IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS EASTERN DIVISION

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,)
Plaintiff,)) Civ. No. 09-cv-2929
ν.)
VOICE TOUCH, INC., a Florida corporation, dba Voice Touch, et al.,) STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT) AND ORDER FOR PERMANENT) INJUNCTION AGAINST
Defendants.) DEFENDANT VOICE) FOUNDATIONS, LLC)

Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission"), filed its Complaint for Injunctive and Other Equitable Relief pursuant to Sections 13(b) and 19 of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b) and 57b, and the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act ("Telemarketing Act"), 15 U.S.C. §§ 6101-6108, to secure temporary, preliminary, and permanent injunctive relief, restitution, disgorgement of ill-gotten gains, and other equitable relief for Defendants' acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), and in violation of the FTC's Trade Regulation Rule entitled "Telemarketing Sales Rule" ("TSR"), 16 C.F.R. Part 310.

Plaintiff and Defendant Voice Foundations, LLC ("Stipulating Defendant"), by and through their attorneys, have agreed to entry of this Stipulated Final Judgment and Order for Permanent Injunction Against Defendant Voice Foundations, LLC ("Order") by this Court in order to resolve all claims against Stipulating Defendant in this action. Plaintiff and Stipulating Defendant have consented to entry of this Order without trial or adjudication of any issue of law or fact herein.

NOW THEREFORE, Plaintiff and Stipulating Defendant, having requested the Court to enter this Order, and the Court having considered the Order reached between the parties, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED as follows:

FINDINGS

- 1. This is an action by the Commission instituted under Sections 13(b) and 19 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b) and 57b, the Telemarketing Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 6101-6108, and the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310. Pursuant to these Sections of the FTC Act and the Telemarketing Act, the Commission has the authority to seek the relief contained herein.
- 2. The Commission's complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted under Sections 5(a), 13(b), and 19 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 53(b), and 57b, and Section 6(b) of the Telemarketing Act, 15 U.S.C. § 6105(b).
- This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case and personal jurisdiction over the parties.
- 4. Venue in the United States District Court for the Northern District of Illinois is proper pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 53(b) and 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) and (c).
- 5. The alleged activities of Stipulating Defendant are "in or affecting commerce" as "commerce" is defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 6. Stipulating Defendant, without admitting the allegations set forth in the Commission's complaint and without any admission or finding of liability thereunder, agrees to entry of this Order.
- 7. Stipulating Defendant waives: (a) all rights to seek judicial review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order; (b) any claim that it may have against the Commission, its employees, representatives, or agents; (c) all claims under the Equal Access to

Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, as amended by Pub. L. 104-121, 110 Stat. 847, 863-64 (1996); and (d) any rights to attorney's fees that may arise under said provision of law. The Commission and Stipulating Defendant shall each bear their own costs and attorney's fees incurred in this action.

- 8. This Order is in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies that may be provided by law.
 - 9. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

For the purpose of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

- 1. "Asset" or "Assets" means any legal or equitable interest in, right to, or claim to, any real or personal property, including, but not limited to, "goods," "instruments," "equipment," "fixtures," "general intangibles," "inventory," "checks," or "notes," (as these terms are defined in the Uniform Commercial Code), lines of credit, chattels, leaseholds, contracts, mail or other deliveries, shares of stock, lists of consumer names, accounts, credits, premises, receivables, funds, and all cash, wherever located.
- 2. "Assisting others" includes, but is not limited to: (1) performing customer service functions, including, but not limited to, receiving or responding to consumer complaints; (2) formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any sales script or other marketing material; (3) providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential customers; (4) performing or providing marketing or billing services of any kind; (5) acting as an officer or director of a business entity; or (6) providing telemarketing services.
- 3. "Individual Defendant" or "Individual Defendants" means James A. Dunne and Damian Kohlfeld.

- 4. "Corporate Defendants" means Voice Touch, Inc., Network Foundations, LLC, Voice Foundations, LLC, and their successors and assigns, as well as any subsidiaries and any fictitious business entities or business names created or used by these entities, or any of them.
- "Defendants" means all of the Individual Defendants and the Corporate
 Defendants, individually, collectively, or in any combination.
- 6. "Document" or "documents" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, audio and video recordings, computer records, and other data compilations from which information can be obtained and translated, if necessary, through detection devices into reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate document within the meaning of the term.
- 7. "Material" means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding, goods or services.
- 8. "Person" or "persons" means a natural person, an organization or other legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, sole proprietorship, limited liability company, association, cooperative, or any other group or combination acting as an entity.
 - 9. "Plaintiff" means the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission").
- 10. "Stipulating Defendant" means Voice Foundations, LLC, by whatever names it may be known, and any subsidiaries, successors, assigns, and any fictitious business entities or business names created or used by Voice Foundations, LLC.
- 11. "Telemarketing" means any plan, program, or campaign (whether or not covered by the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R. Part 310) that is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or the payment of money by means of the use of one or more telephones.

