UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,

Plaintiff,

VS.

FMC Counseling Services, Inc., a Florida corporation;

FDC Assoc Group, Inc., a Florida corporation;

FDC Business, Inc., a Florida corporation;

FMC Review Corporation, a Florida corporation;

NDR Group, Inc., a Florida corporation;

FMC Consultants Group, Inc., a Florida corporation;

JONATHAN L. HERBERT, individually and d/b/a Federal Debt Commission, Inc., FDC Financial, Inc., and FDC Consultants, Inc.;

Defendants.

[PROPOSED]
STIPULATED FINAL ORDER FOR
PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND
MONETARY JUDGMENT

Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("Commission" or "FTC"), filed its

Complaint for Permanent Injunction and Other Equitable Relief ("Complaint") in this matter,
pursuant to Sections 13(b) and 19 of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15

U.S.C. §§ 53(b) and 57b, and the 2009 Omnibus Appropriations Act, Public Law 111-8,
Section 626, 123 Stat. 524, 678 (Mar. 11, 2009) ("Omnibus Act"), as clarified by the Credit
Card Accountability Responsibility and Disclosure Act of 2009, Public Law 111-24, Section
511, 123 Stat. 1734, 1763-64 (May 22, 2009), and amended by the Dodd-Frank Wall Street

Reform and Consumer Protection Act, Public Law 111-203, Section 1097, 124 Stat. 1376, 2102-03 (July 21, 2010), 12 U.S.C. § 5538. The Commission and Defendants stipulate to entry of this Stipulated Final Order for Permanent Injunction and Monetary Judgment ("Order") to resolve all matters in dispute in this action between them.

THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED as follows:

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction over this matter.
- 2. The Complaint charges that Defendants participated in deceptive acts and practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45, and various provisions of the Mortgage Assistance Relief Services Rule ("MARS Rule"), 16 C.F.R. Part 322, recodified as Regulation O, 12 C.F.R. Part 1015, in the marketing of mortgage assistance relief products or services.
- 3. Defendants neither admit nor deny any of the allegations in the Complaint, except as specifically stated in this Order. Only for purposes of this action: (1) Defendants admit the facts necessary to establish jurisdiction; (2) Individual Defendant admits that he had the authority to control the Corporate Defendants, that he participated in the acts and practices of the Corporate Defendants, and that he is authorized to sign this Order on behalf of the Corporate Defendants; and (3) Individual Defendant admits that the persons identified by the Florida Secretary of State as registered agents, officers and directors of the Corporate Defendants did not formulate, direct, control, have the authority to control, or participate in the acts and practices of the Corporate Defendants.
- 4. Defendants waive any claim that they may have under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, concerning the prosecution of this action through the date of

this Order, and agree to bear their own costs and attorney fees.

5. Defendants waive all rights to appeal or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order.

DEFINITIONS

For purposes of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

- 1. "Assisting others" includes:
 - A. performing customer service functions, including receiving or responding to consumer complaints;
 - B. formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any advertising or marketing material, including any telephone sales script, direct mail solicitation, or the design, text, or use of images of any Internet website, email, or other electronic communication;
 - C. formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any marketing support material or service, including web or Internet Protocol addresses or domain name registration for any Internet websites, affiliate marketing services, or media placement services;
 - D. providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential customers;
 - E. performing marketing, billing, or payment services of any kind; or

