Net Discounts, Inc.Net Fit Trends, Inc.Net Success, Inc.Network Agenda, LLC

Optimum Assistance, Inc. Bryce Payne

Kevin Pilon Power Processing, Inc.

Premier Performance, Inc. Pro Internet Services, Inc.

Razor Processing, Inc.

Revive Marketing, Inc.

Simcor Marketing, Inc.

Rebate Deals, Inc.

Ryan Riddle

Terrason Spinks

Success Marketing, Inc. Summit Processing, Inc.

Tran Voyage, Inc. TranFirst, Inc.

Unlimited Processing, Inc. Xcel Processing, Inc.

eCom Success, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Collot Guerard (BCP/MP)

J. Ronald Brooke Burke Kappler (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5, the Electronic Fund

Transfer Act, and Regulation E in connection with the advertisement of

government grants and money-making opportunities.

Status: Complaint filed 12/21/10.

TRO and asset freeze entered 1/13/11. Preliminary injunction entered 2/10/11.

Notice of interlocutory appeal by defendant Jeremy Johnson (Appeal No. 11-17265) filed 9/22/11; dismissed 6/27/12.

Notice of interlocutory appeal by defendants Duane Fielding, Anthon Holdings Corp., and Network Agenda, LLC (Appeal No. 11-17265) filed 9/23/11; dismissed on appellant's motion 11/17/11.

Notice of appeal of order granting first omnibus motion for sale (Appeal No. 12-15778) filed 4/6/12; appellant's opening brief due but not filed 7/16/12; dismissed by 9th Cir. 11/5/12.

Notice of appeal of order granting receiver's motion for fees (Appeal No. 12-16213) filed 5/21/12; appellant's opening brief due but not filed 9/7/12.

Appeal dismissed for failure to prosecute, 12/20/12.

Notices of appeal of order clarifying preliminary injunction (Nos. 13-15768 and 13-15778) filed 4/18/13 and 4/19/13; appeals consolidated and appellants' opening brief filed 5/17/13; Commission's responsive brief filed 6/28/13; reply brief filed 7/15/13.

Notice of appeal (No. 13-15822) filed 4/24/13; appellants' opening brief filed 6/26/13; Commission's answering brief filed 8/7/13.

Motion for summary judgment against all liability and relief defendants filed 11/26/13.

Motion for partial summary judgment by relief defendants filed 11/29/13.

Voluntary dismissal of appeal 13-15822 entered 1/21/14.

Oral argument in appeals 13-15768 and 13-15778 held 2/3/14.

Stipulated final order for permanent injunction against defendants Big Bucks Pro, Inc., Blue Net Progress, Inc., Bolt Marketing, Inc., Business Loan Success, Inc., CS Processing, Inc., GGL Rewards, Inc.,

Highlighting Marketing, Inc., Mist Marketing, Inc., Net Discounts, Inc., Optimum Assistance, Inc., Razor Processing, Inc., Simcor Marketing, Inc., and Scott Muir entered 4/7/14.

Decision by the Ninth Circuit affirming the district court's ruling that certain assets nominally owned by nonparties are subject to the preliminary injunction and asset freeze entered 4/8/14.

Order granting in part and denying in part Commission's motion for summary judgment entered 3/31/15.

# FTC v. JOHN BECK AMAZING PROFITS, LLC, No. 12-56665 (9th Cir.); 2:09-CV-04719 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: John Beck Amazing Profits, LLC

John Alexander, LLC

Jeff Paul, LLC, d/b/a Shortcuts to Millions, LLC

Mentoring of America, LLC

Family Products, LLC Douglas Gravink Gary Hewitt John Beck John Alexander

Jeff Paul

Assigned Attorneys: John D. Jacobs (WRLA)

Stacy R. Procter Christina Tusan Evan Rose (WRSF) Kenneth H. Abbe Matthew Gold Jack Metzler (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 and the Telemarketing

Sales Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of get rich quick

programs and the billing of consumers' accounts.

Status: Complaint filed 6/30/09.

Preliminary injunction entered 11/17/09.

Motion for order to show cause why defendants Jeff Paul, Family Products, LLC, Mentoring of America, LLC, Gary Hewitt, and Douglas Gravink should not be held in contempt of the preliminary injunction

filed 5/19/11; opposition filed 6/1/11; reply filed 6/8/11;

Order granting motion to show cause entered 7/21/11; supplemental response by defendants filed 8/15/11; Commission's objection filed 8/24/11.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 8/15/11; defendants' opposition filed 9/24/11; Commission's reply filed 10/11/11.

Order granting Commission's motion for summary judgment and ordering supplemental briefing on scope of injunctive relief and monetary damages entered 4/20/12; Commission's brief filed 5/7/12; defendants' response brief filed 5/14/12; Commission's reply brief filed 5/21/12.

Final order granting permanent injunction and other equitable relief entered 8/23/12.

Defendant Beck's notice of appeal filed 9/7/12.

Defendant Beck's motion for a stay pending appeal filed 10/9/12; denied 10/9/12.

Appellant's brief filed 2/19/13; Commission's responsive brief filed 4/18/13; reply brief filed 5/2/13.

Oral argument held 2/9/15.

## FTC v. LANIER LAW, LLC, No. 15-11263 (11th Cir.); No. 3:14-cv-786 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Lanier Law, LLC

Fortress Law Group, LLC Surety Law Group, LLC

Liberty & Trust Law Group of Florida, LLC

Michael W. Lanier

Assigned Attorneys: Harold E. Ktiz (SERA)

Marcela C. Mateo

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 of the FT Act and the Mortgage Assistance Relief

Services Rule in connection with the marketing and sale of mortgage

assistance relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 7/8/14.

Ex parte TRO entered 7/11/14. Converted to preliminary injunction with

asset freeze entered 8/1/14.

Motion to dismiss complaint entered 8/26/14; opposition to motion

entered 9/4/14.

Motion for preliminary injunction entered 10/31/14.

Amended complaint against all defendants entered 12/22/14.

Motion to dismiss amended complaint entered 1/13/15. Order granting preliminary injunction entered 2/6/15.

Notices of appeal of Rogelio Robles and Edward Rennick

concerning preliminary injunction filed 3/20/15 and 3/23/15.

# FTC v. LASAROW, No. 1:15-cv-1614 (N.D. III.)

Parties: Avrom Boris Lasarow

L Health Ltd. Kristi Z. Kimball

New Consumer Solutions, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Karen J. Mandel (BCP/AP)

Guy G. Ward

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC

Act in connection with the marketing of mobile device software applications

called Mole Detective for the purported detection of melanoma.

Status: Complaint filed 2/23/15.

## FTC v. LEANSPA LLC, No. 13-653 (2d Cir.); No. 3:11-CV-01715 (D. Conn.)

Parties: LeanSpa, LLC

NutraSlim, LLC NutraSlim U.K. LTD

Boris Mizhen

Leadclick Media, Inc.

Richard Chiang

Angelina Strano, Relief Defendant CoreLogic, Inc., Relief Defendant

Assigned Attorneys: Darren Lubetzky (NER)

Michael Bergman (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 and the Electronic

Fund Transfer Act in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of weight-loss and related health

products through various websites.

Status: Complaint filed 11/07/11.

TRO granted in part 11/14/11.

Preliminary injunction entered 11/22/11.

Amended complaint filed 7/26/12.

Motion for preliminary injunction against defendant Richard Chiang and

relief defendant Angelina Strano filed 9/11/12; opposition by Angelina Strano filed 11/15/12; Commission's reply filed

11/29/12.

Motion for stipulated preliminary injunction against Richard Chiang filed

11/15/12.

Preliminary injunction against Richard Chiang entered 1/17/13.

Preliminary injunction against relief defendant Angelina Strano entered 1/29/13.

Second amended complaint filed 2/19/13.

Notice of appeal by relief defendant Angelina Strano filed 2/21/13.

Appellant Strano's opening brief filed 4/22/13; Commission's brief filed 5/28/13; appellant Strano's reply brief filed 6/11/13.

Oral argument heard 6/18/13.

Summary order and judgment by court of appeals affirming preliminary injunction order against Angelina Strano issued 6/20/13.

- Commission's motion for leave to amend complaint to add CoreLogic, Inc. as relief defendant filed 6/10/13; defendant Leadclick Media's response filed 7/1/13; Commission's reply filed 7/15/13; order granting motion to amend complaint entered 8/28/13.
- Joint motion for entry of stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants LeanSpa, LLC, NutraSlim, LLC, NutraSlim U.K., Ltd. (also d/b/a LeanSpa U.K., Ltd.) and Boris Mizhen and relief defendant Angelina Strano filed 12/23/13.
- Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendants LeanSpa, LLC, NutraSlim, LLC, NutraSlim, U.K., Ltd, and Boris Mizhen, and relief defendant Angelina Strano entered 1/7/14.
- Commission's motion for summary judgment against LeadClick and relief defendant CoreLogic filed 5/5/14; LeadClick's motion for summary judgment filed 5/5/14; CoreLogic's motion for summary judgment filed 5/5/14; Commission's opposition to defendants' motions filed 5/27/14; defendants' oppositions to Commission's motion filed 6/10/14.

Judgment entered in favor of the Commission and State of Connecticut granting summary judgment against CoreLogic Inc. and LeadClick Media Inc. entered 3/6/15.

## FTC v. MDK MEDIA, INC. No. 2:14-cv-5099 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: MDK Media, Inc.

Bear Communications, LLC Makonnen Demessow Kebede

Tendency Media, LLC

Sarah Brekke

Mindkontrol Industries, LLC Christopher Thomas Denovellis

Anacapa Media, LLC Wayne Calvin Byrd, LLC James Matthew Dawson Network One Commerce, Inc. Casey Lee Adkisson Erdi Development, LLC Erdolo Ley Eromo Ocean Tactics, LLC Fraser R. Thompson Phwoar, LLC

Darcy Michael Wedd Concise Consulting, Inc. Mmix Consulting, Inc.

Michael Peter Pajaczkowski

Assigned Attorneys: Faye C. Barnouw (WRLA)

> Marciela Segura Barbara Y K Chun Nicholas M. May

Alleged Conduct: Unfair and deceptive practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act in

connection with placing unauthorized third-party charges on consumers'

mobile phone bills, or "cramming."

Status: Complaint filed 7/3/14.

TRO entered 7/3/14.

First amended complaint filed 10/6/14.

Motion to dismiss and motion to strike portions of complaint filed 11/7/14;

opposition filed 11/17/14; reply filed 11/24/14; motion denied

12/4/14.

### FTC v. MIDWAY INDUSTRIES, LLC, No. 1:14-cv-2312 (D. Md.)

Parties: Midway Industries, LLC d/b/a Midway Industries of Delray Beach, LLC

Commercial Industries, LLC d/b/a State Electric & Power, LLC, d/b/a

Commercial Industries of Palm Beach, LLC

National, LLC d/b/a National Lighting & Maintenance d/b/a National and

National of Delray Beach, LLC

State Power & Lighting, LLC

Essex Industries, LLC

Johnson Distributing, LLC, d/b/a Johnson Distributing MD d/b/a Johnson

**Distributors** 

Hansen Supply, LLC

Environment Industries, LLC Mid Atlantic Industries, LLC

B & E Industries, LLC

Eric A. Epstein Brian K. Wallen

Midway Management, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Amy C.Hocevar (ECR)

Harris A. Senturia Marci Fredrick

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act, the Telemarketing Sales Rule and the

Unordered Merchandise Statute in connection with sale of light bulbs and

cleaning supplies.

Status: Complaint filed 7/21/14.

TRO entered 7/21/14.

Order granting preliminary injunction with continued appointment of

receiver, asset freeze, and accounting entered 10/29/14.

### FTC v. MONEY NOW FUNDING LLC., No. 2:13-cv-1583 (D. Ariz)

Parties: Money Now Funding LLC, a/k/a Cash4Businesses, a/k/a

CashFourBusinesses

Rose Marketing LLC Depaola Marketing LLC

Affiliate Marketing Group LLC

Legal Doxs LLC, a/k/a First Business LLC` US Doc Assist LLC, a/k/a First Business LLC

Affinity Technologies LLC Marketing Expert Solutions LLC Lukeroy K Rose, a/k/a Luke Rose

Cordell Bess, a/k/a Blaine Thompson d/b/a JJB Marketing

Solana Depaola Jennifer Beckman

William D. Claspell, a/k/a Bill Claspell Richard Frost, a/k/a Richard Strickland

Dino Mitchell, a/k/a Dino Jones Clinton Rackley a/k/a Clinton Fosse

Lance Himes, a/k/a Raymond Homes, a/k/a Lance Haist

Leary Darling

Donna Duckett, d/b/a D&D Marketing Solutions

Della Frost, d/b/a ZoomDocs LLC

Christopher Grimes, d/b/a Elite Marking Strategies Alannah M Harre, d/b/a National Marketing Group

Ronald W. Hobbs, d/b/a Ron Hobbs & Associates, d/b/a Sales Academy

**USA LLC** 

Janine Lilly, d/b/a Doc Assistant

Michael Mcintyre, d/b/a McIntyre Marketing

Benny Montgomery, d/b/a Montgomery Marketing

Virginia Rios, d/b/a V&R Marketing Solutions

Kendrick Thomas, d/b/a KT Advertising

Global Network Marketing, LLC Precise Payroll Services, LLC Strategic Media Advertising, LLC

Cynthia Miller, individually and as manager of Global Network Marketing and Precise Payroll Services, LLC, a/k/a Cynthia Metcalf

Assigned Attorneys: Janet Ammerman (BCP/MP)

Rhonda Perkins

James Evans (BCP/AP)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, the Business Opportunity Rule,

and the Telemarketing Sales Rule concerning a telemarketing scheme offering consumers business opportunities under a variety of names.

Status: Complaint filed 8/5/13.

TRO entered 8/5/13.

Preliminary injunction order entered 8/19/13.

Preliminary injunction as to defendants Cordell Bess, Clinton Rackley and Ronald Hobbs entered 9/13/13.

Motion to hold defendants Lukeroy Rose, Cordell Bess, Ronald Hobbs, Clinton Rackley, Della Frost, Richard Frost, Donna Duckett, Janine Lilly, and Dino Mitchell in contempt filed 10/18/13.

Amended complaints adding defendants Cynthia Miller, Global Network Marketing, LLC, Prices Payroll Services, LLC, and Strategic Media Advertising, LLC filed 1/9/14.

Preliminary injunction modified 2/13/14.

Preliminary injunction order with asset freeze and other equitable relief as to defendants Cynthia Miller, Global Network Marketing, LLC, and Precise Payroll Service, LLC entered 4/28/14.

Default as to Global Network Marketing, LLC, Cynthia Miller, Precise Payroll Services, LLC, and Strategic Media Advertising, LLC entered 4/30/14.

Second motion to hold defendant Lukeroy Rose in contempt filed 6/10/14.

Order holding defendant Lukeroy Rose in civil contempt of preliminary Injunction entered 8/27/14.

Motion to strike defendant Benny Montgomery's answer to complaint filed 11/21/14.

Order granting motion to strike defendant Benny Montgomery's answer and directing clerk to enter default against Benny Montgomery entered 12/10/14.

Motion for summary judgment against defendants Lukeroy Rose, Solana DePaola, Lance Himes, Leary Darling, Jennifer Beckman, William Claspell and Clinton Rackley filed 12/15/14.

Application for entry of default as to Montgomery filed 12/17/14.

Motion to stay all further proceedings as to defendants Himes and Claspell until 4/27/15 filed 1/13/15.

Motion to stay all further proceedings as to defendant Jennifer Beckman until 4/27/15 filed 1/20/15.

Order granting stay until 4/27/15 as to defendants Beckman, Himes and Claspell entered 1/21/15.

Motion to stay all further proceedings as to defendant Solana DePaola until 4/27/15 filed 2/11/15.

Order granting stay until 4/27/15 as to defendant Solana DePaola entered 2/12/15.

Order granting in part summary judgment against defendants Rose, Darling and Rackley entered 3/17/15.

## FTC v. MORTGAGE RELIEF ADVOCATES, LLC, No. 2:14-cv-5434 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Mortgage Relief Adovacates, LLC

National Forensic Loan Audit Services, LLC

Evertree, LLC

Key Stone real Estate, LLC

Pablo Rodriguez Michael Rodriguez

Assigned Attorneys: Christian V. Tusan (WRLA)

Jason D. Schall (BCP/FP)

Yaa A. Apori

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act and the Mortgage Assistance Relief

Services in connection with the marketing and sale of mortgage assistance

relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 7/14/14.

Preliminary injunction entered 8/22/14.

Commission's motion for summary judgment as to all claims

filed 3/27/15.

# FTC v. MYTEL INTERNATIONAL, INC., No. 2:87-cv-07259 (C.D. Cal.)

Parties: Mytel International, Inc.

Gilbert N. Michaels Gerald Feldman

Assigned Attorneys: Elsie B. Kappler (BCP/ENF)

Reenah L. Kim

John D. Jacobs (WRLA)

Mark S. Hegedus (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Violation of 1988 permanent injunction order regarding deceptive acts and

Practices in connection with the sale of photocopier toner.

Status: Complaint filed 10/29/87.

Final judgment entered 11/16/88.

Commission's motion for contempt filed 4/17/14.

Defendants motion to stay filed 6/16/14. Order granting stay entered 11/6/14.

#### FTC v. NATIONAL CHECK REGISTRY, No. 1:14-cv-0490 (W.D.N.Y)

Parties: National Check Registry, LLC

Check Systems, LLC

American Mutual Holdings, Inc.

Goldberg Maxwell, LLC Morgan Jackson, LLC Mullins & Kane, LLC Buffalo Staffing, Inc. ECapital Services, LLC Joseph C. Bella, III Diane L. Bella Luis A. Shaw

Interchex Systems, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Colin A. Hector (BCP/FP)

Nikhil Singhvi Thomas J. Widor

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Fair Debt Collection

Practices Act in connection with abusive and deceptive debt collection

practices.

Status: Complaint filed 6/23/14.

TRO entered 6/24/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 7/10/14.

FTC v. NATIONAL UROLOGICAL GROUP, INC., No. 10-125 (S. Ct); Nos. 14-13131,

14-13972, 09-10617 (11th Cir.); No. 1:04-CV-03294 (N.D. Ga.)

Parties: National Urological Group, Inc., d/b/a Warner Laboratories

National Institute for Clinical Weight Loss, Inc.

Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Jared Wheat Thomasz Holda Michael Howell Stephen Smith

Terrill Mark Wright, M.D.

Assigned Attorneys: Sydney M. Knight (BCP/AP)

Tawana E. Davis Edward Glennon Mary Johnson

Leslie Melman (OGC) Amanda Basta (BCP/ENF)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive practices in violation of Sections 5 and 12 in connection with the

sale of a purported weight loss product.

Status: Complaint filed 11/10/04.

Final judgment entered 12/16/08. Notice of appeal filed 2/4/09.

Opinion affirming district court order entered 12/15/09.

Petition for rehearing en banc filed 1/29/10; order denying petition entered 4/26/10.

Appellant's petition for a writ of certiorari filed 7/23/10; Commission's opposition filed 9/24/10; appellant's petition denied 11/1/10.

Commission's motion to hold defendants Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Stephen Smith and Jared Wright in contempt filed 11/1/11; defendant's opposition filed 12/2/11.

Commission's motion to hold defendant Terrill Mark Wright in contempt filed 3/21/12.

Order to show cause why defendants Wright, Hi-Tech Pharmaceuticals, Stephen Smith, and Jared Wright should not be held in contempt entered 5/11/12; response filed 11/13/12.

Motion for contempt judgment filed 10/22/12; defendants' response filed 12/14/12; Commission's reply brief filed 1/10/13.

Order finding defendants liable for contempt and ordering further proceedings on remedy entered 8/8/13.

Trial on contempt remedies held on 1/21/14 - 1/24/14.

Order holding defendants liable for contempt and directing compensatory sanctions to redress consumers entered 5/14/14.

Defendants' notices of appeal filed 7/11/14 and 7/14/14.

Order by district court imposing coercive contempt sanction and directing that defendants Jared Wheat and Stephen Smith be incarcerated until they comply with product recall entered 9/2/14.

Petition for mandamus by defendants Wheat and Smith seeking to overturn coercive contempt order filed 9/4/14; denied 9/4/14.

Notice of appeal from coercive contempt order and emergency motion for a stay by defendants Wheat and Smith filed 9/4/14; Commission's opposition filed 9/5/14; motion for stay denied 9/5/14; motion to voluntarily dismiss appeal filed 9/8/14; appeal no. 14-13972 dismissed 10/15/14.

Motion to purge contempt defendants of contempt filed 9/26/14; Commission's opposition filed 9/26/14.

Second motion to purge contempt defendants or release contempt defendants pending determination of less restrictive mean to purge contempt filed 10/16/14; Commission's response filed 1/13/15; granted 1/20/15.