I.

PERMANENT BAN ON TELEMARKETING

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Stipulating Defendant, whether acting directly or through any person, business entity, trust, corporation, partnership, limited liability company, subsidiary, division, or other device, or any of them, is hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from telemarketing, or assisting others engaged in telemarketing.

II.

PROHIBITED BUSINESS ACTIVITIES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Stipulating Defendant, its officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any person, business entity, trust, corporation, partnership, limited liability company, subsidiary, division, or other device, or any of them, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or provision of any good or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Misrepresenting, or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any material fact, including, but not limited to:
 - that they are calling from, on behalf of, or are otherwise affiliated with the manufacturer or dealer of a consumer's automobile;
 - that the expiration of the consumer's original automobile warranty is imminent;
 - that they are authorized to, and are, selling warranties that continue or extend the consumer's original warranty from the manufacturer;

- 4. that they are selling warranties;
- 5. the total cost to purchase, receive, or use the goods or services;
- any material restrictions, limitations, or conditions to purchase, receive, or use the goods or services;
- any material aspect of the nature or terms of a refund, cancellation,
 exchange, or repurchase policy for the goods or services; and
- any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics of the goods or services.

Provided, however, that nothing in this Section or in any other Section of this Order shall void the ban provision set forth in Section I of this Order.

III.

MONETARY JUDGMENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Judgment is hereby entered in favor of the Commission and against Stipulating Defendant for equitable monetary relief, including, but not limited to, consumer redress, in the amount of Forty Eight Million Dollars (\$48,000,000.00), the total amount of consumer injury caused by the activities alleged in the Commission's complaint.

A. All funds paid pursuant to this Order shall be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including, but not limited to, consumer redress, and any attendant expenses for the administration of such equitable relief. Stipulating Defendant shall cooperate fully to assist the Commission in identifying consumers who may be entitled to redress pursuant to this Order. If the Commission determines, in its sole discretion, that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other

equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to Defendants' practices alleged in the complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited to the United States Treasury as disgorgement. Stipulating Defendant shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies under this Section.

Stipulating Defendant shall have no right to contest the manner of distribution chosen by the Commission. This Judgment for equitable monetary relief is solely remedial in nature and is not a fine, penalty, punitive assessment or forfeiture;

- B. Stipulating Defendant relinquishes all dominion, control, and title to the funds paid to the fullest extent permitted by law. Stipulating Defendant shall make no claim to or demand for return of the funds, directly or indirectly, through counsel or otherwise;
- C. In accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701, as amended, Stipulating Defendant is hereby required, unless it already has done so, to furnish to the Commission its taxpayer identifying numbers (social security numbers or employer identification numbers), which shall be used for purposes of collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of Stipulating Defendant's relationship with the government;
- D. Stipulating Defendant agrees that the facts as alleged in the complaint filed in this action shall be taken as true without further proof in any bankruptcy case or subsequent civil litigation pursued by the Commission to enforce its rights to any payment or money judgment pursuant to this Order, including, but not limited to, a nondischargeability complaint in any bankruptcy case. Stipulating Defendant further stipulates and agrees that the facts alleged in the complaint establish all elements necessary to sustain an action pursuant to, and that this Order shall have collateral estoppel effect for purposes of, Section 532(a)(2)(A) of the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. § 532(a)(2)(A); and

E. Proceedings instituted under this Section are in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies that may be provided by law, including any other proceedings the Commission may initiate to enforce this Order.

IV.

PROHIBITIONS REGARDING CONSUMER INFORMATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Stipulating Defendant, and its officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Disclosing, using, or benefitting from customer information, including the name, address, telephone number, email address, social security number, other identifying information, or any data that enables access to a customer's account (including credit card, bank account, or other financial account), of any person which any Defendant obtained prior to entry of this Order in connection with providing telemarketing services to initiate outbound telephone calls that deliver pre-recorded messages; and
- B. Failing to dispose of such customer information in all forms in their possession, custody, or control within thirty (30) days after entry of this Order. Disposal shall be by means that protect against unauthorized access to the customer information, such as by burning, pulverizing, or shredding any papers, and by erasing or destroying any electronic media, to ensure that the customer information cannot practicably be read or reconstructed.

Provided, however, that customer information need not be disposed of, and may be disclosed, to the extent requested by a government agency or required by a law, regulation, or court order.

V.