- F. acting or serving as an owner, officer, director, manager, or principal of any entity.
- 2. "**Individual Defendant**" means Jonathan Herbert, and by whatever other names or aliases he may be known.
- 3. "Corporate Defendants" or "Receivership Defendants" means FMC Counseling Services, Inc., FDC Assoc Group, Inc., FDC Business, Inc., FMC Review Corporation, NDR Group, Inc., and FMC Consultants Group, Inc., and their successors and assigns, as well as any subsidiaries, and any fictitious business entities or business names created or used by these entities, or any of them.
- 4. "**Defendants**" means the Individual Defendant and all of the Corporate Defendants, individually, collectively, or in any combination.
- 5. **"Financial product or service"** means any product, service, plan, or program represented, expressly or by implication, to:
 - A. provide any consumer, arrange for any consumer to receive, or assist any consumer in receiving, a loan or other extension of credit;
 - B. provide any consumer, arrange for any consumer to receive, or assist any consumer in receiving, credit, debit, or stored value cards;
 - C. improve, repair, or arrange to improve or repair, any consumer's credit record, credit history, or credit rating; or
 - provide advice or assistance to improve any consumer's credit record,
 credit history, or credit rating.

- 6. "**Person**" means a natural person, organization, or other legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, proprietorship, association, cooperative, or any other group or combination acting as an entity.
 - 7. "Secured or unsecured debt relief product or service" means:
 - A. With respect to any mortgage, loan, debt, or obligation between a person and one or more secured or unsecured creditors or debt collectors, any product, service, plan, or program represented, expressly or by implication, to:
 - stop, prevent, or postpone any mortgage or deed of foreclosure sale for a person's dwelling, any other sale of collateral, any repossession of a person's dwelling or other collateral, or otherwise save a person's dwelling or other collateral from foreclosure or repossession;
 - 2. negotiate, obtain, or arrange a modification, or renegotiate, settle, or in any way alter any terms of the mortgage, loan, debt, or obligation, including a reduction in the amount of interest, principal balance, monthly payments, or fees owed by a person to a secured or unsecured creditor or debt collector;
 - obtain any forbearance or modification in the timing of payments from any secured or unsecured holder or servicer of any mortgage, loan, debt, or obligation;

- 4. negotiate, obtain, or arrange any extension of the period of time within which a person may (i) cure his or her default on the mortgage, loan, debt, or obligation, (ii) reinstate his or her mortgage, loan, debt, or obligation, (iii) redeem a dwelling or other collateral, or (iv) exercise any right to reinstate the mortgage, loan, debt, or obligation or redeem a dwelling or other collateral;
- obtain any waiver of an acceleration clause or balloon payment contained in any promissory note or contract secured by any dwelling or other collateral; or
- 6. negotiate, obtain, or arrange (i) a short sale of a dwelling or other collateral, (ii) a deed-in-lieu of foreclosure, or (iii) any other disposition of a mortgage, loan, debt, or obligation other than a sale to a third party that is not the secured or unsecured loan holder.

The foregoing shall include any manner of claimed assistance, including auditing or examining a person's application for the mortgage, loan, debt, or obligation.

- B. With respect to any loan, debt, or obligation between a person and one or more unsecured creditors or debt collectors, any product, service, plan, or program represented, expressly or by implication, to:
 - 1. repay one or more unsecured loans, debts, or obligations; or

 combine unsecured loans, debts, or obligations into one or more new loans, debts, or obligations.

I. <u>BAN ON SECURED AND UNSECURED DEBT RELIEF PRODUCTS AND SERVICES</u>

IT IS ORDERED that Defendants are permanently restrained and enjoined from:

- A. advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or selling any secured or unsecured debt relief product or service; and
- B. assisting others engaged in advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or selling any secured or unsecured debt relief product or service.

II. PROHIBITION AGAINST MISREPRESENTATIONS RELATING TO FINANCIAL PRODUCTS AND SERVICES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or selling any financial product or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from misrepresenting or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any material fact, including:

- A. the terms or rates that are available for any loan or other extension of credit, including:
 - 1. closing costs or other fees;
 - 2. the payment schedule, monthly payment amount(s), any balloon payment, or other payment terms;

- the interest rate(s), annual percentage rate(s), or finance charge(s), and whether they are fixed or adjustable;
- 4. the loan amount, credit amount, draw amount, or outstanding balance; the loan term, draw period, or maturity; or any other term of credit;
- 5. the amount of cash to be disbursed to the borrower out of the proceeds, or the amount of cash to be disbursed on behalf of the borrower to any third parties;
- 6. whether any specified minimum payment amount covers both interest and principal, and whether the credit has or can result in negative amortization; or
- 7. that the credit does not have a prepayment penalty or whether subsequent refinancing may trigger a prepayment penalty and/or other fees;
- B. the savings associated with the loan or other extension of credit;
- C. the ability to improve or otherwise affect a consumer's credit record, credit history, credit rating, or ability to obtain credit, including that a consumer's credit record, credit history, credit rating, or ability to obtain credit can be improved by permanently removing current, accurate negative information from the consumer's credit record or history; or
 - D. that a consumer will receive legal representation.

III. <u>PROHIBITION AGAINST MISREPRESENTATIONS RELATING TO ANY PRODUCTS OR SERVICES</u>

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or selling any product, service, plan, or program, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from misrepresenting or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any material fact, including:

- A. any material aspect of the nature or terms of any refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy, including the likelihood of a consumer obtaining a full or partial refund, or the circumstances in which a full or partial refund will be granted to the consumer;
- B. that any person is affiliated with, endorsed or approved by, or otherwise connected to any other person; government entity; public, non-profit, or other non-commercial program; or any other program;
- C. the nature, expertise, position, or job title of any person who provides any product, service, plan, or program;
- D. the total costs to purchase, receive, or use, or the quantity of, the product, service, plan, or program;
- E. any material restriction, limitation, or condition on purchasing, receiving, or using the product, service, plan, or program; or

F. any other material fact concerning any aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or characteristics of the product, service, plan, or program.

IV. MONETARY JUDGMENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- A. Judgment in the amount of Eight Hundred Fifteen Thousand Eight Hundred and Sixty-Five Dollars (\$815,865) is entered in favor of the Commission against Defendants, jointly and severally, as equitable monetary relief;
- B. Defendants relinquish dominion and all legal and equitable right, title, and interest in all assets transferred pursuant to this Order and may not seek the return of any assets.
- C. The facts alleged in the Complaint will be taken as true, without further proof, in any subsequent civil litigation by or on behalf of the Commission in a proceeding to enforce its rights to any payment or monetary judgment pursuant to this Order, such as a nondischargeability complaint in any bankruptcy case.
- D. The facts alleged in the Complaint establish all elements necessary to sustain an action by the Commission pursuant to Section 523(a)(2)(A) of the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. § 523(a)(2)(A), and this Order will have collateral estoppel effect for such purposes.
- E. Defendants acknowledge that their Taxpayer Identification Numbers (Social Security Numbers or Employer Identification Numbers), which Defendants previously submitted to the Commission, may be used for collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of this Order, in accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701.
 - F. All money paid to the Commission pursuant to this Order may be deposited

into a fund administered by the Commission or its designee to be used for equitable relief, including consumer redress and any attendant expenses for the administration of any redress fund. If a representative of the Commission decides that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or money remains after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining money for such other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to Defendants' practices alleged in the Complaint. Any money not used for such equitable relief is to be deposited into the United States Treasury as disgorgement. Defendants have no right to challenge any actions the Commission or its representatives may take pursuant to this Section.

G. Upon entry of this Order, the freeze on the Individual Defendant's assets shall be dissolved.

V. PROHIBITED DISCLOSURE OF CUSTOMER INFORMATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, are permanently restrained and enjoined from directly or indirectly:

A. failing to provide sufficient customer information to enable the Commission to efficiently administer consumer redress. If a representative of the Commission requests in writing any information related to redress, Defendants must provide it, in the form prescribed by the Commission, within 14 days;

- B. disclosing, using, or benefitting from customer information, including the name, address, telephone number, email address, social security number, other identifying information, or any data that enables access to a customer's account (including a credit card, bank account, or other financial account), that any Defendant obtained prior to entry of this Order;
- C. failing to destroy such customer information in all forms in their possession, custody, or control within 30 days after receipt of written direction to do so from a representative of the Commission.