Motion to stay execution of judgment pending appeal entered 10/30/14; denied 1/23/15.

Appellants' briefs (No. 14-13131) filed 10/30/14.

Order that the US Marshal's Service release Jared Wheat and Stephen Smith from incarceration entered 11/10/14.

Commission's answering brief (No. 14-13131) filed 1/9/15; appellants' reply briefs filed 2/17/15.

Oral argument scheduled for 4/17/15.

FTC v. NEOVI, INC., Nos. 12-56658, 12-56735, 09-55093 (9th Cir.); No. 3:06-CV-01952 (S.D. Cal.)

Parties: Neovi, Inc., d/b/a Neovi Data Corporation and Qchex.com

G7 Productivity Systems, Inc., d/b/a Qchex.com

James M. Danforth Thomas Villwock iProlog Corporation

FreeQuick Wire Corporation

Assigned Attorneys: Korin Ewing Felix (BCP/ENF)

John D. Jacobs (WRLA) Leslie Melman (OGC)

Jack Metzler

Alleged Conduct: Unfair practices in violation of Section 5 in connection with the offering

and sale of online check services.

Status: Complaint filed 9/19/06.

Final order for permanent injunction and other equitable relief entered

1/7/09.

Notice of appeal by defendants filed 1/16/09.

Motion for order to show cause why Thomas Villwock, James M.

Danforth, G7 Productivity Systems, Inc., iProlog Corporation, and FreeQuick Wire Corporation should not be held in contempt filed 10/15/09.

Order requiring Commission to show cause why contempt motion should not be dismissed entered 10/16/09; Commission's response filed 10/21/09

Order by district court staying contempt proceedings pending appeal entered 1/19/10.

Opinion affirming district court order entered 5/14/10; amended 6/15/10. Contempt proceedings reopened 5/14/10.

Final order finding defendants Neovi, Productivity Systems, Thomas Villwock, and James M. Danforth in contempt entered 7/11/12.

Notice of appeal by defendants filed 9/7/12; Commission's cross appeal filed 9/21/12.

Order by the Ninth Circuit requiring defendants to show cause why appellate jurisdiction exists entered 9/24/12.

Commission's memorandum on jurisdiction filed 10/24/13.

Order dismissing appeal for lack of appellate jurisdiction entered 1/22/13. Contempt hearing in district court held 8/12/13.

Order finding that defendants failed to purge their noncompliance with court's 1/7/09 final order, and granting them 30 days to comply entered 1/10/14.

Commission's motion to modify final order filed 2/10/14; defendant's opposition filed 3/6/14; Commission's reply filed 3/13/14.

Order denying Commission's motion to modify entered 8/25/14. Commission's renewed motion to modify final order filed 12/1/14.

## *FTC v. NOURISHLIFE*, No. 1:15-cv-93 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: Nourishlife, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Matthew Wernz (MWR)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC

Act in connection with the labeling, advertising, marketing, distribution, and

sale of children's dietary supplements.

Status: Complaint filed 1/7/15.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction entered 1/14/15.

### FTC v. NPB ADVERTISING, INC., No. 8:14-cv-1155 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: NPB Advertising, Inc., d/b/a Pure Green Coffee

Nationwide Ventures, LLC

Olympus Advertising, Inc. JMD Advertising, Inc. Signature Group, LLC Sermo Group, LLC Nicholas Scott Congleton Paul Daniel Pascual Bryan Benjamin Walsh

Dylan Craig Loher (Relief Defendant) CPW Funding, LLC (Relief Defendant)

Assigned Attorneys: Elizabeth O. Tucci (BCP/AP)

Katherine A. Campbell Mary L. Johnson

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) and Section 12 in

connection with the sale and marketing of purported dietary supplement Pure

Green Coffee.

Status: Complaint filed 5/15/14.

Amended complaint filed 2/5/15.

Joint motion for entry of stipulated order concerning assets of

CPW Funding LLC filed 3/10/15.

Preliminary injunction and entry of stipulated order entered 3/23/15.

#### FTC v. ONLINEYELLOWPAGESTODAY.COM, INC., No. 2:14-cv-0838 (W.D. Wash.)

Parties: OnlineYellowPagesToday.com, Inc.

USYellowPageDirectory.com, Inc.

7703236 Canada, Inc. 7095333 Canada, Inc. Oni Nathifa Julien

Assigned Attorneys: Maxine R. Stansell (NWR)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with deceptive

practices relating to internet business directories.

Status: Complaint filed 6/9/14.

TRO entered 7/3/14.

Permanent injunction and monetary judgment as to defendant

Oni Nathifa Julien enter 3/10/15.

#### *FTC v. PAIRSYS, INC.*, No. 1:14-cv-1192 (N.D. N.Y.)

Parties: Pairsys, Inc.

Tiya Bhattacharya

Uttam Saha

Assigned Attorneys: Gideon E. Sinasohn (SER)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act and the

Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with the sale of computer security

services.

Status: Complaint filed 9/30/14.

TRO entered 9/30/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction order entered 10/9/14. Clerk's entry of default as to Pairsys, Inc. entered 12/22/14.

Bench trial set for 2/9/16.

### FTC v. PARTNERS IN HEALTH CARE ASSOCIATION, INC., No. 1:14-cv-23109 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Partners in Health Care Association, inc.

Gary L. Kiper

United Solutions Group, Inc. d/b/a Debt Relief Experts, Inc.

Walter S. Vargas

Constanza Gomez Vargas

**RBS** Citizens Bank

Assigned Attorneys: Gary L. Ivens (BCP/MP)

Christopher E. Brown

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act, the Telemarketing Sales Rule

regarding the deceptive marketing of medical discount cards.

Status: Complaint filed 8/25/14.

TRO entered 8/25/14.

Preliminary injunction against Partners in Health Care Association and Gary

L. Kieper entered 9/8/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction against defendants United Solutions Group,

Inc., Walter S. Vargas, and Constanza Gomez Vargas entered

9/11/14.

Motion for contempt as to Grumer & Macaluso, P.A. and Gary Kieper

entered 10/23/14; motion denied 2/5/15.

Trial set for 9/21/15.

#### FTC v. PHILIP DANIELSON, LLC, No. 2:14-cv-896 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Philip Danielson, LLC

Foundation Business Solutions, LLC Emerchant, LLC d/b/a Full Biz Solutions

Linden Financial Group, LLC

Acutus Law, P.C.

Direct Results Solutions, LLC
Strata G Solutions, LLC
Philip L Danielson

Philip J. Danielson Tony D. Norton Sean J. Coberly

Tanya L. Hawkins a/k/a Tonya Hawkins

Chad E. Vansickle Jennifer B. Danielson April D. Norton

Assigned Attorneys: Adam M. Wesolowski (BCP/FP)

Thomas J. Widor

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

Mortgage Assistance Relief Services in connection with phony mortgage

relief scheme.

Status: Complaint filed 6/9/14.

TRO entered 6/23/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction as to Linden Financial Group, LLC

entered 8/4/14.

Commission's notice of voluntary dismissal of Jennifer B. Danielson

filed 8/19/14; order of dismissal entered 8/19/14.

Default as to Acutus Law. P.C. Sean J. Coberly, Philip J. Danielson,

Direct Results Solutions, LLC, Foundation Business Solution, LLC, Tanya L. Hawkins, Linden Financial Group, LLC, April D. Norton, Tony D. Norton, Philip Danielson, LLC, Strata G Solutions, LLC,

Chad E. Vansickle, emerchant, LLC entered 10/17/14.

Order modifying Preliminary Injunction as to Linden Financial Group

entered 1/9/15.

Stipulated Final Orders for Permanent Injunction and Monetary Relief as to defendants Philip Danielson LLC, Philip J. Danielson, Direct Results Solutions LLC, Strata G Solutions LLC, Tony D Norton, relief defendant April D. Norton, Sean J. Coberly, Actus Law PC,

Tonya L. Hawkins, Foundation Business Solutions LLC, emarchant LLC, and Chad E. VanSickle entered 2/6/15.

#### FTC v. PSC ADMINISTRATIVE, LLC, No. 1:15-cv-84 (S.D. Ala.)

Parties: PSC Administrative, LLC, f/k/a Payday Support Center, LLC

Coastal Acquisitions, LLC

Jared Irby

Richard Hughes

Assigned Attorneys: Kathryn M. Grajales (BCP/FP)

Miya Rahamim

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the Telemarketing Sales Rule

in connection with the deceptive marketing and sale of debt relief services.

Status: Complaint filed 2/18/15.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 3/5/15.

#### FTC v. SITESEARCH CORP., No. 2:14-cv-02750 (D. Ariz.)

Parties: Sitesearch Corporation

LeapLab, LLC

Leads Company, LLC

John Ayers

Assigned Attorneys: Amanda B. Kostner (BCP/ENF)

Richard M. Waller

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive and unfair acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC

Act in connection with the sale of payday loan applications containing

consumer personal and financial information.

Status: Complaint filed 12/22/14.

Commission's motion for entry of default as to Sitesearch filed 2/12/15. Clerk's entry of default as to Sitesearch Corporation entered 2/13/15.

### FTC v. SOLACE INTERNATIONAL, INC., No. 3:14-cv-00638 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Solace International, Inc.

Aaron Lilly

Bioscience Research Institute, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Janet M. Evans (BCP/AP)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC

Act in connection with the labeling, advertising, marketing, distribution, and

sale of DermaTend and Lipidryl.

Status: Complaint filed 12/10/14.

Stipulated permanent injunction entered 12/11/14.

# FTC v. ST. LUKE'S HEALTH SYSTEM, LTD., No. 14-35173 (9th Cir.); No. 1:13-CV-00116 (D. Idaho)

Parties: St. Luke's Health System Ltd.

Saltzer Medical Group

Assigned Attorneys: J. Thomas Greene (WRSF)

Danica Noble (NWR) Robert J. Schroeder

Douglas Eugene Litvack (BC)

Henry Chao-Lon Su Matthew Paul Accornero Michael James Perry Peter C. Herrick

Joel Marcus-Kurn (OGC)

Michael Bergman

Alleged Conduct: Violation of Section 7 of the Clayton Act resulting from hospital system's

acquisition of physician group.

Status: Complaint filed 3/12/13.

Case consolidated with *Saint Alphonsus Medical Center – Nampa, Inc. v. St. Luke's Health System, Ltd.* (No. 1:12-CV-00560) on 3/19/13.

Trial held 9/23/13 to 10/21/13. Closing argument held 11/7/13. Final judgment entered 2/28/14. Notice of appeal filed 3/7/14.

Motion for stay filed 3/4/14; Commission's opposition to motion for

stay filed 3/28/14.

Appellants' opening brief filed 6/12/14.

Motion for stay denied by district court 6/18/14; temporary stay pending motion to Ninth Circuit entered 6/23/14.

Motion for stay in Ninth Circuit filed 6/24/14; Commission's opposition filed 7/7/14.

Commission's answering brief due 8/13/14.

Oral argument held 11/19/14.

Opinion and Judgment affirmed entered 2/10/15.

Appellees' motion to dissolve stay and expedite issuance of mandate filed

2/18/15; denied 3/4/15.

Appellants' petition for panel rehearing and rehearing en banc

#### filed 3/26/15.

#### FTC v. SUN BRIGHT VENTURES, LLC, No. 5:14-cv-2153 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Sun Bright Ventures, LLC

Citadel ID Pro, LLC Benjamin Todd Workman

Trident Consulting Partners, LLC (relief defendant)

Glenn Erikson

Assigned Attorneys: Russel Deitch (BCP/MP)

Thomas M. Biesty Tracey T. Gronniger

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive and unfair acts or practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC

Act, the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act in connection with soliciting consumers about free products and services.

Status: Complaint filed 7/1/14.

TRO entered 9/4/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunctions entered 9/18/14.

Trial set for 11/30/15.

*FTC v. TRACFONE*, No. 3:13-cv-03440 (N.D. Cal.)

Parties: Tracfone Wireless, Inc. d/b/a Straight Talk Wireless d/b/a Simple Mobile,

d/b/a Telcel America

Assigned Attorneys: Steven Spencer Elg (SERA)

Anna M. Burns

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in

connection with the sale of "unlimited" mobile data service.

Status: Complaint filed 1/28/15.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered

2/20/15.

*FTC v. TRUDEAU*, No. 12-6 (S. Ct.); Nos. 08-4249 10-2418, 10-1383, 13-1746, 13-1747, and 13-1898 (7th Cir.); Nos. 1:03-CV-03904, 1:98-CV-00168 (N.D. Ill.)

Parties: Kevin Trudeau

Shop America (USA), LLC

Robert Barefoot

Deonna Enterprises, Inc.

Karbo, Inc.

Karbo Enterprises, Inc.

Shop America Marketing Group

TruStar Global Media

K.T. Corp. TruCom, LLC

Law Offices of Marc J. Lane

Winston & Strawn LLP

Website Solutions USA (WSU)

Global Information Network USA (GIN USA)

KT Radio Network (KTRN)

Nataliya Babenko

Assigned Attorneys: Michael P. Mora (BCP-ENF)

Jonathan Cohen

David O'Toole (MWR) David Sieradzki (OGC)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive practices in violation of Sections 5 and 12 in connection with the

sale of a dietary supplement; civil contempt for violations of a 1998

stipulated permanent injunction against Kevin Trudeau in connection with infomercial sales of a weight loss book; civil contempt for failure to comply

with 2010 contempt sanction.

Status: Complaint filed 6/9/03.

Stipulated final order for permanent injunction and settlement of claims for monetary relief as to defendants Kevin Trudeau, Shop America (USA), LLC, Shop America Marketing Group, LLC, Trustar Global Media, Limited and Relief defendants K.T. Corporation, Limited and TruCom, LLC, including monetary relief of approximately \$2.1

TruCom, LLC, including monetary relief of approximately \$2.1

million entered 9/3/04.

\* \* \* \* \*

Motion to show cause why defendant Trudeau should not be held in civil contempt for violating permanent injunction, filed 9/13/07.

Order finding Trudeau in contempt for violating permanent injunction entered 11/16/07.

Hearing on remedy for violating permanent injunction held 7/22-25/08.

Judgment confirming 11/16/07 order, requiring monetary payment by Trudeau, and providing for other relief entered 8/7/08.

Commission's motion to amend/correct judgment filed 8/21/08; response by Trudeau filed 9/22/08; Commission's reply filed 10/7/08, corrected 10/21/08.

Supplemental order and judgment entered 11/4/08.

Motion by Trudeau to alter or stay judgment pending appeal filed 11/13/08; Commission's response filed 11/26/08; Trudeau's reply filed 12/3/08; order denying motion entered 12/11/08.

Notice of appeal (08-4249) filed 12/16/08.

Appellant's emergency motion for stay pending appeal filed 12/23/08; Commission's response in opposition filed 1/5/09; appellant's reply filed 1/7/09.

Order denying emergency motion for stay pending appeal entered 1/21/09. Appellant's brief filed 2/17/09.

Motion by Appellant to file supplemental jurisdictional memorandum filed 3/5/09; order granting motion entered 3/12/09; supplemental jurisdictional memorandum filed 3/12/09.

Commission's answering brief filed 3/19/09.

Appellant's reply brief filed 4/2/09.

Oral argument held 5/14/09.

Seventh Circuit Opinion affirming Trudeau contempt finding but vacating and remanding on monetary payment and other relief entered 8/27/09.

\* \* \* \* \*

- Commission's renewed motion to modify stipulated final order for permanent injunction as to defendant Trudeau filed 11/13/09; defendant's response in opposition filed 12/17/09; Commission's reply filed 2/1/10; defendant's sur-reply filed 3/12/10.
- Commission's renewed motion for compensatory monetary remedy as to defendant Trudeau filed 11/13/09; defendant's response in opposition filed 12/17/09, supplemented 1/19/10; Commission's reply filed 2/1/10; defendant's sur-reply filed 3/12/10.

Order finding defendant Trudeau in criminal contempt of court entered 2/11/10; modified 2/17/10.

Notice of appeal (10-1383) of criminal contempt order filed 2/17/10.

Order staying payment of fine pending appeal entered 2/24/10.

Trudeau's motion to stay proceedings pending appeal filed 3/9/10; order denying motion entered 3/12/10.

Supplemental order modifying the stipulated order for permanent injunction and awarding monetary relief entered 4/16/10.

Trudeau's motion to amend the supplemental order filed 4/22/10; Commission's response in opposition filed 5/7/10; Trudeau's reply filed 5/21/10; Commission's sur-reply filed 6/1/10.

Commission's motion to amend the supplemental order filed 5/7/10; Trudeau's response filed 5/21/10.

Seventh Circuit Opinion (10-1383) vacating finding of criminal contempt and remanding for further proceedings entered 5/20/10.

\* \* \* \* \*

Corrected supplemental order modifying the stipulated order for permanent injunction and awarding monetary relief entered 6/2/10.

Notice of appeal (10-2418) of supplemental and corrected supplemental orders filed 6/11/10.

Trudeau's emergency motion for stay pending appeal filed 6/15/10; Commission's response filed 6/23/10; Trudeau's reply filed 6/28/10; order denying motion filed 7/14/10.

Trudeau's brief filed 7/23/10; Commission's brief filed 8/23/10; Trudeau's reply filed 9/13/10.

Oral argument held 9/24/10.

Seventh Circuit opinion affirming contempt sanctions and modification of decree, issued 11/29/11.

Trudeau's petition for rehearing en banc filed 1/13/12; denied 1/30/12.

Trudeau's petition of certiorari filed 6/28/12; Commission's brief in opposition filed 8/27/12; Trudeau's reply brief filed 9/11/12.

Certiorari denied 10/9/12.

\* \* \* \* \*

Motion for coercive contempt order to compel Trudeau to comply with 6/2/10 order requiring payment of \$37 million contempt sanction, filed by Commission 7/16/12

Trudeau's opposition filed 9/25/12

Commission's reply filed 10/15/12.

Order holding that the Commission has established prima facie showing of Trudeau's contempt for failing to pay sanction, and ordering that Trudeau file a sworn financial statement and appear at a hearing entered 12/6/12.

\* \* \* \* \*

Order granting Commission's motions to compel Trudeau's attorneys (Winston & Strawn LLP, and Law Offices of Marc J. Lane) and Trudeau-controlled entities (GIN USA, KTRN, and WSU) to comply with subpoenas, issued 3/7/13.

Motion to hold Lane, GIN USA, KTRN, and WSU in contempt for failing to comply with order compelling subpoenas filed by Commission 4/1/13; Motion to file supporting documents under seal filed by Commission 4/1/13.

Order denying motion to file documents under seal issued 4/4/13.

Notices of appeal (13-1746 and 13-1747) of order denying motion to file under seal, filed by Trudeau, Winston & Strawn, Lane, GIN USA, KTRN, and WSU ("Trudeau appellants"), filed 4/9/13.

Trudeau appellants' motions for emergency stay pending appeal filed with 7th Circuit 4/9/13; 7th Circuit emergency stay issued 4/10/13.

Trudeau appellants' motion for stay pending appeal filed with 7th Circuit on 4/12/13; Commission's opposition filed 4/17/13; 7th Circuit order vacating emergency stay issued 4/19/13; Trudeau appellants' motion to reconsider filed 4/19/13; 7th Circuit order denying reconsideration issued 7/24/13.

Trudeau appellants' motion to dismiss case as moot filed 4/26/13; appeals (13-1746 and 13-1747) dismissed 4/29/13.

\* \* \* \* \*

Trudeau bankruptcy petition filed 4/22/13.

Trudeau motion to stay discovery in district court contempt proceeding filed 4/23/13; Commission's opposition brief and motion for ruling that automatic stay does not apply to contempt proceeding, filed 4/24/13; Trudeau opposition to Commission's motion filed 4/25/13; District court order granting Commission's motion issued 4/26/13.

Notice of appeal (13-1898) filed by Trudeau 4/26/13; Trudeau's motion for stay pending appeal filed 4/26/13; Commission's opposition filed 4/29/13.

Seventh Circuit order denying stay issued 4/30/13.

Trudeau's appeal voluntarily dismissed 5/24/13.

Bankruptcy proceeding dismissed 5/28/13.

\* \* \* \* \*

- Motion to hold defendant in contempt filed 7/13/12; evidentiary hearings before district court on Commission's motion to hold Trudeau in contempt for failing to pay civil contempt sanction, held 5/21/13 and 6/26-27/13.
- Writ *ne exeat* ordering Trudeau to surrender passport and not to leave the United States until further order of court issued 6/25/13.
- Order partially granting motion to hold Trudeau in contempt entered 7/26/13.
- Order finding Trudeau in contempt of court and directing the US Marshall to take him into custody entered 9/18/13; order releasing Trudeau from custody entered 9/19/13.
- Order finding Trudeau in contempt of court and ordering him incarcerated entered 10/17/13; order releasing Trudeau from custody to prepare for criminal contempt trial entered 10/28/13.
- Order directing that Trudeau be incarcerated to coerce compliance with court's prior orders, such coercive incarceration to be independent of any incarceration resulting from Trudeau's recent conviction for criminal contempt, entered 11/21/13.
- Order suspending Trudeau's civil sentence pending completion of his criminal sentence entered 3/19/14.

# FTC v. VANTAGE POINT SERVICES, No. 1:15-cv-00006 (W.D.N.Y)

Parties: Vantage Point Services, LLC

Payment Management Solutions, Inc. Bonified Payment Solutions, Inc.

Gregory Mackinnon Megan Vandeviver Angela Burdorf Joseph Ciffa

Assigned Attorneys: Colin A. Hector (BCP/FP)

Jason Adler

Peter W. Lamberton

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in connection debt collection

activities.

Status: Complaint filed 1/5/15.

TRO entered 1/5/15.

## FTC v. WEALTH EDUCATORS, INC., No. 2:15-cv-2357 (W.D. Cal.)

Parties: Wealth Educators, Inc. d/b/a Family 1st Preservations, d/b/a Family 1st

Home Loans, d/b/a Legal Affiliates & Associates, d/b/a Legal Educators & Co., d/b/a Family 1st Home Prevention, d/b/a Legal Educators USA & Co., d/b/a Stargate Mutual & Associates, d/b/a Providence Financial Advocates, d/b/a Providence Financial Audits

Assigned Attorneys: Barbara Y K Chun (WRLA)

Eleanor Durham (NWR)

Maxine R. Stansell

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and

the Mortgage Assistance Relief Services Rule in connection with home

loans.

Status: Complaint filed 3/31/15.

### FTC v. WILLIAMS, SCOTT & ASSOCIATES, LLC, No. 1:14-cv-1599 (N.D. Ga.)

Parties: Williams, Scott & Associates, LLC

WSA, LLC John Williams Chris Lenyszyn

Assigned Attorneys: Marcela C. Mateo (SER)

Robin L. Rock

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive and unfair acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC

Act and the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in connection with abusive

and deceptive debt collection.

Status: Complaint filed 5/27/14.

TRO with asset freeze entered 5/28/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 6/19/14.

Amended complaint filed 9/24/14.

Commission's motion to hold defendant John Williams in contempt for

violations of the stipulated preliminary injunction order filed

11/10/14; granted 12/2/14.

Clerk's entry of default as to John Williams; Williams Scott & Associates;

and WSA LLC entered 12/12/14.

Order imposing contempt sanctions against defendants John Williams;

Williams Scott and Associates LLC and WSA LLC, as well as Sterling Ross and entities associated with it, entered 12/22/14.

Commission's motion for default judgment against defendants John

Williams, Williams, Scott & Associates LLC, and WSA, LLC

filed 3/6/15.

# FTC v. WORLDWIDE INFO SERVICES, INC., No. 6:14-cv-0008 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: Worldwide Info Services, Inc.

Elite Information Solutions, Inc.

Absolute Solutions, Inc.

Global Interactive Technologies, Inc.

Global Service Providers, Inc.

The Credit Voice, Inc.

Live Agent Response, LLC

Arcagen, Inc.

American Innovative Concepts, Inc. Unique Information Services Inc.

Michael Hilgar Gary Martin Joseph Settecase

National Life Network, Inc.

Yuluisa Nieves

Assigned Attorneys: David A. O'Toole (MWR)

Marissa J. Reich

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 and the Telemarking

Sales Rules in connection with robocalls to senior citizens marketing a

Purportedly free medical alert system.

Status: Complaint filed 1/6/14.

Order granting temporary restraining order and asset freeze entered 1/7/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction entered 1/24/14.

Amended complaint filed 2/25/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction with asset freeze, appointment of a receiver, and other equitable relief as to defendants national Life

Network, Inc. and Yuluisa Nieves entered 5/12/14.

Order dismissing without prejudice defendant The Credit Voice entered

5/14/14.

Permanent injunction and judgment in favor of the Commission

entered 11/13/14.

Motion for default judgment against Live Agent Response 1 LLC

entered 12/5/14.

Order granting motion for default judgment in part and ordering permanent injunctive and monetary relief against Live Agent entered 3/6/15.

FTC v. WRIGHT, No. 2:14-cv-258 (D. Utah); No. 2:13-cv-2215 (D. Ariz.)

Parties: Kevin Wright

**HCG Platinum LLC** 

Right Way Nutrition LLC

Weekes Holdings LLC (relief defendant)
Primary Colors LLC (relief defendant)
Kmatt Holdings LLC (relief defendant)
Nutrisport Holdings LLC (relief defendant)

Ty D. Mattingly (relief defendant)
Julie Mattingly (relief defendant)
Annette Wright (relief defendant)

Assigned Attorneys: James Anthony Prunty (BCP/AP)

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Sections 5 and 12 of the FTC Act,

in connection with the sale of purported HCG and other weight-loss products.

Status: Complaint filed 10/30/13.

Motion to change venue and transfer case to D. Utah filed 2/21/14; Commission's opposition filed 3/7/14; reply filed 3/14/14.

Order granting motion to transfer venue to D. Utah entered 4/9/14.

Stipulated final money judgment and final order for permanent injunction as to defendants Kevin Wright, HCG Platinum, LLC, and Right Way

Nutrition, LLC entered 12/09/14.

## FTC v. WV UNIVERSAL MANAGEMENT, LLC, No. 6:12-CV-01618 (M.D. Fla.)

Parties: WV Universal Management, LLC, d/b/a Treasure Your Success

Leading Production, LLC Global Financial Assist, LLC

HES Merchant Services Company, Inc.

Business First Solutions, Inc.

Voiceonyx Corp.

Universal Processing Services of Wisconsin, LLC

Derek Depuydt Hal E. Smith

Jonathon E. Warren Ramon Sanchez-Ortega

Willy Plancher Valbona Toska

Assigned Attorneys: Fil M. de Banate (ECR)

Jonathan Kessler Michael Milgrom

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5 and the Telemarketing

Sales Rule in connection with sale of services that will purportedly reduce

consumers' credit card interest rates.

Status: Complaint filed 10/29/12.

Order granting preliminary injunction entered 11/14/12.

Amended complaint filed 6/18/13.

Motion to dismiss by HES Merchant Services Company filed 8/7/13;

Commission's response filed 8/23/13.

Motion for summary judgment by Universal Processing Services filed

8/16/13; Commission's opposition filed 9/16/13; reply filed 9/30/13.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and final judgment as to defendants

Willy Plancher, Valbona Toska, WV Universal Management LLC, Global Financial Assist LLC, and Leading Production LLC entered

9/23/13.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 6/30/14; defendant Derek

Depuydt's opposition brief filed 7/29/14; Business First Solutions, VoiceOnyx Corp., and Jonathon Warren's brief in opposition filed

7/30/14; affidavit in opposition by Hal Smith filed 8/1/14.

Permanent injunction and final judgment as to defendant Ramon

Sanchez-Ortega entered 10/6/14.

Order granting Commission's motion for summary judgment entered

11/18/14.

Stipulated permanent injunction and final order as to Derek Depuydt entered 11/20/14.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and final judgment as to defendants, Jonathon Warren, Business First Solutions Inc. and Voiceonyx Corp. entered 11/20/14.

Permanent injunction and final judgment as to defendants Hal E. Smith and HES Merchant Services Company, Inc. entered 2/11/15.

Order granting motion for equitable monetary relief judgment against defendants Hal E. Smith, HES Merchant Services Company, Inc., and Universal Processing Services of Wisconsin, LLC entered 2/11/15.

FTC v. WYNDHAM WORLDWIDE CORP., No. 14-3514 (USCA Third Cir); No. 2:13-CV-01887; 3:13-cv-1887 (D.N.J.); No. 2:12-CV-1365 (D. Ariz.)

Parties: Wyndham Worldwide Corp.

Wyndham Hotel Group, LLC

Wyndham Hotels and Resorts, LLC Wyndham Hotel Management Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: John A. Krebs (BCP/PIP)

Katherine E. McCarron Kevin H. Moriarty Kristin K. Cohen Lisa N.W. Schifferle Jonathan Zimmerman

Andrea Arias

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act in

connection with failing to maintain reasonable of appropriate data security of

consumer for consumers sensitive information.

Status: Complaint filed 6/26/12.

Defendants' motion to dismiss filed 8/27/12; Commission's response filed 10/1/12; defendants' reply filed 10/23/12.

Motion for leave to file amicus curiae briefs filed by the Chamber of

Commerce and the International Franchise Association filed 10/5/12.

Defendants' motion to transfer venue to the District of New Jersey granted 3/25/13.

Order denying defendants' motions to dismiss and amici's motions to file briefs, subject to refiling in the District of New Jersey entered 3/25/13.

Defendants' motions to dismiss re-filed 4/26/13; Commission's opposition filed 5/20/13; defendants' reply filed 6/10/13.

Order denying defendant's motion to dismiss entered 6/23/14; order granting defendant's motion for leave for interlocutory review

entered 6/23/14.

Notice of appeal filed 8/5/14.

Wyndham's opening brief filed 10/6/14; Commission's answering brief filed 11/5/14; Wyndham's reply brief filed 12/8/14.

Oral argument held 3/3/15.

Supplemental memoranda requested by the Court during oral argument

filed 3/27/15.

## FTC v. YOUR YELLOW BOOK, INC. No. 5:14-cv-786 (W. D. Okla.)

Parties: Your Yellow Book, Inc.

Brandie Michelle Law

Dustin R. Law Robert Ray Law

Assigned Attorneys: Reid A. Tepfer (SWR)

Thomas B. Carter James E. Elliott

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act in connection with selling internet

business-directory services.

Status: Complaint filed 7/24/14.

TRO entered 7/25/14.

Commission's motion for contempt and order to show cause filed 8/15/14.

Order granting stay entered 9/30/14.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and monetary judgment entered

12/2/14.

#### FTC v. YOUR YELLOW PAGES, INC., No. 1:14-cv-22129 (S.D. Fla.)

Parties: Your Yellow Pages, Inc., d/b/a EBS Collections

Rapid Pages, Inc., d/b/a Rapid Yellow Pages City Pages, Inc., d/b/a Online City Yellow Pages Donovan B. Hinds, a/k/a Donavan B. Hinds

Andrew Beitler

Ernest Baxter, a/k/a Ernest Baster, a/k/a Carl Jenkins

Assigned Attorneys: Anna M. Burns (SER)

Steven S. Elg

Alleged Conduct: Unfair and deceptive practices in violation of Section 5 of the FTC Act in

connection with the sale of business directories.

Status: Complaint filed 6/9/14.

Stipulated preliminary injunction order as to Andrew Beitler,

Rapid Pages, Inc., Your Yellow Pages, Inc., City Pages, Inc., and Donovan B. Hinds entered 6/23/14.

Preliminary injunction order as to Andrew Beitler, Rapid Pages, Inc.,

Your Yellow Pages, Inc., City Pages, Inc., and Donovan B. Hinds entered 6/23/14.

Orders of entry of default as to City Pages, Inc. and Your Yellow Pages, Inc. entered 8/20/14.

Default final judgment as to defendants Your Yellow Pages, Inc., City Pages, Inc., and Ernest Baxter entered 10/29/14.

Commission's motion for summary judgment as to defendants Beitler and Hinds filed 2/23/15.

Order granting summary judgment in favor of Commission entered 3/26/15.

# **CIVIL PENALTY AND ENFORCEMENT CASES**\*

# (A) Consumer Protection

## FTC v. ABERNATHY MOTOR COMPANY, No. 3:14-cv-00063 (E.D. Ark.)

Parties: Abernathy Motor Company

Wesley Abernathy David Abernathy

Assigned Attorneys: Eric N. Roberson (SWR)

Reid Abram Tepfer

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5, the Magnuson-Moss Act and the Used Car Rule for

failure to display Buyers Guide providing warranty and other information on

used vehicles for sale.

Status: Complaint filed 3/12/14.

## FTC v. BILLION AUTO, INC., No. 5:14-cv-04118 (N.D. Iowa)

Parties: Billion Auto, Inc.

Billion SC, Inc. Billion NSC, Inc.

Billion Community, Inc.

Billion CC, Inc. Billion H, Inc. Billion K, Inc.

Billion FT Des Moines, Inc. Billion Des Moines Motors, Inc.

Billion Hawkeye, Inc.

Billions Empire Motors, Inc.

Billion FT, Inc. Billion G, Inc. Billion T, Inc. Billion C. Inc.

Billion Dells Auto, Inc.

Billion West, Inc.

Billion Montana Motors, Inc.

<sup>\*</sup> Includes all suits in which civil penalties are sought; consumer redress, injunctions, and ancillary equitable relief may also be sought.

Nicholas Media, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Jacob A. Schunk (AUSA)

Kerala T. Cowart (AUSA)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Sections 5 and 16 of the FTC Act and the Truth in Lending Act

regarding the sale and financing of vehicles.

Status: Complaint filed 12/11/14.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and civil penalty entered 12/16/14.

## UNITED STATES v. COMMERCIAL RECOVERY SYSTEMS, No. 4:15-cv-0036 (E.D. Tex.)

Parties: Commercial Recovery Systems, Inc.

Timothy Ford David Devany

Assigned Attorneys: Heide L. Herrmann (DOJ)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act and the Fair Debt Collection Practices

Act in connection with collecting auto loan and credit card debts.

Status: Complaint filed 1/20/15.

# UNITED STATES v. CREDIT SMART, LLC, No. 2:14-cv-4650 (E.D.N.Y.)

Parties: Credit Smart, LLC d/b/a United Abstract

Henry Stark & Associates

Star Processing Credit Star, LLC

Credit Start Finance, LLC

CS Processing Card Smart, Inc.

Paystar International, LLC United Abstract Group

U.S. Receivables Services, Inc.

Barry Calvagna Dawn Veneroni Anthony Picone Lauren Picone

Assigned Attorneys: Colin Hector (BCP/FP)

Daniel Dwyer James Reilly Dolan Peter Lamberton

James W. Harlow (DOJ/CPB) John Vagelatos (AUSA)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and the

FDCPA regarding unfair, abusive, or deceptive debt collection practices.

Status: Complaint filed 8/5/14.

Government's motion to approve consent judgment for permanent injunction

and civil penalty judgment filed 8/7/14.

Stipulated order for permanent injunction and civil penalty judgment

entered 9/22/14.

Motion to alter judgment by Credit Smart, LLC filed 3/30/15; granted

3/31/15.

# UNITED STATES v. DANIEL CHAPTER ONE, No. 10-5370 (D.C. Cir.); No. 1:10-CV-01362 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Daniel Chapter One

James Feijo

Assigned Attorneys: Laura Kim (BCP/ENF)

**Brad Winter** 

Jessica R. Gunder (DOJ/CPB)

Alleged Conduct: Violation of an FTC final cease and desist order in connection with

defendants' continued deceptive advertising, promotion, and sale of supposed

cancer-cure products and failure to send required notification to prior

purchasers of such products.

Status: Complaint filed 8/13/10.

United States' motion for preliminary injunction filed 8/25/10.

Defendants' motion to dismiss filed 9/1/10.

Order denying United States' and defendants' motions, and staying case

pending resolution of defendants' appeal of the Commission's cease

and desist order entered 9/14/10.

Notice of appeal by United States filed 11/12/10. United State's motion to

dismiss appeal voluntarily by United States filed 1/3/11.

Stay lifted 3/7/11.

United States' motion for preliminary injunction filed 3/11/11; opposition

filed 3/25/11; reply filed 4/1/11.

Defendants' motion for stay filed 3/25/11; opposition filed 4/1/11; reply

filed 4/8/11; motion denied 5/10/11.

Order granting United States' motion for preliminary injunction entered

6/22/11.

United States' motion for order to show cause why Daniel Chapter One, James Feijo, and Patricia Feijo should not be held in contempt of 6/22/11 order filed 7/29/11.

United States' motion for summary judgment on liability filed 9/30/11; opposition filed 10/21/11; reply filed 11/30/11.

Order finding defendants in contempt entered 5/9/12; contempt purged and order vacated 5/24/12.

Summary judgment on liability in favor of the United States entered 9/24/12. United States' motion for entry of final judgment filed 4/14/14; defendants' response filed 5/19/14; reply filed 6/6/14.

Order granting United States' motion for entry of final judgment entered 3/31/15.

### UNITED STATES v. DISH NETWORK LLC., No. 13-2282 (7th Cir.); 3:09-CV-03073 (C.D. Ill.)

Parties: Dish Network L.L.C.

Assigned Attorneys: Russell Deitch (BCP/MP)

Gary Ivens

Patrick Runkle (DOJ/CPB)

Lisa Hsiao (AUSA)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 and the Telemarketing Sales Rule in connection with

abandoned calls and telephone calls to consumers on the National Do Not

Call registry.

Status: Complaint filed 3/25/09.

Defendant's motion to dismiss filed 5/21/09; plaintiff's response in

opposition filed 7/17/09; defendant's reply filed 7/27/09; plaintiff's

sur-reply filed 9/11/09.

Order denying motion to dismiss entered 11/2/09.

Defendant's motion for reconsideration or interlocutory appeal filed 11/19/09; plaintiff's response filed 12/22/09; order denying motion

entered 2/4/10.

Memorandum in opposition to motion/petition filed 5/21/10.

Motion to compel 7/30/10; memorandum in opposition to motion 8/16/10; memorandum in support of motion filed 9/24/10; order on motion to compel entered 12/9/10.

Appeal of magistrate judge decision to district court filed 12/29/10.

Defendants' motion to stay action under doctrine of primary jurisdiction filed 12/21/10; opposition filed 1/12/11.

Order directing the parties to file an administrative complaint with the FCC, to obtain its interpretation of statutory language entered 2/4/11.

Order vacating magistrate's decision denying Commission's motion for leave

to file second amended complaint entered 3/12/13.

Amended complaint filed 3/12/13.

Petition for writ of mandamus by Dish Network filed 6/12/13.

Order denying petition for mandamus entered 7/3/13.

United States' motion for summary judgment filed 12/23/13; opposition filed 3/6/14.

Motion for summary judgment by Dish Network filed 1/6/14; opposition filed 5/30/14.

United States' motion for summary judgment filed 5/30/14.

Order directing parties to file memoranda addressing issue of deference to agency's interpretation of its regulations entered 7/8/14; parties' memoranda of law filed 8/8/14; parties' responses to each other's memoranda filed 8/22/14.

Order granting partial summary judgment for United States and partial summary judgment for Dish Network entered 12/12/14.

# UNITED STATES v. FEATURE FILMS FOR FAMILIES, INC., Nos. 2:12-CV-00811, 2:11-CV-00419 (D. Utah); No. 4:11-CV-00197 (N.D. Fla.)

Parties: Feature Films for Families, Inc.

> Corporations for Character LC Family Films of Utah, Inc. Forrest Sandusky Baker, III

Assigned Attorneys: Peter G. Fisher (AUSA)

Daniel M., Bacza (DOJ/CPB) Michael Tankersley (BCP)

Arturo DeCastro

Alleged Conduct: Deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5 and the Telemarketing

> Sales Rule in connection with telemarketing to induce the purchase of goods or services, and to induce charitable contributions, telemarketing calls to

consumers on the Do-Not-Call list.

Status: Complaint filed 5/5/11.

> Defendants' motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim and for improper venue filed 7/25/11; United States' memo in opposition filed

8/8/11; order denying motion entered 10/25/11.

Defendants' counterclaim against the United States filed 11/14/11. United States' motion to dismiss counterclaims for lack of jurisdiction filed 12/21/11; response in opposition filed 1/09/12; motion denied 5/19/12.

Case transferred to the District of Utah 8/20/12.

Case consolidated with Corporation for Character v. FTC, No. 2:11-CV-00419, on 9/6/12.

Defendants' motion for partial summary judgment filed 9/6/12; United States' opposition filed 12/14/12.

United States' motion for partial summary judgment filed 3/1/13. United States' second motion for partial summary judgment filed 5/17/13; opposition filed 7/19/13; reply filed 7/30/13.

Hearing on motions for partial summary judgment held 1/16/14. United States' supplemental memorandum regarding motion for

summary judgment filed 2/14/14; defendants' reply to supplemental memorandum filed 3/7/14.

Order granting in part and denying in part defendants' motion for partial summary judgment and granting in part and denying in part United States' motion for partial summary judgment entered 3/31/15.

### FTC v. LARRY S. GLICKER, No. 3:15-cv-00019 (S.D. Ohio)

Parties: Larry S. Glickler d/b/a Bradford-Connelly & Glickler Funeral Home

Assigned Attorneys: Kerala T. Cowart (DOJ)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of the Trade Regulation Rule Concerning Funeral Industry

Practices in connection with deceptive advertising of caskets.

Status: Complaint filed 1/20/15.

Consent decree entered 1/23/15.

#### *FTC v. LENTINE*, No. 1:15-cv-0033 (E.D. Tenn.)

Parties: Lou Lentine

Viatek Consumer Products Group, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Susan E. Arthur (SWR)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act in connection with the deceptive

promotion or offering for sale of Viatek Mosquito Shield Bands.

Status: Complaint filed 2/17/15.

#### FTC v. RAMEY MOTORS, INC., No. 1:14-cv-29603 (S.D.W.V.)

Parties: Ramey Motors, Inc.

Ramey Automotive Group, Inc.

Ramey Automotive, Inc. Ramey Chevrolet, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Lemuel W. Dowdy (BCP/ENF)

Alleged Conduct: Violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act and the Truth in Lending Act

regarding car financing and leasing.

Status: Complaint filed 12/11/14.

## FTC v. ROSS-CLAYTON FUNERAL HOME, INC., No. 2:13-cv-851 (M.D. Ala.)

Parties: Ross-Clayton Funeral Home, Inc.

David C. Ross

**Eleanor Lewis Dawkins** 

Assigned Attorneys: P. Connell McNulty (BCP/MP)

Patricia Hsue

Alleged Conduct: Violations of the Commission's Trade Regulation Rule Concerning Funeral

Industry Practices by failing to show people a printed or typewritten casket

price list.

Status: Complaint filed 11/21/13.

# (B) Competition

(None pending)

### SUBPOENA AND CID ENFORCEMENT PROCEEDINGS

## IN RE AEGIS MOBILE, LLC, No. 1:13-MC-524 (D.Md)

Parties: Aegis Mobile, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Burke Kappler (OGC)

Leslie R. Melman

Alleged Conduct: Application for an order pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1782 to obtain information

from Aegis Mobile LLC on behalf of the Competition Bureau, Canada, for

use in foreign proceedings.

Status: Application filed 11/1/13; granted 11/1/13.

Commission's motion to compel compliance with subpoena filed 1/28/14;

granted 1/31/14.

Motion to vacate court's 1/31/17 order filed 2/4/14; Commission's response

filed 2/6/14; Aegis Mobile's reply filed 2/7/14; order granting motion

in part entered 2/10/14.

Aegis Mobile's opposition to Commission's motion to compel compliance

with subpoena filed 2/14/14; Commission's surreply filed 3/14/14;

Aegis Mobile's response to surreply filed 3/21/14.

Hearing held 6/5/14.

Order denying Aegis Mobile's motion to vacate, denying in part and granting

in part Aegis Mobile's motion to quash entered 8/4/14.

Status Report submitted by Commission filed 10/30/14. Status Report submitted by Aegis Mobile field 10/30/14. Updated status report submitted by Commission filed 1/22/15.

# FTC v. BOEHRINGER INGELHEIM PHARMACEUTICALS, INC., No. 12-5393 (D.C. Cir.);

No. 1:09-MC-00564 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Mark Hegedus (OGC)

Leslie R. Melman David C. Shonka

Alleged Conduct: Petition for an order to enforce a subpoena.

Status: Petition filed 10/23/09.

Order to show cause entered 12/4/09.

Matter transferred to magistrate judge 12/1/10.

Status conference held on 10/24/11.

Hearing on merits held 12/09/11.

Order denying Commission's petition as to financial analysis documents and ordering Boehringer to redact and produce the remaining records entered 9/27/12.

Order holding that Boehringer failed to conduct an adequate search of its electronically stored information, and ordering Boehringer to run additional searches entered 10/16/12.

Commission's notice of appeal filed 12/11/12.

Boehringer's motion to dismiss appeal filed 1/28/13; Commission's response in opposition filed 2/11/13; Boehringer's reply filed 2/22/13; order denying motion to dismiss entered 4/12/13.

Commission's initial brief filed 6/28/13; appellees' brief filed 8/28/13; Commission's reply brief filed 9/11/13; appellee's final brief filed 10/3/13.

Argument held 10/14/14.

Opinion reversing and remanding to district court entered 2/20/14.

# FTC v. PAGLIA, No. 2:14-cv-1480 (D. Nev.)

Parties: Ralph Paglia

Assigned Attorneys: Blaine T. Welsh (AUSA)

Imad D. Abyad (OGC) Leslie T. Melman

Alleged Conduct: Petition for an order to enforce CID.

Status: Petition filed 9/12/14.

Order enforcing CIDs entered 10/28/14. Commission's contempt motion filed 1/6/15.

## FTC v. RECKITT PHARMACEUTICALS, INC., No. 3:14-mc-00005 (E.D. Va.)

Parties: Reckitt Benckiser Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Assigned Attorneys: Burke W. Kappler (OGC)

Robert P. McIntosh (AUSA)

Alleged Conduct: Petition for an order to enforce a CID

Status: Petition filed 8/8/14.

Reckitt Benckiser Pharmaceuticals' motion to transfer filed 9/3/14:

Commission's brief in opposition to motion to transfer filed 9/12/14;

Order denying motion to transfer entered 9/24/14.

Commission's motion to enforce CID filed 11/24/14; Reckitt's brief in opposition filed 12/8/14; Commission's reply brief filed 12/15/14. Memorandum Opinion directing Reckitt to produce documents for *in camera* review by Special Master entered 3/10/15.

# *FTC v. THE WESTERN UNION CO.*, Nos. 13-3100, 13-3272 (2d. Cir.); No.1:13-MC-00131 (S.D.N.Y)

Parties: The Western Union Company

Lonnie Keene

Keene Consulting Arizona, LLC

Assigned Attorneys: Burke Kappler (OGC)

Leslie R. Melman

Alleged Conduct: Petition for an order to enforce a CID.

Status: Petition filed 4/15/13.

Hearing held 5/28/13.

Enforcement order entered 6/6/13; revised 6/7/13.

Motion by Western Union for clarification or reconsideration filed 6/17/13; Commission's opposition filed 6/19/13; motion denied 6/20/13.

Notice of appeal by Commission filed 8/14/13; cross appeal by Western

Union filed 8/27/13.

Application for contempt by Commission filed 11/8/13; response by Western Union filed 11/27/13; reply filed 12/5/13; stipulated order resolving contempt entered 12/9/13.

Commission's opening appeal brief filed 11/27/13; Western Union's answering and cross-appeal brief filed 2/26/14; Commission's response and reply brief filed 4/28/14; Western Union's reply on cross-appeal filed 5/22/14.

Oral argument held 9/10/14.

Second Circuit court opinion holding that the district court erred in not

enforcing the CID entered 10/8/14.

Joint memorandum of law filed 3/6/15

# SUITS TO ENJOIN FTC ACTION AND OTHER DEFENSIVE LITIGATION

## AYUDA INC. ET AL. v. FTC, No. 1:13-CV-1266 (D.D.C)

Parties: Ayuda, Inc.

Catholic Charities of the Archdiocese of Washington DC

Catholic Legal Immigration Network, Inc.

Legal Aid Justice Center

Assigned Attorneys: Michelle Lo (AUSA)

Jack Metzler (OGC)

Nature of Action: Action alleging violation of the Freedom of Information Act.

Status: Complaint filed 8/20/13

Amended complaint filed 12/2/13.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed on 2/12/14; Ayuda's opposition and cross-motion for summary judgment filed 4/8/14; Commission's reply/cross-opposition due 7/17/14; Ayuda's reply to opposition to cross-motion for partial summary judgment filed

7/31/14.

Order granting in part and denying in part the Commission's motion for

summary judgment and denying Ayuda's cross-motion for partial

summary judgment entered 9/30/14.

Order referring case to mediation entered 3/10/15.

## **BASIC RESEARCH v. FTC**, No. 15-4014 (10th Cir.); No. 2:09-CV-00779 (D. Utah)

Parties: Basic Research

A.G. Waterhouse

Sovage Dermalogic Laboratories Carter-Reed Company, LLC

**Dynakor Pharmacal** 

Dennis Gay

Mitchell K. Friedlander

Assigned Attorneys: Lemuel Dowdy (BCP/ENF)

Frank Gorman

Mark Hegedus (OGC) Gerald Kell (DOJ/CPB) Jeannette Swent (AUSA)

Nature of Action: Declaratory judgment action claiming violations of plaintiffs' free speech

and due process constitutional rights in connection with advertising for

weight loss products.

Status: Complaint filed 8/31/09.

Motion to dismiss complaint filed 10/30/09; plaintiffs' response in opposition filed 12/23/09; Commission's reply filed 1/22/10; plaintiffs' sur-reply filed 4/1/10.

Plaintiffs' motion to consolidate case with *United States v. Basic Research*, *L.L.C.*, No. 2:09-CV-00972 (D. Utah) filed 11/6/09; Commission's response in opposition filed 11/23/09; plaintiffs' reply filed 12/14/09.

Oral argument on pending motions held 5/6/10.

Memorandum decision denying motion to dismiss complaint and granting motion to consolidate case with *United States v. Basic Research*, *L.L.C.*. No. 2:09-CV-00972 entered 5/23/11.

Plaintiffs' motion for partial summary judgment filed 8/17/11; Commission's opposition filed on 9/28/11; reply filed 11/01/11; order granting motion for partial summary judgment entered 6/1/12; hearing held 5/31/12.

Commission's motion for partial summary judgment filed 5/24/12.

Plaintiff's motion for summary judgment and opposition to Commission's motion for partial summary judgment filed 9/12/12; Commission's response filed 1/31/13; plaintiff's reply memorandum filed 3/29/13.

Hearing on pending summary judgment motions held 5/22/13.

Judgment in favor of the plaintiff and dismissing the Commission's complaint and claims with prejudice entered 12/18/14.

Commission's notice of appeal filed 2/13/15.

Order granting appellants' motion for voluntary dismissal entered 3/4/15.

# CAUSE OF ACTION v. FTC, No. 13-5335 (D.C. Cir.); No. 1:12-CV-00850 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Cause of Action

Assigned Attorneys: Mitchell Zeff (AUSA)

Michael Bergman (OGC)

Dione Stearns

Nature of Action: Action alleging violation of the Freedom of Information Act.

Status: Complaint filed 5/25/12.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 9/28/12; plaintiff's opposition brief filed 11/28/12; Commission's reply brief filed

1/25/13.

Opinion and order granting in part and denying in part the Commission's

motion for summary judgment entered 8/19/13.

Final consent judgment entered 9/12/13.

Notice of appeal filed 11/14/13.

Appellant's brief filed 5/6/14; Commission's answering brief filed 8/6/14;

appellant's reply brief filed 9/24/14.

Oral argument held 1/13/15.

## CENTER FOR DIGITAL DEMOCRACY v. FTC, No. 1:14-cv-02084 (D.D.C.)

Parties: Center for Digital Democracy

Assigned Attorneys: Marian L. Borum (AUSA)

Bradley Grossman (OGC)

Nature of the Action: Freedom of Information Act action regarding the release of records.

Status: Complaint filed 12/11/14.

Commission's motion for summary judgment filed 3/23/15.

# **COMPASSION OVER KILLING v. FTC,** No. 15-15107 (9th Cir.); No. 3:13-cv-1385 (N.D. Cal.)

Plaintiffs: Compassion Over Killing

Animal Legal Defense Fund

Elizabeth Barrett Adrea Bock Linda Calbreath Jason Canada Jeri Opalk

Humberto Retana

Defendants: Food and Drug Administration and Margaret Hamburg, Commissioner

Agriculture Marketing Service and David R. Shipman, Administrator Food Safety and Inspection Service and Alfred V. Almanza, Administrator

Federal Trade Commission and Edith Ramirez, Chairwoman

Assigned Attorney: Ann Entwistle (DOJ/CPB)

Michele Arington (OGC)

Nature of Action: Action for declaratory and injunctive relief under the Administrative

Procedure Act in connection with petitions requesting rulemakings to revise

or create new labeling requirements for eggs.

Status: Complaint filed 3/28/13.

Amended complaint filed 3/27/14.

Plaintiffs' motion for summary judgment due 7/23/14; government's opposition due 8/27/14; defendant's response filed 9/26/14;

Commission's reply brief filed 10/27/14.

Order denying plaintiff's motion for summary judgment and granting the Commission's motion for summary judgment entered 12/23/14.

Notice of Appeal filed 1/20/15.

Appellants' opening brief due 6/16/15; government's brief due 7/16/15.

### DESPOT v. ALLIED INTERSTATE, INC., No. 2:15-cv-0015 (W.D. Pa.)

Parties: David Despot

Assigned Attorneys: Paul D. Kovac (AUSA)

Nature of Action: Alleged violations of the FCRA, FDCPA, TCPA, FTCA, in connection with

student loan repayment.

Status: Complaint filed 3/3/15.

#### FRANKEL v. UNITED STATES, No. 1:13cv546 (Fed. Cl.)

Parties: David Frankel

Assigned Attorneys: Jessica R. Toplin (DOJ)

Olga Vaytsman (OGC)

Nature of Action: Action alleging that the Commission failed to conduct the Robocall

Challenge in accordance with its own published rules.

Status: Complaint filed 8/6/13.

Motion to dismiss by USA filed 10/28/13; defendant's response filed

11/7/13; reply filed 11/26/13; sur-reply filed 12/3/13.

Opinion granting in part and denying in part motion to dismiss entered

8/27/14.

## *LABMD v. FTC*, No. 14-12144 (11th Cir.); No. 1:14-cv-0810 (N.D. Ga.)

Parties: LabMD

Assigned Attorneys: David Sieradzki (OGC)

Lauren E. Fascett (DOJ/CPB)

Nature of Action: Action for declaratory and injunctive relief in connection with the FTC's

proceedings against LabMD regarding its patient-information data securing

practices.

Status: Complaint and motion for preliminary injunction by LabMD filed 3/20/14.

Commission's motion to dismiss filed 4/7/14; LabMD's response filed

4/11/14.

Order granting Commission's motion to dismiss entered 5/12/14.

Notice of appeal by LabMD filed 5/14/14.

LabMD's emergency motion for injunction pending appeal filed 5/15/14; Commission's opposition filed 5/19/14; motion denied 5/19/14.

LabMD's opening brief filed 6/24/14; Commission's responsive brief due

7/28/14; LabMd's reply brief filed 8/11/14.

Oral argument held 12/9/14.

Opinion affirming district court entered 1/21/15.

# PHARMACEUTICAL RESEARCH AND MANUFACTURERS OF AMERICA v. FTC, No. 14-5182 (D.C. Cir.); No. 1:13-cv-01974 (D.D.C)

Parties: Pharmaceutical Research and Manufacturers of America

Assigned Attorney: Michele Arington (OGC)

Nature of Action: Action for injunctive and declaratory relief under the Administrative

Procedure Act challenging the FTC's issuance of a rule that addresses when a transaction involving the transfer of rights to a patent in the pharmaceutical

industry is reportable under the HSR Act.

Status: Complaint filed 12/12/13.

Motion for Summary Judgment filed by PhRMA 2/7/14; Commission's opposition and cross-motion for summary judgment filed 3/10/14; PhRMA's reply and opposition to cross-motion filed 3/24/14;

Commission's reply brief filed 3/31/14.

Memorandum Opinion denying PhRMA's motion for summary judgment and granting Commission's cross-motion for summary judgment

entered 5/30/14.

Notice of appeal filed 7/25/14.

PhRMA's brief due 11/10/14; Commission's brief filed 12/10/14; reply brief

filed 12/24/2014.

Oral argument held 3/24/15.

### **AMICUS CURIAE BRIEFS or PARTIAL INTERVENTIONS**

### **BATMAN v. FACEBOOK**, No. 13-16819 (9th Cir.)

Assigned Attorneys: Imad Abyad (OGC)

Nature of Action: Private action concerning Facebook's use of users' names and images for

advertisements without their consent.

Status: Brief of Federal Trade Commission as amicus curiae disagreeing with

district court's view of federal preemption regarding the Children's

Online Privacy Protection Act filed 3/21/14.

## BUCHANAN v. NORTHLAND GROUP, INC., No. 13-2523 (6th Cir.)

Assigned Attorneys: Jack Metzler (OGC)

Nature of Action: Private action addressing the practice of sending debt collection notices for

time-barred debts.

Status: Brief of the Consumer Financial Protection Bureau and the Federal

Trade Commission as amici curiae in support of the district court's

denial of Northland Group's motion to dismiss filed 9/4/13.

Commissions' amicus motion requesting leave to appear at oral argument

filed 8/25/14; order granting motion entered 9/23/14.

Oral argument held 10/7/14.

Opinion and judgment of the district courts is reversed, and the case is

remanded entered 1/13/15.

Order denying Northland Group's petition for rehearing en banc entered

3/13/15.

## HERNANDEZ v. WILLIAMS, ZINMAN & PARHAM, P.C., No. 14-15672 (9th Cir.)

Assigned Attorneys: Burke Kappler (OGC)

Nature of Action: Private action involving provision of Fair Debt Collection Practices Act

requiring that debt collectors provide notice to consumers advising them of

their rights to dispute or obtain verification of the debt.

Status: Brief of the Consumer Financial Protection Bureau and the Federal

Trade Commission as amici curiae in support of appellant and

reversal filed 8/20/14.

# IN RE LAMICTAL DIRECT PURCHASER ANTITRUST LITIGATION, No. 14-1243 (3rd Cir.);

No.2:12-CV-00995 (D.N.J.)

Assigned Attorneys: Markus Meier (BC)

Jamie R. Towey Melanie J. Brown

Mark S. Hegedus (OGC)

Nature of Action: Private action involving antitrust claims that an exclusive license that

effectively prevents a branded company from launching an authorized

generic constitutes a payment-for-delay in restraint of trade.

Status: Brief of the FTC as amicus curiae, opposing defendants' motion to dismiss,

filed 10/5/12.

Order granting motion to dismiss filed 12/6/12.

Notice of appeal filed 12/21/12.

Order, staying appeal pending the Supreme Court's decision in FTC v.

Actavis, Inc. entered 2/26/13.

Defendants motion to remand case back to district court filed 6/20/13;

appellants' response filed 6/25/13.

Court of appeals order remanding the case to the district court for further

proceedings entered 7/2/13.

District court order reaffirming order of dismissal entered 1/24/14.

Notice of appeal docketed 1/30/14.

Commission's brief as amicus curiae in support of appellants filed 4/28/14.

Commission's motion for leave to participate in oral argument filed 7/16/14.

Oral argument held 11/19/14.

#### *MORAN v. THE SCREENING PROS*, No. 12-57246 (9th Cir.)

Assigned Attorney: Jack Metzler (OGC)

Nature of Action: Private action involving a Fair Credit and Reporting Act provision limiting

the time period for listing misdemeanors on a report.

Status: Brief of the Consumer Financial Protection Bureau and the Federal Trade

Commission as amici curiae filed in support of plaintiff's Section

605(a) claim filed on 10/7/13.

Argument held 2/2/15.

#### MOTOROLA MOBILITY, LLC V. AU OPTRONICS CORP., No. 14-8003 (7th Cir.);

No. 1:09-cv-06610 (E.D. III.)

Assigned Attorneys: Mark S. Hegedus (OGC)

Nature of Action: DOJ action involving the standard for assessing effects on U.S. commerce

in applying the Foreign Trade Antitrust Improvements Act.

Status: Brief of the United States and the Federal Trade Commission as amicus

curiae in support of petition for rehearing en banc filed 6/27/14.

Order granting panel rehearing entered 7/1/14.

Brief of the United States and the Federal Trade Commission as amicus

curiae on the merits of the case filed 9/5/14.

Oral argument held 11/13/14.

Opinion affirming district court entered 11/26/14.

Motorola Mobility's petition for rehearing en banc filed 12/17/14.

Order denying Motorola Mobility's petition for rehearing en banc entered

1/12/15.

Petition for writ of certiorari filed 3/16/15.

# MYLAN PHARMACEUTICALS, INC v. CELGENE CORP., No. 2:14-cv-02094 (D.N.J.)

Assigned Attorneys: Kara L. Monahan (BC)

Nature of Action: Private action addressing the question of whether, and to what extent,

antitrust law places limits on a private company's ability to block generic

access to its brand product.

Status: Brief of the FTC as amicus curiae in opposition to defendant's motion to

dismiss filed 6/17/14.

Order granting in part and denying in part motion to dismiss entered

12/23/14.

Motion to certify order denying motion to dismiss for interlocutory appeal

entered 1/6/15; granted 1/30/15.

#### SYKES v. MEL S. HARRIS AND ASSOCIATES LLC, No. 13-2742 (2d Cir.)

Assigned Attorneys: Jack Metzler (OGC)

David M. Gossett (CFPB)

Nature of Action: Class action suit brought by consumers against a group of affiliated debt-

buying companies, alleging violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices

Act.

Status: Brief of Federal Trade Commission and the Consumer Financial Protection

Bureau supporting plaintiffs filed 11/13/13.

Oral argument held 2/7/14.

Motion to hold appeal in abeyance entered 1/14/15.

Order denying motion to hold appeal in abeyance entered 1/16/15. Opinion affirming judgment of the district court entered 2/10/15. Appellants' petitions for rehearing en banc filed 2/24/15.