COOPERATION WITH FTC COUNSEL

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Stipulating Defendant shall, in connection with this action or any subsequent investigations related to, or associated with, the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the FTC's complaint, cooperate in good faith with the FTC and appear, or cause its officers, employees, representatives, or agents to appear, at such places and times as the FTC shall reasonably request, after written notice, for interviews, conferences, pretrial discovery, review of documents, and for such other matters as may be reasonably requested by the FTC. If requested in writing by the FTC, Stipulating Defendant shall appear, or cause its officers, employees, representatives, or agents to appear, and provide truthful testimony in any trial, deposition, or other proceeding related to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the complaint, without the service of a subpoena.

VI.

COMPLIANCE MONITORING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating compliance with any provision of this Order:

- A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, Stipulating Defendant shall submit additional written reports, which are true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in Stipulating Defendant's possession or direct or indirect control to inspect the business operation;
 - B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to use all other lawful means.

including, but not limited to:

- 1. obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, 45, and 69;
- 2. having its representatives pose as consumers and suppliers to Stipulating Defendant, its employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by Stipulating Defendant, without the necessity of identification or prior notice; and
- C. Stipulating Defendant shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

Provided, however, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

VII.

COMPLIANCE REPORTING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

A. For a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, Stipulating

Defendant shall notify the Commission of any changes in its structure, or any business entity that

any Stipulating Defendant directly or indirectly controls, or has an ownership interest in, that

may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including, but not limited to: incorporation or other organization; a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; or a change in the business name or address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, *provided* that, with respect to any such change in the business entity about which Stipulating Defendant learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, Stipulating Defendant shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.

- B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order and annually thereafter for a period of five (5) years, Stipulating Defendant shall provide a written report to the FTC, which is true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which it has complied and is complying with this Order. This report shall include, but not be limited to:
 - A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this Order, obtained pursuant to the Section titled "Distribution of Order;" and
 - 2. Any other changes required to be reported under Subsection A of this Section;
- C. Stipulating Defendant shall notify the Commission of the filing of a bankruptcy petition by such Stipulating Defendant within fifteen (15) days of filing;
- D. For the purposes of this Order, Stipulating Defendant shall, unless otherwise directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, send by overnight courier all reports and notifications required by this Order to the Commission, to the following address:

Associate Director for Enforcement

Bureau of Consumer Protection Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20580 RE: FTC v. Voice Touch, Inc., et al Civil Action 09-cv-2929 (N.D. III.)

Provided that, in lieu of overnight courier, Stipulating Defendant may send such reports or notifications by first-class mail, but only if Stipulating Defendant contemporaneously sends an electronic version of such report or notification to the Commission at: <u>DEBrief@ftc.gov</u>; and

E. For purposes of the compliance reporting and monitoring required by this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with Stipulating Defendant.

VIII.

RECORD KEEPING PROVISIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of eight (8) years from the date of entry of this Order, Stipulating Defendant, for any business in which Stipulating Defendant is the majority owner or directly or indirectly controls, is hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the following records:

- A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
- B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
- C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, telephone numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and description of items or services

purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;

- D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly or indirectly, such as through a third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests;
- E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements, or other marketing materials; and
- F. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including, but not limited to, copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this Order required by the Sections titled "Distribution of Order" and "Acknowledgment of Receipt of Order" and all reports submitted to the FTC pursuant to the Section titled "Compliance Reporting."

IX.

DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, Stipulating Defendant shall deliver copies of the Order as directed below:

A. Stipulating Defendant must deliver a copy of this Order to: (1) all of its principals, officers, directors, and managers; (2) all of its employees, agents, and representatives who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of the Order; and (3) any business entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A of the Section titled "Compliance Reporting." For current personnel, delivery shall be within five (5) days of service of this Order upon Stipulating Defendant. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming their responsibilities. For any business entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A of the Section titled "Compliance Reporting," delivery shall be at least ten (10) days prior to the change in structure; and

B. Stipulating Defendant must secure a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the Order, within thirty (30) days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of the Order pursuant to this Section.

X.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Stipulating Defendant, within five (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, must submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Order. An example of such a statement is attached hereto as Attachment A.

XI.

COMPLETION OF RECEIVERSHIP

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the appointment of William J. Cook pursuant to the Stipulated Preliminary Injunction ("Preliminary Injunction") entered on June 10, 2009, is hereby continued. The Receiver's duties pursuant to the Preliminary Injunction are modified as described herein.