Provided, however, that customer information need not be disposed of, and may be disclosed, to the extent requested by a government agency or required by law, regulation, or court order.

VI. <u>RECEIVERSHIP</u>

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the appointment of Walter J. Mathews, as Permanent Equity Receiver ("Receiver") for Corporate Defendants and any of their subsidiaries, affiliates, divisions, or sales or customer service operations, and any fictitious business entities or business names created or used by these entities, pursuant to the Preliminary Injunction entered on July 29, 2014, is hereby continued in full force and effect except as modified in this Section. The Receiver shall complete liquidation of all assets of the Corporate Defendants within 60 days of entry of this Order and without further order of the Court. The Receiver shall use the proceeds of the sale(s) of these assets to pay any legitimate liens and necessary expenses relating to the sale(s). Upon liquidation of these assets, the Receiver shall submit his final report and application for fees and expenses

relating to the receivership over the Corporate Defendants, and upon approval of the same by the Court, shall pay any remaining funds to the Commission. Upon the Court's approval of the Receiver's final report as to the Corporate Defendants, and the payment of any remaining funds to Plaintiff under this Section, the Receiver shall dissolve the Corporate Defendants and the Receivership shall be terminated.

VII. PROHIBITION ON COLLECTING ON ACCOUNTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from attempting to collect, collecting, or assigning any right to collect payment from any consumer who purchased or agreed to purchase any mortgage assistance relief product or service from any Defendant.

VIII. ORDER ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants obtain acknowledgments of receipt of this Order:

- A. Each Defendant, within 7 days of entry of this Order, must submit to the Commission an acknowledgment of receipt of this Order sworn under penalty of perjury.
- B. For 5 years after entry of this Order, Individual Defendant for any business that he, individually or collectively with any other Defendant, is the majority owner or controls directly or indirectly, and each Corporate Defendant, must deliver a copy of this Order to: (1) all principals, officers, directors, and LLC managers and members; (2) all employees, agents, and representatives who participate in conduct related to the subject

matter of this Order; and (3) any business entity resulting from any change in structure as set forth in the Section titled Compliance Reporting. Delivery must occur within 7 days of entry of this Order for current personnel. For all others, delivery must occur before they assume their responsibilities.

C. From each individual or entity to which a Defendant delivered a copy of this Order, that Defendant must obtain, within 30 days, a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of this Order.

IX. COMPLIANCE REPORTING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants make timely submissions to the Commission:

- A. One year after entry of this Order, each Defendant must submit a compliance report, sworn under penalty of perjury.
- 1. Each Defendant must: (a) identify the primary physical, postal, and email address and telephone number, as designated points of contact, which representatives of the Commission may use to communicate with Defendant; (b) identify all of that Defendant's businesses by all of their names, telephone numbers, and physical, postal, email, and Internet addresses; (c) describe the activities of each business, including the goods and services offered, the means of advertising, marketing, and sales, and the involvement of any other Defendant (which Individual Defendant must describe if he knows or should know due to his own involvement); (d) describe in detail whether and how that Defendant is in compliance with each Section of this Order; and (e) provide a copy of each Order

Acknowledgment obtained pursuant to this Order, unless previously submitted to the Commission.

- 2. Additionally, Individual Defendant must: (a) identify all telephone numbers and all physical, postal, email and Internet addresses, including all residences; (b) identify all business activities, including any business for which he performs services whether as an employee or otherwise and any entity in which he has any ownership interest; and (c) describe in detail his involvement in each such business, including title, role, responsibilities, participation, authority, control, and any ownership.
- B. For twenty (20) years after entry of this Order, each Defendant must submit a compliance notice, sworn under penalty of perjury, within 14 days of any change in the following:
- 1. Each Defendant must report any change in: (a) any designated point of contact; or (b) the structure of any Corporate Defendant or any entity that Defendant has any ownership interest in or controls directly or indirectly that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including: creation, merger, sale, or dissolution of the entity or any subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order.
- 2. Additionally, Individual Defendant must report any change in:

 (a) name, including aliases or fictitious name, or residence address; or (b) title or role in any business activity, including any business for which he performs services whether as an employee or otherwise and any entity in which he has any ownership interest, and identify the name, physical address, and Internet address of the business or entity.

- C. Each Defendant must submit to the Commission notice of the filing of any bankruptcy petition, insolvency proceeding, or any similar proceeding by or against such Defendant within 14 days of its filing.
- D. Any submission to the Commission required by this Order to be sworn under penalty of perjury must be true and accurate and comply with 28 U.S.C. § 1746, such as by concluding: "I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on:_____" and supplying the date, signatory's full name, title (if applicable), and signature.
- E. Unless otherwise directed by a Commission representative in writing, all submissions to the Commission pursuant to this Order must be emailed to DEbrief@ftc.gov or sent by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal Service) to: Associate Director for Enforcement, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20580. The subject line must begin: *FTC v. FMC Counseling Services, Inc. et al.*, FTC Matter No. X140036.

X. <u>RECORDKEEPING</u>

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants must create certain records for twenty (20) years after entry of the Order, and retain each such record for 5 years.

Specifically, the Corporate Defendants and Individual Defendant for any business that he, individually or collectively with any other Defendant, is a majority owner or controls directly or indirectly, must create and retain the following records:

A. Accounting records showing the revenues from all goods or services sold;

- B. Personnel records showing, for each person providing services, whether as an employee or otherwise, that person's: name, addresses, and telephone numbers; job title or position; dates of service; and, if applicable, the reason for termination;
- C. Records of all consumer complaints and refund requests, whether received directly or indirectly, such as through a third party, and any response;
- D. All records necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including all submissions to the Commission; and
 - E. A copy of each unique advertisement or other marketing material.

XI. <u>COMPLIANCE MONITORING</u>

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring Defendants' compliance with this Order, including any failure to transfer any assets as required by this Order:

- A. Within 14 days of receipt of a written request from a representative of the Commission, each Defendant must: submit additional compliance reports or other requested information, which must be sworn under penalty of perjury; appear for depositions; and produce documents, for inspection and copying. The Commission is also authorized to obtain discovery, without further leave of court, using any of the procedures prescribed by Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 29, 30 (including telephonic depositions), 31, 33, 34, 36, 45, and 69.
- B. For matters concerning this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with each Defendant. Defendants must permit representatives of the

Commission to interview any employee or other person affiliated with any Defendant who has agreed to such an interview. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

C. The Commission may use all other lawful means, including posing, through its representatives, as consumers, suppliers, or other individuals or entities, to Defendants or any individual or entity affiliated with Defendants, without the necessity of identification or prior notice. Nothing in this Order limits the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1.

XII. <u>RETENTION OF JURISDICTION</u>

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

IT IS SO ORDERED, this	day of, 20	014
	Hon. William J. Zloch	
	United States District Judge	

SO STIPULATED AND AGREE	D:	Į,
-------------------------	----	----

ATTORNEY FOR DEFENDANTS

FOR PLAINTIFF FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION: Date: 11/13/14 James Davis, Attorney Elizabeth Scott, Attorney 55 West Monroe, Suite 1825 Chicago, IL 60603 312-960-5634 [voice] 312-960-5600 [fax] jdavis@ftc.gov escott@ftc.gov FOR DEFENDANTS: Date: DEFENDANT JONATHAN L. HERBERT, individually and on behalf of the Corporate Defendants APPROVED AS TO FORM: Date: David Rothman Rothman & Associates, P.A. 200 S. Biscayne Blvd. #2770 Miami, FL 33131 305-358-9000 [voice] 305-374-5747 [fax] dbr@rothmanlawyers.com