UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

Federal Trade Commission,
Plaintiff,
v.

Handicapped & Disabled Workshops, Inc., et al.,

Defendants.

Case No. CV-08-0908-PHX-DGC

STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT AND ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND OTHER EQUITABLE RELIEF AGAINST GEORGE THOMAS

This matter comes before the Court on the stipulation of Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission"), and Defendant George Thomas. On May 13, 2008, the Commission filed a Complaint for a permanent injunction and other equitable relief in this matter pursuant to Sections 13(b) and 19(a) of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 53(b) and 57b(a). The FTC charged defendants Handicapped & Disabled Workshop, Inc., Handi-Hope Industries, Inc., Handi-Ship, LLC, Bruce D. Peeples, George Thomas, and Joshua D. Abramson with engaging in deceptive acts or practices in connection with the telemarketing and sale of various household products, in violation of: Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a); the Commission's Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310; and the Unordered Merchandise Statute, 39 U.S.C. § 3009. The Commission and Defendant George Thomas have agreed to the entry of this Stipulated Final Order for Permanent Injunction and Other Equitable Relief ("Order") and to entry of the First Amended Complaint to resolve all matters of dispute between them with respect to the conduct alleged in this action.

Accordingly, by stipulation of the parties to this Order, it is hereby **ORDERED**,

ADJUDGED, AND DECREED:

FINDINGS

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction of the subject matter of this case and the parties hereto. Venue is proper as to all parties in the District of Arizona.
- 2. The activities of Defendant George Thomas are in or affecting commerce, as defined in the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 3. The First Amended Complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted against Defendant George Thomas.
- 4. Defendant George Thomas waives all rights to seek judicial review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order. Defendant George Thomas further waives any claim that may arise under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, and any claims he may have against the Commission, its employees, representatives, or agents.
- 5. Defendant George Thomas enters into this Order freely and without coercion and acknowledges that he has read, understands, and is prepared to abide by, the provisions of this Order.
- 6. By entering into this Order, Defendant George Thomas does not admit to the allegations set forth in the First Amended Complaint, other than the jurisdictional facts. Defendant George Thomas's consent to entry of this Order shall not be interpreted to constitute an admission by him that he has engaged in any violations of any law or regulation.
- 7. This Order is in addition to, and not in lieu of, other remedies that may be provided by law, including both civil and criminal remedies.
 - 8. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

For the purpose of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

1. "Assets" means any legal or equitable interest in, right to, or claim to, any

real and personal property, including, but not limited to chattel, goods, instruments, equipment, fixtures, general intangibles, inventory, checks, notes, leaseholds, effects, contracts, mail or other deliveries, shares of stock, lists of consumer names, accounts, credits, premises, receivables, funds, and cash, wherever located, whether in the United States or abroad.

- 2. "Defendant Thomas" means George Thomas.
- 3. "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, audio and video recordings, computer records, and other data compilations from which information can be obtained and translated, if necessary, through detection devices into reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate document within the meaning of the term.
- 4. "Material" means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding, goods or services.
- 5. "Person" means a natural person, an organization or other legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, sole proprietorship, limited liability company, association, cooperative, or any other group or combination acting as an entity.
- 6. "Representatives" means Defendant Thomas's successors, assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, and those persons in active concert or participation with Defendant Thomas who receive actual notice of this Order, by personal service or otherwise.
- 7. "Telemarketing" means any plan, program or campaign (whether or not covered by the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310) that is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services by means of the use of one or more telephones.
 - 8. The terms "and" and "or" have both conjunctive and disjunctive meanings.

3

45

6

7 8

9

1011

1213

14 15

17

16

18 19

20

2122

2324

25

26

2728

ORDER

I.

PROHIBITED REPRESENTATIONS

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Defendant Thomas and his
Representatives are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from making or assisting
others in making, expressly or by implication, any false or misleading statement or
representation or omission of Material fact in connection with the advertising, offering for
sale, sale, or distribution of any good or service, including, but not limited to,
misrepresenting any of the following:

- A. That any consumer's purchase will significantly help handicapped or disabled people;
- B. That the person soliciting any consumer's purchase is handicapped or disabled;
- C. That all or most persons employed by or working on behalf of Defendant Thomas or his Representatives are handicapped or disabled;
 - D. That any handicapped or disabled person packages products;
- E. That Defendant Thomas or his Representatives operate a charitable organization;
- F. That any consumer ordered, purchased, or agreed to purchase goods or services, and therefore owes money to Defendant Thomas or his Representatives;
- G. The total cost to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are subject to the sales offer;
- H. Any material restrictions, limitations, or conditions to purchase, receive, or use the goods or services;
- I. Any material aspect of the nature or terms of a refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy for the goods or services; and
- J. Any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics of goods or services that are the subject of the sale.

PROHIBITIONS AGAINST DECEPTIVE AND ABUSIVE TELEMARKETING PRACTICES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Thomas and his Representatives, in connection with the advertising, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any good or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from violating or assisting others in violating, in any manner, any provision of the Commission's Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310 (attached hereto as Attachment A), as currently promulgated or as it may hereafter be amended, including, but not limited to, any of the following:

- A. Making any false or misleading statements to induce consumers to pay for goods or services or to induce a charitable contribution, in violation of Section 310.3(a)(4) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.3(a)(4);
- B. Causing consumers' telephones to ring repeatedly, and/or engaging consumers repeatedly in telephone conversation with the intent to annoy, abuse, or harass persons at the called number, in violation of Section 310.4(b)(1)(i) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.4(b)(1)(i);
- C. Causing billing information to be submitted for payment without the express informed consent of the consumer, in violation of Section 310.4(a)(6) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.4(a)(6);
- D. Causing billing information to be submitted for payment when using a payment method other than a credit card or a debit card, without the consumer's express verifiable authorization, in violation of Section 310.3(a)(3) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.3(a)(3);
- E. Initiating any outbound telemarketing call to a person's telephone number on the National Do Not Call Registry of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls to induce the purchase of goods or services, in violation of Section 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), unless:
 - 1. Defendant Thomas or his Representatives have obtained the express

agreement, in writing, of such person to place calls to that person. Such written agreement shall clearly evidence such person's authorization that calls made by or on behalf of a specific party may be placed to that person, and shall include the date the express agreement was obtained, the telephone number to which the calls may be placed, and the signature of that person; or

- 2. Defendant Thomas or his Representatives have an established business relationship with such person and that person has not previously stated that he or she does not wish to receive outbound telemarketing calls made by or on behalf of Defendant Thomas or his Representatives;
- F. Initiating any outbound telemarketing call to a person when that person has previously stated that he or she does not wish to receive an outbound telephone call made by or on behalf of Defendant Thomas or his Representatives, in violation of Section 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A) of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A); and
- G. Initiating any outbound telemarketing call to a telephone number within a given area code without first paying the required annual fee required for access to the telephone numbers within that area code that are included in the National Do Not Call Registry, in violation of Section 310.8 of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310.8.

III.

COMPLYING WITH THE UNORDERED MERCHANDISE STATUTE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Thomas and his Representatives, in connection with the advertising, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any good or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from violating or assisting others in violating any of the provisions of the Unordered Merchandise Statute,

- 39 U.S.C. § 3009, including, but not limited to:
- A. Sending any merchandise without the prior expressed request or consent of the recipient unless such merchandise is clearly and conspicuously marked as a free sample and has attached to it a clear and conspicuous statement that the recipient may treat the merchandise as a gift and may retain, use, discard, or dispose of it in any manner

6 7

8

11

10

12

14

13

15

16 17

18

19 20

21

22

23

24

25 26

27

28

without any obligation whatsoever to the sender; and

Sending any communication, including, but not limited to, bills, invoices, reminders, letters, notices, or dunning communications, that in any manner seek to obtain payment for any merchandise shipped without the prior expressed request or consent of the recipient.

IV.

MONETARY RELIEF

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- A. Judgment is hereby entered against Defendant Thomas, jointly and severally with the other Defendants named in the First Amended Complaint in this case, in the amount of THIRTEEN MILLION FOUR HUNDRED ELEVEN THOUSAND NINE HUNDRED EIGHTEEN (\$13,411,918); provided, however, that this judgment, as to Defendant Thomas, shall be suspended upon receipt by the Commission of the monies as specified in Section IV.B. of this Order.
- B. Mountain America Credit Union, 7181 South Campus View Drive, West Jordan, Utah, 84084, shall transfer to the Commission the sum of TWO THOUSAND THREE HUNDRED EIGHTY DOLLARS AND TWENTY-FIVE CENTS (\$2,380.25) from the account ending in 9545. This account was established by Defendant Thomas and previously frozen by stipulation of the parties and by this Court's order. The funds identified above shall be remitted to the Commission within ten (10) days following the entry of this Order. The payment shall be made to the Commission by certified check or other guaranteed funds payable to the Federal Trade Commission, Financial Management Office, or by wire transfer in accordance with directions provided by the Commission. The check(s) or written confirmation of the wire transfer(s) shall be delivered to: Associate Director, Division of Marketing Practices, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Room 286, Washington, D.C. 20580.
- C. Any and all funds or assets transferred or paid pursuant to Section IV.B. of this Order shall be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its agent to be

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

used for equitable relief, including, but not limited to, consumer redress and any attendant expenses for the administration of any redress fund. In the event that redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable, or any funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds to such other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to the acts and practices alleged in the First Amended Complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited in the United States Treasury as disgorgement. Defendant Thomas shall have no right to contest the manner of distribution or other disposition of funds chosen by the Commission. The Commission in its sole discretion may use a designated agent to administer consumer redress.

V.

RIGHT TO REOPEN

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- The Commission's agreement to, and the Court's approval of, this Order is Α. expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of Defendant Thomas's financial statement dated May 20, 2008, and previously submitted by Defendant Thomas to the FTC ("Defendant's Financial Statement"), which contain material information relied upon by the Commission in negotiating and agreeing to the terms of this Order.
- В. If, upon motion by the Commission, this Court finds that Defendant Thomas has (1) materially misstated the value of any asset that should have been disclosed in Defendant's Financial Statement, (2) made any material misrepresentation or omitted material information concerning his financial condition by failing to disclose any assets that should have been disclosed in the Defendant's Financial Statement, or (3) made any other material misstatement or omission in the Defendant's Financial Statement, then the suspended judgment entered in Section IV.A. shall become immediately due and payable. The Court, without further adjudication, shall enter a modified judgment holding Defendant Thomas liable to the Commission in the amount of THIRTEEN MILLION

(\$ 13,411,918) for consumer redress, less any amounts turned over to the FTC pursuant to Section IV.B. of this Order and any verified payments for consumer redress made by any

FOUR HUNDRED ELEVEN THOUSAND NINE HUNDRED EIGHTEEN DOLLARS

of the other Defendants in this action. This amount shall become immediately due and

payable, and interest computed at the rate prescribed under 28 U.S.C. § 1961, as amended, shall immediately begin to accrue on the unpaid balance.

C. Defendant Thomas agrees that the facts as alleged in the First Amended Complaint filed in this action shall be taken as true without further proof in any bankruptcy case or subsequent civil litigation pursued by the Commission to enforce its rights to any payment or money judgment pursuant to this Order, including but not limited to a nondischargeability complaint in any bankruptcy case. Defendant Thomas further stipulates and agrees that the facts alleged in the First Amended Complaint establish all elements necessary to sustain an action pursuant to, and that this Order shall have collateral estoppel effect for purposes of, Section 523(a)(2)(A) of the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. § 523(a)(2)(A).

D. Defendant Thomas acknowledges and agrees that (1) this monetary judgment is equitable monetary relief, solely remedial in nature, and not a fine, penalty, punitive assessment or forfeiture; (2) any proceedings to lift the stay of the monetary judgment would be in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies as may be provided by law, including any other proceedings that the FTC may initiate to enforce this Order; and (3) all money paid to satisfy the monetary judgment is irrevocably paid for purposes of settlement between the parties and Defendant Thomas relinquishes all interests, rights and title to such money to the fullest extent permitted by law.

E. Should this Order be modified pursuant to this Section V, this Order, in all other respects, shall remain in full force and effect unless otherwise ordered by the Court. Any proceedings instituted under this Section V are in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies as may be provided by law, including any other proceedings that the FTC may initiate to enforce this Order.

VI.

LIFTING OF ASSET FREEZE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the freeze against the assets of Defendant Thomas pursuant to the Preliminary Injunction entered by this Court on May 27, 2008, shall be lifted upon entry of this Order.

VII.

CUSTOMER LISTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Thomas and his Representatives are permanently restrained and enjoined from selling, renting, leasing, transferring, or otherwise disclosing the name, address, telephone number, credit card number, bank account number, e-mail address, or other identifying information of any person who paid money to any of the Defendants at any time prior to the entry of this Order, in connection with the purchase of any products. Provided, however, that Defendant Thomas or his Representatives may disclose such identifying information to a law enforcement agency or as required by any law, regulation, or court order.

VIII.

COOPERATION WITH FTC COUNSEL

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Thomas shall, in connection with this action or any subsequent investigations related to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the FTC's First Amended Complaint, cooperate in good faith with the FTC and appear at such places and times as the FTC shall reasonably request, after written notice, for interviews, conferences, pretrial discovery, review of documents, and for such other matters as may be reasonably requested by the FTC. If requested in writing by the FTC, Defendant Thomas shall appear and provide truthful testimony in any trial, deposition, or other proceeding related to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the First Amended Complaint, without the service of a subpoena.

IX.

COMPLIANCE MONITORING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating compliance with any provision of this Order,

- A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, Defendant Thomas shall submit additional written reports, sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and/or provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in Defendant Thomas's possession or direct or indirect control to inspect the business operation;
- B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to monitor compliance with this Order by all other lawful means, including but not limited to the following:
- 1. obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, and 45;
- 2. posing as consumers and suppliers to: Defendant Thomas, Defendant Thomas's employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by Defendant Thomas, without the necessity of identification or prior notice; and
- C. Defendant Thomas shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

Provided, however, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

X.

COMPLIANCE REPORTING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

- A. For a period of seven (7) years from the date of entry of this Order,
 - 1. Defendant Thomas shall notify the Commission of the following:
- a. Any changes in his residence, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers, within ten (10) days of the date of such change;
- b. Any changes in his employment status (including self-employment), and any change in Defendant Thomas's ownership of any business entity, within ten (10) days of the date of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of each business that Defendant Thomas is affiliated with, employed by, creates or forms, or performs services for; a statement of the nature of the business; and a statement of Defendant Thomas's duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment; and
- c. Any changes in Defendant Thomas's name or use of any aliases or fictitious names; and
- 2. Defendant Thomas shall notify the Commission of any changes in corporate structure of any business entity that Defendant Thomas directly or indirectly controls, or has an ownership interest in, that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including but not limited to a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action that would result in the emergence of a successor entity; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; the filing of a bankruptcy petition; or a change in the corporate name or address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, *provided* that, with respect to any proposed change in the corporation about which the Defendant Thomas learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, Defendant Thomas shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.

indirectly controls the business, are hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create, and from failing to retain the following records:

- A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
- B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
- C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, phone numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and description of items or services purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;
- D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly, indirectly or through any third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests;
- E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements, or other marketing materials; and
- F. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including but not limited to, copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this Order, required by Section XII, and all reports submitted to the FTC pursuant to Section X.

XII.

DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of seven (7) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendant Thomas shall deliver copies of the Order as directed below:

A. Defendant Thomas as a Control Person: For any business that Defendant Thomas controls, directly or indirectly, or in which he has a majority ownership interest, Defendant Thomas must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals, officers, directors, and managers of that business. Defendant Thomas must also deliver copies of this Order to all employees, agents, and representatives of that business who engage in conduct

1	X/X /
1	XV.
2	ENTRY OF ORDER
3	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, there being no just reason for delay, the Clerk
4	is hereby directed to enter this judgment immediately.
5	
6	STIPULATED AND AGREED TO BY:
7	
8	/s/ Kathleen Benway /s/ George Thomas KATHLEEN BENWAY GEORGE THOMAS GARY L. IVENS
9	Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Ave, NW, Room H-281 DEFENDANT PRO SE
10	Washington, D.C. 20580
11	Phone: (202) 326-2024/(202) 326-3071 Facsimile (202) 326-3395
12	Email: kbenway@ftc.gov/ givens@ftc.gov
13	COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFF
14	
15	DATED this 9th day of December, 2008.
16	
17	
18	Daniel G. Campbell
19	David G. Campbell United States District Judge
20	United States District Judge
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	