- A. The Receiver is directed to accomplish the following:
- Sell any marketable assets of Stipulating Defendant Voice
 Foundations;
- 2. Perform all acts necessary to protect, conserve, preserve, and prevent waste or dissipation of the following assets of Stipulating Defendant Voice Foundations:

 a) the funds held in the Northern Trust Bank account established by the Receiver on behalf of Voice Foundations; and b) the assets to be sold pursuant to XLA above;
 - 3. Prepare and submit a final report, as necessary, to this Court and to

the Plaintiff, describing the Receiver's efforts to comply with the terms of this Order, and recommending any additional action required by this Court; and

- 4. Distribute to the Commission any remaining liquid assets at the conclusion of the Receiver's duties without further order of the Court.
- B. The Receiver is entitled to reasonable compensation for the performance of its duties pursuant to this Order and for all duties performed pursuant to the Preliminary Injunction from the existing assets of the receivership estate and from the proceeds of sale of Stipulating Defendant Voice Foundations' assets, without further order of the Court but subject to agreement with the Commission, and such agreement shall not be unreasonably withheld.
- C. Upon the final sale of all assets and the transfer of any funds to the Commission pursuant to this Section, the duties of the Receiver shall terminate, at which time the Receiver shall return all original business records in his possession, and copies of any accounting materials the Receiver prepared in reviewing those original business records, to Stipulating Defendant Voice Foundations.

XII.

DISSOLUTION OF ASSET FREEZE AS TO VOICE FOUNDATIONS, LLC

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the freeze against the assets of Stipulating Defendant Voice Foundations, LLC, pursuant to Section III (Asset Freeze as to Defendant Voice Foundations) of the Stipulated Preliminary Injunction entered on June 10, 2009, shall remain in effect until such time as the Receiver receives payment of all approved fees and expenses of the Receiver and the receivership has been terminated. A financial institution shall be entitled to rely upon a letter from Plaintiff stating that the asset freeze has been lifted.

XIII.

SEVERABILITY

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the provisions of this Order are separate and severable from one another. If any provision is stayed or determined to be invalid, the remaining provisions shall remain in full force and effect.

XIV.

RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

//

JUDGMENT IS THEREFORE ENTERED in favor of the Plaintiff and against

Stipulating Defendant, pursuant to all the terms and conditions recited above.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: AUST 19, 2010

HONORABLE JOHN F. GRADY United States District Judge

SO STIPULATED AND AGREED:

Renomani
ROZINA C. BHIMANI
DAVID A. O'TOOLE
Attorneys for Plaintiff
Federal Trade Commission

Date: 8/12/2010

ALBERT GRYCHOWSKI on behalf of DEFENDANT VOICE FOUNDATIONS, LLC Date: 6-25-10

WILLIAM J. COOK

Receiver for Defendant Voice

Foundations, LLC

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

CHARLES A. VALENTE

Krasnow Saunders Cornblath, LLP

Attorney for Defendant Voice Foundations, LLC

Date: 6/25/10

JUDGMENT IS THEREFORE ENTERED in favor of the Plaintiff and against

Stipulating Defendant, pursuant to all the terms and conditions recited above.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated:	HONORABLE JOHN F. GRADY United States District Judge
SO STIPULATED AND AGREED:	
ROZINA C. BHIMANI DAVID A. O'TOOLE Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission	Date:
ALBERT GRYCHOWSKI on behalf of DEFENDANT VOICE FOUNDATIONS, LLC	Date:
WILLIAM J. COOK Receiver for Defendant Voice Foundations, LLC	Date: 6/29/10
APPROVED AS TO FORM:	
CHARLES A. VALENTE Krasnow Saunders Cornblath, LLP Attorney for Defendant Voice Foundations, LLC	Date:

ATTACHMENT A

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS EASTERN DIVISION

	TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, v. JCH, INC. et al., Defendants.	•)) Case No. 09 C 2929)) Judge Grady))
	AFFIDAVIT	OF	
l,	, be	eing duly sworn,	hereby state and affirm as follows:
1.	My name is	I	am a citizen of the United States and
am over the	age of eighteen. I have person	nal knowledge o	f the facts set forth in this Affidavit.
2.	I am an owner of Voice Fo	undations, LLC,	a defendant in FTC v. Voice Touch,
Inc., et al., 0	9-cv-2929 (United States Dis	trict Court for the	e Northern District of Illinois).
3.	The current business address	ss of Voice Foun	dations, LLC is The current
business tele	phone number of Voice Foun	dations, LLC is	
4.	On [date], Voice Foundation	ons, LLC receive	ed a copy of the Stipulated Final
Judgment Ag	gainst Defendant Voice Found	lations, LLC, wh	ich was signed by the Honorable John
F. Grady and	entered by the Court on [date	e of entry of the	Order]. A true and correct copy of
the Order it r	eceived is appended to this A	ffidavit.	
l decl	are under penalty of perjury u	under the laws of	the United States that the
foregoing is	true and correct. Executed or	n [date], at [city o	and state].

[Full name], as an officer of [corporate defendant]

State of	, City of
Subs	cribed and sworn to before me
this _	day of, 20
	Notary Public
	My Commission Expires: